



# Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr  
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

## Minutes - Final

### Planning Commission

---

Tuesday, May 19, 2020

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

---

**IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE AT PUBLIC MEETINGS HAS BEEN SUSPENDED UNTIL  
FURTHER NOTICE. WATCH LIVE STREAMED MEETINGS AT:  
<https://paradisevalleyaz.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>**

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

##### **STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT**

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller (attended remotely)  
Community Development Director Jeremy Knapp  
Planning Manager Paul Michaud  
Senior Planner George Burton  
Town Engineer Paul Mood (attended remotely)

#### 2. ROLL CALL

**All Commission members attended remotely.**

**Present** 7 - Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright  
Commissioner Charles Covington  
Commissioner Pamela Georgelos  
Commissioner Daran Wastchak  
Commissioner James Anton  
Commissioner Orme Lewis  
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell

#### 3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

#### 4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

None

#### 5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A.**     [20-191](#)     Consideration of a Minor Special Use Permit Amendment  
Mountain Shadows Resort (SUP-20-01). 5445 E. Lincoln Drive.  
  
George Burton, Senior Planner, introduced the Minor Special Use Permit

Amendment for Mountain Shadows Resort. The introduction included background information as well as the scope of the request which provided details about the new left turn lane and a traffic impact study for the new turn lane. He noted that this should be a safer option without visual impact.

Commissioner Lewis asked for additional information on signage.

Mr. Burton responded that they would have to stripe the arrow on the asphalt, as well as potential vertical signs for clarification. He noted that they only received one comment on the item which expressed support of the addition of the left-hand turn. He indicated that staff recommends approval with five stipulations, which he reviewed.

Commissioner Lewis asked if there was a stipulation about signage for health and safety regarding the ingress and egress.

Mr. Burton read stipulation two, which addressed signage, and noted that the only signage that may be required was to identify and clarify traffic patterns.

Commissioner Covington inquired if there would be curbing on each side of the turning lane.

Mr. Burton indicated there would be and used the screen to show where curbing would be located.

Commissioner Wastchak asked if the resort owner entertained this idea during the original approvals.

Mr. Burton replied that to his best recollection the turn lane was not requested at that time.

Commissioner Campbell recalled that he was present for the original approval and that not a whole lot of detail was given on the plans at that time.

Andrew Miller, Town Attorney, agreed with Commissioner Campbell and indicated that the rezoning was not approved with a particular site plan.

Commissioner Wastchak asked if there were plans for adjustments to the medians in that area and if these improvements would be done in conjunction with median alterations already being done along that street.

Paul Mood, Town Engineer, clarified that the left turn lane was part of their current median design plans and there was an agreement in place where Mountain Shadows Resort would pay for the design and construction of the left turn lane portion. He indicated that they were hoping to start making changes to the medians this summer.

Commissioner Anton expressed that this was needed and liked the plans.

Commissioner Covington remarked that it was easy to miss the entrance and that a left turn lane would be a good addition.

Commissioner Georgelos agreed with Commissioner Anton and Covington and noted that this was a good time to make the changes as well.

Chairman Wainwright opened the hearing for public comment.

Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director, briefly explained how public comments could be made.

Mr. Knapp indicated he had not received any requests for comments.

Chairman Wainwright closed the public comment portion of the meeting.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Wastchak, to deem the requested amendment to the Mountain Shadows Resort Special Use Permit (SUP-20-01) located at 5445 E. Lincoln Drive to modify a secondary driveway access designation to a primary driveway access designation for the resort by modifications to the Lincoln Drive turn lane as a Minor Amendment per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Campbell

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wastchak, seconded by Commissioner Georgelos, to approve the Mountain Shadows Minor Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP-20-01), subject to the following stipulations:**

**1. All improvements to the turn lane shall be in substantial compliance with the project narrative and plans:**

- a. Narrative, prepared by Mountain Shadows Resort and dated January 29, 2020;**
- b. Mountain Shadows Left Turn, FIG-1, prepared by CivTech, Inc. and dated November 21, 2019;**
- c. Proposed Traffic Flow Plan, Sheet 3, prepared by CivTech, Inc. and dated January 15, 2020; and**
- d. Mountain Shadows Traffic Impact Study, Project No. 17-0765, prepared by CivTech, Inc. and dated November 2019.**

**2. Signage may be required for safety purposes. Prior to issuance of a permit, the Town Engineer may require the applicant to install street markings, striping, and/or vertical signs deemed necessary to identify the turn lane and clarify any associated traffic patterns (including, but not limited to, directional signage).**

**3. Construction of the left turn lane:**

- a. Lincoln Drive Medians Project. Mountain Shadows Resort may choose to construct the turn lane as part of the Town's Lincoln Drive Medians project. If this option is chosen, the Town will coordinate with Mountain Shadows Resort regarding the timing of the final design and the construction of the turn lane. Mountain Shadows Resort will be required to pay for all design and construct costs associated with the left turn lane in the right-of-way. A development agreement regarding the reimbursement of the median work is required and shall be executed prior to the issuance of any permits associated with the turn**

lane.

