

Commissioner Campbell asked for clarification of the location of the 6-foot tall walls on lots 30, 31, 34, and 35. The applicant explained the location of the walls.

The meeting was opened to the public. There was no comment and the public hearing was closed.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Strom, to deem the request for interior, rear yard walls to exceed the six foot height limitation in Area B (Shea Homes) as a minor amendment to the Special Use Permit zoning per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Covington, to approve the request with one amended stipulation:

All building shall be in accordance with the applicant's February 12, 2018 submittals and the site plan dated February 20, 2018.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

B. 18-081

Consideration of Resolution 2018-06

Acceptance of the Walk & Bike Plan and a Minor General Plan

Amendment to modify portions of the 2012 General Plan with the Walk & Bike Plan

Paul Michaud gave an overview of the Walk and Bike Plan focusing on the differences from the last draft the Commission reviewed. Mr. Michaud then reviewed the edits from the last meeting. Mr. Michaud summarized the four sections of the Plan, including: Introduction, The Plan, Projects & Costs, and Moving Forward. He focused on the maps and cross sections as well as the supporting elements.

Chairman Wastchak questioned the proposed mid-block crossing proposed at Lincoln Drive and Hillside Drive. He has concerns about slowing traffic on Lincoln Drive to allow a crossing. Commissioners Wainwright and Strom shared these concerns. It was noted that keeping it in the plan allows for more consideration, it doesn't mean that the mid-block crossing will be installed.

There was discussion of materials used for marking streets and that these shall not be slick or raised as this could cause a hazard to cyclists.

The Projects & Costs were reviewed. The Goals and Policies were also summarized. There was discussion of removing the reference to the "new"

language from the final draft. Mr. Michaud noted this will be done in the final document.

Mr. Michaud explained that after action tonight the Plan will move to a study session by Town Council on March 22, 2018.

Staff recommends the Planning Commission forward this item to the Town Council with a recommendation for approval.

Commissioner Anton discussed implementation methods for the traffic study on Hummingbird Lane. On page 3-03 he would like additional text regarding a speed limit study for a school zone to limit speed for a short time. There was discussion of the separate study that is being presently being completed in this area. It was noted that Commissioner Anton's suggestion will be passed on to the Town Engineer. Commissioner Anton believes it should be embedded in the Walk & Bike Plan. "and a speed study for a time of day variable speed limit zone similar to that used for schools" should be added to page 3-03.

Commissioner Strom discussed the statistics on p 1-07. It was noted that this shall be changed to, "85% of the people in Paradise Valley who walk or bike do so for health and leisure". On page 2-22, it was noted that the sharrow image should be reversed. Commissioner Strom also questioned the Bike Share policy and whether the Town can charge for pick up of these bicycles. He questioned whether additional language needs to be added. Mr. Michaud explained that there is additional language elsewhere in the Plan. It was agreed that this language is sufficient. Commissioner Strom also noted that the dates on the drafts are the same, February 13th, but there are two different versions. It was noted that the final revised February 13th version is the most current. The PDF on-line is the most current.

The meeting was opened to the public. There was no comment and the public hearing was closed.

A motion was made by Commissioner Strom, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to recommend that the Town Council approve Resolution 2018-06, regarding the acceptance of the Walk & Bike Plan and its associated Minor General Plan amendment that makes the Walk & Bike Plan a supplement of the Town's General Plan. This motion was subject to the following amendments:

- To revise the description of the Traffic Study project on page 3-03 to read as follows: "The Traffic Study focuses on Hummingbird Ln at the intersections with Quartz Mountain Rd. and 61st Pl. Improvements relate to adding stop signs, improved striping, and possible use of bicycle-tolerant milled rumble strips, and a speed study for a time of day variable speed limit zone similar to that used for schools."

- To revise the statistic on the top of page 1-07 to read "85% of the people in

Paradise Valley who walk or bike do so for health + leisure"

- To revise the image on page 2-22, reversing the direction of the bicyclist.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell,
Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

6. ACTION ITEMS

None

7. CONSENT AGENDA**A. 18-080 Approval of February 6, 2018 Planning Commission Minutes**

A motion was made by Commissioner Covington, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to approve the February 6, 2018 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell,
Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

8. STAFF REPORTS**9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS****10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

It was noted that there are no agenda items for the next Commission meeting so this meeting will be cancelled.

There was a request that the Hillside meeting rotation be submitted to the Commission. It was noted that this request will be forwarded to Town Engineer, Paul Mood.

11. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Covington at 7:39 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell,
Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: _____
Eva Cutro, Secretary

adjoining neighbor is now constructing an 8-foot tall block wall approximately 3 feet away from the shared property line with the school. The shipping containers are approximately 8 feet and 8 inches in height. Additional landscaping is also being installed behind the wall on the neighbor's property.

Commissioners Anton and Campbell expressed concerns with the setback on these containers and the use of the containers for storage. They stated there is plenty of room on this property to construct additional storage buildings at a greater setback. There was discussion of building storage buildings further to the east of the existing maintenance building. The Planning Commission would consider a 20-foot setback along the south property line since other buildings on the site are located at this setback. The Planning Commission preferred at least a 40-foot setback be provided along the west property line. There was discussion of allowing the storage containers for a limited time until a new storage building can be constructed. There was discussion regarding whether the existing storage building near the shipping containers was constructed at the 40' setback shown on the site plan.

Commissioner Strom does not like the containers or the existing setbacks. Commissioner Wainwright agrees that the storage containers should be removed, and is fine with a 20-foot side yard setback as long as the height is less than 16 feet. Commissioners Covington and Anton also agree that the shipping containers must be removed and a site-built storage building constructed. There is agreement by the Planning Commission that the containers may be allowed for a limited amount of time.

Staff will work with the applicant to come up with a timeframe for removal of the containers and to apply for a storage building. The applicant is requesting a continuance of the application for approximately 60 days. At that time, they will have an idea of the setback, height, and square footage of the proposed building. Staff recommends another work session at the first meeting in April 2018.

No Reportable Action

C. 18-053

Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")

Paul Michaud discussed that his presentation this evening will cover the edits made to the Walk & Bike Plan from the last meeting. He noted that the Town Engineer, Paul Mood, will provide an update on the traffic study and proposed improvements along Hummingbird Lane. Mr. Michaud explained that this traffic study is noted in the plan, but the proposed work from the study is a sperate project.

Paul Mood, Town Engineer, provided a summary of the traffic study prepared by Kimley Horn. He gave a brief summary of the safety analysis of 61st place and Hummingbird Lane and Quartz Mountain Road and Hummingbird Lane. There are two stop signs at the intersection of Quartz Mountain Road and Hummingbird Lane. Kimley Horn recommends moving the stop signs closer to the intersection, providing stop lines, and adding illuminated raised markers. There was talk of adding speed humps, but the Town does not recommend this due to safety concerns. The consultant looked at adding milled rumble strips. This may require further study. At the intersection of Hummingbird Lane and 61st Place stop signs and illuminated raised markers are being recommended. Mr. Mood stated there have been multiple incidents at this intersection. Kimley Horn also recommends continued police enforcement at these intersections.

Paul Mood's preliminary recommendation would be to start with everything but the rumble strips. The rumble strips will need further study. Responding to where rumble strips are used, there are some in use on Mt. Lemmon near Tucson, Arizona. Commissioner Wainwright has safety concerns with the rumble strips. Commissioner Anton believes additional enforcement at prime cycling times may be the most important measure. Adding, if we could have the cyclists slow down this would be the greatest improvement. Commissioner Covington is opposed to rumble strips. He has ridden over them on his bicycle and they can cause real damage.

Jane White, resident, believes anything placed on the road could be dangerous to cyclists. Even pavement markings can be slick in the rain. She believes it is more an early Tuesday morning problem in this area. She also has concerns with neighbors that place themselves in the road to create a hazard and a distraction. She is working with the police on a solution.

Brett Goett, resident, echoes what Jane White stated. There is a perception in this area that is skewed against the cyclists. Many cars also roll through the stop signs. The cyclist tire traction is very slim and rumble strips are frightening to roll over and dangerous. Painted stripes should not be where the cyclists stop, as these are slippery. The accidents do not result in any cyclists being cited. Raised pavement markers are also dangerous, as these are higher than the bicycle's tread is wide.

