



**PARADISE VALLEY
HILLSIDE BUILDING COMMITTEE MINUTES
June 12, 2019**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Hillside Building Review Committee met on Wednesday, June 12, 2019, at Town Hall, 6401 East Lincoln Drive, Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253. Committee Members present: Chair Scott Jarson, Scott Tonn, Charles Covington, Daran Wastchak, Jonathan Wainwright. Staff present: Hillside Development Administrator Hugo Vasquez and Town Engineer Paul Mood. Scott Jarson called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m.

2. EXECUTIVE SESSION

3. APPLICATION REVIEW

**19-290 Combined review for a new patio, pool, trellis and amenities at 6001 E Foothill Drive North (APN 169-03-057)
David Dick, Architect, David Dick Architect**

Hugo Vasquez, Hillside Development Administrator, shared a brief history of the property and introduced the Item. He noted the percentage of disturbed area would be reduced.

David Dick, architect, shared more plans for remodeling of the home and property. He shared details concerning the pool and landscaping. He noted that color pallet is not very different and will be consistent with the home. He indicated some of the changes are to shield their property to the new home going in next to their property.

Discussion was made on grading and drainage plans for the site.

Mr. Vasquez suggested adding a stipulation to put an area of the property back to natural dessert landscaping.

Chair Jarson asked if there would be lighting in the trellis.

Mr. Dick shared the lighting plans.

Member Wainwright asked the height of the screen wall around the pool and asked if they have considered enclosing the pool equipment.

Mr. Dick responded the wall was six feet tall. He shared that the pool equipment is not enclosed but they are using other means to muffle the noise.



Chair Jarson asked for wording suggestions for a stipulation about reclamation of native disturbed areas and discussion followed.

Chair Jarson called for any public comment on the Item.

Chair Jarson motioned to approve application 19-290 with the stipulations one through eight from staff with the addition of stipulation nine, that all native disturbed area such as retention basins should use materials and native seed mix to re-vegetate to match natural conditions, and the grout color for riprap and soils, if grouted, shall be approved by staff, and drawings should be updated appropriately.

Member Wastchak seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

19-291 Formal review for a new single-family residence at 4208 E Lamar Road (APN 169-53-038)

**Amit Upadhye, Architect, Amit Upadhye Architect
Jeff Hillis, Builder, Hillis Built**

Mr. Vasquez introduced the Item and reviewed the plans.

Member Wastchak asked if the County could take away the septic system.

Mr. Vasquez replied that they can if it does not meet the capacity for the property. Further discussion was made on septic tanks.

Member Tonn asked if the application was before or after the stop work order.

Mr. Vasquez replied that the application came after the stop work order. It was clarified that this application was in order for them to complete the construction they had started.

Amit Upadhye, architect, reviewed details of the plans for the Committee.

Chair Jarson commented the material pallet is good. He then expressed concern about the reflectivity of the glass on the West side.

Member Covington expressed he was also concerned with the reflectivity of the glass.

Member Wastchak pointed out that they can do things to remove the sheen of the glass which would help reduce reflectivity. He noted they could add a stipulation if it becomes a problem.



Chair Jarson asked if they removed a large portion of the can lights.

Mr. Upadhye responded they plan to but need a building permit first.

Member Tonn asked if they have deeper vertical can so the light itself is not visible.

Mr. Upadhye indicated they could do that.

Member Tonn asked if the set back and easement issues have all been resolved. It was indicated that those issues had been taken care of.

Mr. Upadhye asked if they could use stormwater stored in the driveway for irrigation. It was indicated that they could.

Chair Jarson asked if they had given any thought about a top coat on the roof such as rock, stone, or chip. He noted the Committee would prefer if they could do that.

Mr. Upadhye responded would have to investigate that with the contractor.

Paul Mood pointed out that if any changes are made after approval, they need to be approved by Staff, Chair, or Council depending on how substantial the change is.

Chair Jarson asked if there is any exiting landscaping on the property.