In the event the Town does not proceed with the Lincoln Drive Medians Project, Mountain Shadows Resort must finalize the design drawings and secure the appropriate contractor and permits for construction on their own.

b. Independent Construction. Mountain Shadows Resort may construct the turn lane apart from the Town's Lincoln Drive Medians project. If this option is chosen, Mountain Shadows Resort must finalize the design drawings and secure the appropriate contractor and permits for construction on their own.

4. All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by the Minor Amendment SUP-20-01; and

5. The property owner and Town shall sign and record a Waiver of Rights and Remedies agreement under A.R.S. § 12-134 (Proposition 207 Waiver) in the form provided by the Town Attorney within 10 calendar days of the approval of this amendment to the Special Use Permit.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Campbell

**B. [20-213](#)**

Consideration of a Minor Special Use Permit Amendment  
St. Barnabas Church (SUP-20-02). 6715 N. Mockingbird Lane

Chairman Wainwright shared his phone number and indicated that it was for anyone who is unable to join the meeting that still wanted to listen in.

David Getts, applicant, shared a presentation which included history and current information on St. Barnabas Church. He then reviewed the objectives of their beautification project and highlighted information about their parking lot plans.

Mr. Knapp noted that they had 40 people in attendance remotely and asked that those not speaking mute their microphones and addressed how they could indicate they wanted to make public comment when it comes to that portion of the meeting.

Mr. Burton gave a brief background of the request as well as the details about the scope of the request and different options for the parking lot plans.

Commissioner Campbell asked what the width was of the isles associated with the undersized parking.

Mr. Burton replied that all the drive isles were 24-feet wide.

Chairman Wainwright asked if it was the preference of the Town Engineer to keep the parking stalls 19 feet long instead of 20 feet long in order to not lose space in the drive isles between the parking.

Mr. Mood responded that was correct.

Commissioner Campbell shared he was more concerned with parking width than the length. He then clarified he was not concerned with the 19-foot parking stall length.

Commissioner Anton asked if Option 1 or 2 was easier for elderly people and large cars to maneuver.

Commissioner Wastchak commented that he believed the option with angle parking would be easier to move in and out of.

Commissioner Anton indicated he would be in support of the angled Option 1 and that he was happy to see the spaces widened to nine feet.

Commissioner Wastchak asked if Option 1 allowed the existing parking islands to remain as-is.

Mr. Getts remarked that parking is very important to the church. He explained that Option 1 did not change the landscape medians and only made minor adjustments to spaces to get the 9-foot width in the west parking lot. He clarified that Option 2 gives the church more parking spaces, but the shape of the landscape medians would be altered so they are thinner. He emphasized that their members do not have problems parking in the existing 90-degree spaces. He added that the church would prefer to have the ability to choose between both options. It was noted that both plans were compliant with Town guidelines.

Commissioner Lewis expressed that he was keen on landscaping and asked if landscaping had been compromised unduly to create more parking.

Mr. Getts responded that they intended to beautify their entire campus and planned to spend a significant amount of money on landscaping, particularly along the perimeter and while the area for landscaping in Option 2 would be reduced they still planned to put landscaping in.

Chris Winters, the applicant's landscape architect, shared that the medians between the parking spaces was the only thing that changed between the two options. He expressed that the changes were minimal and would not alter the overall number of plants that would be put in. He also added that the net difference was minimal since the Police Department had asked them to not put anything in over three feet tall.

Commissioner Georgelos thanked the applicant for responding to their issues and expressed that she felt both options substantially complied with what the Planning Commission had requested, and the applicant should be able to choose between those two options.

Commissioner Campbell asked if there was a landscape plan for Option B.

Mr. Getts replied that they did not provide a separate landscape plan since the total number of plants and the species was the same and would only be shifted to follow the new layout.

Commissioner Campbell expressed that if they are getting the same amount of landscaping with only a difference in configuration he would be comfortable giving the applicant the flexibility of choosing between the two options.

