

Compliance with Special Use Permit (SUP), SUP Guidelines and Other Standards
Valley Presbyterian Church
SUP-18-16

Compliance with Special Use Permit (SUP), SUP Guidelines and Other Standards

Typically, the nature of the request for the proposed building renovations would require only staff review to verify substantial compliance with approved plans since the proposed renovations are less in total area than the 1999 approved plans and mostly interior remodel. The stipulation verbiage that “all development, construction and usage of the church property shall comply” with the approved plans provides less staff discretion on plan changes. The reduction of required parking spaces from the 1999 approval is a change in stipulation and some of the outdoor landscaping/hardscaping improvements require at least a Minor Special Use Permit amendment.

- *Renovations Building A - Sanctuary*

The sanctuary is proposed to get interior renovations along with an approximate 197 square foot addition to expand the choir room. This expansion is on the south side of the building within existing wall supports. The interior remodel revamps the worship area, restrooms, exterior doors, and mechanical/utilities. A new access roof hatch is proposed on the southwest part of the lower side of the sanctuary roof. Refer to the applicant's narrative for more information.

These renovations have no impact on existing maximum height. It does increase the total lot coverage from 19.1% to 19.2%. These renovations may be visible offsite along Quail Run Road and are within the existing building footprint.

- *Renovations Building B – South Classrooms*

This is an interior remodel to add 7 classrooms from existing office/storage space and to remodel 2 classrooms, resulting in an overall reduction of 450 square feet of enclosed space.

These renovations have no impact on existing height or lot coverage. The reduction of existing interior space converts to outdoor covered area.

- *Renovations Building C – Administrative Offices*

Renovations are for the southern half of the first floor to reconfigure offices, a community room and conference room. Exterior improvements include new windows and doors.

These renovations have no impact on existing maximum height and only marginally increase lot coverage due to the new window shade canopies that will replace existing canopies as shown on Sheet 5.1.2 and Sheet A 9.7.1. This building is along the east property line and is visible offsite.

- *Renovations Building D – Facilities Building*

This is an interior remodel to reconfigure interior office/storage.

These renovations have no impact on existing height or lot coverage. This building is nearest the west property line and not visible offsite.

Compliance with Special Use Permit (SUP), SUP Guidelines and Other Standards
Valley Presbyterian Church
SUP-18-16

- *Site Improvements – South Side of Building A (Sanctuary)*

This area is presently used for parking lot and a landscape/hardscape court. The 1999 SUP had this area shown in Phase 4 with an expanded landscape/hardscape court at approximately 8,250 square feet and realignment of parking spaces. The proposed request expands the court area an additional 15 feet south to approximately 11,250 square feet. It separates the area into three zones via 6-foot and 8-foot tall walls into a separate courtyard for the sanctuary, choir room and additional columbarium space. For more information refer to Sheets L2.1, L2.3, L3.1, L6.1 and L6.2.

The proposed area, including new walls, are minimally setback 70 feet from the property line. There are no SUP guidelines or standards on courtyard walls for churches. These courtyard walls are greater than the suggested minimum building setback for churches of 40 feet along public streets. This area will likely see more use than the existing or 1999 SUP approved layout. Possible concerns may be noise or light trespass to persons residing along the east side of Quail Run Road. The proposed 6-foot and 8-foot tall walls, existing perimeter landscaping, existing parking lot screen walls, and existing stipulation that all scheduled activities cease by 10:00 p.m. (with some holiday exceptions) should sufficiently mitigate possible nuisances. The proposed landscaping is desert-tolerant and like existing landscaping on the site.

- *Site Improvements – East Side of Building A (Sanctuary)*

Presently this area has a driveway that accesses the south parking lot from Quail Run Road underneath the sanctuary porte-cochere. The 1999 SUP approval had no substantive change to this driveway. The current request is to limit driveway access underneath the porte-cochere to emergency or special occasion use like holidays/funerals. The redesign modifies the driveway underneath the porte-cochere and parking spaces with a mix of concrete and asphalt. There will be additional landscaping and new pedestrian lighting.

