



Town of Paradise Valley

Minutes

Hillside Building Committee

Wednesday, January 8, 2020 at 8:00 AM Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Hillside Building Review Committee met on Wednesday, January 8, 2020, at Town Hall, 6401 East Lincoln Drive, Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253. Committee Members present: Chair Scott Jarson, Scott Tonn, Thomas Campbell, James Anton. Staff present: Hillside Development Administrator Hugo Vasquez and Town Engineer Paul Mood. Scott Jarson called the meeting to order at 8:07 a.m.

2. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

3. APPLICATION REVIEW

20-031 Formal review for a new single-family residence at 5912 N Foothill Drive (APN 169-04-012)

Avi Azoulay, Builder, Regal American Homes

Tony Nelson, Construction Manager, Regal American Homes

Steven Adams, Project Engineer, Regal American Homes

Steve Bargeloh, Civil Engineer, D&M Engineering

Ray Thurston, Owner

Hugo Vasquez presented an overview of the proposal as well as a brief history of the project. He pointed out portions of the plan that have changed since they last reviewed the project and some items that had remained the same.

Chair Jarson indicated he liked that the grass areas have been reduced. He then asked if it was actual grass or synthetic.

Tony Nelson, construction manager, replied that it was synthetic.

Member Anton noted that some AstroTurf does not look as good as others.

Member Tonn pointed out that if it was treated as a material than a sample of it would need to be brought in. It was noted that the one on the sample board was the sample.



Member Campbell asked if the new landscaping effected the grading and drainage.

Mr. Nelson shared that it was not affected by landscaping.

Member Tonn inquired if the transfer was complete.

Mr. Nelson stated that it was and that the owner of the application is new now.

Member Tonn asked the owner if the plan was approved if the intent was to not build the house.

Ray Thurston, Owner, indicated that was correct.

Member Tonn asked why the application was not pulled if it was not their intent to build.

Chair Jarson explained that part of it had to do with the value of the land and the potential for construction. He added that he would like to stipulate a plant change to native plants.

Chair Jarson opened the meeting up for any citizens comments. None were offered.

Discussion was made that there were two properties at the same address. It was noted that an address change should be made when the parcel is developed.

Mr. Vasquez noted that applications expire one year from the approval and that the applicant should keep that in mind if they do choose to develop the property.

Chair Jarson stated that he would like to include a stipulation that if construction failed to be completed within the approved time any disturbed areas would be restored to native natural conditions and all existing native plants and disturbance areas including Saguaro shall remain undisturbed.

Paul Mood clarified that they had a year to submit plans.

Member Campbell indicated that he felt it was enough time but asked that they include extensions in the time limit. He added that he felt the address should be changed when a building permit is given.

Chair Jarson motioned to approve the application with the stipulations 1-9 with the addition of three new stipulations. Stipulation 10 that lantana for native species and plants be approved by Staff and Chair and all areas marked on the landscape plan marked as grass turf be synthetic and match the sample. Stipulation 11 if construction fails to proceed in the approved permit time or if ownership is transferred within that



time that all disturbed areas on the site will be restored to its natural and native conditions to be approved by Staff and all existing native plants including Saguaros shall remain undisturbed. Stipulation 12 at the issuance of permit the property address will be changed to a North Mojave Road location and number.

Member Tonn seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

20-032 Concept review for a major remodel and addition at 6024 N 42nd Street (APN 169-22-041)

Eric Spry, Architect, Spry Architecture
Robert Side, Owner

Mr. Vasquez introduced the request for a major remodel. He noted that the proposed net disturbance area was 18.28% and they are allowed approximately 41%.

Eric Spry, architect, indicated that there plans stay within the footprint of the existing home with exception of the garage. He noted that the drive on the west side will be removed as well.

Chair Jarson asked what ideas they have for a material palate.

Mr. Spry indicated they would like to go with gray and beige colors. Some renderings of the home were shown which displayed some stucco and stone material. He added that the palm trees will be removed as part of the landscaping.

Member Anton expressed his frustration that the applicant has owned the property since 2015 and not made any improvements to the landscape already.

