

Smoke Tree Resort Compliance Detail November 10, 2020

Below is a detailed review of the proposed Special Use Permit amendment (SUP-18-05) compared to the Special Use Permit (SUP) Guidelines and other provisions. These items were reviewed by the Planning Commission during July 2020 through November 2020.

History

Use of the property for guest services began prior to its annexation into the Town in 1961. At annexation, the property operated as a resort and restaurant in much the same configuration as it presently exists. The primary building area consists of separate single-story buildings for up to 30 guest units and related functions (17,100 square feet) and an accessory use for a stand-alone restaurant (7,000 square feet). The original Special Use Permit (SUP) was issued on March 13, 1969. There is limited information on past approvals and stipulations for this property. Historically, the property has not had many building permits issued or amendments to its Special Use Permit zoning. The latest activity included renovations to the restaurant in 2007 that never opened.

SUP-18-05 Application Summary

The owner submitted the original Special Use Permit amendment application in May 2018. The Town Council issued its first Statement of Direction in October 2018 (with an extension granted in January 2019). At that time, the proposal included 165 guest units (120 guest rooms and 30 resort residential units with 15 lock-offs). The total floor area proposed was 145,000 square feet and lot coverage at 80,000 square feet. The uses were in a few larger building clusters, with the main guest unit building at 3-stories (with architectural portions up to 45-foot tall and at a 20-foot setback to the south and east property lines). The Planning Commission after several work sessions recommended denial in March 2019.

The applicant revised their plan to the present request between Fall 2019 and May 2020. Town Council issued a revised Statement of Direction in June 2020 (with an extension granted in September 2020). The Planning Commission was given from July 2020 to November 2020 to forward a recommendation to Council.

General Plan/ Zoning

The subject property has a General Plan designation of "Resort/Country Club" pursuant to the Town's General Plan Land Use Map (Attachment B). The zoning on the property is "Special Use Permit - Resort". The proposed resort use is in conformance with this designation and zoning.

Several General Plan policies apply related to the request for redevelopment of the Smoke Tree property. Primary policies that apply are the policies of Goal LU 2.1.2, Special Use Permit Property Revitalization, and several of the policies of Goal DA 2.2.1, Development Area Policy. The site is located in the East Lincoln Development Area that encourages moderate intensity, mixed-use, and context appropriate resort development that includes reasonable separation between incompatible uses and adjacent residential areas and effective buffering of unwanted noise, light, traffic and other adverse impacts. Also, the General Plan encourages upgrading existing structures and properties to improve their physical condition to acceptable Town standards.

Enforcement

As of the date of this report, there are no known active code violations on the subject site.

Use

Article 11 of Zoning Ordinance states a resort is a facility, operated under a single unified management structure, containing guest units primarily for the temporary residency of persons in a physical setting that provides a high level of guest amenities, recreational opportunities and a quality of design that may include architectural features, extensive open space and landscaping. In addition, the Town's Special Use Permit Guidelines defines principal structures as those containing guest units or those containing guest registration areas, facility administrative offices and accessory uses. Principal structures with guest units also may contain permitted accessory uses. It further defines accessory structures shall be those containing accessory uses. The proposal only includes principal and accessory structures.

The narrative dated Oct 1, 2020 generally describes the resort features and uses. Sheet A6 also provides this information. Sheets A8 – A10 identify uses and key count. Uses include 122 hotel rooms (102 in main hotel building and 20 in luxury suites). Resort related accessory uses include restaurant, market/retail, coffee shop, meeting spaces, event lawn, and an event pavilion.

Draft Ordinance 2020-09 includes stipulations that provide parameters for the uses. This includes SUP Stipulations: Item II *Definitions* define the scope of the Resort Hotel and the Resort Ancillary Facilities and Uses, Stipulation 75 required operation under a single unified management structure., and Item III.C *Allowed Uses* outlines the scope and limitations on the various resort uses (e.g. hours of operation, limits on the third-floor area, etc.).

There is also a development agreement that will be reviewed and approved by Council. It includes specific details on minimum improvements for public areas such as the restaurant serving 3 daily meals, variety of interior finishes, minimum features within each key, and acceptable hotel brands.

The largest amount of floor area proposed are in principal structures. The primary building area (80,000 square feet total) with this application is for 122 resort guest units and related functions. Related function space within the primary building area includes a kitchenette/fitness area on the third floor for only guest use (3,470 square feet total – 2,000 square feet interior, 670 square feet enclosed terrace, and 800 square feet exterior terrace). The proposed uses for the remaining building area (48,500 square feet) are for accessory uses. This includes group meeting space (4,000 square feet), a stand-alone restaurant in a similar location to the past restaurant (3,200 square feet), two buildings for resort retail for primary use by guests shown as a market/coffee shop building and in the guest reception building (2,750 square feet total – 2,000 square feet market, 500 square feet coffee shop, and 250 square feet in the guest reception building where guests check in and out of the resort), and remaining space for various back of house services.

The General Plan references resorts in Town have high quality design and are “world-class resorts” being luxury or upscale. The applicant stated there is a niche market being a modern reinterpretation of the resort experience by entering into a referral program to nearby resorts (e.g. spa at Andaz resort), the grouping of rooms with an ability to close off hallway areas for small groups (6 to 12 rooms), catering to guests that want to be in a higher energy area (e.g., walking to Scottsdale dining/shopping), and the price point complements other resort uses instead of competes.

Density

The SUP Guidelines recommend that a resort have a minimum site area of 20 acres and a maximum density of guest units of 1 unit for each 4,000 square feet of site area (being 10.9 units per acre).

The subject site is within the East Lincoln Drive Development Area in General Plan whereby “The Town should encourage moderate intensity, mixed-use, and context appropriate resort development within the East Lincoln Drive Development Areas that includes reasonable separation between incompatible uses and adjacent residential areas and effective buffering of unwanted noise, light, traffic and other adverse impacts.”

The Council Statement of Direction adds that there be consideration of the 4.6 net acre site area and reduced density on west and south sides of site, particularly how the density impacts safety and quality of life of town residents. Complies or not depending on viewpoint whether meets the General Plan development area guidance for “moderate intensity” and is “context appropriate”; along with view on density impacting safety and quality of life through the draft stipulations and various studies provided (parking management plan, parking study, traffic impact analysis, preliminary drainage report, wastewater capacity study, and acoustical study).

