



Legislation Text

File #: 19-207, Version: 1

TO: Mayor Bien-Willner and Town Council Members

FROM: Brian Dalke, Interim Town Manager
Dawn-Marie Buckland, Deputy Town Manager
Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director
George Burton, Planner

DATE: May 9, 2019

DEPARTMENT: Community Development

AGENDA TITLE:

**Consideration of Intermediate Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP-18-10).
5410 N. Scottsdale Road - Paradise Valley Medical Plaza.**

RECOMMENDATION:

Approval of Special Use Permit Amendment SUP-18-10 and Ordinance 2019-01

SUMMARY STATEMENT:

Paradise Valley Medical Plaza is requesting an amendment to their Special Use Permit (SUP) to allow for the addition of a new 9,837 square foot medical building, a new parking area, two new covered parking canopies, new signage, new landscaping, and a new screen wall.

BACKGROUND:

History and Conditions

The original Special Use Permit (SUP) was issued on June 14, 1979 and has been amended several times. The most recent amendment was approved in 2003, which added five new buildings, new parking, signage, landscaping, and lighting. The property is approximately 8.5 acres in size and is located at the southwest corner of Scottsdale Road and Jackrabbit Road.

Statement of Direction

Per the Town's ordinance, the Town Council shall issue a Statement of Direction for Intermediate SUP Amendments. A Statement of Direction is intended to provide general guidelines or project parameters as the application progresses through the Planning Commission and Town Council review. A Statement of Direction is not a final decision and shall create no vested rights to the approval of a Special Use Permit. Nor shall the applicant rely on the matters addressed in the Statement of Direction as those that may become part of an approved Special Use Permit. The Town Council approved the Paradise Valley Medical Plaza's Statement of Direction (SOD) on November 15, 2018. In summary, the SOD identifies the following:

1. Use. The SOD directs the Planning Commission to evaluate if additional changes or

measures are needed to mitigate any adverse effects created by the patient drop-off area and/or increased intensity of use.

2. Traffic, Parking, and Circulation. Attention shall be given to parking lot location, number of parking spaces, and the dimension of the parking spaces. Since a new surgical facility will be added and the new building does not have a defined break-down of how much of the building will be used for medical office or surgery facility, the Planning Commission shall evaluate the parking analysis to determine if the total number of provided parking spaces will accommodate the improvements.
3. Signage. The Planning Commission shall evaluate any proposed signage associated with these improvements. New direction signage shall meet the SUP Guidelines standards and the building signage (such as office or suite numbers) must match the current signage on the campus (in terms of size, height, and design).
4. Impact to Adjacent Uses. The Planning Commission shall evaluate any neighborhood concerns regarding noise or lighting associated with these proposed improvements.

Planning Commission Discussion

The Planning Commission reviewed this application at the December 4, 2018 work study session and December 18, 2019 public hearing. During the public hearing, the Commission modified Ordinance 2019-01 by removing the reference to prior plans that are no longer in effect and recommended approval of an alternate monument sign design, which included the property address and name of the medical plaza on top of the sign. The Commission, by a vote of 6 to 0, forwarded Ordinance 2019-01 to the Town Council with a recommendation of approval.

Town Council Discussion

The Town Council reviewed this application at the January 24, 2019 work study session. During the work study review, the Council requested the applicant provide a traffic report identifying the number of trips and the amount of traffic generated from the proposed improvements. On March 14, 2019, the Council granted the applicants request for continuance and continued the public hearing to May 9, 2019, to provide additional time for the applicant to address neighbor concerns.

Applicant Outreach

Since the continuance on March 14th, the applicant met with the neighbors three additional times. The applicant met with several neighbors on April 2, 2019 at Town Hall to discuss neighborhood concerns. For reference, enclosed is a copy of the notice that was mailed out to the neighbors regarding the April 2nd meeting and an April 5th email from Bill Cook summarizing some of the neighbors concerns and proposed changes to the plan to address the concerns. The applicant also met with several of the neighbors at the Medical Plaza on April 19th and April 29th to discuss the neighborhood concerns and changes to the plans.

