



Legislation Text

File #: 20-104, **Version:** 1

TO: Chair and Planning Commission

FROM: Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director
Paul Michaud, Planning Manager
George Burton, Senior Planner

DATE: March 3, 2020

DEPARTMENT: Community Development

AGENDA TITLE:

Discussion of a Minor Special Use Permit Amendment
St. Barnabas Church (SUP-20-02). 6715 N. Mockingbird Lane.

REQUEST

St. Barnabas Church is requesting a Minor Special Use Permit (SUP) amendment to renovate and replace the parking lot/parking area, update the site drainage and retention, replace and add new signage, re-landscape the campus, improve the playground area with a new solar panel shade structure and fencing, add new trellis shade canopies with solar panels, replace and add new site lighting, and replace a covered parking canopy with a solar panel parking canopy.

BACKGROUND

History

Saint Barnabas Church was established in 1953. The Town annexed the Church in 1964. The original Special Use Permit was issued in 1974 and has been amended several times. The most recent amendment was approved in 2012 for modifications to the exterior lighting and the replacement of an existing ramada with a new ramada.

Parking Lot Renovation

The existing parking lot will be repaved with new asphalt and restriped in order to improve circulation and safety. The improvement will increase the parking count from 306 total parking spaces (with 294 regular spaces and 12 accessible spaces) to a total of 328 parking spaces (with 307 regular spaces and 21 accessible). Also, per the last Major SUP Amendment in 2003, the parking study identified a minimum of 203 required parking spaces. The existing and proposed parking count exceed the minimum requirement.

The applicant proposes to keep the size of the parking spaces the same size as approved in the last Major SUP amendment. The size for the 60-degree parking spaces is 23' long x 8'6" wide (195.5 square feet) and the size for the 90-degree parking spaces is 18' long x 8'6" wide (153 square feet). There are 158 angled parking spaces located between Mockingbird Lane and the front of the

buildings, 4 of these spaces are accessible spaces. 148 angled parking spaces adjoin a landscape tract that could be factored into the parking space size, with 10 angled spaces near the north entrance that have no adjoining landscape tract. The other 170 parking spaces are 90-degree parking spaces, with 17 of these spaces being accessible. 67 of these 170 parking spaces adjoin another parking space. Whereas, 60 of these 170 parking spaces adjoin a walkway and the remaining 43 parking spaces adjoin a landscape tract. The Town Zoning Ordinance identifies a minimum parking space size of 180 square feet (which is typically a 20' long by 9' wide parking space). Staff recommends that all the parking spaces meet the 180 square foot size limit and seeks Planning Commission's input regarding the applicants request to maintain smaller sized 90-degree parking spaces. Subtracting the 60-degree parking spaces and the accessible parking spaces since they comply with ADA requirements, approximately 47% or 153 parking spaces are below the 180 square foot size limit.

The applicant proposes no changes to the location of the three ingress/egress points along Mockingbird Lane. A minimum drive aisle of 12' wide is required for emergency vehicles and the proposed drive aisles will vary in width from 13' wide to 26' wide. Also, the existing parking medians will be reconfigured to accommodate the new parking layout. New landscaping and parking lot lights will be placed in the parking medians and parking areas.

Drainage and Retention Improvements

The proposed improvements will maintain the existing drainage scheme. The first-flush retention volume is retained within the parking lot and adjacent landscape areas while the larger storm event outfall is conveyed off-site via existing drainage patterns to the Five Star Development main channel area through a new storm drainpipe. The existing fire lane at the rear/east end of the property will be changed from asphalt to decomposed granite to help decrease the amount of impervious surface on the site. Retention basins will also be placed along the north, east, and southern parts of the campus. However, portions of retentions basins which are located at the perimeter of the campus will encroach onto the neighboring Five Star property. Five Star Development provided a letter identifying that they will work with the church to obtain any applicable drainage easements or similar mechanisms as needed (please reference the enclosed January 21, 2020 letter from Five Star Development). A stipulation will be added identifying that these easements or mechanisms shall be in place prior to issuance of a building permit.

