# Smoke Tree Resort -Statement of Direction (SOD)Comparative Analysis November 19, 2020

Below is a comparative list or analysis of the Smoke Tree Resort SOD, Plans, and Special Use Permit (SUP) Guidelines.

No.	SOD Topic	Town Code/Special Use Permit Guideline/Town	Proposed by Applicant and/or Suggested SOD Focus
No.	Use More information needed regarding hotel quality standards and new accessory uses. Applicant proposed fourteen accessory uses for forward-facing portions of site that should be considered and defined or narrowed as appropriate as well as specific operational factors (hours of operation, outdoor seating, etc.) shall be studied.		
			Development Agreement, reviewed and approved by Council, includes specific details on minimum improvements for public areas such as the restaurant serving 3 daily meals, variety of interior finishes, minimum features within each key, and acceptable hotel brands.
			Determination is whether the proposed uses and hotel quality standards meet the high quality design policy of the General Plan and the "world-class resorts" vision of luxury or upscale. The applicant stated there is a niche market being a modern reinterpretation of the resort experience by entering into a referral program to nearby resorts (e.g. spa at Andaz resort), the grouping of rooms with an ability to close off hallway areas for small groups (6 to 12 rooms), catering to guests that want to be in a higher energy area (e.g., walking to Scottsdale dining/ shopping), and the price point complements other resort uses instead of competes.

# 2 Density

The proposed 122 units creates a density of approximately 26 units per acre. The Commission shall take into consideration 4.6 net acre site area and reduced density on west and south sides of site, particularly how the density impacts safety and quality of life of town residents.

The SUP Guidelines recommend that resort has:

Minimum site area of 20 acres

Maximum density of guest units of 1 unit for each 4,000 sf of site area (being 10.9 units per acre)

Site is within the East Lincoln Drive Development Area in General Plan whereby "The Town should encourage moderate intensity, mixed-use, and context appropriate resort development within the East Lincoln Drive Development Areas that includes reasonable separation between incompatible uses and adjacent residential areas and effective buffering of unwanted noise, light, traffic and other adverse impacts."

Complies or not depending on viewpoint whether meets "moderate intensity" and is "context appropriate"; along with view on density impacting safety and quality of life.

Site area: 4.6 net acres (5.0 gross acres)

Density:

122 guest units

26.5 units/net acre (24.4 units/gross acre) 115 guest units

25.0 units/net acre (23.0 units/gross acre) SUP Guideline

10.9 units/net acre

50 guest units (net) or 55 guest units (gross)

There is no definition of moderate intensity, so there is a value judgement on whether additional guest units above the SUP Guideline meet "moderate intensity" and is "context appropriate." The proposed density is 2.2 to 2.4 times greater than the SUP Guideline. The applicant cites consideration for a density above the SUP Guidelines due to the site being ¼ the size of the 20-acre minimum for resorts (5.01 gross acres and 4.61 net acres), being located in a Development Area which allows for "moderate intensity," and adjoining non-residential uses on three sides.

# 3 Lot Coverage/FAR

The Planning Commission shall consider lot coverage and floor area ratio while acknowledging the unique characteristics considered in the Development Area and the amendments made to the proposed site development since the Planning Commission last heard this request on March 5, 2019. The review shall address reasonable separation between incompatible uses and effective buffering of unwanted noise, light, traffic, views of the buildings offsite, and other adverse impacts. The lot coverage and floor area ratio shall both be calculated based on net lot area, excluding all dedicated area. There may be consideration of lowering the proposed lot coverage and floor area ratio and/or requiring specific mitigation measures.

Exceeds the lot coverage SUP Guideline, but the SOD allows for consideration based on mitigation measures that are proposed via the draft stipulations and the applicant points to property characteristics in the small 4.6 net-acre size, location in a Development Area, and adjoining non-residential on 3 sides.