Summary of Changes/Updates to the Plans

Some of the concerns raised by the neighbors include noise from deliveries, the noise from trash pick-up, the security of the medical waste area, and concern about noise and increased intensity of use from the new improvements. In response to the neighborhood concerns, the applicant:

1. Reduced the footprint of the proposed medical building from 10,000 square feet to 8,805

- square feet,
2. Relocated the patient pick-up area from the west side of the building to the south side of the building,
 3. Increased the setback of the medical building from 69' to 95' from the west property line,
 4. Will relocate the existing exterior medical waste area to a location inside the new building,
 5. Will relocate the existing trash enclosure from the west side of the campus to the north side of the campus,
 6. Will remove 5 existing parking spaces along the west property line and re-landscape the area to reduce the noise generated by these existing parking spaces,
 7. Will create a new truck loading zone with ramps at the center of the campus,
 8. Agrees to add four "No Deliveries" and one "Deliveries" signs to direct delivery vehicles to the new truck loading area,
 9. Agrees to add new landscaping (with 30 new trees) along the west property line and around the new medical building to help screen the improvements,
 10. Will add a new 8' tall screen wall next to the west property line to help screen and buffer the new medical building and parking area, and
 11. Will pay up to \$10,000 for a speed bump on Vista Drive at a location to be determined by the Town. Alternatively, and if a speed bump is not acceptable to the affected neighbors, other traffic calming measures may be used in lieu of a speed bump to help mitigate potential traffic generated by the new medical building.

SCOPE OF REQUEST:

New Medical Building (Building I)

The new medical building will be located at southwestern part of the campus. It is setback 317' from the north property line, 95' from the west property line, 234' from the south property line, and 367' from the east property line. The new building is 9,837 square feet under roof with 8,805 square feet of footprint, is 20'1" tall, and is a single-story building. Also, an existing covered parking structure will be demolished in order to accommodate the new building and parking area.

Currently, there are three surgical facilities located in the existing/northern building. The new building will be used for either surgical facilities, traditional medical offices, or a combination of both uses (depending upon the tenant that occupies the building). The new patient pick-up area will serve all surgical facilities. The patient pick-up area was relocated from the west side of the building to the south side of the building and is setback approximately 120' away from the west property line.

The new building will have a stucco finish and tile roof to match the architecture of the existing buildings on campus. Wall mounted sconces will be placed around the building and have an output of 0-foot candles measured at the property line. Also, the hours of operation of the new building will comply with the current SUP, which is limited to:

Hours of operation for the Medical Offices shall be Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. and Saturday from 8:00 a.m. to 1:00 p.m., with occasional use outside these hours limited to exigent patient treatment and as necessary by physicians and staff for work activities other than patient treatment; the surgical center shall be Monday through Friday 6:30 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., and, the recovery center shall be Monday through Friday 24 hours, with no overnight stays on Saturday or Sunday. Emergency, 24-hour care shall not be a permitted use.

New Parking

Based upon a meeting the applicant had with the neighbors on May 2, 2019, the applicant submitted updated plans with additional modifications to the parking area. The new plans identify that a total of 21 new parking spaces will be added to the site to accommodate the new building (which will increase the total parking count from 243 spaces to 264 spaces). Each parking space is 180 square feet in size, which includes the overhang area between the wheel stop and curb.

The SUP Guidelines recommend 1 space for 200 square feet of medical office and 1 space for each 2 employees plus 1 space for each surgical room. However, the new building does not have a defined break-down of how much of the building will be used for medical office. Per the SUP Guidelines for medical office, a total of 273 total parking spaces are needed to accommodate the new building and associated uses.

However, a reduction of 9 parking spaces is proposed by the applicant to address several neighborhood concerns. To help reduce the impact of noise from the garbage truck, the existing trash area will be relocated from the west side of the campus to the north side of the campus. As a result, the new trash area will remove 4 existing parking spaces. Also, due to the concern about noise generated from the use of the existing parking spaces located next to the west property line, the applicant will eliminate 5 existing space and relocate the two existing ADA parking spaces several feet to the north. The existing trash area and 5 removed parking spaces will be landscaped.

Despite the reduction in parking spaces, the applicant's parking analysis identifies that the proposed parking supply will still exceed the demand and will continue to facilitate acceptable operations at the Medical Plaza.

Four pole lights will also be placed in the new parking area. The parking lot lights match the existing light poles on campus, are 8' tall, and have an output of 0-foot candles measured at the property line. The hours of operation of the new parking lot lights will comply with the current SUP stipulation, which limits the operation of the lights from 6 a.m. to 9 p.m.

Lastly, Ordinance 2019-01 was updated to reflect the dates on the modified/updated plans. A track-change version of Ordinance 2019-01 is enclosed to identify the change in dates on the plan set.

Traffic Study

The applicant provided a Trip Generation Statement from a traffic engineering firm. The traffic report identifies that the new medical building may generate approximately 260 trips each day, with 17 trips generated during the AM peak hours and 26 trips generated in the PM peak hours.

The applicant will install a speed bump in the western drive aisle to slow down traffic on the west side of the campus. The applicant will also pay up to \$10,000 for a speed bump on Vista Drive at a location to be determined by the Town. Alternatively, and if a speed bump is not acceptable to the affected neighbors, other traffic calming measures may be used in lieu of a speed bump to help mitigate potential traffic generated by the new medical building.