The parking lot water depth does not meet the Town's Storm Drainage Design Manual standards. This means that there may ponding throughout the parking lot that varies from 8.5" to 12" during a storm event; whereas the Storm Drainage Design Manual identifies a maximum ponding limit of 6". Staff is concerned that the excess ponding may impede parking and pedestrian accessibility. However, since the project is not changing the overall layout nor adding additional parking area/surface, there is limited opportunity to comply with the new stormwater storage requirements. As a result, the applicant is requesting a deviation from this requirement and has provided a letter from the church identifying they are aware of and agreeable to the fact that stormwater in the parking lot may impede parking and pedestrian accessibility (please reference the enclosed February 3, 2020 letter from Saint Barnabas Church). Staff recommends that the property meet the Town's Storm Drainage Design Manual requirements which may be achieved with the use of underground storage tanks and seeks Planning Commission's input regarding the applicants request to deviate from the parking lot water depth/ponding standards.

Signage

The Church will replace its two existing monument signs with two new monument signs, add two new direction signs, add a new site ID sign, and add a cross on the back of the Sanctuary building:

- **Monument Signs.** There are two existing wall mounted monument signs located at the north and south side of the central/main church entrance. These signs are externally illuminated and less than 3' tall. The existing signs and portion of wall they are attached to will be removed and replaced with two free standing signs. The new monuments will be single faced, 8' tall by 4' wide (with a total area of 32 square feet), back-light with halo-illuminated push thrus, and will be setback approximately 6' from the front property line adjoining Mockingbird Lane. The monument signs will be illuminated from dusk to 10 p.m. and will have an output of approximately 0.1 foot-candles measured at the front property line.

The proposed monument signs are compliant with the SUP Guidelines. The SUP Guidelines recommend one ground sign no higher than 8' tall and no larger than 32 square feet at each principal entrance to the property. The church has three principal entrances along Mockingbird Lane and is placing two monuments next to the central entrance. The sign illumination is also compliant with Town Code, since the 0.1 foot-candle output is less than the maximum limit of 0.75 foot-candles and uses opaque faced letters which will shield the light source per code.

- **Directional Signs.** One directional sign will be placed at the north and the south entrance. The new signs will be single faced, 4'5" tall by 5' wide (with a total area of 22.5 square feet), back-light with halo-illuminated push thrus, and will be setback approximately 3' from the front property line. The directional signs will be illuminated from dusk to 10 p.m. and will have an output of approximately 0.1 foot-candles measured at the front property line.

The directional signs meet the Town's lighting requirements in which the output is less than 0.75 foot-candles measured at the property line and uses opaque faced letters which will shield the light source. However, the proposed directional signs are not compliant with the SUP Guidelines. The SUP Guidelines recommend that traffic and directional signs within the site shall not exceed 12 square feet in area and a maximum height of 5' tall. The proposed directional signs exceed the 12 sq. ft. area limit and are not placed within the site. Staff seeks the Planning Commission's input regarding the location and increased size of these proposed signs.

- **Identification Sign.** The applicant is proposing to place an identification sign near the southeastern part of the campus. The ID sign is single faced, 8' tall by 4' wide (with a total area of 32 square feet), non-illuminated, and will be setback approximately 50' from the east/nearest property line. The SUP Guidelines do not address ID signs. However, this sign is compliant with the recommended size and height limits of a monument sign (with a maximum height of 8' tall and maximum area of 32 sq. ft.). In essence, this sign is functioning as monument sign that is facing the new Five Star development.
- **Building Sign.** An aluminum cross will be placed on the east/rear part of the existing sanctuary building. The cross will have a maximum size of 6' tall by 3' wide and is not illuminated. The existing sanctuary building is 31'6" tall and is setback approximately 130' from the east property line. The cross will be placed several feet below the top of the parapet (with an approximate height of 28'5" tall).

New Landscaping

New landscaping will be placed in the parking medians, along the drive aisles, along the three entryways adjoining Mockingbird Lane, around the existing memorial garden, and along the north and east property lines. 111 new trees and 15,318 shrubs/ground covering plants will be placed on the campus. The palette includes, but is not limited to, Blue Palo Verde trees, Velvet Mesquite trees, Arizona Ash trees, Oak trees, Desert Hackberry, Hop Bush, Creosote, Superstition Mallow, Bursage, Desert Spook, and Desert Marigold. Landscape lighting will also be used to highlight the new landscaping and illuminate pathways. There are no specific landscape requirements or guidelines internal to a church site.

