



## Legislation Text

---

File #: 20-213, Version: 1

---

**TO: Chair and Planning Commission**

**FROM: Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director  
Paul Michaud, Planning Manager  
George Burton, Senior Planner**

**DATE: May 19, 2020**

**DEPARTMENT:** Community Development

**AGENDA TITLE:**

Consideration of a Minor Special Use Permit Amendment  
St. Barnabas Church (SUP-20-02). 6715 N. Mockingbird Lane

**REQUEST**

St. Barnabas Church is requesting a Minor Special Use Permit (SUP) amendment to renovate and replace the parking lot/parking area, update the site drainage and retention, replace and add new signage, re-landscape the campus, improve the playground area with a new solar panel shade structure and fencing, add new trellis shade canopies with solar panels, replace and add new site lighting, and replace a covered parking canopy with a solar panel parking canopy.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

RECOMMENDATION A:

It is recommended the Planning Commission deem the requested amendment to the St. Barnabas Church Special Use Permit a Minor Amendment per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance.

RECOMMENDATION B:

It is recommended that the Planning Commission approve the St. Barnabas Church Minor Special Use Permit Amendment to renovate and replace the parking lot/parking area, update the site drainage and retention, replace and add new signage, re-landscape the campus, improve the playground area with a new shade structure and fencing, add new trellis shade canopies with solar panels, replace and add new site lighting, and replace a covered parking canopy with a solar panel parking canopy, subject to the following stipulations:

1. All improvements to the site shall be in substantial compliance with the project narrative and plans:
  - a. Narrative, pages 1-3, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 4, 2020;
  - b. St. Barnabas Church SUP Civil Variance Requests letter, pages 1 - 3, prepared by Cypress Civil and dated February 10, 2020;

- c. St. Barnabas Church Storm Water Retention in Parking Lot letter, pages 1 - 2, prepared by Cypress Civil and dated March 16, 2020;
- d. Overall Grading & Drainage Exhibit, Sheet 1 of 1, Prepared by Cypress Civil and dated March 16, 2020;
- e. Overall Grading & Drainage Exhibit Alternate 1 - West Parking, Sheet 1 of 1, Prepared by Cypress Civil and dated March 16, 2020;
- f. Preliminary Grading & Drainage Plan for Saint Barnabas on the Desert, Sheets C1 - C5, prepared by Cypress Civil and dated May 4, 2020;
- g. Preliminary Grading & Drainage Plan (Alternate 1 - West Parking) for Saint Barnabas on the Desert, Sheets C1 - C5, prepared by Cypress Civil and dated May 4, 2020;
- h. Site Plan, Sheet L1, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 1, 2020;
- i. Site Plan - Parking and Shade Design Alternate, Sheet L1.1, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
- j. Hardscape Plan, Sheet L2, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
- k. Landscape Plan, Sheet L3, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
- l. Fountain Plan, Sheet L4, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
- m. Landscape Details, Sheet L5, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
- n. Parking Sections, Sheet L6, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
- o. Head to Head Parking Summary prepared by Cypress Civil and dated May 8, 2020;
- p. Shade Structure Site Plan, Sheet A-3.1, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and Oculus Studio, and dated December 6, 2019;
- q. Shade Structure Elevations, Sheet A-3.2, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and Oculus Studio, and dated December 6, 2019;
- r. Shade Structure Site Plan, Sheet A-3.3, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and Oculus Studio, and revised dated March 17, 2020;
- s. St. Barnabas - View of Play Area with Fabric Shade Structure without Trees perspective prepared by Chris Winter & Associates and dated April 3, 2020;
- t. St. Barnabas - View of Play Area with Fabric Shade Structure with Trees perspective prepared by Chris Winter & Associates and dated April 3, 2020;
- u. Lighting Fixture Schedule, E0, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- v. Existing/Demo Electrical Plan, E1, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- w. Proposed Electrical Plan, E2, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- x. Existing Photometric Plan, E3, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- y. Proposed Photometric Plan, E4, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- z. Light Fixture Cut Sheets, E5, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;