The SUP Guidelines recommend:

25% maximum lot coverage

No guideline on Floor Area Ratio (FAR)

Total impervious surface of 60%

Lot coverage: 29.3% net (27.0% gross)

FAR: 64.0% net (59.0% gross)

Total impervious: 85% net (78% gross)

# 4 Height

The Planning Commission shall evaluate the proposed height and its impact on adjacent properties. The minimum height is encouraged on the west side of the site closest to existing residential properties. transitioning to higher heights on the east side of the site adiacent to Lincoln Medical Plaza, A compelling reason must be given for heights proposed over 36', with such height to be limited in area and considered when necessary for mechanical screening and architectural elements. It is recommended that all heights be taken from original natural grade. If any portion of the rooftop is visible offsite, care should be taken to minimize the impact and screen mechanical equipment. White roofing material is discouraged if visible off-site.

SUP Guidelines recommend the following:

Principal Structures – 36'

Accessory Structures – 24'

Service Structures - 18'

Towers/architectural features may exceed max building heights, subject to SUP approval.

There is no SUP Guideline on Light Reflective Value.

Overall, the proposed heights comply with SUP Guidelines, except for recessing the interior pool area resulting in a 38' height from excavated grade and the Pavilion (32' max) and Pedestrian Courtyard Access archway (32' max) are taller than the 24' SUP Guideline for Accessory Structures. There are many buildings lower the maximum SUP Guidelines (e.g. luxury suites at max 28' versus 36').

Heights measured from Original Natural Grade (ONG) using the average of 1310.5'

<u>Principal Structures</u> are generally on the south half of the site being the main resort 2-and 3-story building with guest rooms, the 2-story luxury suite buildings, and the guest reception building. Heights vary from 18, 28', and 36' from ONG (with the interior area near the pool at 38' tall). Lower heights closer to the west property line.

Accessory Structures are the remaining buildings shown and generally the north half of the site along Lincoln Drive. Heights vary from 18, 20', and 24' from ONG (with the pedestrian archway at a max height of 32' and the Pavilion hipped roof at 32')

Service Structures - None

Stipulation 43 sets the maximum height at 36' from ONG, which includes towers/ architectural features. Sheet A27, Exterior Elevations, is the primary sheet illustrating heights. Sheets A33 and A35 show the main resort at the pool area. The Pedestrian Courtyard Access archway and Pavilion are noted above. There are also chimney elements on the restaurant, 2-story roof of the main resort building, and on some of the luxury suite buildings.

Draft Stipulation No. 25 states: The surfaces and colors of all roofs shall have a Light Reflective Value at or less than 50%.

# 5 Viewsheds

The Planning Commission shall consider the impact to adjoining properties of any encroachment outside of the imaginary plane suggested by the Open Space Criteria. Due to the size of this property being one quarter the suggested 20-acre size per the Special Use Permit Guidelines and the location adjoining other commercial uses, a limited amount of encroachment is proposed and may be permissible. Structures are suggested to generally stair-step from onestory/lowest height closer to the subject site property lines to not more than threestory/36 feet in height from Lincoln Drive, Quail Run Road, and the adjoining Andaz resort. Planning Commission focus shall be that the overall mass of the structures are of an appropriate scale, with special consideration given to the views from the south side bordering the Andaz resort and the west side bordering Quail Run Road.

Viewsheds are a result or combination of setback and heights. The SUP Guidelines recommend the building heights meet the OSC (which helps maintain a view corridor by centering the mass or height of buildings towards the center of the property).

OSC - No building shall penetrate an imaginary plane beginning at 16 feet above the natural grade and 20 feet from exterior property lines, which plane slopes upward at a ratio of one foot vertically for each five feet horizontally measured perpendicular to the nearest property line

Overall, the proposed heights comply with OSC, except for a portion of the Pedestrian Courtyard Access archway and portion of the 3<sup>rd</sup> story adjoining the medical plaza.

There is OSC encroachment along the front/north and east side (Per Sheet A28, Resort Building encroaches 13' above the OSC and Pedestrian Courtyard Entry Structure encroaches approximately 5' above the OSC). The encroachment is mostly along the east side adjoining the medical plaza.