The Town Code, 1996 Landscape Guidelines, and/or SUP Guidelines provide minimum tree and shrub sizes and numbers along the public right-of-way. The application request proposes no substantial changes to the landscaping within the Mockingbird Lane right-of-way. This landscaping was approved in prior SUP amendments. The guidelines suggest at least 21 to 26 trees, with 20% being Ironwood trees along the street frontage. The Town Code requires a minimum 15-gallon size for trees. The existing trees are mature and well larger than 15 gallon in size, with currently about 17 trees. The trees along Mockingbird Lane are mostly Palo Verde with a few ironwood trees. The guidelines suggest at least 32 shrubs along Mockingbird Lane along the church property. There are presently about 100 mature shrubs. The SUP Guidelines suggest a 50' wide landscape tract along the street frontage of Mockingbird Lane. The existing approved condition from a prior SUP amendment has no landscape tract on the private property due to the parking area drive aisle, but the existing landscape tract within the right-of-way is approximately 20' wide

The 1996 Landscape Guidelines and SUP Guidelines provide minimum landscape guidelines for parking areas. This includes 3' tall screening of parking spaces, 25% of the parking areas have landscaping, a recommendation of one canopy tree per 10 parking spaces, and no parking space more than 50' away from a canopy tree. The parking areas comply with the screening guidelines and are in substantial compliance with the other parking area guidelines.

The Chief of Police also recommends that the landscape be maintained in compliance with Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) standards. As a result, staff recommends adding a stipulation identifying that shrubs and bushes shall be maintained at maximum height of 3' tall and tree canopies shall be trimmed to hang no lower than 6' above the ground to provide visibility and increase safety. Staff seeks the Planning Commission's input regarding this recommended stipulation.

New Canopies

With this improvement, the applicant is proposing to replace the existing playground canopy with a new canopy, add three new covered walkway canopies between several of the existing buildings, and replace the rear parking canopy with a new canopy:

- **Playground Canopy.** The playground area is located at the northwestern part of the campus. The existing canopy will be removed and replaced with a new canopy. The new playground canopy is a painted steel shade structure with a solar panel roof. It is 2,385 square feet in size, 23'6" tall from finished grade, and setback 68' from the north property line and setback

234' from the west property line. It has four light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0 foot-candles measured at the north/nearest property line. The lighting on the playground canopy may be illuminated from dusk to 10 p.m., with the exception of special events or services where the illumination will continue until the conclusion of the event.

The new playground canopy is compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum height of 24' tall, a minimum setback of 60' from a residentially zoned property, and a maximum light output of 0.5 foot-candles adjoining residential lots.

- Walkway Canopy. Three walkway canopies will be placed between the Children's Center, Hutton Hall, and Learning Center buildings. The new walkway canopies are painted steel shade structures with solar panel roofs:
 - Canopy 3A is located next to the Children's Center building, is approximately 13' tall from finished grade, approximately 677 square feet in size, and is setback 114' from the north property line and 288' from the west property line. It has four light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0 foot-candles measured at the north/nearest property line. The lighting on the canopy will be illuminated from dusk to dawn, with the lighting levels reduced to 50% after 10 p.m.
 - Canopy 3B is located next to the Learning building, is approximately 12' tall from finished grade, approximately 1,015 square feet in size, and is setback 220' from the north property line and 288' from the west property line. It has six light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0 foot-candles measured at the north/nearest property line. The lighting on the canopy will be illuminated from dusk to dawn, with the lighting levels reduced to 50% after 10 p.m.
 - Canopy 3C is located next to the Hutton Hall building, is approximately 13' tall from finished grade, approximately 843 square feet in size, and is setback 167' from the north property line and 288' from the west property line. It has eight light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0 foot-candles measured at the north/nearest property line. The lighting on the canopy will be illuminated from dusk to dawn, with the lighting levels reduced to 50% after 10 p.m.

The new walkway canopies are compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum height of 24' tall, a minimum setback of 60' from a residentially zoned property, and a maximum light output of 0.5 foot-candles adjoining residential lots.

