



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Final

Planning Commission

Tuesday, March 5, 2019

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:05 p.m.

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller
Community Development Director Jeremy Knapp
Senior Planner Paul Michaud
Planner George Burton
Town Engineer Paul Mood

2. ROLL CALL

Commissioner Campbell attended by phone.

Present 7 - Commissioner Daran Wastchak
Commissioner James Anton
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell
Commissioner Charles Covington
Commissioner Pamela Georgelos
Commissioner Orme Lewis
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. [19-090](#) Major Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP-18-05)
7101 E Lincoln Drive - Smoke Tree Resort Public Hearing

Indexes: Smoketree Resort

Chairman Wastchak introduced the project.

Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director, reviewed the project and staff recommendations. The property is 5.3 acres in size and located at the intersection of Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road. The property

referred to as the Five Star Development/Ritz Carlton Resort is located to the north. Single family residential is located to the west, the Andaz Resort is to the south and Lincoln Medical Plaza is located to the east. The site has been in operation since 1953 and has 32 rooms; 23 of which are in service. The restaurant is not in use. The property is designated SUP-Resort in the general plan, located in the Lincoln Drive South Development Area and zoned SUP-Resort. The applicable General Plan policies include Goal LU 2.1.2, Special Use Permit Property Revitalization and there are several policies of Goal DA 2.2.1 Development Area Policy.

The applicant is requesting 120 traditional hotel guest room keys, 30 resort residential units with 15 of these containing a lock-off feature to be available for rent through the resort. There is a proposed restaurant and bar/lounge. He provided a list of accessory uses. He provided an overview of the site plan and called out the location of each proposed use. He showed the underground parking structure and indicated where the exits/entrances are located. North side of the parking structure contains storage. He then read through the Statement of Direction (SOD) regarding use and density of the project. He noted a requirement for furniture fixtures and equipment (FF&E) consistency with hotel and lock-off features. Density reductions should be considered on the west and south sides of the site. In total, 165 units are proposed with a density of 31 units per gross acre. The stipulations and development agreement address FF&E requirements. The total square footage of the project is 145,000 square feet with a coverage of 34% and floor area ratio (FAR) of 62%. Minimum height is recommended on the west side of the site closest to the existing residential properties and then transitioning to increased heights on the east side of the site adjacent to Lincoln Plaza Medical Center. All heights shall be taken from existing finished grade and there must be a compelling reason to allow heights above 36 feet for mechanical screening. The proposed height is 36 feet to the top of the third story with mechanical screening and some architectural elements going above this point.

He provided a section view demonstrating building height. The applicant has updated the site plan to remove the third story on the south side of the property. The overall height was reduced from 44 feet to 42 feet. The width of the existing right-of-way shows 35 feet, but this is a typo, it is really 25 feet. He presented a graphic showing the viewshed from the Andaz resort. This has some penetration into the viewshed on the south side. The third story was removed at this location and they comply with the front open space requirements.

Mr. Knapp stated that they are proposing a 25-foot setback along Quail Run Road. The setback exhibit will be updated to conform to the site plan. The project will contain a 100-foot setback from the adjacent residential

which complies with the SOD. The SOD asked that the Planning Commission address impacts to residential along the western side of the development and balconies for the hotel guest room keys and resort residential units. The Commission shall also study impact from noise, light, traffic and other adverse impacts to residential units.

He indicated that patios and balconies will be removed from the west property line and will not be seen from the Andaz units. He reviewed stipulations regarding the patio walls. Parking lights need to be adjusted and relocated 15 feet from the property line. Trash collection is located on the southwest portion of the site. Deliveries cannot come from off Quail Run Road. There is a three-foot screen wall along the western property line. Rooftop mechanical equipment will be screened and not cover more than 35% of the roof footprint.

He provided the SOD direction for site landscaping. The Visually Significant Corridors Plan has now been adopted by the Town Council. A stipulation has been included requiring landscaping to be replaced should it die. There are two points of pedestrian access along the frontage and landscaping improvements are included along Quail Run Road and Lincoln Drive. The water impact study shows that the request meets fire flows and improvements are necessary to tie Lincoln Road into Quail Run Road. The drainage report indicates that they are providing pre versus post retention per direction of the Town Engineer. Underground storage tanks will be used and additional information will be required. He then explained the SOD direction for traffic and parking. The General Plan identifies 25 feet of right-of-way on Quail Run Road and 65 feet on Lincoln Drive. The applicant would like to pursue a similar option that was recommended for Lincoln Plaza Medical Center.