The applicant requests consideration for a density and lot coverage above the SUP Guidelines due to the site being ¼ the size of the 20-acre minimum for resorts (5.01 gross acres and 4.61 net acres), being located in a Development Area which allows for “moderate intensity, mixed-use, and context appropriate resort development within the East Lincoln Drive Development Areas that includes reasonable separation between incompatible uses and adjacent residential areas and effective buffering of unwanted noise, light, traffic and other adverse impacts,” and adjoining non-residential uses on three sides. The proposed 122 resort guest units creates a density of approximately 26.5 units per net acre (24.4 units per gross acre) compared to the Town’s SUP Guideline of one unit for each 4,000 square feet of site area (or 10.9 units per acre, suggesting 50 or 55 resort guest units depending on use of net or gross acreage). The table below shown to the Planning Commission previously provides a comparison of the proposed project to existing resort developments within the town limits.

SUP PROPERTY	TOTAL SITE ACREAGE	TOTAL UNITS	DENSITY (UNITS/ACRE)	MAX HEIGHT (FEET)
Five- Star Ritz Carlton	99	458 *	4.6	48
Mtn Shadows	68.5	331 *	4.8	36
Montelucia Omni	28	327 *	11.7	44**
Scottsdale Plaza	36.5	404	11.1	28'
Hermosa Inn	6.4	49	7.7	26
Sanctuary on Camelback Mtn	17	174 *	10.2	24
Andaz	27.5	201	7.3	25
Camelback Inn	117	453 *	3.9	36
Doubletree PV	18.8	378	20.1	28
Smoke Tree (Proposed)	4.6	122	26.5	36
AVERAGES (Excludes Smoke Tree Resort)	46.5	308	9.0	

* Includes for-sale product allowable in rental program

** Lodge at 36', architectural elements up to 44'

Area (Lot) Coverages

The SUP Guidelines recommend that a resort have a minimum 25% maximum lot coverage and total impervious surface area of 60%. There are no guidelines on Floor Area Ratio (FAR). The proposed project has a lot coverage of 29.3% net (27.0% gross), total impervious area of 85% net (78% gross), and FAR: 64.0% net (59.0% gross).

The Council Statement of Direction adds acknowledging the unique characteristics considered in the Development Area and the amendments made to the proposed site development since the Planning Commission last heard this request on March 5, 2019. The review shall address reasonable separation between incompatible uses and effective buffering of unwanted noise, light, traffic, views of the buildings offsite, and other adverse impacts. The lot coverage and floor area ratio shall both be calculated based on net lot area, excluding all dedicated area. There may be consideration of lowering the proposed lot coverage and floor area ratio and/or requiring specific mitigation measures.

SUP PROPERTY	TOTAL ESTIMATED DRIP LINE (SF)	LOT COVERAGE (%)	TOTAL ESTIMATED FLOOR AREA (SF)	ESTMATED FAR (%)
Five- Star Ritz Carlton	746,168	24.6	1,129,168	26.2
Mtn Shadows	767,524	25.7	Not available	Not available
Montelucia Omni	400,126	32.9	555,116	45.5
Scottsdale Plaza	351,107	22.0	Not available	Not available
Hermosa Inn	67,778	24.3	67,778	7.7
Sanctuary on Camelback Mtn	149,986	16.8	Not available	Not available
Andaz	141,000	11.8	141,000	11.8
Camelback Inn	400,000	7.8	Not available	Not available
Doubletree PV	173,970	21.2	257,251	31.4
<i>Smoke Tree (Proposed)</i>	58,832	29.3	128,150	64.0
AVERAGES (Excludes Smoke Tree Resort)	355,295	20.8		

Height

The SUP Guidelines recommend that principal structures not exceed 36 feet tall, accessory structures not exceed 24' tall, and service structures not exceed 18 feet tall. The SUP Guidelines further allows for towers/architectural features to exceed maximum building heights, subject to SUP approval.

The Council Statement of Direction adds that the minimum height is encouraged on the west side of the site closest to existing residential properties, transitioning to higher heights on the east side of the site adjacent to Lincoln Medical Plaza. A compelling reason must be given for heights proposed over 36', with such height to be limited in area and considered when necessary for mechanical screening and architectural elements. It is recommended that all heights be taken from original natural grade. If any portion of the rooftop is visible off-site, care should be taken to minimize the impact and screen mechanical equipment. White roofing material is discouraged if visible off-site.

Overall, the proposed heights comply with SUP Guidelines, except for recessing the interior pool area resulting in a 38' height from excavated grade and the Pavilion (32' max) and Pedestrian Courtyard Access archway (32' max) are taller than the 24' SUP Guideline for Accessory Structures. There are many buildings lower the maximum SUP Guidelines (e.g. luxury suites at max 28' versus 36'). Heights measured from Original Natural Grade (ONG) using the average of 1310.5'

The table below shown to the Planning Commission previously provides a comparison of the proposed project to existing resort developments within the town limits.

SUP PROPERTY	MAX HEIGHT (FEET)
Five- Star Ritz Carlton	48
Mtn Shadows	36
Montelucia Omni	44**
Scottsdale Plaza	28'
Hermosa Inn	26
Sanctuary on Camelback Mtn	24
Andaz	25
Camelback Inn	36
Doubletree PV	28
Smoke Tree (Proposed)	36
AVERAGES (Excludes Smoke Tree Resort) ** Lodge at 36', architectural elements up to 44	32

Principal Structures are generally on the south half of the site being the main resort 2-and 3-story building with guest rooms, the 2-story luxury suite buildings, and the guest reception building. Heights vary from 18, 28', and 36' from ONG (with the interior area near the pool at 38' tall). Lower heights closer to the west property line. Accessory Structures are the remaining buildings shown and generally the north half of the site along Lincoln Drive. Heights vary from 18, 20', and 24' from ONG (with the pedestrian archway at a max height of 32' and the Pavilion hipped roof at 32').