Mr. Upadhye replied there are palm trees. Discussion was made on landscaping for the property and the challenges of revegetation on the lava rock.

Chair Jarson indicated the recess can light trim needs to be approved by Staff. He then suggested stipulating that a revised plan would show revegetation on that area.

Member Covington asked about fence plans.

Mr. Upadhye described the plans for the new fence. Further discussion on the fence was made.

Mr. Mood noted that they would like to add a stipulation that the fence meshing is a color that blends in with the Hillside.

Chair Jarson noted that if they put a stipulation on the glass, they should specify a time frame.



Member Tonn asked if the glass fence is necessary from a design point. Mr. Upadhye replied that some fencing is required.

Member Wastchak suggested the Mr. Upadhye come up with another plan in case the reflectivity of the glass is an issue. Discussion continued on how to avoid the potential reflectivity of the glass.

Chair Jarson asked if there were any public comments on this Item. None were given.

Chair Jarson motioned to approve application 19-291 with the nine existing stipulations from Staff and the inclusion of four addition stipulations. Ten, recess can light trip to be approved by Staff. Eleven, applicant shall revise the landscape plan to include revegetation of existing lava rock disturbed area to be approved by Chair and Staff. Twelve, Hillside geo-mesh material to be approved by Staff. Thirteen, glass railing shall be installed so it will be non-reflective in direct sunlight.

Member Wastchak seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

19-292 Formal review for a new single-family residence at 4342 E Highlands Drive E Lamar Road (APN 169-53-026)

**Jim Blochberger, Architect, Blochberger Design
John Corpstein, Owner**

Mr. Vasquez reviewed the Item with Staff.

Jim Blochberger, architect, noted that the house design has not changed since the last time it was seen by the Hillside Building Committee and received unanimous approval. He added that everything meets the new building standards as well. He noted there is no solar and plans include the use natural lawn as well.

Chair Jarson cautioned that they have had issues with travertine materials not meeting standards in the past even though the samples appeared to be compliant. He suggested being sure all the material meet standards before they are installed to avoid difficulties with trying to fix it later on.

Chair Jarson motioned to approve application 19-292 with stipulations one through seven as indicated by staff.

Member Wastchak seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.



19-293 Concept Review for a new single-family residency at 5912 E Foothill Drive (APN 169-04-012)

**Avi Azoulay, Builder, Regal American Homes
Beau Graffin, Architect, Graffin Design**

Mr. Vasquez introduced the Item and reviewed the plans for the site including the grading and drainage.

Beau Graffin, architect, indicated it would be a Spanish Colonial style home. It was also indicated they are not planning on solar at this time.

Chair Jarson commented to be careful with the colors that they look natural and to be cautious of accent trims around doors and windows, so it does not become more than an accent. He added suggestions for landscaping including limited use of grass. He then pointed out some of the light standards as well.

Discussion was made on grading and drainage. Mr. Mood noted the applicant would have to submit a Storm Drainage Facilities Agreement that states they will maintain they systems they have.

Chair Jarson called for any public comment on the Item.

Phillis Rector stated she never got a notice for the Hillside review of this project where they would try to take this out of Hillside, and she is concerned she will not get a notice for the next review of this project.

Mr. Mood indicated that he believes they never ended up submitting for Hillside removal, but if they had notice would have gone out.

Ms. Rector reiterated that she wants notices for the meetings.

Mr. Mood shared that on the Town Website there is a sign up that would allow her to get a notice of every agenda.

Discussion was made on the use of gray materials.

Member Covington asked about the roof materials.

Mr. Beau responded it is two-piece mission tile.

19-294 Combined Review for a modification to a new single-family residence at 6837 N Lost Dutchman Drive (APN 169-32-026)



Avi Azoulay, Builder, Regal American Homes

Mr. Vasquez introduced the Item. He noted that it had previously come in for review and was denied. He then pointed out changes that have been made since it was last reviewed.

Avi Azoulay, builder, indicated that they reduced the amount of brick and added more stucco. He noted that the landscaping will change dramatically, so right now they are only concerned with approval of the house itself.