The applicant is requesting to use the right-of-way for landscaping buffers and parking which will impact FAR. Full dedication of both Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road is approximately 25% of the site. He presented a cross section of Quail Run Road and explained proposed improvements. The right-of-way on Lincoln Drive is proposed with 49 feet of dedication and 16 feet of roadway easement. Parking is 9' by 18' with two feet of overhang. He described the parking requirements for each proposed use. The applicant is proposing 1.05 spaces per hotel room. This is not supported by the third-party analysis which recommends 1.2 spaces per hotel room. If additional parking is necessary, the underground parking garage will be expanded. The resident portion of the garage has controlled access and two spaces are provided per unit. They have not yet received a valet parking plan. Eight signs are proposed for the site with informational signage on the trash enclosure. He gave the dimensions and location of each of the sign types.

Mr. Knapp noted that 15 chimneys are being proposed which will extend above the building height. There will be eight tower/architectural elements that will extend above building height which include elevator overruns and stairwells. The east and west elevation will need to have the screening height changed from eight feet to six feet. He presented renderings showing views into the project.

Chairman Wastchak asked if there are any questions at this point in the presentation.

Commissioner Campbell asked at what stage will they decide if more parking will be required.

Chairman Wastchak added to his question and clarified that parking capacity could be increased by 15% with valet. If they remove land for future road widening, this could reduce parking for the project. He asked how do they know if the dual use of the lawn area will create a problem.

Mr. Knapp responded the expansion of the parking garage is somewhat tied to the traffic impact analysis. The Town staff has reviewed this document and provided comments. The applicant has not yet responded to these comments. Staff would need to see responses to these comments and see issues addressed prior to going to the Town Council. The Town could require a valet plan to accommodate the addition of tents on the lawn area.

Andrew Miller, Town Attorney, stated that they could address the valet plan in the development agreement should the parking along Lincoln Drive be removed.

Chairman Wastchak asked if they could handle this through the stipulations.

Mr. Knapp noted that they could put that in the stipulations, but they probably do not have enough information tonight. They could base valet requirements off the parking study, if in fact it calls for valet parking with the use of two tents on the lawn area.

Chairman Wastchak asked if the updates will occur prior to the project going to the Council.

Mr. Knapp responded that they will.

Chairman Wastchak asked about the water connection in Lincoln Drive.

Paul Mood, Town Engineer, stated that staff is considering if a new 12" line needs to be brought in off Lincoln Drive onto Quail Run Road which the applicant could tap into.

Commissioner Wainwright indicated that the applicant is proposing 14% or 18 spaces less than required in code.

Mr. Mood stated that they are waiting for the applicant to respond to the third-party comments.

Commissioner Covington asked if the parking structure would be increased if more spaces were needed.

Mr. Mood confirmed that if the surface spaces were maxed out then the parking structure would be expanded. This would be decided before the Town Council takes action.

Chairman Wastchak stated that they have not spent a lot of time talking about landscaping on the south side of the site and indicated that he wants to know more about the proposed trees on the Andaz side.

Commissioner Lewis responded that he does not want Eucalyptus trees. Oleanders can provide density. These could work. Aesthetically they could find a tree that does not work as well but looks better.

Mr. Knapp stated that they could stipulate additional landscaping then what is on the landscape plan be planted by the applicant. Additional landscaping would be compliant if the minimum requirements are met.

Mr. Miller stated that he can draft a stipulation to address this point.

Commissioner Anton asked if the building can go up to 36 feet, mechanical screening with 35% of the roof footprint extend to 42 feet, chimneys allowed up to 45 feet if located within the mechanical screening area and elevators up to 42 feet.

Mr. Knapp replied that this is correct.

Commissioner Anton asked if they know what is included in the architectural elements.

Mr. Knapp clarified that these are the towers which include elevator overruns, stairwells and articulation. There will be eight towers. The heights are included in the stipulations and they can add the numbers as well.

Chairman Wastchak suggested that he just cover the stipulations that have changed.

Mr. Knapp summarized each of the changes as follows:

- More details are provided in the definition of branded residences regarding FF&E and modification if removed from the rental pool.
- Changes to the minimum hotel improvements regarding restaurants and room service.

Mr. Miller recommended that they include lunch and breakfast.

Commissioner Lewis asked if the café could serve three meals at the same time as the major facility.

Mr. Knapp responded that they can.