- aa. Light Fixture Cut Sheets, E6, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
  - bb. Light Fixture Cut Sheets, E7, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
  - cc. Light Fixture Cut Sheets, E8, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
  - dd. Proposed Electrical Plan - Perimeter/Interior Lighting Diagram Lighting Supplement, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated May 2, 2020.
  - ee. Exterior Signage Sign Location, Sheet 1.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
  - ff. Exterior Signage Monument, Sheet 2.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
  - gg. Exterior Signage Detail, Sheet 3.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
  - hh. Exterior Signage Monument, Sheet 4.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
  - ii. Exterior Signage Directionals, Sheet 5.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
  - jj. Exterior Signage Monument, Sheet 6.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
  - kk. Exterior Signage Detail, Sheet 7.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
  - ll. St. Barnabas Supplemental Exhibition - Directional Signage, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated March 27, 2020;
  - mm. February 3, 2020 St. Barnabas Church pre-application for landscape and parking lot improvements letter prepared by Rector Jim Clark; and
  - nn. January 21, 2020 Storm Water Drainage at Saint Barnabas letter prepared by Richard Frazee.
2. Prior to issuance of a building or grading permit associated with these proposed grading and drainage improvements; St. Barnabas Church shall obtain and provide the Town of Paradise Valley with a copy of any applicable drainage easements or similar mechanisms with the neighboring property owner(s) as outlined in the January 21, 2020 Storm Water Drainage at St. Barnabas Letter prepared by Five Star Development;
3. In accordance with Crime Prevention Through Environment Design (CPTED) standards to provide visibility and increase safety:
- a. All new shrubs and plants in the parking lots must be maintained at a maximum height of 3' tall;
  - b. All new tree canopies will be maintained to hang no lower than 6' above grade; and
  - c. All existing trees and shrubs must be pruned and maintained to provide visibility and discourage places of concealment;
4. All exterior lighting shall operate in accordance with the Proposed Electrical Plan Perimeter/Interior Lighting Diagram Lighting Supplement, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Christ Winters & Associates, and dated May 2, 2020. In summary, the perimeter site

lighting shall operate from dusk to 10 p.m., with the exception of special events and services; at which time the perimeter lighting will shut off at the conclusion of the event. For security purposes, the interior lighting located between the buildings may operate from dusk to dawn. However, the interior lighting level shall be reduced to 50% after 10 p.m.

5. New internal directional or wayfinding signs shall comply with the SUP Guidelines and must be reviewed and approved by the Town Manager or Designee;
6. If the alternative parking/site plan is used (Site Plan - Parking and Shade Design Alternate Sheet L1.1 and the Preliminary Grading & Drainage Plan Alternate 1 - West Parking for Saint Barnabas on the Desert Sheets C1 - C5), an updated hardscape plan(s) and landscape plan (s) must be provided to the Town for review. The alternate hardscape plan(s) and landscape plan(s) must be reviewed and approved by the Town Manager or Designee prior to issuance of any permits;
7. If the primary parking/site plan is used (Site Plan Sheet L1.1 and the Preliminary Grading & Drainage Plan for Saint Barnabas on the Desert Sheets C1 - C5), an updated electrical plan and photometric plan shall be provided for Town review. The updated electric plan and photometric plan shall be reviewed and approved by the Town Manager or Designee prior to issuance of any permits;
8. The drywells on campus shall be maintained and cleaned on a regular basis. Drywells shall be inspected after rain events totaling 0.5" or greater to ensure they are functioning properly to allow storm water to dissipate and are kept free of debris. Drywells shall be inspected annually and maintained as recommended by a drywell maintenance contractor. Annual maintenance records shall be kept of file by the property owner and made available to the Town upon request;
9. All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by the Minor Amendment SUP-20-02; and
10. The property owner and Town shall sign and record a Waiver of Rights and Remedies agreement under A.R.S. § 12 1134 (Proposition 207 Waiver) in the form provided by the Town Attorney within 10 calendar days of the approval of this amendment to the Special Use Permit.

## **BACKGROUND**

### History

Saint Barnabas Church was established in 1953. The Town annexed the Church in 1964. The original Special Use Permit was issued in 1974 and has been amended several times. The most recent amendment was approved in 2012 for modifications to the exterior lighting and the replacement of an existing ramada with a new ramada.

### Planning Commission Discussion

The Planning Commission reviewed this application at the March 3<sup>rd</sup> work study session and the April 7<sup>th</sup> public hearing. During the April 7<sup>th</sup> public hearing, the Commission continued the hearing to May 19<sup>th</sup> and requested or identified the following:

1. Parking space. The Commission identified that all the parking spaces must meet the 180

square foot (sq ft), 9' wide x 20' long standard.

2. Drainage. A stipulation must be added identifying that the dry wells will be cleaned and maintained.
3. Directional Signs. The Commission preferred direction sign Option B, with details/cut sheets to be provided and an updated photometric plan to include the direction sign lighting
4. Playground Canopy. The Commission was agreeable to providing two options for the playground canopy (both a solar roofed canopy or a fabric covered canopy).
5. Parking Lot Light Poles. The applicant must evaluate if parking lot light poles in the northeast parking area can be reduced in height. The applicant was directed to:
  - a. Provide section plans of this area (one from the north boundary/area and another from east boundary/area) showing the neighboring fence wall, the proposed landscaping, and the proposed light pole(s).
  - b. Provide a plan or graphic identifying which fixtures are "perimeter" and which fixture are "interior" to identify which lights are subject to the different time restrictions.