- Parking Canopy. The existing parking canopy located at the southeastern part of the campus will be removed and replaced with a new canopy. The new parking canopy is a painted steel shade structure with a solar panel roof. It is 3,278 square feet in size, 17" tall from finished grade, and setback 52' from the east property line and setback 143' from the south property line. It has eight light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is

recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0.2 foot-candles measured at the east/nearest property line. The lighting on the parking canopy will be illuminated from dusk to 10 p.m., with the exception of special events or services where the illumination will continue until the conclusion of the event.

The new parking canopy is compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum height of 24' tall, a minimum setback of 60' from a residentially zoned property, and a maximum light output of 0.5 foot-candles adjoining residential lots.

The replacement and addition of the new canopies result in an additional 4,922 square feet of floor area. The lot coverage will increase from 16.18% to 17.38%; which is below the recommended lot coverage limit of 25% per the SUP Guidelines.

Site Improvements

A new outdoor kitchen, water feature, new or resurface paths, and fencing will be placed on campus:

- **Outdoor Kitchen.** A new outdoor kitchen will be placed internal to the site behind the Hutton Hall building. It is a 3' tall L-shaped countertop with two bar-b-ques.
- **Water Feature.** A new water feature will be placed between the existing labyrinth and the fire lane in the rear of the site. It is a circular feature that is approximately 2' tall, 5' in diameter, and a 16" deep basin. Underwater light fixtures will be placed in the basin.
- **Paths.** Many of the existing pathways will be resurfaced with concrete pavers. A new paver drop-off area will also be placed near the east side of the playground area.
- **Fencing.** New fencing will be placed around the playground. The playground enclosure is a mixture of two fence types and will tie into the existing Children's Center building. A 6' tall metal slat fence will be placed along the west and east sides of the play area and a 6' tall combo view fence (with a 36" of masonry stucco wall on the bottom and a 36" perforated metal panel fence on top) will be placed along the north side of the play area.
- **Stanchion and Chain.** A 4' tall stanchion and chain "gate" will be placed at the north and south ends of the stabilized decomposed granite fire lane (which is located at the rear/east part of the property). This will help keep the internal traffic away from the existing memorial garden and labyrinth area while enabling emergency service vehicles to access the rear part of the campus.
- **Pony Walls.** Two new angled pony walls will be placed along Mockingbird Lane next to the new monument signs (please reference the Smithcraft sign sheets 2.0 and 3.0). Each wall is approximately 33' long, 4' tall, and will be placed next to the west/front property line. Staff recommends that these walls match the height and color of the existing fence wall along Mockingbird Lane.

Site Lighting

New parking lot, landscape, pathway, and building lighting will be placed around campus to improve on-site visibility, way finding, and meet life safety requirements:

- **Pole Lights.** 61 new pole lights will be placed in the parking lot and around the walkways (fixtures L1 - L4 noted on Sheet E2). The height varies from 12' to 16' tall above the adjoining finished grade and are setback a minimum of 40' from the nearest property line. The poles lights have a Radean Post Top (with the light source recessed into the hood of the fixture) and a color temperature of 2700K. The pole lights are compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum height of 16' tall and a minimum setback matching the height of the light pole.

For reference, there are 48 existing light poles on campus that are 12' tall. In 2012, the church received a Minor SUP Amendment that allowed for the replacement and addition of new pole lights on campus. The Minor Amendment allowed for a total of 70 light poles with a maximum height of 12' tall.

