



Legislation Text

File #: 19-053, **Version:** 1

TO: Chair and Planning Commission

FROM: Dawn-Marie Buckland, Deputy Town Manager
Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director
Paul Michaud, Senior Planner

DATE: February 19, 2019

CONTACT:
Paul Michaud, 480-348-3574

AGENDA TITLE:

Discussion of a Minor Amendment to the Valley Presbyterian Church Special Use Permit located at 6947 E McDonald Drive to allow for renovations to some of the existing buildings, landscaping/hardscaping improvements, and modification to the onsite parking spaces from the phased 1999 Special Use Permit approval. (SUP-18-16)

REQUEST

Neal Jones with Jones Studio on behalf of Valley United Presbyterian Church located at 6947 E McDonald Drive (Assessor Parcels 173-07-002, 173-07-003 and 173-07-004B) is requesting a Minor Special Use Permit amendment for minor renovations of four of the eight existing church buildings located on the subject property. These renovations consist of improvements to Building A (Sanctuary) for interior remodel and a 197 square foot expansion; Building B (South Classroom) interior remodel to add 7 classrooms from existing office/storage space and remodel 2 classrooms, resulting in an overall reduction of 450 square feet; Building C (Administrative Offices) to remodel interior spaces; Building D (Facilities) to remodel interior spaces; and the removal of the 1999 approvals for a larger sanctuary expansion and new classroom building. Site improvements include the renovation of the central plaza to provide new hardscaping and landscaping, rework of pedestrian and vehicular access to the plaza, relocation of ADA parking spaces in the main parking lot closer to the buildings, new landscaping/irrigation surrounding these buildings, and modification to the onsite parking spaces from the phased 1999 Special Use Permit approval.

BACKGROUND

History:

Valley Presbyterian is an 8.7-acre site. The site borders the minor arterial of McDonald Drive, Kiva Elementary School, and the local streets of Quail Run Road and Montebello Avenue. The area of the renovations is generally the south half of the site. The site was annexed into the Town when the Town incorporated in May 1961. The church existed on the site prior to annexation. The Town granted the original Special Use Permit to the church in 1975. The last major amendment to the Special Use Permit (SUP) for this church was approved by the Town in 1999. This was for a new day school,

administration building and other related structures. Since 1999, the only other SUP approval included a managerial approval for a cross located in the memorial garden and lastly a Minor Special Use Permit amendment for a new monument sign along McDonald Drive approved in 2016. Refer to Attachment C for more information.

General Plan/Zoning:

The subject property has a “Public/Quasi Public” General Plan designation and is zoned “Special Use Permit - Public/Quasi Public” for a religious facility. The proposed request complies with this designation/zoning. General Plan policies the Planning Commission may wish to consider during its review include:

Policy LU 2.1.2.3, Compatibility of Adjoining Uses

The Town shall ensure that development within Special Use Permit properties is compatible with adjacent land uses, particularly residential uses, by requiring such features as ... landscaped off-street parking areas, loading areas, and service areas screened from adjacent residential areas, to the degree feasible; Lighting shielded to minimize impacts on adjacent residential uses and protect dark skies; and Operational restrictions to limit the adverse impact of noise, light, and traffic and minimize the risk of crime to adjacent residences.

Policy CC&H 3.1.1.2 Protect Established Neighborhoods

The Town shall encourage new development and redevelopment, both private and public, to respect and respond to those existing physical characteristics, buildings, streetscapes, open spaces, and urban form that contribute to the overall character and livability of the neighborhood.

Policy CC&H 3.1.2.4 Places of Worship and Schools

The Town shall recognize and support the continued vitality of the places of worship and schools and the value they bring to the community.

Enforcement:

There are no open known violations at this property as of the date of this report.

