



# Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr  
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

## Minutes

### Planning Commission

---

Tuesday, February 18, 2020

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

---

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wainwright called the meeting to order at 6:02 p.m.

#### STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Community Development Director Jeremy Knapp  
Planning Manager Paul Michaud  
Senior Planner George Burton

#### 2. ROLL CALL

**Present** 7 - Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright  
Commissioner James Anton  
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell  
Commissioner Charles Covington  
Commissioner Pamela Georgelos  
Commissioner Orme Lewis  
Commissioner Daran Wastchak

#### 3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

#### 4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

Vice Mayor Pace thanked the Planning Commission for the work they do and explained that she was there to mostly observe so the Commission can remain independent. She added that if there was anything needed from Council or suggestions to let her know. She shared some of her history working with Planning Commissions previously and indicated she was looking forward to working with the Planning Commission in Paradise Valley.

Chairman Wainwright thanked Vice Mayor Pace for being there and for her help

**A.**     [20-070](#)

EPCOR Booster Pump Station Improvements (CUP-20-01)  
5402 E Lincoln Dr (APN 169-28-001G and APN 169-28-365E)  
Work Study Session

Senior Planner George Burton, introduced the request for a new pump, chemical feed tank, air release valve, and security fence. He then reviewed background for the request and details about the new equipment.

Commissioner Lewis asked what the sound decibel was within five feet of the new pump.

Travis Nuttle, Project Manager, responded he did not have the specific answer on how loud the pump was but would bring that information back to them. He also noted the pump would sit in an enclosure that was a sound abatement.

Commissioner Wastchak asked if the new pump would elevate the sound level on the site.

Mr. Nuttle indicated the new pump was louder, but would not increase the sound level on the site with the sound enclosure.

Commissioner Covington inquired as to what area would be affected by the increased pressure.

Mr. Nuttle stated it would be in and around the Paradise Valley Country Club Golf Course. He explained that it would indirectly affect that system since it would pump into the existing booster station.

Commissioner Anton asked if it pumped 24/7.

Mr. Nuttel responded that it would not initially but could later on if needed. He added that it will most likely run 10% - 50% of the time at the beginning.

Commissioner Anton asked if they had received any complaints about the pump and if the proposed noise mitigation was comparable to what they have now.

Mr. Burton stated he has not received any complaints and that he did not know about the comparability of the noise mitigation. It was noted that the proposed enclosure did not have a roof.

Commissioner Wastchak asked if they could put sound mitigation on the top.

Mr. Nuttel clarified that while it may increase the overall sound of the site that the volume would still be less than that of a passing car.

Commissioner Georgelos inquired what the reason was behind changing the structure of the pump shelter.

Mr. Nuttel replied that the design was standard for EPCOR for pumps outdoors in a residential area. He added that it accommodates limited physical space for a cheaper price.

It was noted that a full enclosure would require more funding and would still create noise from air-conditioning units used to cool the pumps.

Chairman Wainwright asked if they could visit a similar site.

Mr. Nuttel shared that could be arranged.

Chairman Wainwright asked if the parcel was owned by the Camelback Inn and leased by EPCOR.

Mr. Nuttel responded that they have a perpetual lease for the property that was signed back in the 1950's. He noted that they have a long-term goal to buy the land if possible.

Commissioner Georgelos asked for clarification on the location. It was explained that it was closest to a maintenance shed and the pump station.

Mr. Knapp, noted that the applicant was requesting a fence around the site as part of the proposal.

Mr. Burton provided an overview of the requested chemical feed tank.

Commissioner Wastchak asked how many gallons the containment platform held.

It was indicated it would hold 60 gallons which was an extra five gallons than the tank holds.

Mr. Burton shared information on the proposed security fence and air release valve. It was noted that the thick brush would be used as an extension of the fence.

Commissioner Wastchak suggested including a stipulation that if the brush was to ever go away that the fence be extended to close.

Commissioner Campbell pointed out that other pump stations had stucco and masonry walls around them.

Commissioner Anton noted that maintenance on a red wood fence was difficult. He added that a masonry wall would also help with noise mitigation.

Mr. Nuttle shared the wood and iron fence was chosen due to cost factors as well as the constructability on the site. He noted that the proposed fence would allow them to construct the fence without removing or damaging the Oleander shrubs. He shared that they also had five transformers on the site which limited the footprint for building a fence.

Commissioner Wastchak noted that if they needed to get in near the pipes they will have a lot more flexibility with the proposed fence.

Commissioner Georgelos asked what the fencing was on the right side.

Mr. Burton responded that it was chain link fence with tan privacy slats in it. He also noted that the applicant was required to notify all the neighbors within a 1,500-foot radius for the public hearing. He shared that the public hearing was scheduled for March 17, 2020.

Commissioner Georgelos inquired as to what extent they would need easy access to maintain the site and if a masonry wall would inhibit that access

Mr. Nuttle noted that the most critical maintenance would be replacing one or more pumps that goes down at the same time, though accessing those pumps was done via crane from the road. He added that on a daily basis the site has a visual check and when things need to be replaced they have a driveway for a truck to go through.

Commissioner Campbell commented that he was strongly in favor of a masonry fence.

Commissioner Georgelos stated she likes the idea of a fully enclosed fence rather than having a partial fence buffered by vegetation.

Mr. Nuttle reiterated that construction of a masonry fence would be much more difficult, but was not impossible.

Commissioner Lewis asked for clarification on the northwest corner, who owns it, and how it would be dealt with.

It was indicated it was owned by Camelback Inn and was access to the two electrical boxes that they needed access.

Mr. Nuttle noted that swing gates needed slats to let air through, but rolling gates could be left solid metal. He noted that this site would have to have a swing gate.