Covered Parking Canopies

Two new covered parking canopies will be added to the existing parking lot. The canopies will be located at the eastern part of the campus, have a combined square footage of 3,359 square feet, and are setback 23' from the south property line (adjoining the First Southern Baptist Church) and setback 216' from the east property line (adjoining Scottsdale Road). The parking canopies are 11'

tall and are designed to match the existing covered parking structures. Three light fixtures will be placed under each parking canopy with a maximum output of 0.2-footcandles measured at the property line (the SUP Guidelines recommended a maximum output of 0.5-footcandles measured at the property line). The hours of operation of the covered parking canopy lights will comply with the current SUP stipulation, which limits the operation of the lights from 6 a.m. to 9 p.m.

Lot Coverage

The existing lot coverage is 17.19%. The new medical building and two new parking canopies will increase the lot coverage to 19.99%. The proposed lot coverage is compliant with and below the recommended maximum lot coverage of 25% per the SUP Guidelines.

Landscaping

New landscaping will be placed around the new medical building, new parking area, and along the west property line (adjoining the residential properties). The plant palette consists of native plants such as Palo Verde trees, Mesquite trees, orange jubilee, desert spoon, and aloe. No new landscaping lighting is associated with this project.

Due to the landscaping of the western trash area and the removed parking spaces, the applicant increased the amount of new landscaping. The new tree count increased from 30 to 33 trees and the shrubs/ground cover count increased from 301 to 312 plants.

Signage

5 new types of signs will be added to the campus to accommodate the new medical building and to mitigate some of the concerns identified by the neighbors. A new monument sign will be placed next to Scottsdale Road, a new tenant/directional sign will be placed next to the new medical building, tenant identification signs will be placed on the new medical building located at each office/suite, a building identification sign will be placed on the new medical building, and "No Deliveries/Deliveries" signs will be placed along the western drive isle and at the proposed truck loading area:

- *Monument Sign.* The new monument sign will be placed next to Scottsdale Road, near Building C. It's a double-faced sign that is 8' tall and 8'4" wide (with an approximate overall sign area of 67.2 square feet per side and approximately 40 square feet of sign copy per side). The sign will be painted and finished to match the buildings on campus, non-illuminated, will identify the property address, identify the name of the medical plaza, and will identify the name of 5 tenants on each side (with a total of 10 tenants identified).

The existing campus also has two wall mounted signs placed at each entrance (for a total of four existing signs that identify the name of the medical plaza). The existing signs are 3.8' tall, approximately 12 square feet in size (2' x 6'), and are externally illuminated. The combined area of the four existing identification signs is 42 square feet.

The SUP Guidelines recommend one ground sign that is no higher than 8' and no larger than 40 square feet in area at each principal entrance to the property. The new monument exceeds the recommended size limit of 40 square feet (at 62.7 square feet) and does not meet the SUP Guidelines recommendation of being located at the property entrance. However, the sign should have limited impact to the adjoining residential properties since it is located next to Scottsdale Road, will not be illuminated, and will be screened from the western residences by the existing buildings on campus.

- *Tenant/Direction Sign.* A tenant/directional sign will be located between the new medical building and the new parking area. This sign will match the existing directional signage on campus. The sign is 5' tall, 4'6" wide, 22.5 square feet in size, non-illuminated, and will identify the tenant name and associated office/suite number. The SUP Guidelines recommend that traffic and directional signs are limited to a maximum size of 12 square feet in area and a maximum height of 5' tall. The sign meets the recommended height but exceeds the recommend size limit.
- *Tenant Identification Signs.* Tenant identification signs will be placed next to each office or suite. The identification signs will match the existing signs on campus, are 1' tall and 2' wide (with an area of 2 square feet), and will identify the tenant name and associated suite number. The SUP Guidelines do not identify a recommended size or height for tenant identification signs.
- *Building Signage.* The letter "I" will be placed on the east and west elevations of as a building identification sign. This sign will not be illuminated and will match the other building identifications signs on campus in terms of color and size. The SUP Guidelines do not identify a recommended size or height for building identification signs.
- *No Deliveries/Deliveries Signs.* 4 "No Deliveries" signs will be placed next to the western drive aisle to discourage deliveries on the west side of campus. The "No Deliveries" signs are 5' tall, 2' wide, 4 square feet in size, and are non-illuminated. One "Deliveries" sign will be placed at the new truck loading area located in the center of campus. The "Deliveries" sign is 5' tall, 2' wide, 4 square feet in size, and is non-illuminated. Both the "No Deliveries" and "Deliveries" sign are compliant with the SUP Guidelines; which recommend that traffic and directional signs are limited to a maximum size of 12 square feet in area and a maximum height of 5' tall.

