

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Monday, January 08, 2018 8:37 PM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Fwd: Trash Disposal Service

I am still sending you the emails I see that multiple we copied on and dialogue occurred so you can decide whether it needs to be included in Publisher packet thx

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace

Begin forwarded message:

From: Mark Hickman
Date: January 8, 2018 at 5:38:59 PM MST
To: Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Cc: "jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov" <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, "pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov" <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, "smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov" <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, "jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov" <jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, "mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov" <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, "dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov" <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: RE: Trash Disposal Service

Mr. Mayor,

What are you going to do when the potential for reduced costs and fewer trucks on the street is NOT realized and the monopoly "You Forced" begins to ratchet costs higher and higher?

This a mistake to force your idea of utopia on the towns people! The town's people have NOT been clamoring for this idea of yours!

Please reconsider your plan to force the town to try this mess waiting to happen!

Also, please note: I found no humor in your flippant close that " At the end of the day, we are all lucky to live in a place where garbage service is the most controversial topic of the day."

Dr. and Mrs. Hickman.

the key question is whether the status quo for garbage service is good enough for what I call the Best Small Town in America or whether the potential for reduced costs and fewer trucks on the street is a step forward or a step too far for the Town?

-----Original Message-----

From: Mayor Michael Collins [<mailto:mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>]
Sent: Saturday, January 6, 2018 2:14 PM
To: Mark Hickman
Subject: Re: Trash Disposal Service

Mark. Thanks as always for your input. Here are my thoughts on the topic.

There is no absolute right or wrong answer. It's a value judgement for each of us.

The key question is whether the status quo for garbage service is good enough for what I call the Best Small Town in America or whether the potential for reduced costs and fewer trucks on the street is a step forward or a step too far for the Town?

Information on the proposal is online at <http://www.paradisevalleyaz.gov/551/Trash-Collection>.

Join us for a Community Conversation on the topic at 1800 on January 25th at Town Hall. Town Staff and Republic Services will be available to answer your questions. If you can't attend in person, join us online at <https://paradisevalleyaz.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>.

Thanks again for reaching out. At the end of the day, we are all lucky to live in a place where garbage service is the most controversial topic of the day.

Yours in Service

Michael Collins, Mayor
The Best Small Town in America

Town of Paradise Valley
6401 East Lincoln Drive<x-apple-data-detectors://1> Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253<x-apple-data-detectors://1>
Office: 480-348-3690<<tel:480-348-3690>>

Disclaimer: All messages contained in this system are the property of the Town of Paradise Valley and are considered a public record subject to disclosure under the Arizona Public Records Law (A.R.S. 39-121). Town employees, public officials, and those who generate e-mail to and from this e-mail domain should have no expectation of privacy related to the use of this technology. To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other Town Council members. Members of the Town Council may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other Town Council members.

On Jan 1, 2018, at 5:36 PM, Mark Hickman

wrote:

<image003.png>

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Saturday, January 06, 2018 12:21 PM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Fwd: Trash Hauling contract RFP bid competition process and contract quality management

Consider Including this email in packet also

If I see more than the copied I will try to get them to you for disclosure where a dialogue was included so they can be published

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace

Begin forwarded message:

From: Jay Varty
Date: January 6, 2018 at 12:07:00 PM MST
To: Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Cc: Jack Selby Julie Pace Mal Jozoff
, Natalie Varty >, "Rita Varty"
<mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>,
<TrashFeedback@ParadiseValleyAz.gov>, <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>,
<pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Trash Hauling contract RFP bid competition process and contract quality management

Paul, with all due respect.

I am a successful serial entrepreneur also, have been a corporate entity leader in various roles, and have had the opportunity to be in the trenches of a large company service contracting team.

The HOA you are a member of negotiated or bid for a special dedicated service contract for its residents and the result was excellent. Why shouldn't the Town do the same for all the residents?

How many residential locations are there in your HOA? How many are there in the Town? One could argue that your HOA is currently being subsidized by the rest of the residents that use your hauler? This is a slippery slope discussion because it can appear you want to keep a benefit for a few but deny it to the rest of the town. But I can understand the problem you are pointing out and the negative energy it can bring.