There are no SUP guidelines or standards related to hardscaping or landscaping for churches. The SUP guideline for churches suggest parking lots are shielded with a minimum 3-foot tall wall/landscape berm to mitigate vehicle light trespass. These guidelines also suggest a 30-foot wide landscape area along local streets. This parking area is already shielded by existing 4-foot tall staggered walls along the perimeter landscape area that is not proposed to change. The width of the landscape area meets the 1999 SUP of approximately 20 feet. The proposed illumination at the property line has less illumination at the property line than allowed by the SUP guidelines. This area varies between 0.0 and 0.5 foot-candles as illustrated on Sheet E1.4. The predominant fixture is the LF ground fixture at 4 inches tall. The proposed plan uses some pole lights in the parking lot that are 14.75-feet tall, which are less than the suggested maximum pole light height of 16 feet. Unlike residential property or a sign that require a maximum foot-candle measurement of 0.5 or 0.75, respectfully, at the property line; there is

Compliance with Special Use Permit (SUP), SUP Guidelines and Other Standards

Valley Presbyterian Church

SUP-18-16

no specific illumination measurement at the property line for churches. The SUP guideline is an average of 1.6 foot-candles for parking lots and an average of 5.0 foot-candles for entrance roadways, interior driveways and drop off areas.

- *Site Improvements – North Side of Buildings A & B (Sanctuary/South Side Classrooms)*

The modifications in this area are hardscaping, landscaping, adding underground drainage pipe, replacing existing light fixtures. These modifications would generally not require SUP approval. The existing buildings screen this area from offsite. For more information refer to the applicant's narrative.

- *Site Improvements – Main Plaza*

This area is located off Quail Run Road between Building A (Sanctuary), Building B (South Classrooms) and Building C (Administration Offices). This area is generally located across from Palo Verde Lane and not the homes across the street. It presently functions as outdoor space for events/gatherings and drive aisle/parking. The proposed plan would remove the existing hardscape improvements, several parking spaces, and the drive aisles to reserve this space for only pedestrian use. New elements would include new hardscaping, seating, 4-foot and 5-foot tall walls, lighting, and landscaping. Minimum setback from the property line along Quail Run Road is approximately 8 feet.

The applicant was asked to respond to the potential negative nuisances with increased use of this area. Their response is found under Minor Amendment Criteria 3 in their narrative. This includes that Palo Verde Lane is directly across from this area (not homes), walls/landscaping will be added to mitigate noise/visual impact, and the applicant voluntarily met with neighbors within 1,500 feet on October 30, 2018 with no objection to the proposed uses. Stipulation(s) can be added to limit the days/times in using this area and when lighting should be shut off. Presently, an existing stipulation requires all scheduled program activities to cease by 10:00 p.m.

There are no SUP guidelines or standards related to hardscaping, landscaping and walls for churches. The nearest wall is 5-foot tall and setback a minimum of 8 feet from the property line along Quail Run Road. As a comparison, residential standards would require no walls within the first 10-foot setback and up to 3-foot tall within the building setback (40 feet for R-43 lots and churches along a street). As described under "*Site Improvements – East Side of Building A (Sanctuary)*," the proposed illumination at the property line has less illumination at the property line than suggested by the SUP guidelines.

- *East Edge Property Along Quail Run Road (Quail Run Road Drop Off Area)*

This part of the application refers to the proposed drop off area located within the Town's right-of-way along Quail Run Road located just north of the main plaza. The applicant's parking analysis addresses this drop off area (deceleration lane). It is 96 feet in length. This drop-off area is not located on the subject site. It is

Compliance with Special Use Permit (SUP), SUP Guidelines and Other Standards

Valley Presbyterian Church

SUP-18-16

within the Town right-of-way. The applicant agrees to prohibit parking along its site on Quail Run Road. There is already no parking allowed on both sides of Montebello Avenue and parts of the east side of Quail Run Road. No parking along Quail Run Road adjoining the church was likely intended in 1999 based on handwritten notes on the 1999 site plan.

There are no SUP guidelines or specific Town standards for the drop off area. However, the Town Engineer bases his evaluation on professional standards he can discuss at the work study session.

- *West Edge Property Along Kiva Elementary School*

The only change in this area from the existing layout is conversion of 9 existing parking spaces near Building D (Facilities) on the west side of the site in the center of the property for unloading/loading. According to the applicant's parking analysis, the loss of these parking spaces does not affect the ability for the site to meet its parking minimums.