There was discussion of the speed limit in this area. It is 25 mph. Chairman Wastchak questioned if the speed was reduced would the rumble strips become less of a problem. It is believed that slower speeds may create more of a problem.

Dwight Lundell is opposed to rumble strips. He is moving to this area of

Town.

Another resident in the Quartz Mountain area stated she had no issues with the cyclists nor do her neighbors. She also explained that the motorists speed faster than the cyclists.

Paul Michaud and Justin Azevedo, consultant, gave an update on the revisions from the last draft plan. The format changed to three columns, colors were changed in graphics, resort loop added on map, and other Commission requested edits.

New items were added including an education and enforcement graphic.

Anna Thomasson, resident, stated the Town may want to consider interactive maps on-line for the proposed projects.

There was discussion of bike sharing. Commissioner Anton suggested that resorts should be encourage to institute a bike "docking" share program, as opposed to "dockless" bike sharing.

The Planning Commission noted a few edits to the plan.

- Provide an additional map for project locations after the project table.
- Relocate the "Words to Know" sheet back to the front.
- Add a title for the graphic on page 1.04.
- Move the graphics up on page 1.07.
- Increase the font size on the "Resort Loop" labels on pages 2.01, 2.02, and 2.03. 3 and 2.04 "Resort Loop".
- Add a date on the "Existing CIP" label, such as "2018-2022".
- Revise the mid-block crossing and bike sensor photos on page 2.20.
- Re-label the worksheet on page 3.02 to "Project Prioritization Worksheet".
- Add a paragraph or policy regarding the preference for "docking" vs "dockless" bike sharing.

The Planning Commission discussed the proposed time period proposed to complete the listed projects on pages 3-03 through 3-05. There was discussion with adding a crosswalk across Lincoln Drive near Hillside Drive. It was noted that the crosswalk was always on the plan to provide a mid-block crossing. A few Commissioners had concerns adding a crosswalk where there is no existing traffic light. There was discussion of the different type of signage for this type of crossing.

The following edits were noted.

- Add "CIP" or a similar text in the description, where warranted.
- Move up the Berneil Ditch project to 2018-2020/2021-2025.
- Provide the subtotals per time period.
- Re-evaluate the "Tatum Blvd" cost having no dollar value.
- Remove the ".00" from all the dollar amounts.

Mr. Michaud noted the hearing by the Planning Commission is set for February 20, 2018.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

6. ACTION ITEMS

None

7. CONSENT AGENDA

A. 18-052 Approval of January 16, 2018 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Strom, seconded by Commissioner Covington, to approve the January 16, 2018 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

8. STAFF REPORTS

None

9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

None

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Paul Michaud reviewed the upcoming agenda items.

11. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell at 8:50 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Final

Planning Commission

Tuesday, January 16, 2018

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Senior Planner Paul Michaud

2. ROLL CALL

Present 5 - Chairperson Daran Wastchak
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell
Commissioner Charles Covington
Commissioner Dolf Strom
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright
Absent 1 - Commissioner James Anton

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

A. 18-040 Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")

Paul Michaud provided an overview of the Walk & Bike Plan. He noted that the January 2018 plan is a redraft of the February 2017 draft plan. He continued the Planning Commission reviewed components of the plan over the past several months.

Mr. Michaud provided a summary for each of the four chapters, including how the plan compares to the 2012 General Plan and the February 2017 draft plan. He also noted some additional revisions to the January 2018 draft plan.

The Planning Commission provided direction on edits to the January 2018 plan. These included the following points:

- Use a three-column format where possible.
- Not to include the detail on the types of users in the plan, only include this by reference since the appendix will provide this information.
- Use different colors on the visual on pages 1-05 and 1-06 for people that walk and bike on pages 1-05 and 1-06, with the purple-blue color to be one of the colors.
- Move the 81% text on page 1-05 to the top of the page.
- Re-examine the speed hump definition on page 2-17 to ensure it matches the type of speed humps used in the Town of Paradise Valley based on the discussion of width.
- On the pedestrian and bicycle maps, move the Camelback Inn resort symbol closer to Lincoln Drive and to add a resort symbol for El Chorro Lodge. There was discussion on whether El Chorro Lodge was a resort. It was determined that it is classified as a resort by its General Plan designation and zoning, despite its primary use as a dining establishment.
- Modify the recreational path for Ritz Carlton to a trail on the pedestrian and combined map.
- Keep the labels on the bicycle and pedestrian maps general in nature, but add "(resort loop)" after the term on the maps. There was discussion on whether to change the recreational path term on the combined map to resort loop. Earlier discussion was not to change the term since the Ritz Carlton facility was classified as a recreational path.
- Add headlights on the vehicles for the street cross-sections to show direction of travel.
- Delete the Federal Highway Administration and American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials text from the cross sections and either include this in the definitions or in an introductory statement for the part on cross-sections.
- Add a cross section for trail, this was suggested to be combined with the visual on recreational path with the type of surface noted.
- Where possible, use photos that are within Paradise Valley and include people in the photos. This included showing people on the sidewalk and trail photo on page 2-16 and using a Town facility for the speed hump photo.
- Determine if the word "probable" can be replaced with the word "estimated" under Projects & Costs on pages 3-01 through 3-03.
- Update the Goals pages with the label "goals and policies." There was discussion about why this section is needed. It was explained that this is to guide staff, Commission, and Council on future land use decisions.
- Reorder the projects on page 3-03 by the date to be done and not by alphabetical order.
- Revise the form on page 3-02 regarding the prioritization criteria to

include boxes for the separate scores.

A resident, Shawna Glazier, wanted the Town to include enhanced crossings in neighboring municipalities. She also has concerns that the east-west Doubletree Ranch Road route terminates at the mountain with nowhere for the cyclists to go. This is why it's important to show an enhanced crossing at Mountain View. Commissioner Covington requested more information on the westerly termination on Doubletree Ranch and what can be done to safely cross Tatum Boulevard. Paul Michaud indicated that bicycle facilities and crossing improvements were included on past drafts, but evolved into not including these facilities for many reasons as the draft plan and Statement of Direction from Council was reconsidered.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the Moving Forward section. A minor edit was noted in the labeling under goals. Mr. Michaud noted that the developer contribution during platting and intermediate/major Special Use Permit cases needs to be added back in under funding.

Chairman Wastchak assured the Commissioners that they will have another chance to comment at the next work session on February 6, 2018.

Mr. Michaud next reviewed how the proposed plan meets the Statement of Direction. Commissioner Strom suggested a clarification on the rough costs and phasing, to include that the cost estimates are provided for each of the 16 street corridor projects.

For the next meeting, Chairman Wastchak requested that the Commissioners focus on the Project Prioritization to assist staff and provide input.

It was noted that Planning Commission action is scheduled for February 20, 2018.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

6. ACTION ITEMS

None

7. CONSENT AGENDA

A. 18-014 Approval of December 19, 2017 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner

It was noted to correct the term luminaries throughout the document to match the definition.

It was also noted that bug lights/zappers shall be allowed. Language shall be added that bug lights are not considered prohibited colored bulbs.

Scott Tonn's comments were then discussed. Under safety measures, it was noted that the term "Town" may be too vague. It was suggested this shall be changed to "Town Manager or designee" in both the Planning Commission version and Strom/Wastchak version.

The meeting was opened to the public. There was no public present. The meeting was closed to the public.

A motion was made by Commissioner Anton, seconded by Commissioner Covington, to forward to the Town Council the recommendation of approval of Ordinance 2016-09, proposed amendments to Article XXII, Hillside Development Regulations, of the Town Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

A motion was made by Commissioner Strom, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to forward to the Town Council an alternate motion for Section 2208, Outdoor Lighting, to Article XXII, Hillside Development Regulations, of the Town Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

7. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

A. 17-439 Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")

Paul Michaud reviewed the bike/ped maps. Edits were done to show sidewalks and other minor corrections.

The Planning Commission removed the proposed sidewalk on the south side of Doubletree Ranch Road near 52nd Street and near Via Los Caballos. The Planning Commission was in support of the proposed sidewalk on the south side of Doubletree Ranch Road from Invergordon Road to 67th Street since this area has more traffic.

Mr. Michaud discussed the facility maps, three new enhanced intersections, the probable costs, and the next steps.

No Reportable Action

8. CONSENT AGENDA

The Planning Commission had a continued discussion on the Hillside Code starting at 7:55 p.m.