Perhaps the contract management process RFP should have included a requirement to address the special negotiated prices for full HOAs? At this point it may be too late for the RFP process to be improved, however it could be re-bid because it our town process, we own it, we drive it, but there is no rule that precludes negotiating a best and final deal that includes your HOA contract as it stands, and future RFPs to include more efficient HOA situations be treated properly. I think the supplier/vendor is just trying to maximize its profits and there certainly is room for them to honor the existing 100% participation HOA contracts.

I have no access to the details of the offers or the RFP requirements, and have not been involved in any way. I have no conflict of interest other than that I am resident. However I can assert that the definition of the RFP requirements is the most important part of the process as it must include the requirements of all the stakeholders. If all the stake holders' requirements are not in the RFP then an examination of how the RFP requirements were built requires analysis and evaluation.

Nevertheless, I believe that the significant objection you bring up is a valid one and can be addressed with the vendor/supplier before contracting. They will bend. There is a mutually agreeable solution. I think this problem requires tougher negotiation in this managed free market process, if the RFP is not re-issued.

humbly yours,

Jay Varty

On Jan 6, 2018, at 11:31 AM, Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Dear Mr. Varty,

Thanks for reaching out to me.

The RFP gave us a mixed bag of tricks. Some folks would pay less and some folks would pay more, and at first having twice a week trash pick up is also not available. I'm on my HOA board. Currently we are paying \$16.00/month, to get the same service after our contract runs out, would go to \$27.00 per month. I'd have to explain to my HOA members, and several other HOA members throughout the Town, why their costs were going up by 60% for the same services. I can't think of how I'd say that with a straight face.

Our Town does not have a property tax so it would not be saving the residents any money. The 'savings' from less wear and tear on the roads is, at best, a guesstimate. The having only one truck on the street would be a nice benefit, I totally agree!

The amount of residents who believe they can select a better vendor than the government is outweighing those who think one is a better idea. As an elected official, I'm not voting against what my residents want by such a large margin and something that will help some and hurt others.

I'm also a serial entrepreneur. I'm on the global board of the Entrepreneurs Organization. In my experience government picking winners and losers is usually a bad idea and certainly is against the concept of limited government that our Town espouses. Our Town is filled with successful folks who achieved their financial independence by being entrepreneurs.

Competing for your business, in my experience, produces better service.

If you're passionate about this project, please get your fellow residents involved. Voices count for your elected officials.

Please accept this email with my respect for you and your opinion. I wanted you to know where I stand

and why.

Regards,
Paul Dembow
Councilman
(480) 348-3690
pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov<<mailto:pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>>

[cid:22E27191-1774-4D02-9DBE-B0FC17334E5D@expressvpn]

Paradise Valley is residences and resorts with no commercial business and no property tax

6401 E. Lincoln Dr.
Paradise Valley AZ 85253

Disclaimer: All messages contained in this system are the property of the Town of Paradise Valley and are considered a public record subject to disclosure under the Arizona Public Records Law (A.R.S. 39-121). Town employees, public officials, and those who generate e-mail to and from this e-mail domain should have no expectation of privacy related to the use of this technology. To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other Town Council members. Members of the Town Council may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other Town Council members.

On Jan 6, 2018, at 11:28 AM, Jay Varty < > wrote:

To my fellow town residents and honorable council members:

I would like to make a short statement to the council members in support of the process that has been undertaken to add professional supply/vendor management processes to improve all aspects of how trash hauling is carried out in Paradise Valley. It is clear to me that the effort can be a win-win for all stakeholders concerned. The quality of the result will be directly related to the competitive nature of the process, which pits the qualified relevant trash hauling companies against each other in a capitalist free-for-all bid process, with prudent rational requirements in the Request for Proposal. These limits and requirements were used to create the best results for the town and its residents.

The future satisfaction of the residents will hinge in part on the professional management and quality control to be managed by the town staff contract administration. By measuring service quality with feedback from residents, service problems should be resolved with the selected supplier working towards meeting the objectives set out in the contract. Quality control can be maximized by including the residents in a quality survey periodically, amongst other methods you can define. If the supplier fails to deliver its promises, then a new RFP should be issued and the contract cancelled for non-performance.