DISCUSSION/FACTS

1999 SUP Phasing

Approved Sheet DR0.1 from 1999 outlined phased improvements. This included Phase 1 perimeter improvements for perimeter landscaping and shared parking with Kiva Elementary School. Phase 1 was completed and will not be altered with this request except for landscaping/hardscaping in front of the sanctuary related to the proposed drop-off area/main plaza along Quail Run Road. Phase 2 was construction of the family life center labeled as Building F (Landes Center) on the proposed site plan. This building is completed. There are no changes to this building as part of the current request. Phase 3 related to construction of a new administrative building and adjacent parking. The administration building is completed and designated as Building C. This request proposes some minor changes to the administration building. Phase 4 is the last phase that has not been completed. This phase included approximately 9,465 square feet of new classrooms (included basement and 2nd story) to replace what is shown as Building G (The Crossing) on the site plan, a 1,900 square-foot expansion of the sanctuary for added seating, and reconfiguration of the southern parking lot when the church met final fundraising goals. The current request eliminates the new classroom building, reduces the sanctuary expansion to 197 square feet, and proposes a reduction in the total number of final parking spaces based upon the total reduction of building square footage.

Compliance with Special Use Permit (SUP), SUP Guidelines and Other Standards

Typically, the nature of the request for the proposed building renovations would require only staff review to verify substantial compliance with approved plans since the proposed renovations are less in total area than the 1999 approved plans and mostly interior remodel. The stipulation verbiage that “all development, construction and usage of the church property shall comply” with the approved plans provides less staff discretion on plan changes. The reduction of required parking spaces from the 1999 approval is a change in stipulation and some of the outdoor landscaping/hardscaping improvements require at least a Minor Special Use Permit amendment.

- *Renovations Building A - Sanctuary*

The sanctuary is proposed to get interior renovations along with an approximate 197 square foot addition to expand the choir room. This expansion is on the south side of the building within existing wall supports. The interior remodel revamps the worship area, restrooms, exterior doors, and mechanical/utilities. A new access roof hatch is proposed on the southwest part of the lower side of the sanctuary roof. Refer to the applicant’s narrative for more information.

These renovations have no impact on existing maximum height. It does increase the total lot coverage from 19.1% to 19.2%. These renovations may be visible offsite along Quail Run Road and are within the existing building footprint.

- *Renovations Building B - South Classrooms*

This is an interior remodel to add 7 classrooms from existing office/storage space and to remodel 2 classrooms, resulting in an overall reduction of 450 square feet of enclosed space.

These renovations have no impact on existing height or lot coverage. The reduction of existing interior space converts to outdoor covered area.

- *Renovations Building C - Administrative Offices*

Renovations are for the southern half of the first floor to reconfigure offices, a community room and conference room. Exterior improvements include new windows and doors.

These renovations have no impact on existing maximum height and only marginally increase lot coverage due to the new window shade canopies that will replace existing canopies as shown on Sheet 5.1.2 and Sheet A 9.7.1. This building is along the east property line and is visible offsite.

- *Renovations Building D - Facilities Building*

This is an interior remodel to reconfigure interior office/storage.

These renovations have no impact on existing height or lot coverage. This building is nearest the west property line and not visible offsite.

- *Site Improvements - South Side of Building A (Sanctuary)*

This area is presently used for parking lot and a landscape/hardscape court. The 1999 SUP had this area shown in Phase 4 with an expanded landscape/ hardscape court at

approximately 8,250 square feet and realignment of parking spaces. The proposed request expands the court area an additional 15 feet south to approximately 11,250 square feet. It separates the area into three zones via 6-foot and 8-foot tall walls into a separate courtyard for the sanctuary, choir room and additional columbarium space. For more information refer to Sheets L2.1, L2.3, L3.1, L6.1 and L6.2.