Commissioner Lewis clarified there would be no oleanders in the landscaping.

Mr. Getts indicated oleanders would not be included.

Commissioner Wastchak commented that he was also supportive of giving the applicant the ability to choose between both options for the parking lot.

Commissioner Covington shared he was willing to give them both options as long as they were committed to landscaping to the best of their ability for both.

Commissioner Anton stated he felt they needed to go with the angled parking option for their older patrons.

Chairman Wainwright asked how many accessible parking stalls were available in each option.

Mr. Burton replied it was 13 spaces for both options.

Mr. Getts commented that he believes they have always had sufficient ADA accessible complaint spaces. He noted that most of their elderly patrons attend their earliest service when the parking lot is not full. He added that they would also accommodate any patrons that were not comfortable with 90-degree parking.

Chairman Wainwright pointed out that several of the 19-foot-long parking spaces had space in front of them that would give vehicles additional space to pull in. He expressed that he was sympathetic to Commissioner Anton's concerns about parking for the elderly, but noted that the Planning Commission should take into consideration that accessible parking was being provided. He clarified that he would like to give the church the flexibility of choosing between the two options.

Chairman Wainwright asked if there were any objections to the 19-foot-long parking spaces. None were made. He asked if the Commissioners were in favor of giving the applicant the flexibility of choosing between both options.

Several commissioners indicated they were in favor of the flexibility. Commissioner Anton expressed he was not in favor.

Commissioner Lewis suggested the landscaping going in to the heart of the campus be enhanced.

Mr. Winters responded that was one of the reasons the church embarked on this project.

Commissioner Georgelos asked if Commissioner Anton would be comfortable

with a row of 45-degree parking and leaving the rest at 90-degree parking.

Commissioner Anton agreed.

Mr. Getts stated they could take a look at creating a row of angled parking that would be convenient for elderly patrons, though it may not be located in the west parking lot. He then asked that they still approve both options.

Mr. Burton continued his presentation on the item and shared the drainage and retention improvement plans. He noted that the updated drainage plans were the same for both options. He shared that the applicant was requesting a deviation from the ponding limit from 6 inches to 9 inches.

Commissioner Anton asked that the language about the dry well being cleaned and maintained be more detailed.

Mr. Burton read the full stipulation on that item which included more detail.

Commissioner Campbell suggested they add a stipulation that required signage which identified the areas that had excessive ponding.

Commissioner Lewis agreed with the suggestion.

Commissioner Georgelos commented that it could be a good addition.

Mr. Getts replied they would be willing to put signage up that identified parking stalls prone to flooding.

Mr. Burton shared information regarding the different signage plans for the site as well as the proposed new cross. He presented further information regarding the new landscaping for the property. He noted that if they went with Option 2 the applicants would be required to submit a landscape plan since it was not provided.

Mr. Burton reviewed plans for the proposed canopies on the church campus. He presented details on the two options for the solar canopy that would be placed over the playground area. Option 1 was for a solar panel canopy and Option 2 was for two fabric shade canopies. Mr. Burton shared details regarding the planned walkway and parking canopies throughout the site.

Commissioner Anton inquired about what time the lights are turned off on campus.

Mr. Burton explained there were two lighting options and noted what areas were designated as perimeter lighting and what areas were designated as interior lighting.

Commissioner Anton asked if they needed perimeter lighting till 10:00 p.m.

Mr. Getts pointed out that their current lights turn off at 10:00 p.m. He shared that they often have events in the evening that last till 9:00 p.m. and noted that

for public safety they wanted to be sure the lights were on long enough afterwards for people to clean up and get to their cars without the lights going out on them. He shared that they would look into the lighting controls and see if they could possibly turn off or dim the very perimeter parking lot lights earlier.

Commissioner Covington asked if Town Codes restricted how late the lights could be on.

Mr. Burton responded there was not. He noted that most other churches kept their lights on from dusk to dawn or about 10:00 p.m. He noted that they could reword the stipulation to encourage the applicant to turn the lights off earlier, but they would still be allowed to go until 10:00 p.m.

Mr. Burton continued his presentation providing information on the new outdoor kitchen, pathways, water feature, fences and pony walls. He reviewed details about proposed site lighting which included parking lot lights, landscape lights, pathway lights, and building lights.

Commissioner Georgelos inquired if the playground lighting still had 16-foot light poles and if the applicant would consider lowering the playground lights since they are near the residential area.