Chairman Wastchak explained that the redlined copy in the packet did not show track changes from last meeting due to computer issues. He also mentioned that Scott Tonn's comments will also be further explained. Many of Mr. Tonn's comments were outside the scope of the SOD. These will not be included at this time. After staff has incorporated all revisions that are within the SOD parameters Chairman Wastchak and Commissioner Strom will prepare another draft with non-SOD revisions. Both versions will possibly be sent to Town Council.

Mr. Burton went through Commissioner's Strom written concerns. There was discussion of the Hillside bond. This will be based on the grading fee. There was discussion of eliminating the "USA Consumer Price Index" language. It was decided this language will remain. It was noted that new single family homes and major remodels shall have different standards than minor projects. This language will be added in.

Formatting issues were addressed and illustrations were refined.

The overall 40-foot height limit was discussed. Clarifying language regarding driveway entry gates and retaining walls to prevent erosion or flooding will be added.

Approaches for off-site and on-site storm water was discussed.

It was noted that Section 2209. B. will need an illustration.

Commissioner Strom stated that, as written, he would have to vote in opposition. He does not believe the SOD allows enough revision.

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to continue this item to the hearing of December 19, 2017. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

6. ACTION ITEMS

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A.** 17-405 Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")

Paul Michaud provided more information on the existing conditions on the resort loop. He identified the right-of-way widths along this corridor and provided cost estimates. Commissioner Mahrle asked if the cost assumes not using the existing sidewalk. Mr. Michaud replied yes, the cost considers the existing sidewalk would be removed and replaced with a new recreation path. There were questions and discussion about the cost estimates and contingency fee.

Responding to discussion on the usefulness of a 10-foot wide path, Commissioner Covington remarked that a 10-foot wide path is typically generous for a bike rider. Commissioner Mahrle stated that a challenge in biking on sidewalks is vegetation that infringes on the sidewalk and the dips for driveways. He remarked that sidewalks are better than nothing.

Responding to a discussion on signage, Commissioners Mahrle and Covington remarked that pavement markings may be appropriate along the resort loop. After some discussion, direction was given to staff to include some amount of pavement signage for the resort loop.

The direction to staff was to provide a revised cost estimate for the resort loop that excludes any acquisition of right-of-way, wash areas, and retaining walls. Also, it was directed to use one-quarter of the intersection component cost since the resort loop is on only one side of the street. Commissioner Mahrle stated that the Planning Commission should forward to the Town Council the best plan with the understanding that this is a long-range plan, and just because something is in the plan that does not mean the Town necessarily has to do it.

There was discussion regarding what items are included in the enhanced intersection cost. Mr. Michaud identified that the attachment to the action report about the enhanced intersections provides the detailed explanation of potential improvements for the identified intersections. It was pointed out that the attached cost template for "Crossing w Pavers" in the action report is the cost estimate that was applied in the specific corridor examples presented.

Mr. Michaud summarized the bicycle corridors on McDonald Drive east of Invergorgon Road and Mockingbird Lane between McDonald Drive and Lincoln Drive.

On McDonald Drive, Mr. Michaud described three different options/cross sections based upon cost. Mr. Michaud explained the scope and attributes of each section, noting the Town could consider a mix of the different options. Option 1 suggested using pavement sharrows with no other changes to the street. Option 2 suggested removing the turn lane to

accommodate bike lanes. Option 3 suggested a full reconstruction with sidewalks and bike lanes. Chairman Wastchak stated that the removal of the turn lane on Option 2 would pose a problem since he and many of his neighbors use the turn lane to access their driveways. Commissioner Strom suggested consideration of replacing the vertical curb with rolled curb so bicyclists have an area to move when a vehicle approaches. The Planning Commissioners ranked the three options. The ranking order was the first choice of Option 1, followed by Option 2 with the enhanced median at the Kiva crosswalk, then Option 3. Commissioner Covington suggested Option 1 should include a 10-foot wide recreation path and reduce the speed limit to 25 mph.

Regarding moving the existing crosswalk at Kiva school on McDonald Drive further east away from the driveway into the cemetery, the Planning Commission did not find a need to relocate the crosswalk and were supportive of adding landscape medians around the crosswalk.

There was discussion on lowering the speed limit to make vehicles and bicyclist speed more compatible.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the Mockingbird options. Both options had full reconstruction to accommodate bike lanes. Option 1 excluded sidewalk on the east side. The Planning Commission preference was Option 1.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the revised Pedestrian and Bicycle Facilities Map. There were no suggested edits from the Planning Commission.

Commissioner Mahrle remarked that the Town has to make a decision on whether it wants to be bike hostile, bike neutral, or bike friendly. He believes the bike map is bike hostile and the overall plan is bike neutral at best.

Mr. Michaud quickly reviewed the enhanced intersections.

Chairman Wastchak stated he would like the December 5, 2017 Planning Commission meeting to focus on hillside and moved the bicycle-pedestrian work study discussion to the meeting of December 19, 2017.

No Reportable Action

7. CONSENT AGENDA

A. 17-404 Approval of November 7, 2017 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to approve the November 7, 2017 minutes with a change to the motion on the Hillside Code item to the meeting date of November 21, 2017 instead of November 17, 2017. The motion carried by the following vote:



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Final

Planning Commission

Tuesday, October 17, 2017

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Assistant Town Attorney Deborah Robberson
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Senior Planner Paul Michaud
Planner George Burton
Town Engineer Paul Mood

2. ROLL CALL

Present 5 - Chairperson Daran Wastchak
Commissioner James Anton
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell
Commissioner Dolf Strom
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright
Absent 2 - Commissioner Charles Covington
Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. 17-354 Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")
- Paul Michaud updated the Planning Commission on the direction from the Town Council on the Statement of Direction (SOD) reconsideration. Dawn-Marie Buckland emphasized that the Council was clear that staff and Commission stick to the original SOD.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the original SOD point by point. It was noted that the SOD points are met by many of the goals, policies, and implementation measures in the draft plan reviewed by the Planning Commission over the

past few months.

Chairman Wastchak summarized the various bicycle facility slides. It was noted that the consultant provided some preliminary cost estimates that will be reviewed at a subsequent meeting. Chairman Wastchak would like to see the cost estimates for the SOD bicycle facilities not already in the Capital Improvement Plan (CIP).

There was discussion on the resort loop and whether or not Council direction is to construct it at 10-feet in width. Mr. Michaud replied that in past meetings he has noted that reaching 10-feet in width will be a challenge in certain areas. Chairman Wastchak and Mr. Michaud did not believe it was the Council intent to construct a 10-foot wide path, but Chairman Wastchak will follow up with Council on this matter.

There was discussion on the two street segments identified on the bicycle facilities SOD map that are not presently in the CIP. These street segments are McDonald Drive east of Invergordon Road and Mockingbird Lane between Lincoln Drive and McDonald Drive. Chairman Wastchak requested more detailed information on these segments for the next meeting.

Commissioner Anton asked if there was any demand for the resort loop. Mr. Michaud described the outreach to the resort concierges, including the bike rentals offered by the resorts. The Planning Commission asked Mr. Michaud to follow up with the resorts along the resort loop with the following questions: How many bikes do the resort have available on-site? How often do people rent/use these bikes? Do the resorts offer bike racks/locks for those riding to the resort on a bike? Can they valet the bike?

There was discussion where many bicyclists ride and the routes they take (e.g. south on Mockingbird Lane, across McDonald Drive and Casa Blanca Drive and other local roads). Chairman Wastchak relayed concerns that spending money on McDonald Drive to Invergordon Road may be wasteful if bicyclists use local streets like Casa Blanca Drive.

Chairman Wastchak identified that Council discussed several safety items. He stated that safety issues may be brought back to Council.

Paul Mood provided an update on the engineering process progressing along Hummingbird Lane.

Paul Michaud presented the evaluation criteria. There were no suggested edits.

Mr. Michaud stated that this item will be set for discussion at the November 16, 2017 Planning Commission work session.

No Reportable Action

B. 17-355

Discussion of Hillside Code Updates (Article XXII of the Town Zoning Ordinance)

George Burton updated the Planning Commission on the direction from the Town Council on the Statement of Direction (SOD) reconsideration. Dawn-Marie Buckland emphasized that the Council was clear that staff and Commission stick to the original SOD.

Mr. Burton reviewed the four remaining SOD topics of lighting, solar panels, safety, and cantilevers.