Stipulation 43 sets the maximum height at 36' from ONG, which includes towers/ architectural features. Sheet A27, Exterior Elevations, is the primary sheet illustrating heights. Sheets A33 and A35 show the main resort at the pool area. The Pedestrian Courtyard

Access archway and Pavilion are noted above. There are also chimney elements on the restaurant, 2-story roof of the main resort building, and on some of the luxury suite buildings. Draft Stipulation No. 25 states: The surfaces and colors of all roofs shall have a Light Reflective Value at or less than 50%.

The visual below illustrates the proposed heights:



Open Space Criteria (OSC) [Viewsheds]

Viewsheds are a result or combination of setback and heights. The SUP Guidelines recommend the building heights meet the OSC (which helps maintain a view corridor by centering the mass or height of buildings towards the center of the property). OSC is when no building shall penetrate an imaginary plane beginning at 16 feet above the natural grade and 20 feet from exterior property lines, which plane slopes upward at a ratio of one foot vertically for each five feet horizontally measured perpendicular to the nearest property line.

The Council Statement of Direction adds that due to the size of this property being one quarter the suggested 20-acre size per the Special Use Permit Guidelines and the location adjoining other commercial uses, a limited amount of encroachment is proposed and may be permissible. Structures are suggested to generally stair-step from one-story/lowest height closer to the subject site property lines to not more than three-story/36 feet in height from Lincoln Drive, Quail Run Road, and the adjoining Andaz resort. Planning Commission focus shall be that the overall mass of the structures are of an appropriate scale, with special consideration given to the views from the south side bordering the Andaz resort and the west side bordering Quail Run Road.

Overall, the proposed heights comply with OSC, except for a portion of the Pedestrian Courtyard Access archway and portion of the 3rd story adjoining the medical plaza. Specifically, this encroachment is along the front/north and east side (Per Sheet A28, Resort Building encroaches 13' above the OSC and Pedestrian Courtyard Entry Structure encroaches approximately 5' above the OSC). The encroachment is mostly along the east side adjoining the medical plaza

Setbacks

The SUP Guidelines recommend certain minimum setbacks based on the structure/use. The uses applicable to the proposed application are the following: principal structures suggested at a 100-foot setback (regardless of whether the property line adjoins residential or non-residential), accessory structures suggested at a 60-foot setback adjoining residential and a 40-foot setback adjoining non-residential, and pools suggested at a 200-foot setback adjoining residential and a 65-foot setback adjoining non-residential. The SUP Guidelines also include suggested setbacks for structures/uses not part of the proposed application. This includes service structures at 100 feet, game courts that have suggested setbacks like a pool, and equestrian uses with a suggested 200-foot setback.

The applicant is proposing a minimum setback of 52'6" from the net property line (post dedication of 45'6" half width) for principal structures along Lincoln Drive, 50' from the net property line (post dedication of 25'0" half width) from Quail Run Rd, 60' from the south property line and 45' from the east property line. Below are tables showing SUP Guidelines and proposed setbacks for both Principal Structures, the Third Story Communal Area, and Accessory Structures. The principal structures using the buildings shown on Sheet A8 are C, J, L, M, N, O, and P. These structures are on the south (rear face) of the site. These principal structures only meet the SUP Guideline setback from Lincoln Drive. A primary reason for this is that the existing resort is ¼ of the suggested 20-acre site size. The guest reception building and separate building suites on the southwest portion of the site are principal structures with heights closer to the 24' height of accessory structures than the 36' height of a principal structure. All accessory structures meet or exceed the suggested setbacks in the SUP Guidelines.

Principal Structure Setbacks		
	SUP Guideline	Proposed
North (Lincoln Drive)	100'	165'
West (Quail Run Road)	100'	[50']
South (Andaz)	100'	[60']
East (Lincoln Medical)	100'	[45']

3 rd Story Element Structure Setbacks		
	SUP Guideline	Proposed
North (Lincoln Drive)	100'	165'
West (Quail Run Road)	100'	232'
South (Andaz)	100'	110'
East (Lincoln Medical)	100'	[55']

Accessory Structure Setbacks		
	SUP Guideline	Proposed
North (Lincoln Drive)	40'	52'6"
West (Quail Run Road)	40'	50'
South (Andaz)	40'	60'
East (Lincoln Medical)	40'	45'

The pool setbacks comply and far exceed the SUP Guidelines.

Pool Structure Setbacks		
	SUP Guideline	Proposed
North (Lincoln Drive)	65'	250'
West (Quail Run Road)	200'	240'
South (Andaz)	65'	170'
East (Lincoln Medical)	65'	120'

Impact to Adjacent Uses

The Council Statement of Direction covers impacts to adjacent uses. Compliance is best referenced through the other topics covered in this Compliance Detail document (Landscaping, Outdoor Lighting, Noise, and Traffic/Parking/Access/Circulation). The Statement of Direction focuses on the restaurant, market/coffee shop, Third Floor Communal Area (previously described as a third story bar/lounge with indoor/outdoor space which the applicant modified to a guest only fitness area/kitchenette space), impact to the residential homes west of the site, and location of outdoor employee areas and service uses such as maintenance, maid service/laundry, trash collection/storage, mechanical equipment (roof/ground), and all other noise generating elements.

Noise

The applicant submitted an acoustical study from MD Acoustics which the Town reviewed via a 3rd party reviewer from Acoustical Consulting Services. This acoustical study models potential operational noise for the entire site to verify compliance to the Town's noise standards in Section 10-7-3 of the Town Code. These noise standards require on-site noise at the property line not to exceed 45 dBA after 10:00 p.m. and before 7:00 a.m. Monday through Saturday, all day Sunday, and on legal holidays. Noise from 7:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. Monday through Saturday cannot exceed 56 dBA. There are other noise standards not addressed in the acoustical study or typically requiring a separate Special Use Permit stipulation. This includes vehicle noise as defined under Section 10-7-4 of the Town Code that applies to this site as it does anywhere within the Town limits. Also, construction and other similar nuisance noise has different standards as defined in Article 8-10 of the Town Code that applies to this site as it applies within the Town limits.