The bid process is designed to make the contracting of the service as cost efficient as possible by the mere inclusion of all the trash haulers in the process to compete directly with each other, and by causing them to figure out the best, most efficient manner of gathering the trash with a vastly superior volume of business than if split into 5 different haulers. In fact its possible for the account to be more profitable than ever for the hauler that wins the contract, while at the same time making the cost to the individual homeowner less expensive or more service rich. Apparently these objectives are being met.

I am confident the town residents will gain lower prices and better quality of life as a result of the

process. The minimum service levels must always be spelled out in the RFPs, and subsequently in the service contracts, to give the residents the service choices they require. Clear conflict-of-interest policies and ethics policies must be in place and enforced for the town contract management team. This effort does create additional responsibilities for the PV town staff, a challenge I am sure they can execute professionally and capably, along with the active oversight of the mayor and town council members.

Thanks for your time and consideration.

Jay Varty

<Paul.Dembow.Head.Shot.jpg>

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Saturday, January 06, 2018 8:44 AM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Fwd: Trash

Not sure if this needs to go but I am going through and seeing anything we we are all copied

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace

Begin forwarded message:

From: Council Member Julie Pace <jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Date: December 12, 2017 at 1:51:24 PM MST
To: Pam Kirby
Cc: Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member David Sherf <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member Mark Stanton <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Trash

Thx for email. We just learned the terms and are starting Education process of terms to community. So to early to know what community wants, as terms just released this past week. Thank you for your interest

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Dec 10, 2017, at 1:01 PM, Pam Kirby

wrote:

Good afternoon,
I would like to know from each of you if you plan to support staff recommendation from 12/7 of the single hauler trash provider of Republic. Given that this is a simple yes/no, a prompt reply would be greatly appreciated!

Thank you,
Pam

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Monday, January 08, 2018 4:55 PM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Fwd: Unified garbage collection badly needed

Julie Pace
Council Member
Town of Paradise Valley
6401 E. Lincoln Drive
Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253
jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov
Work: 480.348.3690
Cell: 480.985.2613

Paradise Valley is residences and resorts with no commercial business and no property tax.

Disclaimer: All messages contained in this system are the property of the Town of Paradise Valley and are considered a public record subject to disclosure under the Arizona Public Records Law (A.R.S. 39-121). Town employees, public officials, and those who generate e-mail to and from this e-mail domain should have no expectation of privacy related to the use of this technology. To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other Town Council members. Members of the Town Council may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other Town Council members.

Begin forwarded message:

From: Patricia Mayberry
Date: January 8, 2018 at 4:53:33 PM MST
To: Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Unified garbage collection badly needed

Thank you, Paul and Michael, for your responses to my email. I appreciate you both taking the time to respond. Paul, I completely understand that your HOA doesn't want your garbage fees to increase to \$27.00/month. However, I'd like to point out that your HOA has essentially created a city service for your private neighborhood by bargaining for reduced rates and having only one garbage truck on your streets. This is precisely what I would like the Town of Paradise Valley to do for the town at large. As a resident in a non-HOA neighborhood, I pay \$47.00/month for one can and no recycling - plus one to two garbage trucks on our street five days a week.

Doesn't seem quite right, does it?
Trish

On Jan 5, 2018, at 4:27 PM, Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Ms. Mayberry,

Thanks for reaching out to me.

The RFP gave us a mixed bag of tricks. Some folks would pay less and some folks would pay more, and at first having twice a week trash pick up is also not available. I'm on my HOA board. Currently we are paying \$16.00/month, to get the same service after our contract runs out, would go to \$27.00 per month. I'd have to explain to my HOA members, and several other HOA members throughout the Town, why their costs were going up by 60% for the same services. I can't think of how I'd say that with a straight face.

Our Town does not have a property tax so it would not be saving the residents any money. The 'savings' from less wear and tear on the roads is, at best, a guesstimate. The having only one truck on the street would be a nice benefit, I totally agree!

The amount of residents who believe they can select a better vendor than the government is outweighing those who think one is a better idea. As an elected official, I'm not voting against what my residents want by such a large margin and something that will help some and hurt others.

Unless things change with the RFP or numbers, we will disagree on this matter. If things change... I can change my opinion too.

If you're passionate about this project, please get your fellow residents involved. Voices count for your elected officials.