Lighting

The revisions related to adding LUX, modifying when holiday lights can be used, and adding Kelvin to 3,000 was discussed. It was noted to keep foot-candles and add LUX.

Solar Panels

The Planning Commission had no edits to the solar panel text.

Safety

Mr. Burton explained eight safety criteria he researched from other communities based on Planning Commission input at a prior meeting in an attempt to address the SOD. It was noted to modify the beginning paragraph to state the points "may be required by the Town to be addressed." There was a lot of discussion on the criteria, including making them more objective and/or adding triggers. Overall, the direction was to have three criteria. This includes the construction site criteria with the added traffic circulation, parking management, and construction fencing components. The other two criteria of geologic reports and blasting would remain. The grading & drainage criteria was deemed unnecessary in this section since it is addressed elsewhere.

There was discussion regarding on-site retention and the Storm Drain Design Manual. Revisions to the text were suggested.

Cantilevers

Mr. Burton described the replacement illustration. It was noted to add dimension lines for the width and height. It was directed to also keep the existing illustration with a modification to remove the brace shown on the existing illustration.

On Figure 5, regarding the 12-foot high column with a deck show on top of

The Town Council discussed proposals made by Council Member Pace regarding hillside preservation and reconsideration of the Mummy Mountain Preserve Trust's mission, scope, and membership.

There was Council consensus for Council Member Pace and Council Member Moore to work with an advisory group to the Town Manager to review the Trust's bylaws and recommend changes.

17-321 Discussion of Statement of Direction Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan

Senior Planner Paul Michaud and Planning Commission Chair Daran Wastchak discussed topics that were raised during Planning Commission meetings related to the Paradise Valley Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan and that were not included in the initial Statement of Direction (SOD) adopted by the Council. After much discussion, there was Council consensus not to amend the SOD to include the new topics. However, the Council directed staff and the Planning Commission to forward to the Council any safety concerns and other topics not addressed within the SOD's scope in a separate recommendation.

17-348 Discussion of Statement of Direction - Hillside Lighting Code

Planner George Burton and Planning Commissioner Dolf Strom summarized potential Hillside Lighting Code amendments that were not included in the initial Statement of Direction adopted by the Council. After much discussion, there was Council consensus not to amend the SOD to include the new topics. However, if the Commission identifies any health and safety issues they should be forwarded to the Council.

Mayor Collins recessed the meeting at 6:00 PM.

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

- 17-334 The Town Council may go into executive session at one or more times during the meeting as needed to confer with the Town Attorney for legal advice regarding any of the items listed on the agenda as authorized by A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).**

No action was taken on this item.

4. BREAK

parameters of the Statement of Direction.

Commissioner Strom suggested to gather all the retention code provisions into one category. Mr. Burton will work with Commissioner Strom on these edits.

No Reportable Action

C. 17-302

Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan

Paul Michaud presented the proposed revised goals, policies, and implementation measures for the bicycle and pedestrian master plan. He explained that the packet included a track change version comparing those goals, policies, and implementation measures in the General Plan and another document that compares the changes to the February 2017 draft of the bicycle and pedestrian master plan.

He reviewed each revised goal and policy. There was discussion of signage. This included a request for clarification on Policy 4.6.5 that the intent is not to install signage, but if the Town must install signage that it be the minimum number along with the rest of the conditions outlined in that policy. Staff stated it would reword this policy. Some suggestions included, "Shall not install signs except where appropriate/needed" or "The Town desires to minimize visual clutter and shall only allow the minimum needed/required signs". The Planning Commission had no other changes to the draft revised goals and policies.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the draft revised implementation measures. There was concern over multiple responsible parties listed. Commissioner Strom wanted only one party listed or more clarity on who is responsible for what aspects of each measure. Eva Cutro noted that this format follows the existing General Plan.

Regarding Implementation Measure 3, addressing minimizing adverse impacts to the neighborhood, Commissioner Anton commented that additional detail regarding how the adverse impacts would be minimized may be necessary. The Planning Commission had no other changes to the draft revised implementation measures.

Mr. Michaud next reviewed the timeline of upcoming meetings. He stated October 12th is scheduled for Town Council amendment to the Statement of Direction, moved from September 28th. He continued that October 7th is the next Commission work session. Mr. Michaud asked the Planning Commission whether or not the proposed November 7th citizen review and December 5th action dates are still viable with the Statement of Direction going back to Town Council since the noticing would need to be done by October 13th. In an effort to avoid holiday weeks, the revised meeting

dates would be December 5th for citizen review and January 16th for Planning Commission action. The Planning Commission agreed to push out the timeline to the latter dates.

Heidi McCaulley had a question regarding lighting on her home. Her final inspection was held up because her lighting did not meet Code. She has a concern regarding her neighbor's lighting.

Ms. McCaulley also wanted to express safety concerns and requested when these will be addressed. The safety concerns are being reviewed by the Town Manager, with input from the Commission and Council. This will be it's own study, separate from the bicycle and pedestrian master plan. Commissioner Anton suggested that the neighbors should get together, propose solutions that they would like to see, and prioritize their concerns and solutions. Mr. McCaulley suggested to reduce the speed limit to 15 mph, install additional stop signs, and add rumble strips or speed humps.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

6. ACTION ITEMS

7. CONSENT AGENDA

A. 17-300 Approval of September 5, 2017 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to approve the September 5, 2017 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington,
 Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Chairperson Wastchak

8. STAFF REPORTS

Eva Cutro gave a quick review of the previous night's Visually Significant Corridors charrette. She thanked Commissioners Covington and Strom for their participation.

9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

None

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Final

Planning Commission

Tuesday, September 5, 2017

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m.

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Senior Planner Paul Michaud
Planner George Burton
Town Engineer Paul Mood

2. ROLL CALL

Present 7 - Chairperson Daran Wastchak
Commissioner James Anton
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell
Commissioner Charles Covington
Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle
Commissioner Dolf Strom
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

A. 17-275 Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan

Paul Michaud presented the progress on the bicycle and pedestrian master plan. He stated that the items for discussion this evening includes identification of any changes to the route maps from what was already discussed, noting that the Statement of Direction will be brought back to Town Council at their meeting of September 28, 2017. He continued that he would like input on the proposed enhanced intersections, mission statement, and goals and policies.

Commissioner Mahrle objects with the Town Manager's interpretation that the Statement of Direction needs to go back to Town Council. He feels this is within the scope of the Commission's purview.

Mr. Michaud highlighted the pedestrian routes discussed at the last meeting. The Planning Commission had no changes to the pedestrian route map.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the bicycle Capital Improvement Program Map and route map discussed by the Planning Commission at the last meeting. He asked to verify any changes related to the deviations from the Statement of Direction. The one change was on Jackrabbit Road between Invergordon Road and the Arizona Canal east of Scottsdale Road. This change was to modify the proposed bike lanes to a recreation path on one side since there are physical constraints in the area, the use will likely be recreational bike riders based on the STRAVA heat maps, and the existing General Plan and policies do not indicate bike improvements on this corridor.

There was discussion regarding modification of a 6-foot wide sidewalk into a 10-foot wide recreation path. It was noted that additional pavement could be added or the entire sidewalk could be reconstructed. There are costs and benefits to both methods.

Commissioner Strom inquired on consideration of making rolled edge curb along the north side of McDonald Drive near Invergordon Road. Chairman Wastchak did not recall any discussion on rolled curb.

There was discussion about signs. Mr. Michaud clarified the intent is to limit the amount of signs.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the proposed enhanced intersections.

Commissioner Strom asked what the definition of an enhanced intersection. Mr. Michaud responded it is any intersection that needs an improvement or enhancement such as a crosswalk or other physical improvement that makes it safer for bicyclists or pedestrians. He added that these intersections are on a bike or pedestrian path.

In updating the Hummingbird Lane intersections, it was noted that the prior concept of mini-roundabouts has been changed to stop signs and rumble strips based on site inspection. The Town Engineer noted that the final design will require the appropriate engineering study. Mr. Michaud added that the intersections would require approval to fund and engineering plans through a Town process beyond this master plan.

There were no specific concerns with the proposed enhanced intersections, except to modify the write up for each intersection to emphasize what is proposed for enhancement.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the proposed mission statement. There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the timing, noting that the intent is to have a complete Draft 2 of the plan by the end of October 2017.