# 6 Setbacks

The amended proposal increased building setbacks along much of the perimeter of the site. The Planning Commission shall explore appropriate setbacks, with particular attention to the privacy and noise levels for residents west of the site and resort guests south of the site. Consideration should be given to a 100-foot SUP guideline setback to the adjacent residential property lines. The Commission shall also identify any mitigating circumstances that may buffer the development (e.g. the use of vegetation, modified setbacks or heights, reorientation of the structures, etc.).

SUP Guidelines:

Minimum distance from exterior property lines:

Principal Structures – 100' (whether to residential or other)

Accessory Structure

- 60' (adjoining residential)
- 40' (adjoining other)

Service Structure - 100'

Pools & Game Courts

- 200' (adjoining residential)
- 65' (adjoining other)

Parking lots and interior drives, excluding exterior points of access

- 60' (adjoining residential)
- 40' (adjoining other)

Equestrian uses – 200'

## Complies as noted below in each section

Minimum setbacks for all structures:

<u>Principal Structures</u>. Only complies with SUP Guidelines to north from Lincoln Dr (Only residential is to the west property line)

- 165' from north property line
- 50' from west property line (nearest structures are 18' and 28' tall, 36' portions have setback ~230'. As a comparison, residential zoned parcel larger than 4 acres from street allows up to 30' tall main home at 40' setback)
- 60' from south property line
- 45' from east property line

<u>Accessory Structures</u>. Complies with SUP Guidelines (Only residential is to the west property line)

- 52'6" from north property line
- 75' from west property line (Pavilion is nearest building, Event Lawn pergola at entry at 50' setback/20')
- 290' from south property line (Event Lawn pergola is the furthest south structure)
- 45' from east property line

N/A - No Detached Service Structures

<u>Pool</u>. Complies with SUP Guidelines (Only residential is to the west property line/ no game courts)

- 250' from north property line
- 240' from west property line
- 170' from south property line
- 120' from east property line

Parking Lot and Drive Aisles. Not in compliance, similar to existing in areas and up to 17' including right-of-way for Lincoln Dr and up to 25' including right-of-way for Quail Run Rd

- 5' from north property line
- 3' from west property line
- 3' from south property line
- 3' from east property line

N/A - No equestrian facilities or barns

# 7 Impact to Adjacent Uses

The proposal has the resort restaurant and market (with outside tables) along the north side of the property near Lincoln Drive. Additionally, a third story bar/lounge with indoor/outdoor space is proposed, which should be evaluated for square footage (bar/rooftop deck), types of uses, impacts of light and noise trespass offsite; a sound study shall be required and certified by an acoustical engineer. The Planning Commission shall consider impacts including noise, light, traffic and any other adverse impacts, particularly for those existing residential properties west of the site along Quail Run Road, In particular, outdoor employee areas and service uses such as maintenance, maid service/laundry, trash collection/storage, mechanical equipment (roof/ground), and all other noise generating elements shall be studied and buffering of uses shall be considered.

SUP Guidelines:

# Outdoor Lighting

See Item 8 below

Noise. Town Code limits stationary/fixed noise to: 7 am - 10 pm: 56 db 10 pm - 7 am: 45 db Sundays & Holidays: 45 db

Parking & Traffic
Refer to Item 9 below for more information

Parking and driveway areas located to prevent lights from shining onto adjacent residential property

Parking areas and driveways located within 200 feet of adjacent residentially zoned property shall be screened with a minimum 3' high, solid, decorative wall or a landscaped berm providing equivalent screening or a combination of both

No loading, truck parking, trash containers or outdoor storage area shall be located within 100 feet of adjacent residentially zoned property. All such areas shall provide visual and noise screening to minimize impacts on adjacent residential property

Complies as noted below in each section

# Outdoor Lighting

See Item 8 below

#### Noise.

Complies if accept the noise mitigation factors identified in Stipulations 36 – 42

Acoustical study identified that ambient noise on Lincoln is greater than 45 db/56 db limits.

Acoustical study models potential operational noise for entire site to verify compliance with Town's noise standards.