Please accept this email with my respect for you and your opinion. I wanted you to know where I stand and why.

Regards,
Paul Dembow
Councilman
(480) 348-3690
pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov<<mailto:pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>>

[cid:22E27191-1774-4D02-9DBE-B0FC17334E5D@expressvpn]

On Jan 6, 2018, at 1:54 PM, Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Trish. Thanks as always for your input. Here are my thoughts on the topic.

There is no absolute right or wrong answer. It's a value judgement for each of us.

The key question is whether the status quo for garbage service is good enough for what

I call the Best Small Town in America or whether the potential for reduced costs and fewer trucks on the street is a step forward or a step too far for the Town?

Information on the proposal is online at <http://www.paradisevalleyaz.gov/551/Trash-Collection>.

Join us for a Community Conversation on the topic at 1800 on January 25th at Town Hall. Town Staff and Republic Services will be available to answer your questions. If you can't attend in person, join us online at <https://paradisevalleyaz.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>.

Thanks again for reaching out. At the end of the day, we are all lucky to live in a place where garbage service is the most controversial topic of the day.

Yours in Service

Michael Collins, Mayor
The Best Small Town in America

Town of Paradise Valley
6401 East Lincoln Drive<[x-apple-data-detectors://1](#)>
Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253<[x-apple-data-detectors://1](#)>
Office: 480-348-3690<<tel:480-348-3690>>

On Jan 5, 2018, at 10:56 AM, Trish Mayberry

wrote:

Dear Town Council,

I moved from Scottsdale to Paradise Valley in 1979 and couldn't believe such a beautiful town had garbage cans on the street five days a week. I've continued to be amazed at the pushback from residents through the years. And I was shocked at the inflammatory language in a flyer I recently received from a resident who wouldn't even print a last name!

Please list me as 101% in favor of a single provider. It makes sense on all counts. I hope most residents will see that this is a much needed and common sense approach.

Thanks for all the good work you do on the town's behalf.
Trish Mayberry

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Saturday, January 06, 2018 8:15 AM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley

All three of emails you identify seem to be the Correct ones. It was the one from Scott requesting town take action about the up to 250,000 in road costs being used by Republic but the up to 250,000 is in staff presentation and on web site and in Jim Shano Report all already in public and Kevin's response and my response if you think these qualify. Thx Andrew. I airways think it is fine to put things in public eye so out in as many emails as you want for packet. Thx

BCC will help a great deal on this as I thought you and or Duncan told us to use BCC when we talked in the beginning to avoid these issues and the League also suggested this tool. I have heard it mentioned at town. BCC Will be helpful because you can't see all the names on phones when responding. This tool will help. Thx again

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace

On Jan 6, 2018, at 12:39 AM, Andrew Miller <amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

I may not have seen all of them, just the one form Scott to Kevin (which copied the full Council), yours to Scott (that also copied all of the Council), and then Kevin's email to you alone that cautioned about sending comments to the full Council. If there are others, it is probably best to forward them to Duncan and he can then print them for the Council packet for 1/25. Thanks.

Andrew Miller
Town Attorney
Paradise Valley
6401 E. Lincoln Drive
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253
(480) 348-3691
amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Saturday, January 06, 2018 12:33 AM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley

Also there were potentially a couple of emails that night with Scott and me so will you just incident all of them

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace

On Jan 6, 2018, at 12:18 AM, Andrew Miller <amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Thank you very much for Republic Services as your waste Paradise Valley



And while the holidays may be nearing an end we
for you and the community. But we need your help

You see, the Town of Paradise Valley recently asked for proposals
garbage collection system in town that has too many noisy, polluting
and prices that can and should be lower than they are.

We're proud that our company was selected from so many
in a much better way. The improvements include:

- A **price reduction of \$4.40 per month** for the average customer
increase
- A **70% reduction in heavy vehicle traffic** which means less noise
and fewer chances for accidents with garbage trucks through
Valley
- Lower taxpayer costs for road maintenance, a **savings of**
- **Less pollution** with natural gas trucks being the only ones in
Valley
- **Improved community appearance** with uniform containers
- **Additional services** such as Christmas tree collection, holiday
shredding events
- **Known pricing for 7 years** with only a 3.5% annual increase
- **Public safety assistance** according to former Paradise Valley
Wintersteen

Several years ago the Town of Fountain Hills adopted a trash collection plan that has been being considered in Paradise Valley after being frustrated with the service in Fountain Hills. Voters there now ***overwhelmingly support the new, better***

All you need to do to make this happen for Paradise Valley is to write and send to the Town Council at the emails below to let them know how you feel about the ***Better Environment*** plan for garbage service in Paradise Valley.