- Item D is a new item for hotel improvements, requiring at least one fitness area to accommodate professional grade exercise equipment and/or areas to provide spa services.
- Language from the branded residential was incorporated into the resort residential requiring the same FF&E as the hotel keys.
- The hours of operation section has an addition referring to the Town Code as amended from time to time. This language will be added to the section on patios.
- A new stipulation restricts patios from the west side of the property as long as the adjacent properties are zoned residential. If they are zoned SUP in the future, patios may be added through a managerial amendment to the SUP.
- Outdoor patios on the south side of the site shall meet the following criteria:
 - Perimeter fence with a minimum height as prescribed in the building code
 - Occupancy shall be restricted to the designated patio area and occupancy shall be restricted from spaces outside of the patio areas.
 - A viewshed study shall be completed taken from 10 feet of the northern most Andaz hotel key and 5'8" above grade. It shall show a line of sight towards the Smoke Tree property.
 - If the study shows that occupants of the third story patios can be seen from the Andaz hotel key, then the patio perimeter wall shall be constructed of a solid material to screen the patio.

Chairman Wastchak commented that they need to increase the height of the wall for proper screening.

Mr. Knapp suggested added language to include height of the screening.

Commissioner Campbell suggested that they include adequate height and patio occupants into the stipulation. They are trying to block the patio occupants and not just the patio.

Commissioner Wainwright stated that they don't want the wall to be overly high.

Chairman Wastchak mentioned that they could pull the wall back further onto the roof line to keep the occupants out of the sight line.

- Patios shall comply with allowable noise levels as defined in the code as amended from time to time.
- Additional landscaping shall be added to the southern property line above and beyond that shown in the approved landscape plan, to create a full visual barrier between the subject property and adjoining property to the south. There should be a time period to allow the vegetation to mature.
- New stipulation to remove sign nine shown on the sign plan. Any future signs are subject to the minor SUP process.

Mr. Knapp stated that there is a new section five for requirements for information to be submitted prior to Council.

Commissioner Anton shared his concern that there is no minimum square footage for the fitness center and suggested 400 square feet.

Commissioner Campbell stated that he does not feel qualified to sign off on a square footage.

Commissioner Anton responded that most have 400-500 square feet.

Commissioner Campbell stated that he is in support of a 400 square foot minimum.

Commissioner Georgelos stated that the site plan shows the spa is approximately 2,500 square feet and she does not want to create a disconnect with the stipulations. She is okay with a minimum square footage and then they can exceed it.

Mr. Knapp suggested language to break the two uses apart to include a

minimum of 2,500 square feet for the spa and 400 square feet for the fitness center.

Commissioner Georgelos suggested that they go back to the original plan.

Mr. Miller stated that on page 27 under temporary uses, he will add that if two temporary structures are utilized, under the Town Manager's discretion, valet plan shall be utilized to avoid a shortage of parking spaces.

Chairman Wastchak opened the public hearing.

Edward Bole commented that he represents Sun Chase which owns nine acres west of the subject property. He is not in opposition. They have been working with representatives with the Town and Smoke Tree. They submitted their concerns and some of these have been resolved. They are still meeting and talking about these issues. The stipulations have addressed many of the questions.

Edward Sanford, Scottsdale resident, commented that the outside events at Andaz ruins his Friday and Saturday nights. They run multiple events per night. He suggested that they place a stipulation to control noise decibel.

Mr. Knapp clarified that the stipulations refer to the Town Code regarding noise levels. After 10:00 p.m. the maximum decibel level is 56. If there are issues, residents may call the police department and staff can follow up with the resort the following day.

Warren Bryant, Paradise Valley resident, mentioned that he is concerned with buffering shown in the plan regarding noise. No buffering is provided on the residential side. They hear the noise during the evening events at Andaz Resort.

Commissioner Anton noted that there are residences that will be on-site, so they will not be happy if there is noise.

Cassandra Aires stated that she was asked to convey by Taylor Robinson his appreciation for the Planning Commissions hard work. She indicated that they have been working on this project for over a year and have met ten times with the Planning Commission. They have made some concessions at the Planning Commission request like reduced heights, increased setbacks, protection of residents and lots of public outreach. They will continue to work with their immediate neighbors. She stated that of the 14 public comment submitted and over 40 doors they have knocked on, only two provided opposition. She stated that there are two letters of support that will be in the next staff report. She quoted SUP section one. This site is

uniquely situated.