For reference, during the March 3<sup>rd</sup> work study review, the Commission requested or identified the following:

1. Parking Lot. Update the parking spaces to meet the 180 sq ft size and 9' width. The Commission encouraged that the applicant modify more of the parking spaces to meet these above size requirements.
2. Drainage. The Commission was in agreement with the request to deviate from the ponding requirement, but inquired if additional options could be identified.
3. Directional Signs at the North and South Exits. The Commission requested that the applicant reduce the size/area of the directional signs to meet the 12 sq ft maximum size limit. Also, the Commission requested that the address numbers be added to one of the monument signs or one of the directional signs.
4. Identification Sign. The Commission requested that the applicant provide documentation identifying if Five Star is in agreement with the proposed ID sign located at the southeast part of the property.
5. New Cross on the back of the Sanctuary Building. The Commission was in agreement with the applicant's request for a larger cross. The Commission asked the applicant to identify size and height of the new cross and provide documentation identifying if Five Star has any issues with the new cross on the Sanctuary Building.
6. Landscaping. The Commission requested that the applicant provide a plan showing where the new landscaping can and cannot meet Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) standards.
7. Playground Canopy. The Commission requested that the applicant lower the height of the canopy and modify the illumination hours of the playground canopy (e.g. dusk to 8:30 p.m.).

The applicant addressed the latest comments from April 7<sup>th</sup> and incorporated the changes into the plans and project narrative.

### Parking Lot Renovation

The existing parking lot will be repaved with new asphalt and restriped in order to improve circulation and safety. The applicant identified that they wanted to maintain the existing size of the parking spaces; in which the size for the 60-degree parking spaces are 23' long x 8'6" wide (195.5 sq ft) and the size for the 90-degree parking spaces are 18' long x 8'6" wide (153 sq ft). However, the Town

Zoning Ordinance identifies a minimum parking space size of 180 sq ft (which is typically a 20' long by 9' wide parking space).

During the public meeting, the Commission requested that the applicant update all the parking spaces to meet the 9' wide x 20' long (180 sq ft) standard. In response to this direction, the applicant provided two parking options. Both options resulted in all parking spaces to have a minimum width of 9' and resulted in the majority of spaces meeting or exceeding the 20' length. Also, per the last Major SUP Amendment in 2003, the parking study identified a minimum of 203 required parking spaces. The existing and proposed parking count exceeds the minimum number of parking spaces.

- Parking Plan Option 1. The first parking plan will increase the parking count from 306 existing total parking spaces (with 294 regular spaces and 12 accessible spaces) to a total of 314 parking spaces (with 301 regular spaces and 13 accessible spaces). This plan has 149 60-degree parking spaces and 175 90-degree parking spaces. 80% of the spaces meet the 9' wide x 20' long standard. These spaces abut landscape or walkway areas which allow the vehicle to "overhang" into the landscape/walkway area. The remaining 20% (or 64 parking spaces) are head to head spaces which are 9' wide x 19' long (or 171 sq ft).
- Alternate Parking Plan. The alternate parking plan will increase the parking count from 306 existing total parking spaces to 362 parking spaces (with 349 regular spaces and 13 accessible spaces). With this plan, all the parking spaces were reconfigured to 90-degree spaces. Due to the reconfiguration, many of the landscape areas were reduced in size which results in a reduction in landscaping. A stipulation was added to identify that if the alternate parking plan is used, the applicant must provide an updated landscape plan for Town Manager or Designee approval.

82% of the spaces meet the 9' wide x 20' long standard. These spaces abut landscape or walkway areas which allow the vehicle to "overhang" into the landscape/walkway area. The remaining 18% (or 64 parking spaces) are head to head spaces which are 9' wide x 19' long (or 171 sq ft).

- Ingress/Egress. The applicant proposes no changes to the location of the three ingress/egress points along Mockingbird Lane. A minimum drive aisle of 12' wide is required for emergency vehicles. The entrance and two exits vary in width from 12' wide to 26' wide. Also, all internal drive aisles are 24' wide. Since the Town does not have an isle standard, the Town utilizes the City of Scottsdale standard which recommends a minimum width of 24'.
- Landscaping. The SUP Guidelines recommend a 3' tall wall or landscape buffer to screen parking lots from a public street and a 40' wide landscape area adjacent to residentially zoned property. However, the applicant is utilizing existing conditions by: 1) maintaining the existing 3' tall wall along the west property line, 2) re-configuring and re-landscaping the parking medians, and 3) adding new landscaping along the north and east property lines. Please reference the "New Landscape" section below for more detail.
- Lighting. New parking lot lights will be placed in the parking medians and parking areas. Please reference the "Site Lighting" section below for more detail.