Mr. Getts responded that the lights would be under the canopy, but he did not believe it would be a problem to lower them.

Chairman Wainwright asked if Commissioner Anton and Commissioner Georgelos would share information they gathered from the lighting presentation they attended at St. Barnabas Church.

Commissioner Georgelos shared that they were able to see the 16-foot tall lighting structures at the presentation and not the 12-foot structures. She noted that the lights had good dissemination and did not puddle the light in one area.

Commissioner Anton agreed. He added that he was pleased with the reduction of the pole height and felt it was appropriate for the property.

Chairman Wainwright expressed he was pleasantly surprised that from about 30 feet away you could see very little light reflecting off the pole. He added that he was impressed with the lack of light hot spots and would be a nice safety improvement from what is there now.

Mr. Burton provided a brief review of the public comments that they have received on this item and noted the full comments were included in their packets. Mr. Burton then went over the minor SUP amendment criteria as well as staff's recommendation to deem the request as a minor SUP amendment and to approve the amendment with stipulations included in the packet. He then reviewed the suggested stipulations.

Some discussion was made on the wording for Stipulation 4.

Commissioner Georgelos pointed out that they needed to add that the



playground pole lights would be reduced in height from 16 feet tall to 12 feet tall to Stipulation 4.

Mr. Burton continued to review the recommended stipulations included in the packet.

Commissioner Georgelos asked if they wanted to include the signage for flooding in the parking lot as a stipulation.

It was indicated that it would be added as an additional stipulation.

Commissioner Anton suggested that the stipulation on perimeter lighting be altered to turn off at an earlier time, with the exception of special events and services.

Further discussion was made on if changes to the stipulation should be made.

Mr. Getts noted that the northeast parking lot near the residential area is where most people are parking for the evening events in the education building that end at 9:00 p.m.

Father Clark pointed out that they would also like lighting on their property at night to keep it protected from vandalism and safe for people who walk through the cemetery and labyrinth during later hours.

Commissioner Wastchak remarked that while they want to be respectful of the neighbors the lights are already on till 10:00 p.m. and is an existing condition.

Chairman Wainwright shared that these lights will be an improvement from the current flood lights they have.

Commissioners Georgelos and Anton agreed.

Mr. Burton clarified the changes made by the Planning Commission to the recommended stipulations.

Commissioner Campbell disclosed that his son is an Eagle Scout from the Boy Scout group that the Church sponsors, but did not feel it would impact on his ability to be impartial in this matter.

It was noted that Chairman Wainwright lost his connection and was attempting to rejoin the meeting.

Commissioner Anton opened the meeting up for public comments.

Mr. Knapp reminded the public of how they could make a request to speak.

Lori Suretz thanked the Commission for listening to and considering the comments made in a respectful manner. She recommended St. Barnabas consider the installation of security cameras on the campus. She noted that there are smart systems for lights that could be considered for the site as well.

Chairman Wainwright rejoined the meeting via phone and noted that the power went out at his house and pointed out that may have forced other people to drop out of the meeting as well.

Mr. Knapp responded that there was still 33 people in the meeting, which was about where they were at when Chairman Wainwright left the meeting.

Mr. Getts remarked that they had plans to install security cameras.

Chairman Wainwright stated that he was confident the church would respect her concern but was reluctant to make it a stipulation.

Jim Hawkins commented that him and his wife often take walks in the area at night and have never seen children playing in the playground or cars in the parking lot in the last six to seven months they have lived in the area. He added that contrary to what had previously been stated there are not currently lights on in the parking lot until 10:00 p.m.

Mary Hamway remarked that the church has been active in serving the community for 60 years and they have put together a great plan to enhance the area. She expressed that there are not things happening at the church now because of the pandemic, but it is normally a very active community and the property is often used. She added that the lights are needed for the potential 24 hour use of the property and are dark sky approved.

Bret Yeller thanked the church for accommodating some of the requests from the neighbors for lowering the lighting. He added that he questioned that the perimeter lights were needed till 10:00 p.m. each night. He suggested options such as motion sensors on the perimeter lights to accommodate people that came in late at night but allowed them to shut off earlier.

Mr. Getts remarked that they have not explored the option of motion sensors but believed there would be additional costs included with that. He reiterated that they will investigate if they can shut off some of the perimeter lights earlier with their system.

Commissioner Campbell pointed out that some of these high-power commercial lights take time to turn on and may not be conducive to a motion sensor option.

Jim Hawkins asked if they find the lights are only being used as late as 10:00 p.m. a portion of the time if they could come back to the Planning Commission and revisit this item.