With a couple caveats on operation and existing conditions discussed by the Planning Commission, the acoustical study meets all industry standards and the Town Code noise requirements. The caveats are as follows:

- Delivery/Garbage Bin Location. The study noted that delivery trucks and/or trash pick-up in the northeast portion of the site models sound at 54 dBA at the west property line adjoining the medical center. Stipulation 32.a prohibits use of this loading area/trash pickup during the nighttime, Sunday, and holiday periods when the Town's noise requirement is 45 dBA.
- Modeling Assumptions. All modeling use various assumptions, including the model in the submitted study that used weighted averages. The 3rd party reviewer cautioned some measurements above the Town standard could occur since the modeled noise in Table 3 and Table 4 show instances whereby the project noise meets or are close to the maximum allowable dBA levels. However, other mitigation factors include the required resort management monitoring of events, other stipulations on the resort, the lower perceived decibel level for those off property since any nearby guest or resident is not adjoining the resort

property line where the modeled noise measurement is taken, and the short duration of the noise generating event.

- **Ambient Noise.** The ambient noise, specifically along Lincoln Drive, is greater than 45 dBA and 56 dBA limits. Town Code compliance uses site project noise, but it is noteworthy that off-site ambient noise impacts this site.

Landscaping

The SUP Guidelines recommend a 30' wide landscape buffer adjoining local/collector streets (not met), a 50' wide landscape buffer adjoining major/minor arterial streets (not met), landscape islands provided every 100' within surface parking areas (met), and shade tree planters provided between every four parking stalls (met in many places). However, due to the small size of the resort (at 4.6 net acres), the applicant is unable to fully comply with these recommended landscape buffers.

Landscaping will be placed around the perimeter of the resort and throughout the resort campus. Many of the desert trees and plants will be placed along the north and west property lines (adjoining Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road), while a shrub hedge will be placed along the east and south property lines (adjoining Lincoln Plaza Medical Center and Andaz Resort). The table below summarizes the proposed landscape buffers/setbacks:

Landscape Buffers/Setbacks		
	SUP Guideline	Proposed
North (Lincoln Dr)	50'	[5'] (up to 17.5' including ROW) Existing 0' (~7' including ROW)
West (Quail Run Rd)	30'	[3'] (areas up to 25' on site) Existing similar factor in ROW dedication and setback of buildings
South (Andaz)	0'	3' – 4'
East (Lincoln Medical)	0'	3' – 4'

Landscaped Islands/Shade Trees		
	SUP Guideline	Proposed
North (Lincoln Dr)	Every 100' & tree planters every 4 stalls	Every 4 stalls
West (Quail Run Rd)		Varies up to every 10 stalls (also adjoins oleander hedge)
South (Andaz)		Varies up to every 9 stalls (also adjoins oleander and sour orange hedge)
East (Lincoln Medical)		Every 8 stalls (with trees in the right-of-way)

The subject site is located within the Resort Living Character Zone (the corridor east of Mockingbird Lane along Lincoln Drive) in the Visually Significant Corridors Master Plan (VSC). Being a Major Special Use Permit Amendment, the VSC suggests design of the best option for design elements and materials. This may include lush landscaping (met), boulders arranged in random natural clusters (none), specialty paving in the landscape area as well as at nodes and gateway locations (included), site furnishing and features (none), low-stone veneered accent walls (included, but not stone veneered), decorative utility screens (included), and custom light fixtures (included on-site, not in the right-of-way). The proposed landscape palette consists of a mixture of trees, shrubs, and accent cactus. The primary plant material includes date palms, live oaks, palo verdes, acacia, sour orange, oleander, hop bush, lantana, red yucca, aloe, boxwood beauty, and lady's slipper. The proposed

landscape plan also includes plants from the Resort Living Character Zone, such as desert willows, ironwood, palo verde, aloe, sage, and yucca.

The VSC Plan recommends utilities should be painted to blend with their background and/or screening should incorporate stone and patterns selected from the applicable Character Zone (e.g. weathered steel framed panel segments which are able to be opened at multiple locations. Including layered cut-metal mountain motif and varying the opening size of a metal mesh to create layering and visual movement in the screen patterns). Sheet A39 of the proposed plans show a decorative metal screen and landscaping around existing APS cabinet location. Sheet A40 of the proposed plans show two potential areas of relocation of the existing APS utility cabinet. The Development Agreement and Stipulations 12, 27, and 28 address utility cabinet screening and/or relocation.

Section 5-10-7.D of the Town Code requires that Major Special Use Permits provide landscaping along the rights-of-way at 4 fifteen-gallon native trees and 5 one-gallon native shrubs every 100 lineal feet, unless otherwise approved by the Town where there is existing right-of-way landscaping or where other special circumstances occur. Whereas, the Town's 1996 landscape guidelines have a lesser calculation of 1 canopy tree at 30-foot intervals and shrubs at 20-foot intervals. The guidelines also suggest 20% of the trees be Ironwood. The proposed landscape plan has three Ironwoods internal to the site.

Based on the right-of-way frontage for this site (being approximately 425' along Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road excluding driveway area), unless special circumstances exist, each street frontage requires between 14 to 17 native trees and 21 shrubs. The proposed landscape plan has 12 trees along Quail Run Road and 20 trees along Lincoln Drive (counting the 12 Acacia trees within the parking spaces fronting Lincoln Drive). Each street frontage has over 100 shrubs and/or cactus.

During the July 7th meeting, the Commission requested that the applicant modify the landscape plan to consider use of a taller tree specimen and stagger the trees in the south parking area to help screen the mass of the 3rd story building. The Commission requested that staff also provide a copy of the Lincoln Plaza Medical Center landscape plan for reference and comparison. In response to this direction, the applicant provided the medical center landscape plan and updated the landscape plan by replacing several desert willow trees with live oak trees in the southern part of the parking lot.

In accordance with the SOD, Stipulation 69 addresses replacing dead landscaping.

Utilities

Will serve letters have been provided by EPCOR, CenturyLink, Cox, APS, and Southwest Gas. In addition, the Town is the sewer service provider and will be extending the sewer line in the area with its own Capital Improvement Project. The Town will serve the site with sewer and a sewer buy back will be required for the property.

The existing APS cabinet along Lincoln Drive is currently 4-5 feet from the edge of the roadway. The development agreement addresses relocation since any relocation depends upon the load calculations that are not available until the construction drawing phase. Screening is addressed as noted under "Landscaping" above.