# Parking & Traffic

Complies if support the parking and traffic studies, along with use stipulations (Stipulations 32-35) and right-of-way/parking/circulation stipulations (Stipulations 44-57)

Parking placed on perimeter of property. Main entrance/driveway on Quail Run Rd and shared entrance/driveway on Lincoln Dr

3' tall screen wall at north and west property lines

6' tall hedge at south and east property lines Existing masonry wall at south property line

Trash located near east property line 150' from the proposed Lincoln Drive right-of-way (next to medical plaza). It has a setback 420' from the west property line adjoining residentially-zoned property. 6' tall trash enclosure wall

2 back of house locations:

East back of house location has loading delivery area facing Lincoln Medical Plaza West back of house is located between Restaurant and Pavilion. These are accessed via the shared driveway along the east side and screened by the buildings, along with a 8' tall rolling gate at the loading area.

# 8 Landscaping, Utilities and Exterior Lighting

Planning Commission focus on landscaping and exterior lighting shall be along the perimeter of the site, including review of appropriate screening or relocation of the utility cabinets along Lincoln Drive. Consideration for possible relocation of utility cabinets shall consider aesthetics, long-term maintenance and operation, safety and cost. Elements of the Visually Significant Corridors Plan shall be considered for landscaping along Lincoln Drive. A stipulation shall be considered to ensure replacement of any landscaping should it die.

SUP Guidelines recommend the following:

# **Outdoor Lighting**

Light source hooded and shielded so not visible from an adjacent property

Up-lighting not greater than 300 lumens

Pole lights limited to maximum height of 16' tall and minimum setback equal to height of the fixture

Maximum output of 0.5 ft candles adjacent to residential property. 0.75 max foot-candle (fc) output by Zoning Ordinance

#### Landscaping

SUP Guideline 30' wide landscape buffer adjoining local/collector streets

SUP Guideline 50' wide landscape buffer adjoining major/minor arterial streets

No landscape buffer guideline along non-residential property lines

Landscaped islands shall be provided every 100 feet within surface parking areas. Shade tree planters shall be provided between every four stalls

# Complies as noted below in each section

## Outdoor Lighting

Complies with SUP Guidelines, except 7 12' tall pole light setbacks less than height of pole.

Fixtures hooded and shielded

Up-lights 250 lumens

Parking lot pole lights reduced from 16' height to 12' height. 2' setback from north, 16' from east (except fixture near trash enclosure), 20' from west, and 16' from south

0 - 0.3 fc at property lines

#### Landscaping

**Not in compliance**. 5' (up to 17.5' including right-of-way); Existing 0' (~7' including right-of-way)

**Not in compliance**. 3' (areas up to 25' on site); Existing similar factor in right-of-way dedication and setback of buildings

**N/A.** The south and east property lines are similar to the existing minimum condition at mostly 3'to 4' setback

**Generally complies**. Approximate shade trees adjoining property lines:

- North every 4 stalls
- East varies up to every 10 stalls (also adjoins oleander hedge)
- South every 9 stalls (also adjoins oleander and sour orange hedge)
- West every 8 stalls(with trees in the right-of-way)

Section 5-10-7.D, Town Code requires landscaping along the rights-of-way at 4 fifteengallon native trees and 5 onegallon native shrubs every 100 lineal feet, unless otherwise approved by the Town; 1996 landscape guidelines have a lessor calculation of 1 canopy tree at 30' intervals and shrubs at 20' intervals; SUP Guidelines also suggest 20% of the trees be Ironwood.

Visually Significant Corridor - Resort Living Zone

Stipulation if landscaping dies

## **Utility Cabinets**

The VSC Plan recommends utilities should be painted to blend with their background and/or screening should incorporate stone and patterns selected from the applicable Character Zone (e.g. weathered steel framed panel segments which are able to be opened at multiple locations. Including layered cut-metal mountain motif and varying the opening size of a metal mesh to create lavering and visual movement in the screen patterns)

Generally complies. Based on the right-of-way frontage for this site (being approximately 425' along Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road excluding driveway area), unless special circumstances exist, each street frontage requires between 14 to 17 native trees and 21 shrubs. The proposed landscape plan has 12 trees along Quail Run Road and 20 trees along Lincoln Drive (counting the 12 Acacia trees within the parking spaces fronting Lincoln Drive). Each street frontage has over 100 shrubs and/or cactus. 3 Ironwoods, but these are internal to the site.