No Reportable Action

B. 17-284

Discussion of Draft Visually Significant Corridors Master Plan (VSC)

Eva Cutro introduced the topic and the consultants.

John Griffin and Kevin Kuglar, consultants, gave an overview of the draft plan. It was noted the plan is divided into five sections.

Commissioner Strom asked about the cover of the plan. He stated he liked the concept of decorative material at the Lincoln Drive/Tatum Boulevard intersection. He had concerns about the durability of the material and the safety with marking travel lanes, the photo radar lines, and related markings.

The Planning Commission stated that the landscape guidelines, particularly the information on the plant types is useful and should be promoted. The proposed plants are all native or native-adapted.

John explained the street scape enhancements. There was discussion on the decorative luminaires. It was noted the Town would maintain these luminaires.

In discussing implementation, the proposed good, better and best options were reviewed.

The corners at the Lincoln Drive/Tatum Boulevard intersection were discussed, which included improvements such as seating and opportunity for vertical elements to acknowledge the pillars of the community. These would be places to take advantage of views, places to provide visual interest, and create some verticality to provide balance among the four corners. It was noted that working with the adjoining homeowner associations will be required to use some of their land, but maintenance would likely be a Town function. The Planning Commission liked the conceptual designs, particularly the pillars of the community corner that could be paid for through donations. Phasing of the one vertical element or use of natural plant material was suggested on the other corner instead of the proposed pillar. All agreed that some type of shade should be incorporated, either natural or with a structure.

No Reportable Action**C. 17-270**

Discussion of Subdivision Sign and Modified Subdivision Wall . Kachina Estates Subdivision (MI 17-02). Northeast corner of Casa Blanca Drive and Malcomb Drive.

Mr. Burton described the request on the screen wall and subdivision sign. It was noted that these were installed without approval. Staff is not supportive of the screen walls since it reduces the sense of openness.

Commissioner Mahrle remarked on his frustrations when individuals do work without proper approval. He wants stronger penalties. Rich Brock, developer, responded.

Commissioner Anton stated that the residence could be viewed through the original fence in their back yard and swimming pool, creating a lack of privacy. Drew Hyatt, architect, stated the neighbors he heard back from are in support of the request. Homeowner Devin Booker spoke regarding his concerns over safety and privacy. There was discussion on the ability to plant oleanders or similar plants behind the fence and the approved shrubs in front of the fence per the approved landscape plan.

No Reportable Action**D. 17-265**

Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")

Paul Michaud introduced the consultant team of Jim Coffman and Justin Azevedo. Lieutenant Carney will join the meeting to discuss enforcement measures that the Town is utilizing.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the pedestrian facilities proposed in the plan. The existing General Plan does not address pedestrian facilities. Mr. Michaud reviewed a map of existing pedestrian sidewalks, those that are in the Capital Improvement Plan, and those that were addressed in the Statement of Direction.

Commissioner Mahrle noted the abundance of recreational paths on the proposed plan. It was stated that the legend on the map is incorrect. Discussion ensued on recreational paths and that these may be 6 - 10 feet in width. 10 to 12 feet is recommended, especially if it is promoted for bicycle use as well. However, the Town may not be able to accommodate a path of this width along Lincoln Drive. Commissioner Campbell stated the desire to have the path less curvilinear if it will also accommodate bicycles.

Mr. Michaud noted that the pedestrian facilities are focused on the non-local streets. There was discussion of what the official pedestrian map

shall look like and that it should be pushed out to the public.

Lieutenant Carney reviewed enforcement. The motorcycle officer has changed his schedule to come in at 5 a.m. to be available to observe the early morning cyclists. A decoy car and police volunteers have also been utilized. A bike detail was done by police on Tuesday morning in the area of Hummingbird Lane. They stopped people for running the stop sign. Fifty bike citations have been issued since January 2017 and 30 traffic deployments have been done in the Hummingbird area since July 1, 2017. The majority of citations are for stop signs, others are for speed or riding more than two abreast. The police have met with leaders of various bicycle groups. At least one has now re-routed their direction. A neighbor commented that the re-routing may prove more dangerous.

Shauna Glazier, a cyclist and resident, has met with the police to try to work with the neighborhood. They have tried to divide the group into sub groups to ease the impact on the neighborhood. She believes they need to find a way to meet in the middle.

Carl Schaeffer, resident of Hummingbird, spoke of the dangerous conditions on his street. He just received a speeding ticket for driving 38 miles in the 25 mile zone on his street. He believes if he gets a ticket the cyclists should as well. A cyclist also complained to him that he needs to keep the street clear of gravel or the cyclists will sue him.

Nan Murley, resident, wrote a letter that is included in the Commission packet. She noted that many neighbors are out of Town and that they should have another chance to speak at a later date. Believes signage and landscape maintenance may aid the situation.

Carly Welch, resident, has teenage kids and is concerned about when they drive. She proposes having cyclists go up Hummingbird instead of down it. Shauna Glazier aid she would bring this request to her bicyclist group.

John McCauley, resident, has no problem if the cyclists obey the law. The speed limit is 25 or 15 miles per hour along the curves.

Marci Johnson, resident, says she has been at her home for 40 years. It is noisy and litter is thrown. It was noted that the litter is from a construction site, not the cyclists. She also stated reflective or bright clothing should be utilized by walkers and cyclists.

Commissioner Wainwright stated he will try to ride this route. He also noted at his previous home the cyclists could be very rude.

Commissioner Anton stated that it doesn't work when too many cyclists are on the same street. He believes cuts in the street may discourage cyclists from going too fast. He believes the residents need to suggest what improvements they would like.

Chairman Wastchak believes the Hummingbird area has a unique situation and may need to be addressed separate from the complete bicycle/pedestrian plan.

Commissioner Covington stated he is an avid cyclist and obeying the law is a priority.

Paul Michaud reviewed the bicycle component of the proposed plan. The Strava map was shown. This shows the heaviest used areas of the Town.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the General Plan map, the existing bicycle facilities, what is in the Capital Improvement Plan, and what is in the Statement of Direction.

The differences between the proposed map and the Statement of Direction were discussed.

1. Mountain View Road west of 52nd st has bike lanes and is heavily used.
2. Tatum Boulevard to the trailhead should be addressed. The City of Phoenix is willing to work with the Town on this connection.
3. 56th St. to Cherokee Elementary would provide a safe connection to a school.
4. 32nd St. is a connection that was supported in the opinion survey.
5. Lincoln/McDonald differs from the Statement of Direction because it recommends an expansion of the resort loop.
6. Invergordon Road north of McDonald has existing bike lanes
7. Jackrabbit road provides a connection to the AZ canal.

Commissioners Campbell and Mahrle are encouraged by the deviations from the SOD. Commissioner Mahrle would like even more facilities on Lincoln Drive and Tatum Boulevard. Commissioner Covington and Chairman Wastchak are also supportive of this compromise between the original plan and the Statement of Direction .

Commissioner Anton believes that the 32nd Street connection is too busy for cyclists and perhaps Palo Cristi Road should be looked at. The Strava map shows very little use of 32nd Street. It was noted that the residents of Palo Cristi Road may not support a recreational path along this road. Also, the draft 1 plan included facilities on Palo Cristi Road.

Jim Coffman asked if the Commission would support a connection on

McDonald Drive from Tatum Boulevard to 40th Street as suggested in the existing General Plan. This would deviate from the Statement of Direction.

Enhanced intersections were discussed next. The intersection of Quartz Mountain Road and Hummingbird Lane was discussed. At a minimum, stop signs are suggested, even a four way stop sign in this area. Consultants recommend a traffic circle with a raised island. Stop signs are not always obeyed. A traffic circle cannot be ignored. A pavement change may also be utilized. Mr. McCauley suggested placing a dip in the road at this location, it would also help with drainage. Shauna Glazier is supportive of traffic circles.

Hummingbird Lane and 61st Place was discussed next. A road straightening and raised median with a change in pavement is suggested. Nan Murley suggested that water flows be taken into consideration.

Rumble strips and cobblestones were also discussed as calming devices. Mrs. Glazier does not believe these calming devices will slow down cyclists or prevent them from using Hummingbird Lane. The consultant believes the rumble strips need additional studies.

The last intersection discussed was Hummingbird Lane and Cheney Drive. Roadway would be re-aligned to simplify the intersection. A roundabout could be added with decorative pavement details.

Roadway cross sections were quickly reviewed, including the Berneil Ditch.