The Water Service Impact Study indicates that sufficient flow is available in the area but a waterline extension is required in Quail Run Road to service the property. EPCOR has previously installed a stub out in Quail Run Road outside of Lincoln Drive and will require Smoke Tree to reimburse EPCOR for this work as part of their Water Impact Analysis.

The Preliminary Drainage Report has been submitted as well. The report indicates the applicant will provide the required on site retention through a series of inlets and underground pipes.

Outdoor Lighting

The SUP Guidelines recommend that any exterior light source be hooded and shielded so it is not visible from an adjacent property, that up-lighting is not greater than 300 lumens, that pole lights not exceed a maximum height of 16' tall (with minimum setback equal to height of the fixture), the maximum output be 0.5 ft candles (fc) adjacent to residential property (0.75 fc output in the Zoning Ordinance), and suggests varying light levels based on use (1.6 fc for parking lots, 5.0 fc for entrance roadways, interior driveways and drop off areas, adjacent to service buildings and loading docks, and pool areas, 3.0 fc in conjunction with architectural lighting, and 10.0 fc for outdoor dining areas). Article XXV of the Zoning Ordinance also recommends a maximum color temperature of 3000 Kelvins (K) for lights associated with signs.

Below is a summary of the resort light fixtures:

- *Pole Lights.* 22 pole lights will be placed in the parking lot and around the auto court/entrance (Fixture Type SA). These pole lights are 12' tall above the adjoining finished grade (height includes a 28" decorative base), have a color temperature of 2700 K, have a ML660 Millenia Series hood (with the light source recessed into the hood of the fixture), will have shields on all the perimeter fixtures to help reduce the amount of light trespass onto the neighboring properties, will operate from dusk to dawn. and vary in setback from 2' to 20' from the adjoining property lines (with a minimum setback of 12', except for the 6 fixtures along Lincoln Drive and one fixture at the garbage bin enclosure at a 2-foot setback).
- *Building Lights.* Four different fixtures will be placed on or around the exterior of the resort buildings. All building lights will turn on at dusk, be reduced to 50% intensity at 1:00 a.m., and turned off at dawn. Below lists the various estimated building light fixtures:
 - 57 wall sconces (Fixture Type WP) will be placed on the buildings. The light source is shielded by an opaque cover, directed downward, and has a color temperature of 2700K.
 - 30 sconces (Fixture Type WS) will be placed in the building patios. The light source is recessed in the hood of the fixture, directed downward, and has a color temperature of 3000K.
 - 56 accent lights (Fixture Type LT) will be placed on the building trellises and on two free standing trellises located in the event lawn. The light source is recessed into the fixture, directed downward, and has a color temperature of 2700K.
 - 52 accent up-lights (Fixture Type LU) will be placed around five of the buildings and in certain areas of the parking lot. These lights will highlight the façade of the buildings. The light source is recessed within the fixture, will have a maximum of 250 lumens, and have a color temperature of 2700 K. Stipulation 66.f was added by the Planning Commission allowing for these fixtures to be turned off or reduced in intensity if they fail

- to meet the low light level intent of the SUP Guidelines while still providing for safety, security, and enjoyment.
 - 18 custom carriage light fixtures predominately on the restaurant building and pavilion. These lights will be a maximum of 250 lumens and have its light source shielded.
 - The building lights are compliant with the SUP Guidelines which require the lights source of the fixture to be hooded or shielded so it is not visible from adjacent properties.
- *Landscape and Path Lights.* One type of bollard, two types of landscape fixtures, and one type of hand rail fixture will be used to illuminate the landscaping and pathways. All landscape lights will turn on at dusk, be reduced to 50% intensity at 1:00 a.m., and turned off at dawn:
 - 12 bollard lights (Fixture Type BL) will be placed next to the various walkways internal to the site. The bollards are approximately 4' tall, have the light source recessed in the top of the fixture, and have a color temperature of 3000K.
 - 25 ring lights (Fixture Type TR) will be placed on the palm trees. Each ring can hold up to four lights. The lights will illuminate from the bottom half of the trees directed downward, have a color temperature of 2700 K, and the light source is recessed in the hood of the fixture. The majority of the tree lights are located in the event lawn and pool area; however, four of these tree lights are located at the main entrance off of Quail Run Road. Palm tree lights are generally limited when approved, and based on the mostly interior location the majority of the Commission found them acceptable.
 - 42 landscape up lights (Fixture Type GU) will placed around the campus and in the right-of-way. 10 lights will be located in the Lincoln Drive right-of-way and 8 lights will be located in the Quail Run Road right-of-way. The Town typically prohibits light fixtures in the right-of-way and the Town Engineer does not support light fixtures in the right-of-way. The color temperature is 2700 K.
 - An estimated 12 handrail fixtures (Fixture Type HR) will be placed under all the exterior handrails on campus. The light source is recessed inside the fixture, has a color temperature of 2700 K, and the light is directed downward on the walking surface.
- *Water Feature Lights.* 19 water feature lights will be used in the seven water features and pool shown on Sheet A11. Each fixture is 250 lumens.
- *Sign Lights.* The sign lighting will be backlit, the light source completely shielded, not exceed the 0.5 fc at the property line, have a maximum color temperature of 2700 K.
- *Output.* The applicant provided a photometric plan which illustrates the combined output of the proposed exterior lighting. Per the photometric plan, the maximum output along any of the property lines is 0.3 fc (below the suggested 0.5 fc). The pool area maximum is 4.9 fc and entrance areas maximum is 4.7 fc (both below the suggested 5.0 fc).

Traffic

The applicant provided a traffic impact analysis. All traffic studies use various models and assumptions to estimate traffic of a future development. This study included actual data collected in May 2018, data from the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE), and methodologies presented in the Highway Capacity Manual (HCM), Special Report 209, and Updated 2016 and using Synchro software, version 10.0 under the HCM 6th edition methodology. Development of the nearby Five Star project was factored into the study. Specific assumptions to note are since this boutique resort does not fully comply with the definition of a standard hotel or a resort hotel, a combination of the two was used from the ITE. Additionally, an internal capture percentage was applied to the external restaurant trips, and market/coffee shop trips because it is assumed that not all trips to and from these areas will be external. For the restaurant, the study anticipated that 50% of the trips will be arriving externally and the other 50% will be hotel guests. For the market/coffee shop, the study assumed that 65% of the trips will be from resort guests and the remaining 35% will be external trips.