Commissioner Wastchak suggested if they did not do a block wall to use a rusted metal fence that would hang post to post and be less maintenance than the wood.

Mr. Burton continued with his presentation and presented details about the air release valve and the next steps in the approval process.

Chairman Wainwright inquired if the applicant would be able to push back the March 17, 2020 public hearing.

Mr. Nuttle noted their contractor was ready to go and they would prefer not pushing the hearing back.

Commissioner Georgelos asked the height of the other structures within the site.

Mr. Nuttle responded the building was around 9 to 10 feet tall. It was indicated that the shed was around 15 or 16 feet tall.

Commissioner Georgelos commented that she did not like high walls, but wondered if they would not want a higher wall to cover everything up.

Commissioner Anton asked what the ground cover would be.

Mr. Burton indicated it would all remain the same.

Mr. Nuttle commented that if they disturb anything, they will restore it, but they did not have plans for new covering anywhere.

Mr. Burton reviewed the schedule moving forward.

Chairman Wainwright clarified that there was a strong preference for stucco block wall as well as a continuous wall or stipulation that a wall would be put up if the vegetation were to die.

Commissioner Lewis expressed he was concerned about the Camelback Inn property to the northwest side with the two units on it.

Commissioner Campbell explained that he believed the site was left open around the transformers, so they could be easily accessed and there was likely not room for additional hedges or fences.

**No Reportable Action**

**B. [20-081](#) Discussion of Noticing for Application Requests**

Mr. Michaud provided a brief overview of the item.

Mr. Knapp explained why the item was on the agenda and noted that they would eventually like a recommendation for Council.

Commissioner Wastchak asked if they follow Arizona Revised Statutes and how they could modify from there.

Mr. Michaud responded that they had to at least meet minimums of state statutes but could make more stringent regulations in addition if they desired. Mr. Michaud then reviewed the current Town noticing. He then provided an overview of what was included in Arizona Revised Statutes on noticing. He reiterated that current Town Code met Arizona Revised Statutes.

Mr. Michaud provided information on other communities noticing policies. He noted that most have a much smaller noticing radius than Paradise Valley and they applied to fewer application types. He added that sign postings in other cities were generally larger than Paradise Valley's. Mr. Michaud then provided some direction on how to move forward.

Commissioner Lewis asked how many days prior to the meeting a sign needed to be posted.

Mr. Michaud replied that it was generally 15 days and stayed up for the duration of the decision being made and had to be removed 10 days after a decision had been made.

Commissioner Wastchak asked if the Planning Division had suggestions of how and when to reduce the planning radius on certain applications.

Mr. Knapp explained that they could give some recommendations with direction from the Commission.

Commissioner Lewis inquired who paid for the signage.

Mr. Knapp replied that currently the Town provides the signs and if they moved to another type of posting the applicant would have to pay for and acquire themselves. He added that mailing was done by the applicant as well.

Commissioner Lewis asked how many properties would be included in a 1,500-foot radius in an area with single acre lots.

Mr. Michaud shared that one 1,500-foot radius included 212 parcels while another 1,500-foot radius resulted in 630 parcels.

Commissioner Campbell commented that he liked a multi-tiered option that increased or decreased the noticing radius based on the complexity of an application.

Commissioner Wastchak and Chairman Wainwright indicated they agreed with Commissioner Campbell.

Commissioner Georgelos recommended they also look at noticing outside of the Town limits.

Commissioner Campbell stated that at a minimum they should always notice lots outside the Town if these lots are adjacent to the subject property.

Chairman Wainwright suggested following the minimum stated statute for mailing notices to people outside Town boundaries.

Discussion was made on what was required by Arizona State Statute for neighboring communities.

Mr. Knapp recommended a minimum of 300 feet mailing radius outside of the Town boundaries. He added that this item was scheduled for their next two meetings and he would like to have a recommendation from the Planning Commission by the March 17, 2020 meeting.

Chairman Wainwright commented that he felt there was a consensus that they would like to see a reduction in mailings with a multi-tiered system and an increase in signage.

Commissioner Georgelos asked if they should consider earlier noticing requirements.

Mr. Knapp responded that they have discussed tying the noticing to the first work study session and following up with additional notices on major amendments, though several notices may not be appropriate for minor amendments.

Commissioner Wastchak left the meeting.

**No Reportable Action**

## 5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

## 6. ACTION ITEMS

None

## 7. CONSENT AGENDA

### A. [20-068](#) Approval of January 21, 2020 Planning Commission Minutes

**A motion was made by Commissioner Anton, seconded by Commissioner Covington, to approve the January 21, 2020 Planning Commission minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 6 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos and Commissioner Lewis

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Wastchak

### B. [20-082](#) Approval of February 4, 2020 Planning Commission Minutes

February 4, 2020 Planning Commission Meeting notes amended on page 2, comment (9) to remove the word "that" and replace with "to have".

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Georgelos, to approve the February 4, 2020 Planning Commission minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 6 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos and Commissioner Lewis

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Wastchak

## 8. STAFF REPORTS

None

## 9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

None



**10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Mr. Knapp stated the next meeting agenda would have five items including the Caballo Lane lot split, the EPCOR booster pump, the Mountain Shadows turning lane minor amendment, the minor amendment for landscaping and parking modifications at St. Barnabas, and continued discussion on public mailing notifications.

Mr. Knapp noted the next two meetings were on March 3, 2020 and March 17, 2020.

Chairman Wainwright noted that March 17, 2020 was also Commissioner Anton's last meeting and after the meeting they will gather to send him off with a toast.

**11. ADJOURNMENT**

A motion was made by Commissioner Anton at 7:48 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to adjourn the meeting. The motion passed by the following vote:

**Paradise Valley Planning Commission**

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
Jeremy Knapp, Secretary