Mayor Michael Collins: 480.315.1000 - mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner: 480.442.3532 - jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Paul Dembow: 480.650.9940 -

pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Scott Moore: 480.828.8518 - smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Julie Pace: 480.985.2613 - jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Mark Stanton: 602.799.2401 - mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov

David Sherf: 310.729.2982 - dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Or you can call and leave them a message at 480.348.3610.

Thank you for all your help to
improve the Paradise Valley

community and save more
residents more money.

ParadiseAZ.com

Cc: Andrew Miller; Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner

Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley

No worries but it is something Andrew and I think even Duncan keeps telling us. Use bc even if sending to all of us in reports to avoid anyone hitting reply all and capturing everyone. I think we just need to print the emails at issue as part of public packet to ensure transparency as it is all items that should be public anyway so you might want to ask Andrew to make sure that is proper step to ensure disclosure to public and avoid any issues

There are differences for attorney client privileged communications I believe but it might be good if Andrew does a refresher on all this so we all strive to use same protocols and understand differences between asking questions or discussing items thx

Andrew and Jerry maybe you guys can address also and we figure out why constructive steps.
Thx team

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace

On Jan 4, 2018, at 8:02 AM, Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

That was a good idea.

I will say that I don't remember having the conversation about using the blind copy tool. I went back through my emails from you but didn't see it. Must have been an oral conversation. To that, my apologies for not picking up on that suggestion. As I mentioned earlier, I will experiment with it. Thanks

From: Council Member Julie Pace

Sent: Wednesday, January 03, 2018 8:11 PM

To: Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov>

Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley

Importance: High

I contacted each council member by text and send following email:

When you get to your computer delete WITHOUT reading emails one from me and one from Scott that says something like big savings better environment. Kevin sent to us and failed to bc council and when Scott and I did emails as reply all thinking it was Kevin and staff it went to all of Council. I reminded Kevin he is supposed to bc all of us but copy staff. He keeps forgetting to do that. And when we are on phones you can see the other names as they are buried

Excuse errors from gliding.

Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 3, 2018, at 5:48 PM, Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Can you recall this message?

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Wednesday, January 03, 2018 5:40 PM
To: Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Cc: Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Mark Stanton <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member David Sherf <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Andrew Miller <amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley
Importance: High

I beg to differ on costs of roads damage. I keep bringing this up and I know that damage to roads with long starts and stops on asphalt and in heat of summer because of our long distance between houses on a one acre per house town has real costs. There are various studies out there that confirm road damage costs include jim Shanos. I read about it in other cities also and all the HOAs in PV who attend PV meeting confirmed they all saw savings on road damages that went away once they all went to single hauler in each hoa We have several owners of road building companies in town who can confirm there are real costs and damages to road by having ten h to 12 big heavy trucks go by everyone's house who are not in hoas on a weekly basis. I don't know about the rest of Scotts questions. Just clarifying the road issue.

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace

On Jan 3, 2018, at 4:56 PM, Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Kevin- is Town staff representing to Republic and to others that staff has accurate, reliable and defendable studies that conclude the Town will save up to \$250,000 on road maintenance? If so, is this savings on an annual basis?

If this information is not defendable have you notified Republic Services that they're representing misleading information that is not endorsed by our staff.

Do you have a new proposal from Republic that says
“no one’s rates will increase”? For how long will no
one’s rates increase?

Is it true that the license agreement

Please see below-

Scott Moore

Council Member

Town of Paradise Valley

6401 East Lincoln Drive

Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253-4399

o 480-948-7411

m 480-828-8518

smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this
message should not forward it to other members of the public
body. Members of the public body may reply to this message, but they
should not send a copy of the reply to other members.