Mr. Burton explained that if it is approved as is, the approval would run with the land until the church came back for another amendment. He noted that the church could respond to a neighbor's complaint on their own if they desired.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner**

Covington, to deem the requested Special Use Permit (SUP) amendment by the St. Barnabas Church (SUP-20-02) located at 6715 N. Mockingbird Lane to renovate and replace the parking lot/parking area, update the site drainage and retention, replace and add new signage, re-landscape the campus, improve the playground area with a new solar panel shade structure and fencing, add new trellis shade canopies with solar panels, replace and add new site lighting, replace a covered parking canopy with a solar panel parking canopy, and related improvements, as a Minor Amendment per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote: .

Commissioner Lewis left the meeting prior to the vote on SUP-20-02.

**Aye:** 6 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton and Commissioner Campbell

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Lewis

A motion was made by Commissioner Wastchak, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to approve the St. Barnabas Church Minor Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP-20-02), subject to the following stipulations:

1. All improvements to the site shall be in substantial compliance with the project narrative and plans:
  - a. Narrative, pages 1-3, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 4, 2020;
  - b. St. Barnabas Church SUP Civil Variance Requests letter, pages 1 - 3, prepared by Cypress Civil and dated February 10, 2020;
  - c. St. Barnabas Church Storm Water Retention in Parking Lot letter, pages 1 - 2, prepared by Cypress Civil and dated March 16, 2020;
  - d. Overall Grading & Drainage Exhibit, Sheet 1 of 1, Prepared by Cypress Civil and dated March 16, 2020;
  - e. Overall Grading & Drainage Exhibit Alternate 1 - West Parking, Sheet 1 of 1, Prepared by Cypress Civil and dated March 16, 2020;
  - f. Preliminary Grading & Drainage Plan for Saint Barnabas on the Desert, Sheets C1 - C5, prepared by Cypress Civil and dated May 4, 2020;
  - g. Preliminary Grading & Drainage Plan (Alternate 1 - West Parking) for Saint Barnabas on the Desert, Sheets C1 - C5, prepared by Cypress Civil and dated May 4, 2020;
  - h. Site Plan, Sheet L1, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 1, 2020;
  - i. Site Plan - Parking and Shade Design Alternate, Sheet L1.1, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
  - j. Hardscape Plan, Sheet L2, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
  - k. Landscape Plan, Sheet L3, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
  - l. Fountain Plan, Sheet L4, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
  - m. Landscape Details, Sheet L5, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
  - n. Parking Sections, Sheet L6, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and dated May 11, 2020;
  - o. Head to Head Parking Summary prepared by Cypress Civil and dated May 8, 2020;
  - p. Shade Structure Site Plan, Sheet A-3.1, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and Oculus Studio, and dated December 6, 2019;

- q. Shade Structure Elevations, Sheet A-3.2, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and Oculus Studio, and dated December 6, 2019;
- r. Shade Structure Site Plan, Sheet A-3.3, prepared by Chris Winters & Associates and Oculus Studio, and revised dated March 17, 2020;
- s. St. Barnabas - View of Play Area with Fabric Shade Structure without Trees perspective prepared by Chris Winter & Associates and dated April 3, 2020;
- t. St. Barnabas - View of Play Area with Fabric Shade Structure with Trees perspective prepared by Chris Winter & Associates and dated April 3, 2020;
- u. Lighting Fixture Schedule, E0, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- v. Existing/Demo Electrical Plan, E1, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- w. Proposed Electrical Plan, E2, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- x. Existing Photometric Plan, E3, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- y. Proposed Photometric Plan, E4, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- z. Light Fixture Cut Sheets, E5, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- aa. Light Fixture Cut Sheets, E6, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- bb. Light Fixture Cut Sheets, E7, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- cc. Light Fixture Cut Sheets, E8, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated January 6, 2020;
- dd. Proposed Electrical Plan - Perimeter/Interior Lighting Diagram Lighting Supplement, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Chris Winters & Associates, and dated May 2, 2020.
- ee. Exterior Signage Sign Location, Sheet 1.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
- ff. Exterior Signage Monument, Sheet 2.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
- gg. Exterior Signage Detail, Sheet 3.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
- hh. Exterior Signage Monument, Sheet 4.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
- ii. Exterior Signage Directionals, Sheet 5.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
- jj. Exterior Signage Monument, Sheet 6.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
- kk. Exterior Signage Detail, Sheet 7.0, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated April 8, 2020;
- ll. St. Barnabas Supplemental Exhibition - Directional Signage, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Architectural Signs and dated March 27, 2020;
- mm. February 3, 2020 St. Barnabas Church pre-application for landscape and parking lot improvements letter prepared by Rector Jim Clark; and
- nn. January 21, 2020 Storm Water Drainage at Saint Barnabas letter prepared by Richard Frazee.