- **Wall Mounted Lights.** 34 wall mounted lights will be placed around the existing buildings (fixtures L5, L6, L7, L12, and L13 on the Sanctuary, Hutton Hall, Children's Center, Learning Center, and Sean's Place buildings per Sheet E2). 26 of the fixtures are exterior ceiling mounted lights and the remaining 8 are wall mounted lights. The light source is recessed within each fixture and the color temperature varies from 2700K to 3000K.
- **Surface Mounted Lights.** 73 surface mounted lights down lights will be placed on the existing trellis, the existing covered walkway, the new solar playground canopy, the new solar walkway canopies, and the new solar parking canopy (fixtures L8, L9, L10, L11, L14, and L15 noted on Sheet E2). The light source is recessed within each fixture and the color temperature is 2700K.
- **Recessed Mounted Lights.** 28 recessed lights will be placed along the eaves and above the doorways of the existing Gift Shop building, the existing Music Center building, and the existing Sean's Place building (fixture L11 noted on Sheet E2). The light source is recessed within the fixture and has a color temperature of 2700K.
- **Ground Mounted Lights.** 60 ground mounted lights will be placed in the landscape median of the center entrance and around the rear courtyard/memorial garden area (fixtures L16 and L18 on Sheet E2). 53 up-light will be used to illuminate the landscaping and 7 bollard lights will be used to illuminate the existing labyrinth. The light source of the landscape up-lights is recessed in the fixture and has a color temperature of 2700K. The bollard lights are 36" tall, with the light source recessed inside the hood of the fixture, and has a color temperature of 3000K.
- **Tree Mounted Lights.** 12 tree mounted down-lights will placed in trees throughout the campus (fixture L17 on Sheet E2). The light source is recessed within the fixture, the light is directed downward, has a color temperature of 2700K, and will be limited to a maximum height of 18' tall.
- **Output of Proposed Lighting.** The photometric plan identifies a maximum output of 0.2 foot-candles measured at the property line for the proposed exterior lighting. The proposed lighting is compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum output of 1.6 foot-candles for parking lots and a maximum output of 0.5 foot-candles adjoining a residential property.

- Timing of Proposed Lighting. The perimeter site lighting will operate from dusk to 10 p.m. with the exception of special events and services; at which time the perimeter lighting will shut off at the conclusion of the event. For security purposes, the interior lighting located between the buildings will operate from dusk to dawn. However, the interior lighting level will be reduced to 50% after 10 p.m. A stipulation will be added to this amendment to clarify these limits.

DISCUSSION/FACTS:

General Plan:

The proposed improvements are consistent with Section 1.3 of the Town's General Plan which encourages the continued revitalization and improvement of the Town's SUP properties while protecting the adjacent residential neighborhoods.

Minor Amendment Criteria

Per Section 1102.7 of the Zoning Ordinance, a Minor Amendment to a Special Use Permit shall include any proposal which is not a Managerial Amendment and does not:

1. Change or add any uses; or
2. Increase the floor area of the project by more than 5,000 square feet or constitute an increase of more than 15% upon the existing or, if still under construction, approved floor area square footage of the affected SUP property, whichever is less, with any such increase to be measured cumulatively over a sixty-month period; or
3. Have any material effect on the adjoining property owners that is visible, audible, or otherwise perceptible from adjacent properties that cannot be sufficiently mitigated; or
4. Change the architectural style of the existing Special Use Permit.

Zoning Ordinance Compliance:

The proposed improvements are consistent with the existing church use and are substantially compliant with the SUP Guidelines. The renovation of the parking lot will help define the primary/central entrance and adds another 22 parking spaces to the church campus. The proposed lighting should improve visibility on-site, will use code compliant light fixture, has a low output of 0.2 foot-candles measured at the property line, and will limit the hours of illumination (with the perimeter lighting turning off by 10 p.m. or at the conclusion of an event/service and the interior lighting running at half the output from dusk to dawn).

The new canopies and monument signs are also compliant with the SUP Guidelines and Town Code. They meet the recommended setbacks, heights, and area limits and the increase in floor area is less than 5,000 square feet (resulting in a slight increase in lot coverage from 16.18% to 17.38%). There is no change in use nor change in architectural style.

However, not all the proposed improvements are compliant with or meet the SUP Guidelines and Town standards. Approximately half of the parking spaces are undersized and do not meet the 180 square foot size limit recommended by the Town Zoning Ordinance. The parking lot is not compliant with the Town's Storm Drainage Design Manual water depth/ponding standards and staff also has concerns regarding the directional signs. The directional signs exceed the recommended size limit

and appear to function as both a monument and direction sign. Staff is seeking the Commission's input and direction regarding these deviations.

Public Comment

Public notification is not required for the work study session.

Next Steps

This application is scheduled for public hearing on April 7, 2020. Notification will be performed in accordance with the public hearing process.

ATTACHMENT(S):

- A - Vicinity Map & Aerial Photo
- B - Application
- C - Narrative & Plans
- D - January 21, 2020 letter from Five Star Development
- E - February 3, 2020 letter from Saint Barnabas Church
- F - SUP Guidelines