The proposed area, including new walls, are minimally setback 70 feet from the property line. There are no SUP guidelines or standards on courtyard walls for churches. These courtyard walls are greater than the suggested minimum building setback for churches of 40 feet along public streets. This area will likely see more use than the existing or 1999 SUP approved layout. Possible concerns may be noise or light trespass to persons residing along the east side of Quail Run Road. The proposed 6-foot and 8-foot tall walls, existing perimeter landscaping, existing parking lot screen walls, and existing stipulation that all scheduled activities cease by 10:00 p.m. (with some holiday exceptions) should sufficiently mitigate possible nuisances. The proposed landscaping is desert-tolerant and like existing landscaping on the site.

- *Site Improvements - East Side of Building A (Sanctuary)*

Presently this area has a driveway that accesses the south parking lot from Quail Run Road underneath the sanctuary porte-cochere. The 1999 SUP approval had no substantive change to this driveway. The current request is to limit driveway access underneath the porte-cochere to emergency or special occasion use like holidays/funerals. The redesign modifies the driveway underneath the porte-cochere and parking spaces with a mix of concrete and asphalt. There will be additional landscaping and new pedestrian lighting.

There are no SUP guidelines or standards related to hardscaping or landscaping for churches. The SUP guideline for churches suggest parking lots are shielded with a minimum 3-foot tall wall/landscape berm to mitigate vehicle light trespass. These guidelines also suggest a 30-foot wide landscape area along local streets. This parking area is already shielded by existing 4-foot tall staggered walls along the perimeter landscape area that is not proposed to change. The width of the landscape area meets the 1999 SUP of approximately 20 feet. The proposed illumination at the property line has less illumination at the property line than allowed by the SUP guidelines. This area varies between 0.0 and 0.5 foot-candles as illustrated on Sheet E1.4. The predominant fixture is the LF ground fixture at 4 inches tall. The proposed plan uses some pole lights in the parking lot that are 14.75-feet tall, which are less than the suggested maximum pole light height of 16 feet. Unlike residential property or a sign that require a maximum foot-candle measurement of 0.5 or 0.75, respectfully, at the property line; there is no specific illumination measurement at the property line for churches. The SUP guideline is an average of 1.6 foot-candles for parking lots and an average of 5.0 foot-candles for entrance roadways, interior driveways and drop off areas.

- *Site Improvements - North Side of Buildings A & B (Sanctuary/South Side Classrooms)*

The modifications in this area are hardscaping, landscaping, adding underground drainage pipe, replacing existing light fixtures. These modifications would generally not require SUP approval. The existing buildings screen this area from offsite. For more information refer to the applicant's narrative.

- *Site Improvements - Main Plaza*

This area is located off Quail Run Road between Building A (Sanctuary), Building B (South Classrooms) and Building C (Administration Offices). This area is generally located across from Palo Verde Lane and not the homes across the street. It presently functions as outdoor space for events/gatherings and drive aisle/parking. The proposed plan would remove the existing hardscape improvements, several parking spaces, and the drive aisles to reserve this space for only pedestrian use. New elements would include new hardscaping, seating, 4-foot and 5-foot tall walls, lighting, and landscaping. Minimum setback from the property line along Quail Run Road is approximately 8 feet.

The applicant was asked to respond to the potential negative nuisances with increased use of this area. Their response is found under Minor Amendment Criteria 3 in their narrative. This includes that Palo Verde Lane is directly across from this area (not homes), walls/landscaping will be added to mitigate noise/visual impact, and the applicant voluntarily met with neighbors within 1,500 feet on October 30, 2018 with no objection to the proposed uses. Stipulation(s) can be added to limit the days/times in using this area and when lighting should be shut off. Presently, an existing stipulation requires all scheduled program activities to cease by 10:00 p.m.

There are no SUP guidelines or standards related to hardscaping, landscaping and walls for churches. The nearest wall is 5-foot tall and setback a minimum of 8 feet from the property line along Quail Run Road. As a comparison, residential standards would require no walls within the first 10-foot setback and up to 3-foot tall within the building setback (40 feet for R-43 lots and churches along a street). As described under “*Site Improvements - East Side of Building A (Sanctuary)*,” the proposed illumination at the property line has less illumination at the property line than suggested by the SUP guidelines.