Generally complies. Landscaping will be placed around the perimeter of the resort and throughout the resort campus. The palette consists of a mixture of trees, shrubs, and accent cactus. The primary palette includes Date Palms, Live Oaks, Palo Verdes, Acacia, sour orange, oleander, hop bush, lantana, red yucca, aloe, boxwood beauty, and lady's slipper. The proposed landscape plan also includes plants from the Resort Living Character Zone (the corridor east of Mockingbird Lane along Lincoln Drive) in the Visually Significant Corridors Master Plan, such as Desert Willows, Ironwood, Palo Verde, Aloe, Sage, and Yucca.

**Complies.** Stipulation 69 addresses replacing dead landscaping

#### **Utility Cabinets**

**Complies.** Sheet A40 showing decorative metal screen and landscaping around existing APS cabinet location

Sheet A41 showing two potential areas of relocation of the existing APS utility cabinet

The Development Agreement and Stipulations No. 12, 27, and 28 address utility cabinet screening and/or relocation

# 9 Traffic, Parking, Access, and Circulation

The proposed density and location within a heavilytraveled and mixeduse density area near the City of Scottsdale creates a heightened need for ensuring the proposed redevelopment does not have a negative impact on traffic safety, parking, and circulation. The Town Council has worked with the owner of Smoke Tree Resort and Lincoln Plaza Medical Center on access with a solution for a shared driveway, along with right-of-way improvements. The Planning Commission shall focus their review on the following:

Location and screening of loading zones and dumpsters

Deceleration turn lane for eastbound traffic entering the site

Cross-access easement(s) with Lincoln Medical Plaza

Sidewalk and other pedestrian circulation

The SUP Guidelines recommend the following:

SUP Guidelines suggest parking calculation based on uses, allowing shared parking based on information documenting overlapping usage of on-site facilities by guests or visitors and as contained in an approved traffic and parking analysis

General Plan recommends the following:

Major Arterial Cross Section with 130' width (or 65' half width) with median, 24' of asphalt, 2' curbs, and a 6' wide sidewalk

Local Cross Section with 50' width (or 25' half width), 24' of asphalt and 2' curbs

Complies if support the parking and traffic studies, along with use stipulations (Stipulations 32-35) and right-of-way/parking/circulation stipulations (Stipulations 44-57). Also refer to Item 7 above.

The SUP parking by use is 333 parking spaces, the parking study uses a shared parking model approach modeling a top peak parking demand of 187 parking spaces. The project proposal is for 170 traditional on-site parking spaces that can increase to 199 on-site parking spaces in valet mode and a total of 224 parking spaces using the 25 available contract parking spaces with the adjoining medical plaza during certain times.

<u>Lincoln Drive</u>. 45'6" half street (post dedication) with 25.5' of asphalt, 2' wide curb, and 6' wide sidewalk

Deceleration/turn lane that takes you to the shared entrance at the east property line with Lincoln Plaza Medical Center

Quail Run Road. 25' of half street (post dedication) and will comply with Town pavement standards north of resort entry

The primary loading/unloading and dumpsters are at the northeast area of the site setback at least 100' from Lincoln Drive and away from nearby residential and nearby resort units.

The plan includes a deceleration lane on Lincoln Dr

Cross-access easements will be addressed in the Development Agreement.

Sidewall and pedestrian circulation is shown on the site plan (Sheet A8)

Necessary roadway dedication for Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road

Adequacy of the required and provided parking spaces based on the proposed use(s) which shall allow for adequate parking throughout the life of the project that shall be identified in a Parking Management Plan.

Full build-out of The Ritz-Carlton Resort Special Use Permit

Uses that generate quick turn-around trips such as a coffee shop or take-out food

The Development Agreement, Sheet A7 of the Approved Plans, and Stipulations 44 and 45 address right-of-way dedication.

The Parking Management Plan and related parking/traffic studies were submitted and reviewed. Compliance is an individual judgement call.