Members of the Committee reviewed images. Discussion was then made on what had previously been approved.

Mr. Azoulay noted material changes on the roof and the surface of the retaining wall. Discussion continued on those material changes. Some concern was expressed on the color of the split face materials for the wall.

Chair Jarson also noted there is a lot of contrast in the material design which concerns him.

Member Tonn pointed out that the images may make the contrasts look starker than they actually are.

Discussion was made on what was visible from the street.

Mr. Azoulay stated the retaining walls are not visible from the street since it is in the back and there is a significant drop in elevation. Further discussion was made on where the split face material would be used on the property.

Mr. Azoulay indicated they would like the courtyard wall to be approved as well.

Mr. Vasquez noted that if they come back with another application there will be fees associated with that.

Chair Jarson commented that he is fine with the pallet, but that the grout needs to be called out, so they can be sure it is a natural gray that goes with the brick. He added that he feels the split face design around the pool and other areas is too much.

Member Wastchak stated he is not comfortable with the split face since it will look white.

Mark Peterson, property owner, explained that he did not realize that the contrast was the big issue and explained his goal of trying to give the home an elegant feel with the stone. He noted that the stone is real and not synthetic, so the color could not be made darker.



Member Tonn indicated he would like the stone to match the color of the stucco more.

Chair Jarson reiterated that his is fine with it in some areas such as the front entrance as an accent. It was noted that they are fine with the split face on the house itself but not on the walls and retaining walls.

Mr. Azoulay indicated the only wall they would want to keep the split face stone on is the screening wall for the master bedroom.

Member Tonn suggested only cladding the interior with the white stone.

Mr. Mark explained why he would like the stone he has chosen. Further discussion was made on the stone material and where it should be used or not. It was decided that the exterior of the master bedroom privacy wall would be stucco, but the interior could be whatever stone they desired.

Chair Jarson stated four stipulations he would like to see in order for the plans to be approved.

Chair Jarson motioned to approve application 19-294 with the twelve stipulations from Staff and four additional stipulations. Thirteen, the material palette change is approved as submitted for the main residence, excepting all site, landscape, and retaining walls which should be maintained in stucco and painted to match the previously approved color. Fourteen, split face material is approved for three (3) locations: at the entry of the residence, at the casita hallway, and as the inside material of the master bedroom privacy wall. Fifteen, brick grout/mortar color shall be LRV-compliant and is subject to Chair and Staff approval. Sixteen, no landscape, hardscape or grading/drainage changes are approved with this application.

Member Tonn seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

Discussion was made on what the process is moving forward.

4. STAFF REPORTS

Chair Jarson stated the Town of Paradise Valley Native Hillside Plant List Staff has been working on will be a great asset for them. He noted that it also includes a list of prohibited plants.



Mr. Vasquez noted that they want to prohibit grasses, specifically Bermuda Grass, since it spreads.

Member Wastchak asked if there was a type of grass that was not invasive that they could allow for those who want it rather than making a complete prohibition against grass.

Mr. Mood indicated they could look into if there is a proven non-invasive turf.

Discussion was made on if they should include the section of prohibited plants or not.

Member Wastchak cautioned against completely prohibiting grass and potential discrimination of Hillside by not allowing any grass or turf.

Chair Jarson indicated he was in support of not allowing palm trees on the Hillside. He noted that they can block views of the mountain.

Mr. Mood commented that they are looking at making changes to the Hillside Code and asked if they would consider making changes to how many times someone can come back under one application. Discussion followed. It was noted that applicants returning multiple time takes Staff and Committee time.

Chair Jarson suggested a possible limit of three times.

5. COMMITTEE REPORTS

6. NEXT MEETING DATE

Chair Jarson announced the next meeting would be Wednesday, August 14, 2019 at 8:00 a.m.

7. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Jarson moved to adjourn the meeting.

Member Wainwright seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously, and the meeting was adjourned.