- *East Edge Property Along Quail Run Road (Quail Run Road Drop Off Area)*

This part of the application refers to the proposed drop off area located within the Town’s right-of-way along Quail Run Road located just north of the main plaza. The applicant’s parking analysis addresses this drop off area (deceleration lane). It is 96 feet in length. This drop-off area is not located on the subject site. It is within the Town right-of-way. The applicant agrees to prohibit parking along its site on Quail Run Road. There is already no parking allowed on both sides of Montebello Avenue and parts of the east side of Quail Run Road. No parking along Quail Run Road adjoining the church was likely intended in 1999 based on handwritten notes on the 1999 site plan.

There are no SUP guidelines or specific Town standards for the drop off area. However, the Town Engineer bases his evaluation on professional standards he can discuss at the work study session.

- *West Edge Property Along Kiva Elementary School*

The only change in this area from the existing layout is conversion of 9 existing parking spaces near Building D (Facilities) on the west side of the site in the center of the property for unloading/loading. According to the applicant’s parking analysis, the loss of these parking spaces does not affect the ability for the site to meet its parking minimums.

- *Parking -Parking Lot*

In the present condition, there are 607 total parking spaces available for church use. 434 parking spaces are on the church property and 173 parking spaces are on the Kiva Elementary School property. Certain parking areas are restricted during certain days and times based on the major amendment approved at the church in 1999 and the addition of more shared parking in 2006 on the Kiva Elementary School property. The required church parking for the present condition is 382 parking spaces.

Based on the final build-out from the approved 1999 plans, there were 575 total parking spaces available for church use. 449 parking spaces are on the church property and 126 parking spaces are on the Kiva Elementary School property. The required church parking for the 1999 approved condition is 447 parking spaces.

Existing Stipulation 10 states “No parking on Kiva School property shall count to satisfy Valley Presbyterian Church required parking.” This typically means that the required parking total for all the buildings be satisfied on the subject site. Required parking can be based on the calculations suggested in the Special Use Permit guidelines and many times through a parking analysis that might demonstrate shared parking, existing data, or other means to support a lesser parking total than suggested by the guidelines. Not including any of the parking spaces on the Kiva Elementary School property, the present total parking spaces of 434 and the 1999 final phase total parking spaces of 449 are more than the required parking of 382 in the present condition and 447 in the 1999 final phase condition.

The required parking for the current request is 389 parking spaces. This is based on the parking analysis that uses the calculations per the Special Use Permit guidelines and the 1999 parking space approvals for square footage remaining unchanged and not part of this Minor Special Use Permit amendment. The submitted parking analysis does not consider actual parking data or shared parking among uses on the church site. The applicant did provide a snapshot of some existing parking counts in their narrative that they feel supports the existing parking usage does not exceed the available onsite parking. The Town has in the past accepted actual data and/or shared parking data to demonstrate a lower required parking calculation.

Based on the required 389 parking spaces in the parking analysis, the proposed interim and proposed last phase condition results in 2 and 34 required parking spaces, respectfully, not contained within the church property. As such, if existing data or other data is not used to support a lower required parking calculation or more parking is added, it will be necessary to remove/modify Stipulation 10 that all required parking be on the church property. The proposed interim condition results in 387 total parking spaces on the church property. The final condition results in 355 parking spaces on the church property. There is no change to the 173 shared parking spaces located on the Kiva Elementary School property.

The south parking lot improvements modify the parking space layout by removing the angled parking and adding landscape tracts. This design will prevent vehicular traffic crossing parking spaces. The parking space sizes, aisle widths and lighting conform to the existing church stipulations. There is no change to the perimeter landscaping. The landscaping meets the resort guidelines related to parking lot landscaping of having landscape islands every 100

lineal feet and shade trees. The resort guidelines are referenced since there are no Town parking lot landscape guidelines.