Traffic calming measures were also reviewed and other enhanced intersections were identified. Wayfinding signs were shown and it was noted they would be in limited quantities.

This will come back to Commission on September 5th for further discussion.

It was noted that the Commission may need to go back to Council for the deviations from the Statement of Direction. Commissioner Mahrle did not believe this was necessary. Chairman Wastchak stated he has already discussed the deviations with Councilmember Bien-Willner (the liaison between Council and Commission).

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

would only apply to properties with the same restrictions as this lot (if any similar parcels exist).

Staff would like to see more detail on the area around the entry cul-de-sac and more detail on signage.

There was also a request for a dimension from the call box to the ROW. It was noted it is 75'. There is also room for residents to pass any cars that are stopped at the call box. Additional graphics were requested.

Open Space Criteria applied to these lots would pose a large problem according to the applicant. General direction seemed to not apply the open space criteria. It was noted that this criteria is only required for R-43 and R-175.

There was discussion regarding how height will be measured. The grade elevations are still being discussed with the Engineering department. Height may be an issue with lots 6, 7, and 8.

There was a concern that there may be confusion with calling this the Villas at Cheney Estates.

No Reportable Action

B. 17-254

Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")

Paul Michaud introduced the consultants, Jim Coffman and Justin Azevedo.

Mr. Michaud presented per the Planning Commission packet. He reviewed the Statement of Direction (SOD). Introduced the Resort Loop and safety concerns, and the focus on bicycle and pedestrian routes while avoiding "urban" design elements. The SOD also calls for addressing mitigation of conflicts and minimizing signage when possible. This study should be paired with the Visually Significant Corridors plan, identify rough costs and phasing, prioritize projects while being clear and legible.

The survey results were reviewed as well as the maps of pedestrian facilities.

Gaps in sidewalks were discussed.

Bicycle related survey results were discussed. The STRAVA bicycle usage map was analyzed. There was discussion of speed humps. There was a request for additional information on the STRAVA map and to include it in the next packet.

There was a request to invite a police officer to a Commission meeting to discuss enforcement measures.

It was stated that the shared use path on Lincoln Drive has been revised to a resort loop in the SOD. There was discussion of the Capital Improvement Program and how it aligns with the proposed plan.

Missing bicycle connections were also shown.

Chairman Wastchak believes there must be a connection from the Resort Loop to someplace. The Commissioners were all in agreement. It should not be a stranded island, but we also need to be cautious of costs.

Commissioner Mahrle is beyond disappointed on the SOD as it relates to bicyclists. He believes it ignores reality and cyclists will continue to ride in the Town. He believes the SOD is short sighted and naive. It sends the message to residents that we don't care about bike paths or pedestrian paths.

Commissioner Campbell does not understand the Resort Loop to nowhere. He believes we should look at McDonald Drive or some other connection.

Tim Welsh, resident, believes McDonald Drive is horrible for bicyclists and automobiles due to the medians. He prefers the concept of a 10-foot wide shared path as originally proposed. McDonald Drive would have been a great option if not for the medians.

Commissioner Campbell is flabbergasted by the whole process. Mr. Michaud explained that bicyclists can still use sidewalks on McDonald Drive or the roadway. He added there may be an option to make improvements, such as widening part of the pavement or where there are medians or use of ribbon curb to address the ability of a motorist to more safely pass a cyclist.

Commissioner Anton believes the SOD plan may work to direct tourists, but all other cyclists are going to continue riding where they currently ride regardless of a new bike map.

Chairman Wastchak believes it is a balancing act and this study should guide where the Town invests its money.

John McCauley, resident, bicyclists use side roads so they don't have to compete with vehicles. This could lead to a conflict between cyclists and pedestrians. His concern is with the safety of pedestrians and residents

that live on these streets (Hummingbird).

Chairman Wastchak noted that the Council realized that there are issues on certain streets in the Town that are dangerous and need to be addressed. The Commission needs to respect these concerns, but not let that overly influence what happens elsewhere in the Town.

There was discussion of how we move forward. Chairman Wastchak asked if there will be a convening of stakeholders to work through some of these concerns. This is not currently in the scope of work. Chairman Wastchak would like to take the time to get this right.

Mr. Michaud explained that input was received from all stakeholders and there are opposing points of view. The Commission may have to move forward knowing this matter.

Jim Coffman suggests that a focus should be on the missed bicycle connections. He reviewed a map illustrating these missed connections.

Commissioner Anton stated that there are different bicycle users. Those that are getting from point A to point B and others that are just riding around. Their needs may have to be addressed separately.

Heidi McCauley, resident, discussed runners' and walkers' fear of the cyclists on Hummingbird Road.

Mr. Michaud stated the goal of the next meeting was to go over goal and policies, but the direction is up to the Planning Commission.

Mr. Michaud explained that the Commission must keep in mind that this is a long range plan and not a Capital Improvement Program.

Jim Coffman explained that there are many more details not discussed, but it is up to the Commission what to focus on. One of his main focuses is safety.

Chairman Wastchak believes that the plan must include options. Must be a tool box, not a telling of what needs to be done.

Chairman Wastchak believes it is okay to keep options in the toolbox, but specific illustration on streets could be misinterpreted. Standard details may be a better option.

It was discussed whether cyclists want to ride on sidewalks. It was noted they do not and sidewalks are not a good alternative for mature cyclists,

maybe for kids.

Rick Mahrle agrees that there are the destination cyclists and recreational cyclists. He is a recreational rider but could follow a destination if there is a good one offered.

No Reportable Action

8. CONSENT AGENDA

A. 17-255 Approval of July 11, 2017 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to approve the July 11, 2017 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Strom

9. STAFF REPORTS

Paul Michaud provided the Commission the upcoming packet.

10. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

None

11. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

12. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell at 9:40 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Strom

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: 
Eva Cutro, Secretary

12. ACTION ITEMS**17-231 Consideration of Paradise Valley Bicycle & Pedestrian Master Plan
Statement of Direction**

Senior Planner Paul Michaud presented the proposed Statement of Direction for the Bicycle Pedestrian Master Plan. He stated that since the Council discussion on February 23, 2017 on the Statement of Direction, the Town received much public feedback. On June 8, Mayor Collins offered a proposal narrowing the scope of bicycle and pedestrian facilities. There was general Council support for the revised Statement of Direction based on the Mayor's proposal; however, several residents objected to certain language that seemed anti-bicyclist.

Residents Shawna Glazier, Michelle Childs, Mimi Shaps, Janie White, Brent Donaldson, Rod Riley, and Phoenix resident James Winebrenner opposed the Statement of Direction in its current form. They believed it treated cyclists unfairly. They encouraged the Council to delay final action until amendments could be made providing for coexistence between vehicles, cyclists, and pedestrians consistent with the General Plan.

John McCauley and Heidi McCauley expressed safety concerns with shared usage on Hummingbird Ln. They encourage the Town to focus on enforcement of traffic laws for vehicles and cyclists in that area.

Responding from a question from Mayor Collins, Planning Commission Daran Wastchak stated that he would relate the Council's discussions to the Commission and would work to find a solution that would address joint-use and safety concerns.

After Council discussion Council Member Stanton proposed the following amendment to the Safety and Enforcement section of the Statement of Direction:

- o **EMPHASIZE SAFETY AND ENFORCEMENT:** Recommend bicycle facilities, policies, and enforcement measures that foster bicyclists following the rules of the road to improve safety and the creation of a non-confrontational environment. Of particular concern is addressing bicyclists that ride more than two abreast, bicyclists not stopping at signed intersections, and speeding. Recommend any new traffic rules or laws if necessary to remedy a material or defect in an existing law.

In addition there was Council direction to recommend bicycle facilities, policies, and program measures encouraging bicycling for people of all ages and bicycling abilities; and to formulate strategies to educate bicyclists, pedestrians, motorists and the general public promoting positive interaction between each user group.

Council Member Dembow offered additional amendments but they did not receive a second.

A motion was made by Council Member Stanton, seconded by Council Member Sherf, to approve the Statement of Direction (SOD) for the Paradise Valley Bicycle & Pedestrian Master Plan, as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Mayor Collins

Vice Mayor Bien-Willner
Council Member Moore
Council Member Pace
Council Member Sherf
Council Member Stanton

Nay: 1 - Council Member Dembow



**TOWN COUNCIL MEETING
6401 E. LINCOLN DRIVE
PARADISE VALLEY, ARIZONA 85253
MINUTES
Thursday, June 8, 2017**

1. CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Mayor Collins called to order the Town Council Meeting for Thursday, June 8, 2017 at 4:00 p.m. in the Town Hall Boardroom.

COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT

Mayor Michael Collins
Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner
Council Member Paul Dembow attended by telephone conference call
Council Member Scott Moore
Council Member Julie Pace
Council Member David A. Sherf
Council Member Mark Stanton

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Manager Kevin Burke
Town Attorney Andrew Miller
Town Clerk Duncan Miller
Police Chief Peter Wingert
Town Engineer Paul Mood
Director of Administration and Government Affairs Dawn Marie Buckland
Public Works Director Brent Skoglund
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Senior Planner Paul Michaud
Planner George Burton
Engineering Services Analyst Jeremy Knapp

2. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

17-176

Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle & Pedestrian Master Plan

Senior Planner Paul Michaud presented the draft Statement of Direction for the Planning Commission related to the Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan.

Mayor Collins presented his proposed revision to the Bicycle Circulation Map and Statement of Direction. His proposal eliminated approximately six miles of bike lane and route designations and focused on facility improvements away from local neighborhoods, congested vehicle traffic locations, and hillside areas. In addition, his proposal included a new concept called the "Resort Loop" that connected central resorts with a shared-use recreational path.

The Council discussed the Mayor's proposal, offered amendments, and agreed to schedule the Statement of Direction for a vote at the next meeting.

17-051 Update of Paradise Valley Bicycle & Pedestrian Master Plan

Senior Planner Paul Michaud and Jim Coffman of Coffman Studio updated the Town Council on the Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan. They provided an overview of the draft plan and asked for specific direction on the major components of the draft. They reminded Council that the purpose of the Master Plan was to fulfill the General Plan goal to analyze non-motorized circulation system for the Town, define bicycle and pedestrian routes, design standards for street and off-street signage, identify projects, and create performance measures. They summarized existing conditions and recommendations based on feedback from residents.

The Council discussed developing a Statement of Direction (SOD) or similar clarification to the Planning Commission to set parameters on their review. There was consensus on the following:

- Focus more on pedestrian paths and connectivity, and give less priority to bicycles
- Limit signage and pavement markings
- Collaborate with the Visually Significant Corridors Master Plan process for consistent treatment of design, especially on Lincoln and Tatum
- Collaborate with area drainage studies
- Focus on local connectivity and not regional connectivity
- Discourage bicycle use of major arterials
- Walking paths on Town-owned property behind houses was generally discouraged

Council discussed dividing up the master plan by project areas. The Council expressed cost considerations and concerns. They asked for specific cost estimates for each proposed improvement to the extent possible. The Council directed staff delay Planning Commission action on the Master Plan until after the Council provides direction to the Commission.

17-063 Review and Discussion of Work Space Reallocation Study

Town Manager Kevin Burke introduced Vice President Staci Seyer and Project Manager Brady Rewerts of Corgan Architecture & Interior Design. Corgan was selected through an RFQ process to analyze the space utilization needs for the Town Hall, Police Department, and Public Works buildings. Mr. Rewerts presented design proposals for each building. Two options were offered for Town Hall to improve service delivery by providing public counter space for post office, Human Resources/Town Clerk, Finance/Utility Billing, Planning/Building from a central lobby area.

The Council generally favored the recommendations for the Police Department, Public Works, and Town Hall option 1. The Council authorized staff to develop project phasing and cost estimates. Construction would be programmed into the Capital Improvement Program budget to compete with other projects.



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Final

Planning Commission

Tuesday, February 21, 2017

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Acting Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Senior Planner Paul Michaud

2. ROLL CALL

Present 4 - Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright
Commissioner Daran Wastchak
Commissioner Jeff Wincel
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell
Absent 2 - Chairperson Dolf Strom
Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

A. 17-048 Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle & Pedestrian Master Plan

Paul Michaud introduced Jim Coffman, the lead consultant on the Bicycle and Pedestrian Plan. The plan is currently at the refine stage. Mr. Coffman gave an overview of the public outreach. He explained the relationship between the 2012 General Plan and the proposed plan. Additional direction is needed from the Planning Commission on selecting a cross section for the major arterial of Lincoln Drive and Tatum Boulevard; as well as a cross section for McDonald Drive.

A pedestrian route map is proposed. The General Plan does not currently have a pedestrian map. Wayfinding signs are also included in the plan. Signs would be used conservatively. The proposed above grade signs are

of natural materials including gabion cages and rocks. Some signs are proposed on the pavement.

One cross section for the major arterial includes narrowing the lanes to 11 feet to allow a 5.5-foot bike lane with a 2-foot buffer from the travel lane. The second option does not impact existing curb and gutter. The travel lanes are 12-feet and 13-feet in width. This option includes no in road bike lane. Sidewalks and multi-use paths are proposed instead separated by landscape from the travel lanes. The Planning Commission preferred this cross section design for Lincoln Drive and Tatum Boulevard.

There was discussion over 11-foot travel lanes. Mr. Coffman stated the Town Engineer stated the Town Engineer would not support travel lanes on a major arterial less than 11 feet in width. He continued that narrower lanes are becoming the norm. There was concern that hard-core riders will not use a sidewalk, rather they will continue riding in the street. If the option with the bike lane is preferred, recreational riders can still use the sidewalk.

McDonald Drive cross sections were discussed next. Two draft options were shown. The first option maintains curb and gutter except around medians where the curb and gutter "bows" out. The center turn lane is removed to accommodate bike lanes on both sides of the street. A decomposed granite path is also proposed for the south side of the street. There was discussion as to whether the volume on McDonald Drive requires a turn lane. It was observed that the volume is not high, but there may be a backup during peak hours without the turn lane. The turn lane is only 9-foot wide currently. The second option leaves current conditions, but adds the decomposed granite path and signs (sharrows) on the pavement in key locations. A twenty-five mile per hour speed limit is proposed with both options.

Sally Wingate, Echo Canyon resident, likes 25 mile per hour speed limit. Driveways are on the road and these homeowners would appreciate the lower speed limit. She also suggested to add a permanent speed camera(s) on McDonald Drive. She rides her bike on the sidewalk.

There was discussion that the medians on McDonald Drive would remain in both options and that no increase in the speed limit is being considered. Commissioner Campbell wanted to know if both options could be considered, one east of Invergordon Road and one west of Invergordon Road. There was concern about not wanting to invite more cyclists to McDonald Drive.

Scott Turner, resident, stated that removal of a few medians along McDonald Drive may make it easier to get around cyclists. There was

discussion of further moving the curb and gutter at the medians to allow the buffer to remain between the bike lane and the vehicular lane. There was discussion of doing nothing. There was a discussion of using a bike lane on just one side of the road. Mr. Coffman said it is unusual to see just one bike lane.

Commissioner Wainwright preferred the do nothing option on McDonald Drive. He doesn't want to encourage more bicycle traffic on this street nor does he want the turn lane removed. Commissioner Campbell can see a benefit to removing cyclists from Lincoln Drive and moving them to McDonald Drive. He doesn't want all turn lanes removed. Maybe just leave turn lanes at major intersections. Chairman Wastchak does not like the look of a "painted" road on McDonald Drive. His only problem with cyclists is at the medians. Maybe the plan can keep the current look but still bow out the road at the medians. This would get rid of the "pinch points". This may even create a traffic calming effect as a secondary benefit (similar to concept at 48th Street). All liked the pedestrian paths.

Mimi Daiza, resident, stated two of her three properties have driveways on Tatum Boulevard. She is not a fan of the plan because she doesn't want more pedestrian or cyclist traffic on Tatum Boulevard. She believes this will be a hazard when cars are trying to exit driveways. She inquired the location of the multi-use path. Mr. Coffman noted the general plan is to have this path on the east side of Tatum Boulevard and a sidewalk on the other side of the street.

Addition of the Minor Collector is proposed in the plan with additional pedestrian sidewalks. A decomposed granite path is an option as well.