Although, staff recommends that all the parking spaces meet the 180 sq ft size limit, both parking

plans/options have more than 203 parking spaces that meet the 180 sq ft standard (as recommended by the 2003 parking study). Staff seeks Planning Commission's input regarding the applicants request to maintain 64 smaller sized 90-degree parking spaces (9' wide and 19' long at 171 sq ft in area).

### Drainage and Retention Improvements

The applicant provided preliminary grading and drainage plans to address the two proposed parking lot layouts/options. Both parking layouts/options maintain the same drainage patterns and ponding levels.

The proposed improvements for either parking lot layout/option will maintain the existing drainage scheme. The first-flush retention volume is retained within the parking lot and adjacent landscape areas, while the larger storm event outfall is conveyed off-site via existing drainage patterns to the Five Star Development main channel area through a new storm drainpipe. The existing fire lane at the rear/east end of the property will be changed from asphalt to decomposed granite to help decrease the amount of impervious surface on the site. Retention basins will also be placed along the north, east, and southern parts of the campus. However, portions of retention basins which are located at the perimeter of the campus will encroach onto the neighboring Five Star property. Five Star Development provided a letter identifying that they will work with the church to obtain any applicable drainage easements or similar mechanisms as needed (please reference the enclosed January 21, 2020 letter from Five Star Development). A stipulation has been added to identify that these easements or mechanisms shall be in place prior to issuance of a building or grading permit.

Portions of the parking lot water depth do not meet the Town's Storm Drainage Design Manual standards; which identifies a maximum ponding limit of 6". This means that there may be up to 9" of ponding in the rear parking areas during a storm event. The original submittal identified ponding varying from 8.5" to 12". However, in response to Commission's discussion during the work study session, the applicant raised the inlet of the drywells three to four inches in order to reduce the ponding to no more than 9". A stipulation has also been added to identify that the drywells must be maintained and cleaned on a regular basis.

Staff is still concerned that the excess ponding may impede parking/pedestrian accessibility and recommends that the property meet the Town's Storm Drainage Design Manual requirements. However, since the project is not changing the overall layout nor adding additional parking area/surface, there is limited opportunity to comply with the new storm water storage requirements other than adding underground storage tanks and additional drywells. As a result, the applicant is requesting a deviation from this requirement and has provided a letter from the church identifying they are aware of and agreeable to the fact that storm water in the parking lot may impede parking and pedestrian accessibility (please reference the enclosed February 3, 2020 letter from Saint Barnabas Church).

### Signage

The Church will replace its two existing monument signs with two new monument signs, add two new directional signs, add a new site ID sign, and add a cross on the back of the Sanctuary building:

- **Monument Signs.** There are two existing wall mounted monument signs located at the north and south side of the central/main church entrance. These signs are externally illuminated and less than 3' tall. The existing signs and portion of wall they are attached to will be

removed and replaced with two free standing signs. The new monuments will be single faced, 8' tall by 4' wide (with a total area of 32 sq ft), back-light with halo-illuminated push thru, and will be setback approximately 6' from the front property line adjoining Mockingbird Lane. The monument signs will be illuminated from dusk to 10 p.m. and will have an output of approximately 0.1 foot-candles measured at the front property line.

The proposed monument signs are compliant with the SUP Guidelines. The SUP Guidelines recommend one ground sign no higher than 8' tall and no larger than 32 sq ft at each principal entrance to the property. The church has three principal entrances along Mockingbird Lane and is placing two monuments next to the central entrance. The sign illumination is also compliant with Town Code, since the 0.1 foot-candle output is less than the maximum limit of 0.75 foot-candles and uses opaque faced letters which will shield the light source per code.

- **Directional Signs.** A directional sign will be placed at the north and the south exits. The new directional signs are aluminum fabricated pans that will be placed on a new 4' tall wall. The new signs are wall mounted, are single faced, have a height of 4' tall, externally illuminated, setback approximately 4' from the front property line, and have a sign copy area of 11.9 sq ft (2'6" tall by 4'9" wide). These signs will be illuminated from dusk to 10 p.m. and have an output of 0.2 foot-candles measured at the property line. They are compliant with the Town's lighting requirements since the output is less than 0.75 foot-candles measured at the property line and uses opaque faced letters which will shield the light source

The SUP Guidelines recommend that traffic and directional signs located within the site shall not exceed 12 sq ft in area and a maximum height of 5' tall. The proposed directional signs meet the size and height requirement but are not located within the site.