The study looked at a scenario with a shared driveway with Lincoln Plaza Medical Center and a scenario without a shared driveway. The shared driveway approach is the proposed approach. This study states that the proposed development is anticipated to generate approximately 754 external weekday daily trips, with 51 external trips occurring in the AM peak hour (7 AM to 9 AM) and 77 external trips occurring in the PM peak hour (4 PM to 6 PM). In addition to other nearby driveways and intersections, the study analyzes the traffic at the nearby intersections of Mockingbird Lane and Lincoln Drive and Scottsdale Road and Lincoln Drive based on existing conditions, opening year, and the horizon build-out year.

According to the traffic impact analysis, vehicle delays presently exist at the nearby intersections of Mockingbird Lane and Lincoln Drive and Scottsdale Road and Lincoln Drive under the existing condition at peak morning and evening times in certain directions of travel. The proposed redevelopment is not expected to noticeably worsen these vehicles delays. The study suggests some timing adjustments and changes from split to protected phasing to mitigate delays. For example, during the PM peak hour at the intersection of Scottsdale Road and Lincoln Drive, it is recommended that the eastbound phase be extended from 30 seconds to 33 seconds and the westbound phase be increased from 13 seconds to 21 seconds. With these mitigation measures applied, it is expected that the eastbound delay will decrease from 57.3 seconds per vehicle to 54.2 seconds per vehicle and the westbound delay will decrease from 70.1 seconds per vehicle to 63.0 seconds per vehicle.

Also, the study describes the queue storage and sight visibility at intersections along Lincoln Drive. The study states that a storage length of 100 feet will be provided for the right turn deceleration lane, however, if interference with other turn lanes is expected with the 100 foot storage length, 75 feet would be an acceptable storage length.

Sight visibility at driveway intersections and street intersection with Quail Run Road are shown as 33' x 33' and use AASHTO methodology. Section 8-1-13 of the Town Code typically requires a 50' by 50' clear corner vision area. However, the Town Engineer may allow modification if one or both of the intersecting streets are controlled by stop signs or traffic signals and no decrease in sight distance would occur as a result of the modification.

A single trip distribution pattern was assumed for the proposed development. The resulting trip distribution percentages for the study area shows the vehicular traffic will primarily arrive to the site via Scottsdale Road (65%), then Lincoln Drive (25%), and lastly Mockingbird Lane (10%).

The Town retained a 3rd party firm to review the traffic impact analysis. This 3rd party reviewer requested confirmation that the traffic analyses has been sent to the City of Scottsdale as traffic signal timing adjustments are recommended at the intersection of Scottsdale Road and Lincoln Drive. The 3rd party reviewer also requested that the intersection of Lincoln Drive and Mockingbird Lane be analyzed with a southbound and westbound right turn lane as these improvements will be constructed with the Five Star development project.

Parking

The SUP Guidelines suggest parking lots/drives (excluding exterior points of access) at a 60-foot setback adjoining residential and a 40-foot setback adjoining non-residential. The parking lot and drive setbacks are not in compliance with the SUP Guidelines. They are similar to the existing condition.

Parking Lot-Drive Setbacks		
	SUP Guideline	Proposed
North (Lincoln Drive)	40'	<u>[5'] (up to 17.5' including ROW)</u> <u>Existing parking in ROW</u>
West (Quail Run Road)	65'	<u>[3'] (areas up to 25' on site)</u> <u>Existing 50' (after ROW dedication)</u>
South (Andaz)	40'	<u>[3' – 4']</u>
East (Lincoln Medical)	40'	<u>[3' – 4']</u>

The SUP Guidelines suggest the location of parking and driveway areas to prevent lights from shining onto adjacent residential property (with many parking spaces along the perimeter, screening is necessary to prevent light trespass); parking areas and driveways within 200 feet of adjacent residentially zoned property be screened with a minimum 3-foot high, solid, decorative wall or a landscaped berm providing equivalent screening or a combination of both (the proposed plan includes a 3-foot tall screen wall in front of any parking spaces at the north and west property lines and 6-foot tall sour hedges along the east property line adjoining the medical center and the south property line along Andaz resort – which the adjoining non-residential uses have their own oleander hedge and/or wall).

The SUP Guidelines suggest no loading, truck parking, trash containers or outdoor storage area be located within 100 feet of adjacent residentially zoned property (with all such areas having visual and noise screening to minimize impacts on adjacent residential property). The garbage bin enclosure (6-foot tall with gate) is near east property line 150' from the proposed Lincoln Drive right-of-way (next to medical plaza). It has a setback 420' from the west property line adjoining residentially-zoned property. The property has two back of house locations. The east back of house location has loading delivery area facing the medical plaza. The west back of house is located between the restaurant and pavilion. These are accessed via the shared driveway along the east side and screened by the buildings, along with a 7-foot tall rolling gate at the loading area.

The SUP Guidelines suggest basing parking calculations on uses, allowing shared parking upon information documenting overlapping usage of on-site facilities by guests or visitors and as contained in an approved traffic and parking analysis. The non-shared SUP parking by use is 333 parking spaces for this project. The parking study uses a shared parking model approach modeling a top peak parking demand of 187 parking spaces. The project proposal is for 170 traditional on-site parking spaces that can increase to 199 on-site parking spaces in valet mode and a total of 224

parking spaces using the 25 available contract parking spaces with the adjoining medical plaza during certain times. 6 of the 170 proposed parking spaces will be accessible and in compliance with the *Americans with Disabilities Act* (ADA) regulations. For more information refer to the parking study and parking management plan.

The Council Statement of Direction adds that the project demonstrate an adequacy of the required and provided parking spaces based on the proposed use(s) which shall allow for adequate parking throughout the life of the project that shall be identified in a Parking Management Plan. Also, it states the full build out of the Five Star (Ritz Carlton) project be included and the Planning Commission consider the impacts on uses that generate quick turn-around trips (such as coffee shop or take-out food). The Parking Management Plan was provided and accepted by the Town Engineer (along with the Parking Study and Traffic Impact Analysis that factored in the full build-out of the Five Star project). The parking study quick turn-around trips se uses are "Resort Retail" in the definition section of the ordinance intended for primary use by guests and the Stipulation 35 limits the public use of such areas to square footages consistent with the parking study.