Chairman Wastchak closed the public hearing.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to recommend that the Planning Commission forward to the Town Council approval of Ordinance #2019-02 of the Smoke Tree Resort Major Special Use Permit Amendment with the conditions and effective date as described in said ordinance, along with the edits identified in the meeting this evening and the plan modifications identified in Section V of said ordinance. The motion failed by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Campbell and Commissioner Wainwright

Nay: 4 - Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos and Commissioner Lewis

Indexes: Smoketree Resort

A motion was made by Commissioner Georgelos, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to recommend that the Planning Commission forward to the Town Council denial of Ordinance #2019-02 of the Smoke Tree Resort Major Special Use Permit Amendment with the conditions and effective date as described in said ordinance, along with the edits identified in the meeting this evening and the plan modifications identified in Section V of said ordinance.

Commissioner Covington stated he did not find the application as presently depicted to meet the Statement of Direction. In particular, he noted the density and height do not meet those parameters, along with too many drawings to be revised.

Commissioner Georgelos agreed with Commissioner Covington. She added the application could have more progress on lowering density and height, along with increasing setbacks. She added that there are also open ended issues on how the site will be used, noting auxiliary uses. She stated the concept presented is great, but the application is not there yet. She found the renderings to have flair and appeal in accordance with Town standards.

Commissioner Lewis stated the proposal has more substance and complexity than other resorts in Town, noting issues around too much intensity and density.

Commissioner Anton stated he wants the project to be done, but done right. He noted concerns of regret if the Town approves this project at this height and setbacks.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos and Commissioner Lewis

Nay: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Campbell and Commissioner Wainwright

B. [19-088](#)

Public Hearing for recommendation to the Town Council for amendments

to the Town Zoning Ordinance, Article XI, regarding changes to process for approval of Managerial Amendments

Mr. Miller stated that this is the third time they have discussed these amendments. There are four proposed changes to Section 1102.8(A) of the zoning ordinance:

1. Have the manager transmit all determinations approving a managerial amendment to the Town Council within two business days of making the determination.
2. The decision is final unless within seven calendar days afterwards, at least three members of the Town Council submit a written request to the Town Manager to appeal the determination approving the amendment application.
3. The Town Council would have the authority to decide appeals from the Town Manager's approval of a managerial amendment application and first affirm whether the Town Manager's decision meets the criteria for a managerial amendment; if so, then there shall be no further appeal and the managerial amendment is final.
4. If the Town Council decides that the criteria have not been met, they may by majority vote, deny the Managerial Amendment, in whole or in part, or reclassify the application to a different category of the Special Use Permit amendment.

Staff is recommending that the Planning Commission forward to the Town Council a recommendation of approval of the proposed ordinance.

Commissioner Wainwright stated that having three Council members is a high bar and asked why not just have one.

Mr. Miller stated they did not want one or two Council members making these decisions. If there are three Council members agreeing then the scope of the decision would be greater. There is also precedent in that it takes three Council members to get an item on a future council agenda.

Chairman Wastchak opened the public hearing. No one spoke. He then closed the public hearing.

A motion was made by Commissioner Covington, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to forward to the Town Council a recommendation of approval of Ordinance 2019-04, proposed amendments to Article XI, Special Uses and Additional Use Regulations, of the Town Zoning Ordinance regarding the approval of Managerial Amendments. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

6. ACTION ITEMS

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

A. [19-085](#)

Discussion of Major Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP-18-12)
10555 N Tatum Boulevard - Mountain View Medical Center

Paul Michaud, Senior Planner, indicated that tonight the focus is to review the updated traffic report and exterior lighting. The request is a major amendment to demolish all the structures and construct six new medical buildings. Residents were concerned that this is a “done deal.” They are concerned that the additional 30,000 square feet will increase traffic and affect quality of life. In the last work session, the Commission spoke about the landscape track in the back being 25 feet in width. The Commission wanted resident input on tree selection and on an eight-foot tall wall. The applicant agreed to sign modifications requested by the Commission. The Statement of Direction (SOD) included consideration that the garden level be removed and placed at-grade.

Chairman Wastchak stated that they have received numerous letters from the residents concerned that there has not been enough opportunity to speak directly with the applicant. He indicated that he met with the applicant last week and they talked about having two neighborhood meetings. The applicant is willing to hold two meetings. They will present the project at the first meeting and hear from the residents. The second meeting will allow the residents to hear the applicant’s responses to their concerns. If a resident can’t make the first meeting, they can make the second meeting.

Commissioner Anton commented that it is important for residents to provide constructive criticism to the applicant.