- **Identification Sign.** The applicant is proposing to place an identification sign near the southeastern part of the campus. The ID sign is single faced, 8' tall by 4' wide (with a total area of 32 sq ft), non-illuminated, and will be setback approximately 50' from the east/nearest property line. The SUP Guidelines do not address ID signs. However, this sign is compliant with the recommended size and height limits of a monument sign (with a maximum height of 8' tall and maximum area of 32 sq ft). In essence, this sign is functioning as monument sign that is facing the new Five Star Development.

Per the Commission's request, the applicant provided documentation from Five Star Development identifying that they do not have any concerns with the proposed sign. A copy of the March 12, 2020 letter from Five Star Development is attached for reference.

- **Building Sign.** An aluminum cross will be placed on the east/rear part of the existing sanctuary building. The cross will have a maximum size of 12' tall by 6' wide and is not illuminated. The existing sanctuary building is 31'6" tall and is setback approximately 130' from the east property line. The cross will be placed several feet below the top of the parapet (with an approximate height of 28'5" tall).

### New Landscaping

New landscaping will be placed in the parking medians, along the drive aisles, along the entryway and exits adjoining Mockingbird Lane, around the existing memorial garden, and along the north and east property lines. 111 new trees and 15,318 shrubs/ground covering plants will be placed on the

campus. The palette includes, but is not limited to, Blue Palo Verde trees, Velvet Mesquite trees, Arizona Ash trees, Oak trees, Desert Hackberry, Hop Bush, Creosote, Superstition Mallow, Bursage, Desert Spoon, and Desert Marigold. Landscape lighting will also use used to highlight the new landscaping and illuminate pathways. There are no specific landscape requirements or guidelines internal to a church site.

The Town Code, 1996 Landscape Guidelines, and/or SUP Guidelines provide minimum tree and shrub sizes and numbers along the public right-of-way. The application request proposes no substantial changes to the landscaping within the Mockingbird Lane right-of-way. This landscaping was approved in prior SUP amendments. The guidelines suggest at least 21 to 26 trees, with 20% being Ironwood trees along the street frontage. The Town Code requires a minimum 15-gallon size for trees. The existing trees are mature and well larger than 15 gallon in size, with currently about 17 trees. The trees along Mockingbird Lane are mostly Palo Verde with a few Ironwood trees. The guidelines suggest at least 32 shrubs along Mockingbird Lane along the church property. There are presently about 100 mature shrubs. The SUP Guidelines suggest a 50' wide landscape tract along the street frontage of Mockingbird Lane. The existing approved condition from a prior SUP amendment has no landscape tract on the private property due to the parking area drive aisle, but the existing landscape tract within the right-of-way is approximately 20' wide.

The 1996 Landscape Guidelines and SUP Guidelines provide minimum landscape guidelines for parking areas. This includes 3' tall screening of parking spaces, 25% of the parking areas have landscaping, a recommendation of one canopy tree per 10 parking spaces, and no parking space more than 50' away from a canopy tree. The parking areas comply with the screening guidelines and are in substantial compliance with the other parking area guidelines.

The Chief of Police also recommended that the landscaping be maintained in compliance with Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) standards. CPTED identifies that shrubs and bushes should be maintained at maximum height of 3' tall and tree canopies shall be trimmed to hang no lower than 6' above the ground to provide visibility and increase safety. During the March 3<sup>rd</sup> work session, the Commission requested that the applicant update their landscape plan to identify where they can and cannot meet the CPTED standards. As a result, the applicant added the following note to their plan, "All new landscape in parking lots will be maintained at 3' high max. All tree canopies will be maintained at 6' from grade. All existing trees and shrubs will be pruned and maintained to allow visibility and discourage places of concealment." A stipulation was also added to identify this landscape maintenance requirement.

Also, the applicant provided an alternate parking plan which will affect the landscaping and hardscape. The applicant noted that the alternate parking plan will result in some loss of landscaping (with a 22% reduction in the parking landscape area due to the reconfigured parking/landscape islands). Since an alternate landscape/hardscape plan was not provided, a stipulation was added which requires the applicant to submit an update hardscape/landscape plan for Town Manager or Designee review and approval prior to issuance of any permits.

#### New Canopies

With this improvement, the applicant is proposing to replace the existing playground canopy with a new canopy, add three new covered walkway canopies between several of the existing buildings, and replace the rear parking canopy with a new canopy:

- **Playground Canopy.** The playground area is located at the northwestern part of the campus. The existing canopy will be removed and replaced with a new canopy. The applicant provided two canopy options - a solar roofed canopy and a fabric shade canopy:

**Solar Roofed Canopy.** The new playground canopy is a painted steel shade structure with a solar panel roof. It is 2,385 sq ft in size, 22'2" tall from finished grade, and setback 68' from the north property line and setback 234' from the west property line. It has four light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0 foot-candles measured at the north/nearest property line. The lighting on the playground canopy may be illuminated from dusk to 8:30 p.m., with the exception of special events or services where the illumination will continue until the conclusion of the event.