Robert Side, owner, replied that he would have someone come out and take care of the trees as soon as possible.

Member Anton asked about the chain-link fence around the project.

It was noted that there was also a non-complaint retaining wall for the neighbor's driveway and a basketball hoop that was on their property that would need to be addressed.

Chair Jarson indicated that he felt the color palate was appropriate. He then suggested that on the stone portions looking for the most natural looking stones and that native stones would be most preferable. He added that for roof surfaces they will want to see something that is not reflective and look natural. He suggested stones that can be placed on top of foam roofs. He also noted that they like to see native landscape without



any grasses. He asked that they be mindful of lighting so that it does not wash the architecture.

Member Campbell expressed that he would like to see more stone on the south elevation.

Chair Jarson noted that travertine pool deck surfaces are highly problematic even if the samples appear to meet light reflectance value (LRV) standards. He also recommended a permeable paver for the drive especially since it is steep.

Member Tonn expressed concern for how the retention basins will look.

Member Campbell recommended they look into other solutions such as permeable materials for the auto path.

Mr. Spry indicated that they have tried to split it up into a number of smaller basins that could be hidden with landscaping.

Discussion continued on different options for water retention on the site.

Chair Jarson called for any comments from the community on this project.

Eric Endy indicated that he was a neighbor and that he has some concerns about the east side driveways proximity to his pool, patio, master bedroom, and second bedroom and asked that the property owners could come to a less intrusive solution and consider using the west drive instead of the east. He also expressed concern that changes to the east side drive may affect the storm water wash that runs between their two homes on the east side.

Mr. Spry clarified that they are not proposing any changes to the east side drive other than paving it. He added that using the west drive does not allow guests access to the front door.

Discussion was made on the addition of landscaping along the east property line to mitigate any visual or light disturbances to the neighbors.

**20-033 Concept review for a new single-family residence at 5939 E Quartz Mountain Road (APN 169-48-005A)
Ram Gangadean, Owner**

Mr. Vasquez reviewed the application as well as a brief history of the project.



Ram Gangadean, owner, noted that they have owned the subject property as well as the neighboring property to the east since 1994 and 1995. He further explained his intention with the property.

Discussion was made on the location of the property lines.

Mr. Gangadean shared that he likes landscaping and plans to make the home as inconspicuous as possible with landscaping. He added that they may change the roof to the American Clay Tile.

Chair Jarson reminded him that with any flat roof they may have to meet higher standards than simply being LRV compliant. He recommended lightweight stones on top of foam. He then asked if they anticipate solar paneling.

Mr. Gangadean indicated that they might on the flat roof portion.

Chair Jarson shared that they will need to plan for some sort of screening for the solar panels. He added that he should also be mindful of native landscaping and lighting that will not wash vertical surfaces of the home.

Mr. Gangadean explained that he plans to have some trees in the auto court area as well which may help with water permeation.

Member Tonn recommended getting the roof color to blend in with the surrounding area so that it disappears as much as possible from Hummingbird Lane.

Member Anton expressed that he was happy with the plans.

Chair Jarson asked for any public comments on the current application.

Nan Murley, resident, commented that they have serious problems with water runoff in the neighborhood and asked for more information on the grading and drainage on the lot.

Member Anton stated that previously the Town did not look at water retention but now they do, and they take the matter seriously.

Further discussion was made on water drainage and retention in the area and on the subject site. It was noted he will need a formal plan by the time of the formal meeting for the application.

Member Campbell encouraged the applicant to have a permeable pavement solution to help create more water storage on the site. He also encouraged him to look at the



alignment so there is more space for mitigating the impact of the driveway from the neighbors on the west.

Mr. Gangadean noted that he would like the drive to be more meandering than the visual depicts so there is room for more trees. He added that he may be able to help mitigate more if the neighbors allow him to plant things on their property that he would be willing to maintain.

Ms. Micuda indicated she lived on the property to the west of the subject site. She noted that their main concern is privacy, water runoff, and devaluing of their home by blocking the view. She pointed out that using vegetation to block car lights from the drive could potentially block more of their view.