Mr. Michaud summarized the SOD guidelines for traffic. The existing traffic is at a level of service D or better.

Paul Mood, Town Engineer, stated that he has looked at the report. Staff has looked at the report and believes that applicant has addressed the past comments.

Dawn Cartier with Civtech commented that they started with a simulation analysis of the Shea Boulevard and Tatum Boulevard intersection. This required them to observe the conditions in the field and preform extra counts. They found that the City of Phoenix would need to increase the length of the traffic cycle to 150 seconds to increase efficiency. This is a long cycle length and longer than the City would want. They asked the City for a longer north bound left turn green arrow during the evening peak

period.

Chairman Wastchak asked if the 150 seconds is in both the east-west and north-south direction.

Ms. Cartier confirmed that it is. The City has other signals in the area that need to be on the same cycle length.

Commissioner Wainwright asked if the City prefers a longer cycle.

Ms. Cartier commented that only at this intersection. They need more time for specific movements.

Commissioner Georgelos asked what else is the City of Phoenix going to be receptive to on traffic modifications. .

Ms. Cartier stated that she spoke with the City traffic engineer and he is open to increasing the green left bound arrow. The overall signal will need to stay at 150 seconds.

Commissioner Anton asked what impact the proposed development will have on this intersection.

Ms. Cartier stated that the overall impact is relatively small. These are six lane roads and are built to accommodate 40,000 cars per day and they are not at capacity yet. The overall increase would be around 1%. Under the rules they are still operating in acceptable conditions.

Chairman Wastchak asked Mr. Mood if these are recommendations that the Town could pursue.

Mr. Mood stated that he would work with Phoenix of some of these issues. This is a Phoenix intersection.

Ms. Cartier stated that they looked at the impact of U-turns that occur from vehicles heading south from Fry's and heading north. Phoenix will be installing a traffic signal on Shea Boulevard that aligns with the Trader Joe's driveway. This will allow a safe way for people to enter onto Shea Boulevard. This will be a significant improvement. It is expected to be constructed within 18 months.

Ms. Cartier stated that they analyzed bus bays on Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard. They modeled a bus through every 15 minutes. Every time a bus is stopped it would affect that cycle and then correct in the next cycle. The six lanes allow for slower traffic and buses on the outside lanes, so no

bus bays are recommended. They analyzed the need for deceleration lanes and used the criteria from Phoenix. On a six-lane roadway the City typically would not require a deceleration lane. They are not recommending these except in the area where they have the space. Phoenix did say that if the Town wants them, the right-of-way would come from behind the sidewalks within the Town boundaries.

She indicated that there was a question regarding signalizing Beryl Avenue and if this would be acceptable. The City of Phoenix does not like this idea, because there is nothing across the street to align it with the intersection. They did look at the signal warrants and they do not meet the volume warrants. The crash data does not warrant a signal either. There was only one crash in 2016 and four in 2017. There are only two that are correctable for a signal. It requires at least five correctable crashes.

Chairman Wastchak suggested that Ms. Cartier attend at least one of the public meetings to answer questions.

Ms. Cartier responded that she will make it to one of the meetings. She indicated that they were asked to look at parking and traffic into the Fire Brand Ranch neighborhood. They counted all occupied spaces and removed vacant spaces from the calculation. They got information from the current tenant of the increase in foot traffic. It is about 10% more. This was applied on a per square foot ratio. They were able to calculate what it would take to park the medical center at full capacity. This is their recommendation at a minimum parking ratio. The plan is showing even more than this amount of parking. The average vacancy at medical centers is around 10-15%. They did not see issues with parking in the neighborhood, but they did see cut through traffic. It is hard to track who is a resident of the neighborhood and not. Their counts show that of the 35 cars entering Beryl Avenue, five of these enter the Fire Brand Ranch neighborhood. In the morning about 13 cars enter the neighborhood. This seems reasonable for the amount of traffic they would expect.

She mentioned that they were asked to address the gating and restricting for the removal of the Beryl Avenue driveway access. The locations that are noted for gating have challenges in relation to the trash enclosure and parking areas that would not fall within the gate. The medical center driveway would be restricted at night. Gates could cause extra U-turn movements. She is not sure if there would be influence to the heavier traveled streets. Speed humps will have the biggest impact in slowing traffic.

Commissioner Anton stated that this is not a convenient place to cut through. His idea to shut down the street was to be a benefit to the adjacent

residents. This would help with controlling deliveries and noise.

Commissioner Lewis asked what the normal practice is to stripe Tatum Boulevard.