Access

Existing vehicular access will be reconfigured to remove one of the two driveways onto Lincoln Drive (a Town project expected to be complete in late 2020) and to add two driveways on Quail Run Road (with the southernmost an exit-only driveway). The primary proposed access will be off of Quail Run Road (south of the future signalized Quail Run Road and Lincoln Drive intersection and with Quail Run Road north of this entrance being fully improved). The other access will be a shared access with Lincoln Plaza Medical Center off Lincoln Drive. The ownership for Smoke Tree Resort and Lincoln Plaza Medical Center recorded a reciprocal agreement for the shared access driveway along Lincoln Drive in April 2020. The Lincoln Drive access will accommodate full turning movements, including left in and left out movements onto Lincoln Drive. A deceleration lane on eastbound Lincoln Drive is shown on the site plan at the shared access driveway.

The Smoke Tree team explained at the July 7, 2020 Planning Commission work session and later work sessions that the primary intent is for the resort main access to be located off of Quail Run Road. It was noted that the shared driveway access with Lincoln Plaza Medical Center along Lincoln Drive will act more as a service entry encouraging service traffic westbound from Scottsdale Road instead of through the Town limits. Although both the Quail Run Road access and the Lincoln Drive access are not restricted, the proximity of the loading, dumpsters, and back of house functions behind the market/coffee shop are located along the northeast portion of the site which should encourage this behavior. These uses are also setback from the Lincoln Drive right-of-way line 100' or more, bordering the medical plaza and not bordering residential or other nearby resort uses. Stipulation 56 references use of the shared access along Lincoln Drive for commercial vehicles.

Loading zones are not specifically called out in the submittal. However, as previously noted, the area near the northeast part of the site contains the back of house and dumpsters. The auto court off the Quail Run Road access adjoining the guest reception building is another loading zone for guest arrival and departure. Although not marked as a loading zone, it is likely that the curb side along the north elevation of the restaurant, market, and coffee shop will serve in this capacity for dropping off and picking up persons.

Circulation

Vehicular circulation will primarily enter and exit from the signalized intersection of Quail Run Road and Lincoln Drive into the development, with the unsignalized Lincoln Drive access available. The internal driveway layout runs along the full perimeter of the resort property, with the resort buildings in the center. The internal driveway has a minimum 24-foot width, which is standard for two-way traffic flow. Parking spaces will meet the 180 square-foot size required in Section II of the Zoning Ordinance by using a 9-foot width, 18-foot depth, and 2-foot overhang into adjoining landscape or walkway areas. There will be a total of 170 proposed self-park spaces with the accommodation of a 199 vehicles utilizing a full valet parking scenario.

Pedestrian circulation will be from Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road. The Town is in the process of implementing a project which will install a sidewalk on the south side of Lincoln Drive to the eastern Town limits, which includes coordination with the Smoke Tree ownership. The resort will have a decorative surfaced walkway linkage from the Lincoln Drive sidewalk to the resort's pedestrian courtyard access element that leads to the resort buildings which complies with the Town's Visually Significant Corridors Plan. This application request also includes sidewalk along the east side of Quail Run Road from Lincoln Drive to the resort access, again with decorative surface material delineating linkage from the sidewalk to the resort buildings. The area of the resort buildings includes a network of pedestrian pathways the lead from the various buildings to the parking drive aisles and perimeter sidewalks along the public rights-of-way on all four sides.

Right-of-Way Dedication/Improvements

The existing right-of-way along Lincoln Drive east from Quail Run Road to the Town limits is 65 feet north of the street centerline (granted as part of the Five Star development Special Use Permit application) and generally thought to be 33 feet south of the Lincoln Drive centerline due to ambiguity in historical records. The Town's General Plan suggests a total right-of-way width of 130 feet for Major Arterial streets. The applicant's request of a Major Special Use Permit amendment allows for the Town the ability to seek right-of-way. Ideally, this is the full 65 feet of right-of-way as future street improvement widening, utilities, etc. are unknown. The application as presented proposes a dedication of 45 feet 6 inches of right-of-way along Lincoln Drive south of the street centerline (which includes the area for deceleration lane and sidewalk) and additional intersection and sidewalk easement as shown on Sheet A7 of the plan set. Existing conditions less than the full 130 feet of right-of-way exists on portions of Lincoln Drive for a variety of reasons. This includes Lincoln Plaza Medical Center which through remodeling their existing building entered into a development agreement to grant 40 feet of right-of-way south of the street centerline and a sidewalk/utility easement that varies in width between approximately 8 feet to 17 feet south of this dedication.

The Town's General Plan Typical Major Arterial street cross section suggests a major arterial provide two travel lanes in each direction (28 feet in width, including curbs), a 10-foot wide median, optional 4-foot wide bicycle lanes in each direction, and room for 6-foot wide meandering sidewalks on both sides of the street (generally requiring 15 feet of width if the sidewalk is not attached to the curb). Lincoln Drive is not designated for bike lanes in the Town's General Plan. This cross section does not detail deceleration lanes which are necessary at the median break and into the shared access driveway along Lincoln Drive as part of this project. The planned improvements will comply with Town standards as there is an active Town project for Lincoln Drive. Stipulations 44 and 46 addresses this matter.

Along Quail Run Road, the Town has 25 feet of right-of-way west of the street centerline. The applicant proposes to grant 25 feet of right-of-way east of the centerline. This right-of-way complies with the typical local street cross section in the Town's General Plan. In accordance with the proposed plan set, development of the proposed project includes construction of the full 26 feet width of local street improvements. The only exception is approximately 100 lineal feet of right-of-way near the south end of the resort property because the west half of the Quail Run Road right-of-way is under private ownership and the area south of the main resort access on Quail Run Road will taper to the existing condition.