Mr. Gangadean stated he was confident with the location of the neighbor's home and the driveway that he would be able to mitigate any potential car lights from shining onto their property without blocking their view.

Ms. Micuda suggested having the driveway come off Hummingbird Lane.

Mr. Gangadean pointed out that would create a steep driveway and was not something they wanted to do.

Chair Jarson noted that it would also create more disturbed area on the property that was not previously disturbed.

Member Campbell recommended permeable pavement again to decrease the need and size for retention basins.

Mr. Gangadean replied that he was not concerned about the location of his retention areas since they will be blocked from the street view by existing vegetation.

20-034 Combined review for modifications to the residence at 6824 N Highlands Drive (APN 169-53-012)

Rod Cullum, Builder, Cullum Homes

Eddie Strong, Director of Architecture, Cullum Homes

Preston Simonson, VP of Construction, Cullum Homes

Mr. Vasquez presented a brief overview of the project and previous issues the owner has had with grading on the site.

Rod Cullum, builder, reviewed more history of the site and project which included moving the re-location of the home, issues with plans for the retaining walls and steel deck, and more. He explained that they eventually came up with a plan with the help of



city staff which is the revised plan they are now coming to them with. He noted that with the revised plan they are under the allowed disturbed area.

Mr. Cullum replied that it was going to be a wine cellar with exposed rock that is pinned for stability. He noted that he was told to document the space as habitable.

Chair Jarson asked if there was any benefit to further treating the roof of the space to make it look more natural.

Mr. Cullum indicated they would be concerned about it washing away. He added that it is not visible to the home owner or from the street.

Member Campbell pointed out there was a parcel behind his property and asked if the roof was visible from that site.

Mr. Cullum stated that he did not know for sure but noted that the site was very steep and would be difficult to build on.

Chair Jarson expressed concern with the septic leach area.

Mr. Vasquez clarified that the owner will have to maintain it and ensure it does not have problems over time. He then continued his presentation of the site plan.

Mr. Cullum shared plans to use a new type of paver that is permeable for the patio.

Discussion was made on transmission tower.

Member Campbell indicated concern with the base of the faux cactus.

Mr. Cullum agreed that work needed to be done on the concrete base.

Member Anton asked that they soften the transition from rocks to no rocks in the area.

Mr. Cullum responded that they could put some more work into that.

Chair Jarson asked if there were any comments from members of the public on this item and none were offered.

Chair Jarson motioned to approve Application 20-034 with the stipulations by Staff with the following changes and modifications, adding the verbiage "the exposed cuts and gut eye channel should...blend with native surroundings, with the color to be approved by Staff" on stipulation seven, and to stipulation nine "fly ash septic areas to be continually broadcast with native seed revegetation mix as needed and monitored until



established,” and “channeling east of drive to be naturalized and blended from exiting rock to grade condition” to stipulation ten.

Member Campbell seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

20-035 Election of Hillside Chair

Member Anton nominated Chair Jarson for Hillside Chair.

Member Campbell seconded the motion.

Motion passed unanimously.

4. STAFF REPORTS

Mr. Mood noted that the Hillside Committee update to Council was coming up. He added that they notice that there are not regulations about demolishing a structure with no active permit. He suggested possibly making someone grade and re-vegetate the land. He noted that they may want to bring this idea up with Council.

Some suggestions were made on how to address the issue.

Member Tonn asked why someone might demolish a home without plans to rebuild.

Mr. Mood explained that reasons could include not wanting to pay property tax or making the land more sellable.

Mr. Mood stated that the Hillside brochure is almost complete and will be sent out soon. He noted that they wanted to update the website before finalizing the broacher.

Member Tonn commented on how easy the address list was to identify what properties were included in hillside. He then asked how many lots are in hillside.

Mr. Mood replied that it was over 1000. He then showed a digital version of the brochure.

5. COMMITTEE REPORTS

6. NEXT MEETING DATE

Chair Jarson announced the next meeting would be Wednesday, February 12, 2020 at 8:00 a.m.



7. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Jarson moved to adjourn the meeting.

Member Anton seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously, and the meeting was adjourned.