Screen Wall

An 8' tall masonry screen wall will be placed on or next to the western property line. As illustrated on the site plan, the screen wall will be placed on the property line of the northwestern neighbor (located at 7045 E. Jackrabbit Road) and will have a 7' separation from the two southwestern properties (located at 5311 N. Quail Run Road and 5301 N. Quail Run Road). However, the following stipulations were added the SUP to enable the screen wall to be placed on the west property line (if the neighbors agree to do so) and to ensure a minimum finish on the wall:

- The 8' tall screen wall as depicted on Sheet A1.1 and Sheet A1.2 may be: 1) constructed in accordance with the approved plans, or 2) constructed on the west property line for portions of the wall for which the Medical Plaza Owner has received written permission of the neighboring property owner.
- Regarding the 8' tall screen wall as depicted on Sheet A1.1 and Sheet A1.2, the Medical Plaza Owner's side of the wall shall be either split face or integral color block or shall have a finish of stucco and paint, as determined by the Medical Plaza Owner. Each neighbor's side of the wall shall be finished with stucco and paint unless the Medical Plaza Owner and the neighbor agree otherwise.

The applicant also provided a Potential Traffic Noise Impact Assessment prepared by an acoustical consultant. The assessment identifies that the new medical building may increase traffic noise by approximately 1.4 decibels. However, with the 8' tall screen wall, the potential traffic noise may decrease by approximately 1.9 decibels.

DISCUSSION:

Zoning Ordinance Compliance

The proposed improvements are consistent with the existing medical office use. The new medical building, covered parking canopies, signage, landscaping, and screen wall will be designed in accordance with the existing architectural style of the SUP and meet the recommended setbacks, heights, and lot coverage standards.

General Plan

The proposed improvements are consistent with Section 2.1.2 of the Town's General Plan which encourages the continued revitalization and improvement of the Town's Special Use Permit properties while protecting the adjacent residential neighborhoods.

Public Comment

In accordance with the Town Code, the applicant held a citizen review/neighborhood meeting on December 6, 2018. A copy of the meeting minutes is enclosed for reference. The applicant also notified the neighboring properties of the December 18, 2018 Planning Commission public hearing in accordance with the public hearing process. Staff received comment from several neighbors regarding the proposed improvements, expressing concerns such as noise, increase intensity of use, traffic, etc. A copy of the public comment emails/correspondence, the December 18th Planning Commission meeting minutes, and the April 2, 2019 neighborhood meeting notice are enclosed for review.

INTERMEDIATE AMENDMENT CRITERIA:

An Intermediate Amendment to a Special Use Permit shall include any proposal which does not:

1. Change or add any uses; or
2. Increase the floor area of the project by more than 40% upon the existing or, if still under construction, approved floor area square footage of the affected SUP property, with any such increase to be measured cumulatively over a sixty-month period; or
3. Have any significant material effect on the adjoining property owners that is visible, audible, or otherwise perceptible from adjacent properties that cannot be sufficiently mitigated.

The Intermediate SUP Amendment process applies to this project due to the amount of square footage that is being added. The new medical building is 9,838 square feet and the covered parking canopies have a combined area of 3,359 square feet. Since a Minor SUP Amendment limits the amount of additional square footage to a maximum of 5,000 square feet, this application must be processed as an Intermediate SUP Amendment.

ACTION:

During the public hearing, Council will either approve, approve with stipulations, deny, or continue the

application for further review.

ATTACHMENT(S):

1. Application
2. Vicinity Map & Aerial Photo
3. Project Narrative & Plans (Updated May 6, 2019)
4. Draft Ordinance 2019-01 (Updated May 6, 2019)
5. Trip Generation Statement prepared by CivTech
6. April 24, 2019 Supplemental Parking Analysis prepared by CivTech
7. May 1, 2019 Supplemental Parking Analysis prepared by CivTech
8. Potential Traffic Noise Impact Assessment prepared by Acoustical Consulting Services
9. Statement of Direction (SOD)
10. Existing PV Medical Center SUP Stipulations
11. SUP Guidelines
12. SOD Consideration Points
13. Citizen Review/Neighborhood Meeting Notice & Meeting Minutes
14. Public Comment & Correspondence
15. December 18, 2018 Planning Commission Meeting Minutes
16. March 4, 2019 Request for Continuance Letter from Applicant
17. Notice for Second Neighborhood Meeting on April 2, 2019
18. April 5th Email from Bill Cook Summarizing Neighbors Concerns
19. Paradise Valley Medical Plaza Changes Since March 14 Meeting provided by Applicant (Updated May 6, 2019)
20. Power Point Presentation