The new playground canopy is compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum height of 24' tall, a minimum setback of 60' from a residentially zoned property, and a maximum light output of 0.1 foot-candles adjoining residential lots.

Per the Commission's request from the March 3<sup>rd</sup> work study session, the applicant reduced the height and hours of illumination of the playground canopy. Originally, the playground canopy was 23'2" tall and illuminated from dusk to 10 p.m. The applicant reduced the height to 22'2" tall and reduced the hours of illumination from dusk to 8:30 p.m.

**Fabric Shade Canopy.** The new playground canopy is a painted steel shade structure with a fabric roof (composed of two fabric sails). It is 2,385 square feet in size, 22'2" tall from finished grade, and setback 68' from the north property line and setback 234' from the west property line. It has four pole light fixtures that will be placed underneath the canopy (two 16' tall light poles under each fabric sail/canopy). The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0 foot-candles measured at the north/nearest property line. The lighting on the playground canopy may be illuminated from dusk to 8:30 p.m., with the exception of special events or services where the illumination will continue until the conclusion of the event.

The new playground canopy is compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum height of 24' tall, a minimum setback of 60' from a residentially zoned property, and a maximum light output of 0.1 foot-candles adjoining residential lots.

- **Walkway Canopy.** Three walkway canopies will be placed between the Children's Center, Hutton Hall, and Learning Center buildings. The new walkway canopies are painted steel shade structures with solar panel roofs:
  - Canopy 3A is located next to the Children's Center building, is approximately 13' tall from finished grade, approximately 677 sq ft in size, and is setback 114' from the north property line and 288' from the west property line. It has four light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0 foot-candles measured at the north/nearest property line. The lighting on the canopy will be illuminated from dusk to dawn, with the lighting levels reduced to 50% after 10 p.m.

- Canopy 3B is located next to the Learning building, is approximately 12' tall from finished grade, approximately 1,015 square feet in size, and is setback 220' from the north property line and 288' from the west property line. It has six light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0 foot-candles measured at the north/nearest property line. The lighting on the canopy will be illuminated from dusk to dawn, with the lighting levels reduced to 50% after 10 p.m.
- Canopy 3C is located next to the Hutton Hall building, is approximately 13' tall from finished grade, approximately 843 sq ft in size, and is setback 167' from the north property line and 288' from the west property line. It has eight light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0 foot-candles measured at the north/nearest property line. The lighting on the canopy will be illuminated from dusk to dawn, with the lighting levels reduced to 50% after 10 p.m.

The new walkway canopies are compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum height of 24' tall, a minimum setback of 60' from a residentially zoned property, and a maximum light output of 0.5 foot-candles adjoining residential lots.

- **Parking Canopy.** The existing parking canopy located at the southeastern part of the campus will be removed and replaced with a new canopy. The new parking canopy is a painted steel shade structure with a solar panel roof. It is 3,278 sq ft in size, 17" tall from finished grade, and setback 52' from the east property line and setback 143' from the south property line. It has eight light fixtures that will be mounted underneath the canopy. The light source is recessed inside each light fixture, has a color temperature of 2700K, an output of 0.2 foot-candles measured at the east/nearest property line. The lighting on the parking canopy will be illuminated from dusk to 10 p.m., with the exception of special events or services where the illumination will continue until the conclusion of the event.

The new parking canopy is compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum height of 24' tall, a minimum setback of 60' from a residentially zoned property, and a maximum light output of 0.5 foot-candles adjoining residential lots.

The replacement and addition of the new canopies result in an additional 4,922 sq ft of floor area. The lot coverage will increase from 16.18% to 17.38%; which is below the recommended lot coverage limit of 25% per the SUP Guidelines.

### Site Improvements

A new outdoor kitchen, water feature, new or resurface paths, and fencing will be placed on campus:

- **Outdoor Kitchen.** A new outdoor kitchen will be placed internal to the site behind the Hutton Hall building. It is a 3' tall L-shaped countertop with two barbeques.
- **Water Feature.** A new water feature will be placed between the existing labyrinth and the fire lane in the rear of the site. It is a circular feature that is approximately 2' tall, 5' in diameter,

and a 16” deep basin. Underwater light fixtures will be placed in the basin.