2. Prior to issuance of a building or grading permit associated with these proposed grading and drainage improvements; St. Barnabas Church shall obtain and provide the Town of Paradise Valley with a copy of any applicable drainage easements or similar mechanisms with the neighboring property owner(s) as

outlined in the January 21, 2020 Storm Water Drainage at St. Barnabas Letter prepared by Five Star Development;

3. In accordance with Crime Prevention Through Environment Design (CPTED) standards to provide visibility and increase safety:

- a. All new shrubs and plants in the parking lots must be maintained at a maximum height of 3' tall;
- b. All new tree canopies will be maintained to hang no lower than 6' above grade; and
- c. All existing trees and shrubs must be pruned and maintained to provide visibility and discourage places of concealment;

4. All exterior lighting shall operate in accordance with the Proposed Electrical Plan Perimeter/Interior Lighting Diagram Lighting Supplement, prepared by Woodward Engineering and Christ Winters & Associates, and dated May 2, 2020. In summary, the perimeter site lighting shall operate from dusk to 10 p.m., with the exception of special events and services; at which time the perimeter lighting will shut off at the conclusion of the event. For security purposes, the interior lighting located between the buildings may operate from dusk to dawn. However, the interior lighting level shall be reduced to 50% after 10 p.m. The playground pole lights shall be lowered in height from 16' tall to 12' tall.

5. New internal directional or wayfinding signs shall comply with the SUP Guidelines and must be reviewed and approved by the Town Manager or Designee;

6. If the alternative parking/site plan is used (Site Plan - Parking and Shade Design Alternate Sheet L1.1 and the Preliminary Grading & Drainage Plan Alternate 1 - West Parking for Saint Barnabas on the Desert Sheets C1 - C5), an updated hardscape plan(s) and landscape plan(s) must be provided to the Town for review. The alternate hardscape plan(s) and landscape plan(s) must be reviewed and approved by the Town Manager or Designee prior to issuance of any permits;

7. If the primary parking/site plan is used (Site Plan Sheet L1.1 and the Preliminary Grading & Drainage Plan for Saint Barnabas on the Desert Sheets C1 - C5), an updated electrical plan and photometric plan shall be provided for Town review. The updated electric plan and photometric plan shall be reviewed and approved by the Town Manager or Designee prior to issuance of any permits;

8. The drywells on campus shall be maintained and cleaned on a regular basis. Drywells shall be inspected after rain events totaling 0.5" or greater to ensure they are functioning properly to allow storm water to dissipate and are kept free of debris. Drywells shall be inspected annually and maintained as recommended by a drywell maintenance contractor. Annual maintenance records shall be kept of file by the property owner and made available to the Town upon request;

9. All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by the Minor Amendment SUP-20-02; and

10. The property owner and Town shall sign and record a Waiver of Rights and

Remedies agreement under A.R.S. § 12-1134 (Proposition 207 Waiver) in the form provided by the Town Attorney within 10 calendar days of the approval of this amendment to the Special Use Permit.

11. Signage shall be place in the parking lot identifying the areas of ponding or flooding. The signage must be reviewed and approved by the Town Manager or Designee.

The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 5 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Wastchak and Commissioner Campbell

**Nay:** 1 - Commissioner Anton

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Lewis

## 6. ACTION ITEMS

None

## 7. CONSENT AGENDA

None

## 8. STAFF REPORTS

None

## 9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

Commissioner Campbell asked when Town Hall may be opened back up.

Mr. Knapp replied that some discussion has happened on the topic and a committee has been formed to prepare plans for how to safely do that, but a date had not been determined. He added that they will continue to meet in this manor until they hear otherwise.

## 10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Mr. Knapp indicated they would not have a meeting on June 2, 2020 due to lack of business and possibly not a meeting on June 16, 2020 as well. He added that they may get some more work from Town Council later in the summer.

## 11. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Georgelos at 9:25 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Covington, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 6 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton and Commissioner Campbell

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Lewis

**Paradise Valley Planning Commission**

By: Carl E. Knapp  
for Jeremy Knapp, Secretary