Responding to request of a couple neighbors on Quail Run Road adjacent to the resort, Sheet A41 of the plan set (Quail Run Roadway Exhibit), Stipulation 57, and the Development Agreement addresses improvements on Quail Run Road to mitigate traffic that may go past the new resort access. The existing condition of Quail Run Road and the nearby accessways are not at typical Town standards. This includes a private strip of land on the west portion of the Quail Run Road alignment owned by a nearby resident a gate is desired, private access easements for the residential parcels east and southeast of the resort, and an emergency access for Andaz resort that uses the private strip of land. The proposed resort plans requires dedication of right-of-way along Quail Run Road and Lincoln Drive, along with street improvements (including the west half of Quail Run Road north the new resort access). Stipulation 57 addresses the Quail Run improvements generally with direction that the Development Agreement cover mitigation measures such as column markers on both sides of Quail Run Road past the resort access, signage, and transitioning the new pavement on Quail Run Road south of the resort access to tie into the existing pavement on Quail Run Road. This stipulation requires the gate matter be reviewed within the second year of operation based on an independent study of traffic and parking past the resort access and after the appropriate approvals by Council (e.g. gate SUP). The nearby resident would like the private gate addressed as part of the resort SUP without going through a separate Town process. The resort SUP and Development Agreement addresses mitigation along Quail Run Road, but the approval of a private access gate(s) off the resort property involve residential owners not part of the resort application, a General Plan that shows Quail Run Road a through street (which will be evaluated in the current General Plan update), deviations to typical Town private roadway gate guidelines, among other aspects that merit a more thorough review by the Planning Commission and/or Town Council.

Signage

The Zoning Ordinance requires that there be no permanent signs in the right-of-way (which there are none). It requires the light element cannot be visible and must be fully shielded, there be no moving/flashing signs, and backlight-illumination requires a maximum 100 Lumens per lineal foot (the proposed signs comply and Stipulation 58 requires all signs be compliant with Article XXV, Signs, of the Town Zoning Ordinance). The Zoning Ordinance defines a double-sided sign counted as two signs (there are no double-sided signs). Internal illumination cannot exceed 0.75 foot-candles at property line (in addition to Stipulation 58 noted above, the photometric plan includes the both the exterior light fixtures and sign illumination, with the maximum output of 0.3 fc). Externally illuminated signs cannot exceed 3000 Kelvins (the signs do not exceed 2700 Kelvins). The signs must be illuminated only when the business is open. Resort identification, monument signs at the street entrances shown on Sheet A37, and the Pedestrian Courtyard Access sign shown on Sheet A38 have no proposed hours to be turned off as the resort is open 24 hours a day. This will also be the case with any direction/wayfinding signage. Stipulation 62 requires market, coffee shop, and other ancillary signage not be visible off property and requires Town Manager approval. Any hours such signs may be illuminated can be addressed with that approval as this is not specifically addressed in any stipulation.

The SUP Guidelines suggest only one identification sign at each street entrance, with a maximum height of 8-foot tall and a maximum area of 40 square feet (along a Minor/Major Street) and with a maximum height of 4-foot tall and a maximum area of 32 square feet (along a Minor/Major Street). The proposed plan shows five resort identification signs (with one being a building-mounted sign on the Pedestrian Courtyard Access structure that links the restaurant building to the market/coffee shop building. The proposed signs exceed the SUP Guideline in number. The two proposed signs along Lincoln Drive comply with the SUP Guideline except that the sign at the Lincoln Drive/Quail Run Road intersection is 8 square feet larger.

- *Lincoln Drive/Quail Run Road Corner Sign No. 1.* This is one monument sign that will be placed at the corner of Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road. This sign will be placed in the center of a decorative wall and the sign copy is 3 feet 6 inches tall by 12-foot long (for an area of 48 square feet). The sign will have backlit letters. The light source is shielded by opaque letters and has a 2700 Kelvin color temperature. The sign is located outside the AASHTO visibility triangle and is below the recommended 8-foot height limit. However, the sign exceeds the recommend size of 40 square feet.
- *Lincoln Drive Shared Access Sign No. 2.* This is one monument sign that will be placed at the corner of Lincoln Drive next to the shared entrance with Lincoln Plaza Medical Center. This sign is a free standing monument with a planter. The sign copy is 4-foot tall by 8-foot long (for an area of 32 square feet). The sign will have backlit letters. The light source is shielded by opaque letters and has a 2700 Kelvin color temperature. The sign is located outside the AASHTO visibility triangle and is below the recommended 8-foot height limit. This sign complies with the SUP Guidelines.
- *Quail Run Road Resort Auto Court Access Signs No. 3.* These are two monument signs. A sign will be placed along the north and south entrance on Quail Run Road. These signs are free standing monument signs with planters. The sign copy is 4-foot tall by 8-foot long (for an area of 32 square feet). The sign will have backlit letters. The light source is shielded by opaque letters and has a 2700 Kelvin color temperature. The sign is located outside the

AASHTO visibility triangle and is below the recommended 8-foot height limit. This sign complies with the SUP Guidelines.

- *Pedestrian Courtyard Sign No. 4.* This is one building mounted sign. It is placed on the archway that connects the restaurant building to the market/coffee shop building. The sign is setback approximately 55' from the net/post dedication Lincoln Drive property line, is approximately 15-foot tall, has a sign copy area of 40 square feet, and has backlit letters. The light source is shielded by opaque letters and has a 2700 Kelvin color temperature. This sign complies with the SUP Guidelines. The SUP Guidelines address signs mounted on an exterior wall of any structure to have only structure identification for emergency access (e.g. Building A). However, a few SUP properties have building-mounted signs (i.e., Phoenix Country Day School, Paradise Valley United Methodist, Five Star), with others having building signage not visible from off-property (i.e., Camelback Inn). Stipulation 59 prohibits outward facing signs visible from street or adjoining properties.
- *Resort Retail Signs.* Sheet A12 and Sheet A13 of the Supplemental Exhibits illustrates various retail signage for the accessory uses such as the restaurant, market, and coffee shop. Stipulation 62 allows this type of signage provided it is not visible from off property and approved by Town Manager.
- *Directional Signage.* The SUP Guidelines suggest these signs not exceed 5-foot tall and 12 square feet in sign area. Stipulation 58 on 58 requires SUP Guidelines to be met and Stipulation 60 requires Town Manager approval for new directional/wayfinding.