- Paths. Many of the existing pathways will be resurfaced with concrete pavers. A new paver drop-off area will also be placed near the east side of the playground area.
- Fencing. New fencing will be placed around the playground. The playground enclosure is a mixture of two fence types and will tie into the existing Children’s Center building. A 6’ tall metal slat fence will be placed along the west and east sides of the play area and a 6’ tall combo view fence (with a 36” of masonry stucco wall on the bottom and a 36” perforated metal panel fence on top) will be placed along the north side of the play area.
- Stanchion and Chain. A 4’ tall stanchion and chain “gate” will be placed at the north and south ends of the stabilized decomposed granite fire lane (which is located at the rear/east part of the property). This will help keep the internal traffic away from the existing memorial garden and labyrinth area while enabling emergency service vehicles to access the rear part of the campus.
- Pony Walls. Four pony walls will be placed along Mockingbird Lane. Two new walls will be placed at the entrance next to the new monument signs and a new wall will be placed at each exit. The two walls at the entrance are approximately 33’ long, 4’ tall, and setback 2’ from west/front property line. The new walls placed at the north and south exists are approximately 39’ long, 4’ tall, and setback 2’ from west/front property line.

These new pony walls will be placed partially behind an existing site wall and are 1’ taller than the existing wall. The additional height is intended to be an architectural feature that provides variation. However, staff recommends that these walls match the 3’ height and the color of the existing fence wall along Mockingbird Lane.

- Due to the improvements on the Five Star property and the proposed landscape improvement on the church campus, the existing 3’ walls at the north and south property lines will be removed.

### Site Lighting

New parking lot, landscape, pathway, and building lighting will be placed around campus to improve on-site visibility, wayfinding, and meet life safety requirements. Currently, there are 48 existing light poles on campus that are 12’ tall. In 2012, the church received a Minor SUP Amendment that allowed for the replacement and addition of new pole lights on campus. Although the lighting from the Minor Amendment was not implemented, it allowed for a total of 70 light poles with a maximum height of 12’ tall. The applicant now requests the following lighting improvements:

- Pole Lights. 61 new pole lights will be placed in the parking lot and around the walkways (fixtures L1 - L4 and L19 noted on Sheet E0). The height varies from 12’ to 16’ tall above the adjoining finished grade and are setback a minimum of 40’ from the nearest property line. The poles lights have a Radean Post Top (with the light source recessed into the hood of the fixture) and a color temperature of 2700K. The pole lights are compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum height of 16’ tall and a minimum setback matching the height of the light pole.

Due to neighbor concerns regarding the parking lot lights located in the northeast part of the campus, the Commission asked the applicant to lower height of the 16' tall pole light in this area and to provide a section plan showing the neighboring fence wall, the proposed landscaping, and the proposed light pole(s) for evaluation. In response to Commission's request, the applicant lowered the height of the parking lot poles to 12' tall in the northeastern and perimeter parts of the parking lot. A total of 22 parking lot poles have been reduced in height from 16' tall to 12' tall (please reference Sheet E2 Proposed Electrical Plan). However, the applicant only provided updated electric plans for one of the two parking layouts (the alternate layout/option was provided). The applicant indicated that the location and output of the two plans should be similar. As a result, a stipulation has been added identifying that if the applicant uses the primary or first option, an updated electrical plan and photometric shall be provide for Town Manager review and approval prior to issuance of any permits.

The applicant also provided sections of the northeast part of the parking lot to show the new pole lights in relation to the neighboring properties in this area. The applicant also met with the neighbors on May 6<sup>th</sup> and provided a lighting demonstration of the proposed Radean light fixture.

- **Wall Mounted Lights.** 34 wall mounted lights will be placed around the existing buildings (fixtures L5, L6, L7, L12, and L13 on the Sanctuary, Hutton Hall, Children's Center, Learning Center, and Sean's Place buildings per Sheet E2). 26 of the fixtures are exterior ceiling mounted lights and the remaining 8 are wall mounted lights. The light source is recessed within each fixture and the color temperature varies from 2700K to 3000K.
- **Surface Mounted Lights.** 73 surface mounted lights will be placed on the existing trellis, the existing covered walkway, the new solar playground canopy, the new solar walkway canopies, and the new solar parking canopy (fixtures L8, L9, L10, L11, L14, and L15 noted on Sheet E2). The light source is recessed within each fixture and the color temperature is 2700K.
- **Recessed Mounted Lights.** 28 recessed lights will be placed along the eaves and above the doorways of the existing Gift Shop building, the existing Music Center building, and the existing Sean's Place building (fixture L11 noted on Sheet E2). The light source is recessed within the fixture and has a color temperature of 2700K.
- **Ground Mounted Lights.** 60 ground mounted lights will be placed in the landscape median of the center entrance and around the rear courtyard/memorial garden area (fixtures L16 and L18 on Sheet E2). 53 up-light will be used to illuminate the landscaping and 7 bollard lights will be used to illuminate the existing labyrinth. The light source of the landscape up-lights is recessed in the fixture and has a color temperature of 2700K. The bollard lights are 36" tall, with the light source recessed inside the hood of the fixture, and has a color temperature of 3000K.
- **Tree Mounted Lights.** 12 tree mounted down-lights will placed in trees throughout the campus (fixture L17 on Sheet E2). The light source is recessed within the fixture, the light is directed downward, has a color temperature of 2700K, and will be limited to a maximum height of 18' tall.
- **Output of Proposed Lighting.** The photometric plan identifies a maximum output of 0.2 foot-