Enhanced local cross section is another addition to the General Plan. Buffered bike lanes with decomposed granite trails are shown. There was discussion of the color of the paint stripes. Light tan paint could be used or decorative concrete. Commissioner Wincel has concerns with painted roads. If not maintained they look run down. He prefers an architectural solution. Chairman Wastchak stated there was a concern about keeping the roads looking rural. Mr. Coffman reviewed another option that has no striping but adds a decomposed granite path to one side of the road. A third option exists for just Golf Drive with walkable shoulders. It was noted that the map needs to better define where the three options will be used. There was also a comment that the maps need to be larger in the plan.

Performance Measures will be introduced in this plan. These will assist in monitoring progress. There was crash data shown. Most accidents occur east of Invergordon Road. There was discussion of progress since the 2012 General Plan. There was discussion of bike counts and pedestrian

counts. Connections to Phoenix and Scottsdale were shown, along with discussion of improvements that Phoenix and Scottsdale have implemented.

Scott Turner, resident, was concerned that if the speed limit is reduced on McDonald Drive existing traffic controls should also be examined. This could include changing the four-way stop at Mockingbird Lane and McDonald Drive to a two-way stop or converting certain intersections to a roundabout.

There was discussion of needing to work with the Ritz-Carlton team with both the Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan and the Visually Significant Corridors plan. There was a concern with the lack of continuity on the Town's sidewalk network. Commissioner Wincel noted sidewalk gaps on Vista Drive and 68th Street. Mr. Michaud remarked that the scope of work on the inventory did not include all Town streets. As such, the inventory did not cover many local streets.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the upcoming meeting schedule. He stated the citizen review for this plan is set for the Planning Commission meeting of March 21, 2017 and the meeting for Planning Commission recommendation is set for April 18, 2017. The Planning Commissioners present did not see a need for additional study sessions then those noted.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

6. ACTION ITEMS

None

7. CONSENT AGENDA

A. 17-052 Approval of February 7, 2017 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Wincel, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to approve the February 7, 2017 Planning Commission minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

Absent: 2 - Chairperson Strom and Commissioner Mahrie

8. STAFF REPORTS

Mr. Miller gave a legislative update on small cell site regulations. It was noted that the Town Manager is also working on efforts to get better cell

16-390 Update on Town's Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan

Senior Planner Paul Michaud introduced James Coffman of Coffman Studios and Dean Chambers of J2 Engineering who were selected by the Town to develop the Bicycle Pedestrian Master Plan. Mr. Michaud explained that Town's current General Plan includes an implementation measure to prepare a pedestrian master plan by 2020.

The consultants described the project scope, what has been accomplished, the public participation process, routes and preferences identified through public meetings, and the timeline.

The Council expressed concern about bike lanes on Lincoln Dr and Tatum Blvd especially if that meant shrinking vehicle lanes to install bike lanes. The Council also conveyed a preference to limit striping on residential streets. There was discussion about prioritizing connectivity between resorts and other local destinations over connectivity with neighboring municipalities.

16-414 Discussion of Expectations of Council Regarding Staff Communication

Mayor Collins stated that he and Vice Mayor Sherf added this item to the agenda to get a sense from the Council about when councilmembers-elect should start receiving council correspondence from staff, including Council meeting packets, reports from the Town Manager, and executive session / attorney-client privilege material. It was noted that past practice was to wait until after the General Election to provide non-confidential materials. Attorney-client and executive session information was not shared until after the members were sworn in.

There was Council consensus that councilmembers-elect should receive meeting materials as soon as they are elected. The Town Manager should also send his weekly updates to newly-elected members. It was agreed that he should continue to write to Council as his primary audience but include a disclaimer, assuming that the report is provided to councilmembers-elect and the public, that the correspondence is a summary only and additional background or context may be necessary to fully understand this issue. It was further suggested that the disclaimer encourage readers to contact Town representatives for more information.

The Council asked for further clarification on attorney-client privilege and a protocol for council members to follow so as not to violate privilege by forwarding messages or discussing subjects that were raised in an executive session with department directors and other staff.

Mayor Collins recessed the meeting at 6:15 PM.

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Campbell

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Wainwright

STUDY SESSION ITEMS (CONTINUED)

16-315 Update on Town's Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan

Paul Michaud gave a presentation with Jim Coffman, a consultant working as the project manager for the plan. Mr. Michaud explained the general plan was ratified by public vote and explained the five phases of the plan.

Mr. Michaud stated the consultant will present a draft of formal plan at the December 14, 2016 open house event.

Mr. Michaud and Mr. Coffman discussed the results from the resident survey and responses as well as the challenges and area of opportunity.

Commission discussed the current bike laws of the town as well as the state. Commission expressed concerns about traffic safety. Mr. Coffman explained once the routes have been narrowed down they will look at safety and traffic prior to final decision.

Mr. Coffman explained they would be doing a bicycle count on October 15, 2016 between 6:00 a.m. - 9:00 a.m. to get a better idea of the number of bikes and routes currently used.

Mr. Michaud explained they will be holding an open house on October 19, 2016 at 5:30 p.m. for the public to discuss, get feedback and look at possible routes, among other items.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

7. CONSENT AGENDA

16-316 Approval of September 20, 2016 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the minutes of September 20, 2016. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Campbell

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Wainwright

16-178 Cancellation of Regular Council Meeting for June 23, 2016**16-176 Renewal of Solid waste removal services contract with Sonoran Waste Disposal L.L.C.**

Recommendation: Authorize the Town Manager to renew a contract for solid waste removal services with Sonoran Waste L.L.C. for FY 2016/2017 in an amount of \$28,700 and to exercise up to three one-year renewal options.

16-192 Approval to extend the Intergovernmental Agreement between the Superior Court of Maricopa County and the Town of Paradise Valley for jury services

Recommendation: Approve the amendment to extend the Intergovernmental Agreement between the Superior Court of Maricopa County and the Town of Paradise Valley for jury services for an additional two year term (June 30, 2016 - June 30, 2018).

A motion was made by Council Member Dembow, seconded by Council Member Stanton, to approve the Consent Agenda. The motion passed unanimously.

11. PUBLIC HEARINGS

There were no public hearings.

12. ACTION ITEMS**Award of Contract for Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan**

Senior Planner Paul Michaud presented a proposal to award a contract to Coffman Studio, PLLC to develop a bicycle and pedestrian master plan. He stated that this master plan would satisfy one of the goals in the General Plan and one of the Town Council's quality of life initiatives. He described the bid, review, and selection processes followed to select Coffman Studio. He stated that the plan would take approximately 10 months to complete.

Responding to a question from the Council, Mr. Michaud described the stakeholders that would be involved and the outreach process.

There were no public comments.

A motion was made by Council Member Hamway, seconded by Council Member Stanton, to authorize the Town Manager to execute a contract with Coffman Studio, PLLC in the amount not to exceed \$143,695.02 to develop a Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan for the Town. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Vice Mayor Sherf, Council Member Bien-Willner, Council Member Dembow, Council Member Hamway, and Council Member Stanton

Nay: 1 - Council Member

Absent: 1 - Mayor Collins

Consideration of "The Villas at Mountain Shadows - Amended - Condominiums"
Final Condominium Plat Map

Mr. Michaud presented The Villas at Mountain Shadows - Amended - Condominiums" Final Condominium Plat Map during the study session. There were no questions from the Council. Planning Commissioner Scott Moore presented the Commission's report. He noted the Commission unanimously recommended approval of both plat maps.

There were no public comments.

A motion was made by Council Member Hamway, seconded by Council Member Syms, to approve the Final Condominium Plat Map, "The Villas at Mountain Shadows - Amended - Condominiums" (FP 16-02), subject to the following stipulations:

1. Development shall be in substantial compliance with the Final Condominium Plat Map, "The Villas at Mountain Shadows – Amended - Condominiums," Sheets 1-6, prepared by Coe & Van Loo Consultants, Inc. dated May 18, 2016.
2. The final improvements shall be in substantial compliance with improvement plans approved by the Town Engineer and Community Development Department that address items such as sewer, water, grading, drainage, paving, landscaping, and irrigation. Prior to the recordation of the Final Condominium Plat Map, the applicant shall provide, subject to Town approval and consistent with the requirements set forth in the SUP and Development Agreement, all assurances necessary to guarantee completion of any improvements in the public right-of-way. The Town Engineer shall approve said final improvement plans prior to the issuance of any building permit for a residential unit in said Final Condominium Plat Map.
3. Within 60 days of approval of the Final Condominium Plat Map, the applicant shall submit to the Town Mylars of the approved plans and an electronic version of these plans in a pdf format for the Town's permanent record.