Ms. Cartier stated that Phoenix has not responded to this question yet.

Commissioner Covington stated that they need to ensure that people coming in and out of the medical plaza are safe as well.

Mr. Michaud described the exterior lighting guidelines. He commented that exterior lighting needs to be shielded and not to direct light onto adjacent property. Up lighting shall be 250 lumens or less. Pole lighting shall not exceed 16 feet in height. Light fixtures shall be setback the height of the fixture. Foot candles are limited to those allowed per their use. At the property lines the foot candle needs to be less than 0.5. Currently the site has bollards and ground lighting. The proposed lighting complies with SUP guidelines, although the pole lights and wall sconces may have a different feel than what exists today. There are two fixtures being used in the parking area. The pole height is 16 feet and the building mounted fixtures are mounted directly to the building. He presented a cut sheet of the proposed fixtures. He mentioned that there was a request to speak form submitted regarding this project.

Chairman Wastchak asked about a 16-foot pole light and asked if it is shielded so the residents in the neighborhood will see the light source.

Mr. Michaud responded that they shouldn't see it. He presented a detail of the light. These lights are setback at least 60 feet from the property line.

Commissioner Georgelos asked if a 16-foot pole height meets the height requirement.

Mr. Michaud responded that it does. The height cannot be higher than 16 feet. Currently the height is about 42 inches within bollards. The lumen count is within the guidelines.

Commissioner Campbell stated that he is not happy with the change from bollard lighting to pole lighting due to the number of residents looking into the site. In the past they have taken a strong stance to not have pole lighting.

Chairman Wastchak asked the applicant to speak to this issue.

John Cantrell commented that their thinking on the pole lights is that they

will provide more security by spreading out the light more. The photometrics show the lighting is far from the residential. They do have a mixture of bollards and poles. It provides a better level of lighting.

Chairman Wastchak stated that the existing condition seems to be working.

Commissioner Georgelos indicated that the pole lighting is too high.

Commissioner Wainwright stated that he is not in favor of the 16-foot poles. It may work in some areas of the site through.

Commissioner Covington asked if the security issues could be addressed through more bollards.

Commissioner Anton commented that they could do pole lights on the corner of Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard, but near the residents they should be bollards.

Commissioner Campbell mentioned that he is not opposed to a hybrid solution with poles remote from the residents. They could be hidden by the building configuration. He asked if they have any crime statistics to show they are trying to solve an existing problem.

Chairman Wastchak replied that this would be good to have.

In general, the Planning Commission was not in favor of the current lighting proposal.

Mr. Cantrell circled the interior poles that will need to be removed and replaced with bollards.

Mr. Michaud stated that they will have a work session on March 19, 2019 to discuss landscaping and architectural designs. They can discuss draft stipulations on April 2, 2019 and comments from the neighborhood meeting. They will need to revisit the construction phases. April 16, 2019 is the official public hearing.

Commissioner Lewis stated that this property has 1,000 feet of frontage. This is the entrance into the Town and there is no Town entrance signage. He would like to see open space on the perimeter of the property.

Chairman Wastchak noted that there is a sign on the corner now. He asked Commissioner Lewis to look at it and provide comments. The plan now is to keep the sign.

No Reportable Action

7. CONSENT AGENDA

A. [19-087](#) Approval of February 19, 2019 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Anton, seconded by Commissioner Covington, to approve the February 19, 2019 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

8. STAFF REPORTS

None

9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

Chairman Wastchak indicated that they need to have a discussion regarding the Smoke Tree Resort process and asked if they could do this in executive session

Mr. Miller responded that they could not do this in executive session. That item has been concluded so it would not be appropriate to have a continuing discussion about that application. They could set up a work session to discuss process. On complicated cases they could have a work session to plan the number of work sessions that they will have. More time may need to be built into the process.

Commissioner Campbell stated that they may need a retreat because it appears they have a communication break down and commissioners need to voice their concerns earlier in the process. They have had retreats in the past to help get more comfortable with each other.

Mr. Miller stated that usually they will prepare several topics to discuss prior to the retreat.

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Mr. Knapp mentioned that they will have a hearing for 3474 E Valley Vista Lane, Valley Vista Minor SUP amendment, Camelback Golf Club Minor Amendment for the maintenance netting and a work session on Mountainview Medical.

Commissioner Anton requested that they put the golf club at the head of the line.

11. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Lewis at 9:32 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Georgelos, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: 

Jeremy Knapp, Secretary