- *Parking –Parking Lot*

In the present condition, there are 607 total parking spaces available for church use. 434 parking spaces are on the church property and 173 parking spaces are on the Kiva Elementary School property. Certain parking areas are restricted during certain days and times based on the major amendment approved at the church in 1999 and the addition of more shared parking in 2006 on the Kiva Elementary School property. The required church parking for the present condition is 382 parking spaces.

Based on the final build-out from the approved 1999 plans, there were 575 total parking spaces available for church use. 449 parking spaces are on the church property and 126 parking spaces are on the Kiva Elementary School property. The required church parking for the 1999 approved condition is 447 parking spaces.

Existing Stipulation 10 states "No parking on Kiva School property shall count to satisfy Valley Presbyterian Church required parking." This typically means that the required parking total for all the buildings be satisfied on the subject site. Required parking can be based on the calculations suggested in the Special Use Permit guidelines and many times through a parking analysis that might demonstrate shared parking, existing data, or other means to support a lessor parking total than suggested by the guidelines. Not including any of the parking spaces on the Kiva Elementary School property, the present total parking spaces of 434 and the 1999 final phase total parking spaces of 449 are more than the required parking of 382 in the present condition and 447 in the 1999 final phase condition.

The required parking for the current request is 389 parking spaces. This is based on the parking analysis that uses the calculations per the Special Use Permit

Compliance with Special Use Permit (SUP), SUP Guidelines and Other Standards

Valley Presbyterian Church

SUP-18-16

guidelines and the 1999 parking space approvals for square footage remaining unchanged and not part of this Minor Special Use Permit amendment. The submitted parking analysis does not consider actual parking data or shared parking among uses on the church site. The applicant did provide a snapshot of some existing parking counts in their narrative that they feel supports the existing parking usage does not exceed the available onsite parking. The Town has in the past accepted actual data and/or shared parking data to demonstrate a lower required parking calculation.

Based on the required 389 parking spaces in the parking analysis, the proposed interim and proposed last phase condition results in 2 and 34 required parking spaces, respectfully, not contained within the church property. As such, if existing data or other data is not used to support a lower required parking calculation or more parking is added, it will be necessary to remove/modify Stipulation 10 that all required parking be on the church property. The proposed interim condition results in 387 total parking spaces on the church property. The final condition results in 355 parking spaces on the church property. There is no change to the 173 shared parking spaces located on the Kiva Elementary School property.

The south parking lot improvements modify the parking space layout by removing the angled parking and adding landscape tracts. This design will prevent vehicular traffic crossing parking spaces. The parking space sizes, aisle widths and lighting conform to the existing church stipulations. There is no change to the perimeter landscaping. The landscaping meets the resort guidelines related to parking lot landscaping of having landscape islands every 100 lineal feet and shade trees. The resort guidelines are referenced since there are no Town parking lot landscape guidelines.

The application includes a request to remove the chained area in the south parking lot that generally divides this lot into two parking areas. Refer to the existing 1999 Sheets DR1.0 and DR1.2. The southernmost parking spaces are presently restricted to only ballfield use, and special church events during the weekday. This request seeks to eliminate this use separation in the south parking lot as patrons generally park close to the sanctuary and many times persons unintentionally run into these chains with their vehicle. The present and proposed interim parking lot layout design is such that a vehicle can access the southernmost parking area through the parking spaces, avoiding the chained access.

- *Exterior Lighting*

As described under site improvements, the proposed exterior light fixtures match the existing fixtures on the site. The lumens for these fixtures are generally 250 which comply or are lower than SUP guidelines. The fixture heights are generally under 2-feet tall, with building fixtures at door level and parking lot pole lights at 14.5-feet tall that are less than the 16-foot tall SUP guideline. Illumination levels meet and are mostly lower than maximum suggested SUP guidelines. There is

Compliance with Special Use Permit (SUP), SUP Guidelines and Other Standards

Valley Presbyterian Church

SUP-18-16

no specific illumination measurement at the property line for churches. The SUP guideline is an average of 1.6 foot-candles for parking lots and an average of 5.0 foot-candles for entrance roadways, interior driveways and drop off areas. Most of the site perimeter has illumination readings of 0.0 foot-candles. The maximum reading is 1.7 foot-candles in one spot near the driveway leading to the porte-cochere of the sanctuary off Quail Run Road.