**Thank you very much for ch
Republic Services as your waste
Paradise Valley.**



And while the holidays may be nearing an end we still h
for you and the community. But we need your help to m

You see, the Town of Paradise Valley recently asked for proposals to
garbage collection system in town that has too many noisy, polluting t
and prices that can and should be lower than they are.

We're proud that our company was selected from several others in a much better way. The improvements include:

- A **price reduction of \$4.40 per month** for the average customer increase
- A **70% reduction in heavy vehicle traffic** which means less noise and fewer chances for accidents with garbage trucks throughout the Valley
- Lower taxpayer costs for road maintenance, a **savings of up to 10%**
- **Less pollution** with natural gas trucks being the only ones allowed in the Valley
- **Improved community appearance** with uniform containers and trucks
- **Additional services** such as Christmas tree collection, household shredding events
- **Known pricing for 7 years** with only a 3.5% annual increase
- **Public safety assistance** according to former Paradise Valley Councilmember Wintersteen

Several years ago the Town of Fountain Hills adopted a trash collection system, being considered in Paradise Valley after being frustrated with their current system in Fountain Hills. Voters there now **overwhelmingly support the new, better system**.

All you need to do to make this happen for Paradise Valley is to write Mayor Michael Collins, the Town Council at the emails below to let them know how you feel about the **"Better Environment"** plan for garbage service in Paradise Valley.

Mayor Michael Collins: 480.315.1000 - mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner: 480.442.3532 - jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Paul Dembow: 480.650.9940 -

pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Scott Moore: [480.828.8518](tel:480.828.8518) - smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Julie Pace: 480.985.2613 - jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Mark Stanton: 602.799.2401 - mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov

David Sherf: 310.729.2982 - dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Or you can call and leave them a message at [480.348.3610](tel:480.348.3610).

Thank you for all your help to
improve the Paradise Valley
community and **save more
residents more money.**



ParadiseAZ.com

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Thursday, January 04, 2018 10:14 AM
To: Kevin Burke
Cc: Andrew Miller; Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley

No worries but it is something Andrew and I think even Duncan keeps telling us. Use bc even if sending to all of us in reports to avoid anyone hitting reply all and capturing everyone. I think we just need to print the emails at issue as part of public packet to ensure transparency as it is all items that should be public anyway so you might want to ask Andrew to make sure that is proper step to ensure disclosure to public and avoid any issues

There are differences for attorney client privileged communications I believe but it might be good if Andrew does a refresher on all this so we all strive to use same protocols and understand differences between asking questions or discussing items thx

Andrew and Jerry maybe you guys can address also and we figure out why constructive steps.
Thx team

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 4, 2018, at 8:02 AM, Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

That was a good idea.

I will say that I don't remember having the conversation about using the blind copy tool. I went back through my emails from you but didn't see it. Must have been an oral conversation. To that, my apologies for not picking up on that suggestion. As I mentioned earlier, I will experiment with it. Thanks

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Wednesday, January 03, 2018 8:11 PM
To: Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley
Importance: High

I contacted each council member by text and send following email:

When you get to your computer delete WITHOUT reading emails one from me and one from Scott that says something like big savings better environment. Kevin sent to us and failed to bc council and when Scott and I did emails as reply all thinking it was Kevin and staff it went to all of Council. I reminded Kevin he is supposed to bc all of us but copy staff. He keeps forgetting to do

that. And when we are on phones you can see the other names as they are buried

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 3, 2018, at 5:48 PM, Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Can you recall this message?

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Wednesday, January 03, 2018 5:40 PM
To: Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Cc: Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Mark Stanton <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member David Sherf <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Andrew Miller <amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley
Importance: High

I beg to differ on costs of roads damage. I keep bringing this up and I know that damage to roads with long starts and stops on asphalt and in heat of summer because of our long distance between houses on a one acre per house town has real costs. There are various studies out there that confirm road damage costs include jim Shanos. I read about it in other cities also and all the HOAs in PV who attend PV meeting confirmed they all saw savings on road damages that went away once they all went to single hauler in each hoa We have several owners of road building companies in town who can confirm there are real costs and damages to road by having ten h to 12 big heavy trucks go by everyone's house who are not in hoas on a weekly basis. I don't know about the rest of Scotts questions. Just clarifying the road issue.