The application includes a request to remove the chained area in the south parking lot that generally divides this lot into two parking areas. Refer to the existing 1999 Sheets DR1.0 and DR1.2. The southernmost parking spaces are presently restricted to only ballfield use, and special church events during the weekday. This request seeks to eliminate this use separation in the south parking lot as patrons generally park close to the sanctuary and many times persons unintentionally run into these chains with their vehicle. The present and proposed interim parking lot layout design is such that a vehicle can access the southernmost parking area through the parking spaces, avoiding the chained access.

- *Exterior Lighting*

As described under site improvements, the proposed exterior light fixtures match the existing fixtures on the site. The lumens for these fixtures are generally 250 which comply or are lower than SUP guidelines. The fixture heights are generally under 2-feet tall, with building fixtures at door level and parking lot pole lights at 14.5-feet tall that are less than the 16-foot tall SUP guideline. Illumination levels meet and are mostly lower than maximum suggested SUP guidelines. There is no specific illumination measurement at the property line for churches. The SUP guideline is an average of 1.6 foot-candles for parking lots and an average of 5.0 foot-candles for entrance roadways, interior driveways and drop off areas. Most of the site perimeter has illumination readings of 0.0 foot-candles. The maximum reading is 1.7 foot-candles in one spot near the driveway leading to the porte-cochere of the sanctuary off Quail Run Road.

Minor Amendment Criteria Conformance

Planning Commission will need to take two actions related to this application request at a future meeting. First, the application request must be deemed a minor amendment pursuant to the four criteria in Section 1102.7.B of the Town Zoning Ordinance. Second, the Planning Commission must take action on the application with any relevant stipulations. This request meets the four minor amendment criteria as follows:

- 1. Change or add any uses.**

There is no change in allowable use or addition of a new use. The renovations relate to existing church/school uses.

- 2. Increase the floor area of the project by more than 5000 square feet or constitute an increase of more than 15% upon the existing or, if still under construction, approved floor area square footage of the affected SUP property, whichever is less, with any such increase to be measured cumulatively over a sixty-month period.**

The increase in floor area is under the allowable criteria. The total proposed new square footage is approximately 197 square feet. The total approved square footage is being reduced as the request eliminates approximately 9,465 square feet of new classrooms and 1,900 square feet to the sanctuary.

3. Have any material effect on the adjoining property owners that is visible, audible, or otherwise perceptible from adjacent properties that cannot be sufficiently mitigated.

Many of the described improvements will not be visible from neighboring properties or minorly modify existing building elevations. The perimeter landscaping remains intact. Areas that have more visibility include the proposed pull-out on Quail Run Road near the sanctuary which is mitigated with removing regular driveway access onto the property near that location and prohibiting on-street parking along Quail Run Road adjoining the church. Also, the site improvements at the main plaza extend closer to Quail Run Road and will likely be used more than in the past. Additional landscaping and walls around the main plaza are proposed to mitigate potential nuisances. Stipulations such as, and not limited to, day and time of use can be added or modified.

4. Change the architectural style.

The proposed addition, renovations and site improvements will be in the architectural style of the existing structures and plant palette on the church property.

Public Comment & Noticing

Mailing notification will be done in advance of the scheduled hearing to all property owners within a radius of 1,500 feet, along with a newspaper advertisement and property posting. The tentative meeting to act by the Planning Commission is March 19, 2019.

DISCUSISON POINTS

Below are some possible points of discussion for the upcoming study session:

- Provide direction on the required parking calculation.
- Discuss the proposed pull-out on Quail Run Road.
- Identify additional submittal items that may be needed to evaluate the request.
- Discuss possible stipulations.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. Vicinity Map
- B. Application/Narrative
- C. Plans
- D. Parking Analysis
- E. SUP History
- F. Draft Stipulations

- C:
- Applicant
 - Case File