candles measured at the property line for the proposed exterior lighting. The proposed lighting is compliant with the SUP Guidelines, which recommend a maximum output of 1.6 foot-candles for parking lots and a maximum output of 0.5 foot-candles adjoining a residential property.

- **Timing of Proposed Lighting.** The perimeter site lighting will operate from dusk to 10 p.m. with the exception of special events and services; at which time the perimeter lighting will shut off at the conclusion of the event. For security purposes, the interior lighting located between the buildings will operate from dusk to dawn. However, the interior lighting level will be reduced to 50% after 10 p.m. The applicant provided a “Perimeter/Interior Lighting Diagram” to clarify this lighting schedule and a stipulation was added to define these limits.

## **DISCUSSION/FACTS:**

### General Plan:

The proposed improvements are consistent with Section 1.3 of the Town’s General Plan which encourages the continued revitalization and improvement of the Town’s SUP properties while protecting the adjacent residential neighborhoods.

### Minor Amendment Criteria

Per Section 1102.7 of the Zoning Ordinance, a Minor Amendment to a Special Use Permit shall include any proposal which is not a Managerial Amendment and does not:

1. Change or add any uses; or
2. Increase the floor area of the project by more than 5,000 sq ft or constitute an increase of more than 15% upon the existing or, if still under construction, approved floor area square footage of the affected SUP property, whichever is less, with any such increase to be measured cumulatively over a sixty-month period; or
3. Have any material effect on the adjoining property owners that is visible, audible, or otherwise perceptible from adjacent properties that cannot be sufficiently mitigated; or
4. Change the architectural style of the existing Special Use Permit.

### Zoning Ordinance Compliance:

The proposed improvements are consistent with the existing church use and are substantially compliant with the SUP Guidelines. The renovation of the parking lot will help define the primary/central entrance and adds another 9 parking spaces to the church campus. The proposed lighting should improve visibility on-site, will use code compliant light fixtures, has a low output of 0.2 foot-candles measured at the property line, and will limit the hours of illumination (with the perimeter lighting turning off by 10 p.m. or at the conclusion of an event/service and the interior lighting running at half the output from dusk to dawn).

The new canopies and monument signs are also compliant with the SUP Guidelines and Town Code. They meet the recommended setbacks, heights, and area limits and the increase in floor area is less than 5,000 sq ft (resulting in a slight increase in lot coverage from 16.18% to 17.38%). There is no change in use nor change in architectural style.

However, not all the proposed improvements are compliant with or meet the SUP Guidelines and Town standards. Approximately twenty percent of the parking spaces are undersized (at 171 sq ft) and do not meet the 180 sq ft size limit recommended by the Town Zoning Ordinance and the parking lot is not compliant with the Town's Storm Drainage Design Manual water depth/ponding standards.

#### Public Comment

Noticing was performed in accordance with the public hearing process. A copy of the notification material is enclosed for reference. Also, staff received comment of support and opposition regarding the proposed improvements. Two of the neighboring property owners adjoining the northeast part of the parking lot expressed concern regarding the parking lot lights in this area. To address this concern, the applicant lowered the height of the parking lot lights in this area from 16' tall to 12' tall and held a lighting demonstration with the neighbors on May 6<sup>th</sup>. Enclosed is copy of the public comment emails/correspondence for reference.

#### Next Steps

This SUP Amendment requires two actions. First, the Commission must determine if the scope of improvements constitutes a Minor SUP Amendment in accordance with Section 1102.7 of the Zoning Ordinance. If deemed a Minor SUP Amendment, then the Planning Commission must approve, approve with stipulations, deny, or continue the public hearing for further discussion and review.

#### **ATTACHMENT(S):**

- A - Vicinity Map & Aerial Photo
- B - Application
- C - Narrative & Plans
- D - January 21, 2020 letter from Five Star Development
- E - February 3, 2020 letter from Saint Barnabas Church
- F - March 13, 2020 letter from Five Star Development
- G - SUP Guidelines
- H - Notification Materials
- I - Public Comment