The parking/traffic studies included full buildout of the Five Star development.

The Parking Management Plan and related parking/traffic studies were submitted and reviewed. Compliance is an individual judgement call. These uses are "Resort Retail" in the definition section of the ordinance intended for primary use by guests and the Stipulation 35 limits the public use of such areas to square footages consistent with the parking study.

# 10 Signage

Planning Commission review shall focus on the impact of project sign location, dimensions, and illumination on the resulting impact to the streetscape. The Commission shall look at the broader signage plan for Lincoln Drive including proposed gateway signs, identification signs, and Ritz-Carlton and Lincoln Medical Plaza signage.

# Zoning Ordinance

- No permanent signs in the right-of-way
- Light element cannot be visible/ must be fully shielded
- No moving/flashing signs
- Backlight-illumination requires max 100 lumens per lineal foot
- Double-sided sign counted as 2 signs
- Internally-illumination 0.75 foot-candles at property line
- Externally illumination 3000 Kelvins max
- Illuminated when business open

# SUP Guidelines

 Identification sign at each entrance

# Complies as noted below in each section

# Proposed signs comply with Zoning Ordinance requirements

No proposed resort signage in the rights-ofway.

Stipulation 58 requires all signs be compliant with Article XXV, Signs, of the Town Zoning Ordinance.

In addition to Stipulation 58 noted above, the photometric plan on Sheet A16 includes the both the exterior light fixtures and sign illumination. The light out near the perimeter signs show a maximum output of 0.3 fc.

Sheet A17 depicts the backlit signage as 2700 Kelvins.

Resort identification, monument signs at the street entrances shown on Sheet A37, and the Pedestrian Courtyard Access sign shown on Sheet A38 have no proposed hours to be turned off as the resort is open 24 hours a day. This will also be the case with any direction/wayfinding signage. Stipulation 62 requires market, coffee shop, and other ancillary signage not be visible off property and requires Town Manager approval. Any hours such signs may be illuminated can be addressed with that approval as this is not specifically addressed in any stipulation.

#### Resort Identification:

Complies, except in number. Monument 1 is 8 sf larger than the Guideline and Monument 2 is 8 sf smaller than the Guideline. 5 identification signs (includes Pedestrian Courtyard Access sign) whereby the Guideline would suggest 3 signs (one for each entrance)

Minor/Major Street, 8' max tall, 40 square feet (sf) max sign area

Others, 4' max tall, 32 sf max sign area

Monument 1 sign is slightly larger in sign area than the SUP Guideline and Monument 2 is has less sign area than the Guideline.

Technically, there are 5 resort identification signs for three driveways.

Monument 1 at corner of Lincoln Dr and Quail Run Rd at 3'6" tall, 12' long, and 48 sf in area. Backlit letters.

Monument 2 at east/shared entrance on Lincoln Dr at 4' tall, 8' long, and 32 sf in area. Backlit letters.

Auto Court. One sign on each side of primary entrance on Quail Run Rd at 4' tall, 8' long, and 32 sf in area (each). Backlit letters.

 A sign, mounted on an exterior wall of any structure shall contain only structure identification as necessary for emergency access

# Building Signage

A few SUP properties have buildingmounted signs (i.e., Phoenix Country Day School, Paradise Valley United Methodist, Five Star), with others having building signage not visible from off-property (i.e., Camelback Inn). Stipulation 59 prohibits outward facing signs visible from street or adjoining properties.

Pedestrian Courtyard Access Sign mounted on pedestrian archway facing Lincoln Dr and setback 55' from north property line, approximately 15' tall, and 40 sf in area. Backlit letters.

Resort Retail signage permissible if not visible from off property and approved by Town Manager per Stipulation 62:

**Complies.** Light source hooded and shielded and compliant with 0.3 ft candle output at property line. No changeable copy.

**Complies**. Stipulation 58 requires SUP Guidelines to be met and Stipulation 60 requires Town Manager approval for new directional/wayfinding

- Illumination per Zoning Ordinance
- Changeable copy permitted
- Traffic/directional signs 5' max tall, 12 sf max area