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 3, 2018, at 4:56 PM, Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Kevin- is Town staff representing to Republic and to others that staff has accurate, reliable and defendable studies that conclude the Town will save up to \$250,000

on road maintenance? If so, is this savings on an annual basis?

If this information is not defensible have you notified Republic Services that they're representing misleading information that is not endorsed by our staff.

Do you have a new proposal from Republic that says "no one's rates will increase"? For how long will no one's rates increase?

Is it true that the license agreement

Please see below-

Scott Moore

Council Member

Town of Paradise Valley

6401 East Lincoln Drive

Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253-4399

o 480-948-7411

m 480-828-8518

smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other members of the public body. Members of the public body may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other members.

Thank you very much for choosing
Republic Services as your waste
Paradise Valley.



And while the holidays may be nearing an end we still have
for you and the community. But we need your help to make

You see, the Town of Paradise Valley recently asked for proposals to replace the current garbage collection system in town that has too many noisy, polluting trucks and prices that can and should be lower than they are.

We're proud that our company was selected from several others and that we did it in a much better way. The improvements include:

- *A **price reduction of \$4.40 per month** for the average customer and a **3.5% annual increase***
- *A **70% reduction in heavy vehicle traffic** which means less noise, less pollution and fewer chances for accidents with garbage trucks throughout the Valley*
- *Lower taxpayer costs for road maintenance, a **savings of up to \$1.5 million per year***
- ***Less pollution** with natural gas trucks being the only ones allowed in the Valley*
- ***Improved community appearance** with uniform containers and no illegal dumping*
- ***Additional services** such as Christmas tree collection, household appliance recycling and shredding events*
- ***Known pricing for 7 years** with only a 3.5% annual increase*
- ***Public safety assistance** according to former Paradise Valley Councilmember Wintersteen*

Several years ago the Town of Fountain Hills adopted a trash collection system that is now being considered in Paradise Valley after being frustrated with their current system in Fountain Hills. Voters there now **overwhelmingly support the new, better system**.

All you need to do to make this happen for Paradise Valley is to write Mayor and the Town Council at the emails below to let them know how you feel about the **"Better Environment"** plan for garbage service in Paradise Valley.

Mayor Michael Collins: 480.315.1000 - mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov
Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner: 480.442.3532 - jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov
Paul Dembow: 480.650.9940 -

pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Scott Moore: [480.828.8518](tel:480.828.8518) - smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov
Julie Pace: 480.985.2613 - jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov
Mark Stanton: 602.799.2401 - mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov
David Sherf: 310.729.2982 - dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Or you can call and leave them a message at **480.348.3610**.

Thank you for all your help to
improve the Paradise Valley
community and **save more
residents more money.**



ParadiseAZ.com

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Thursday, January 04, 2018 10:14 AM
To: Kevin Burke
Cc: Andrew Miller; Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley

No worries but it is something Andrew and I think even Duncan keeps telling us. Use bc even if sending to all of us in reports to avoid anyone hitting reply all and capturing everyone. I think we just need to print the emails at issue as part of public packet to ensure transparency as it is all items that should be public anyway so you might want to ask Andrew to make sure that is proper step to ensure disclosure to public and avoid any issues

There are differences for attorney client privileged communications I believe but it might be good if Andrew does a refresher on all this so we all strive to use same protocols and understand differences between asking questions or discussing items thx

Andrew and Jerry maybe you guys can address also and we figure out why constructive steps. Thx team

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 4, 2018, at 8:02 AM, Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

That was a good idea.

I will say that I don't remember having the conversation about using the blind copy tool. I went back through my emails from you but didn't see it. Must have been an oral conversation. To that, my apologies for not picking up on that suggestion. As I mentioned earlier, I will experiment with it. Thanks

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Wednesday, January 03, 2018 8:11 PM
To: Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley
Importance: High

I contacted each council member by text and send following email:

When you get to your computer delete WITHOUT reading emails one from me and one from Scott that says something like big savings better environment. Kevin sent to us and failed to bc council and when Scott and I did emails as reply all thinking it was Kevin and staff it went to all of Council. I reminded Kevin he is supposed to bc all of us but copy staff. He keeps forgetting to do

that. And when we are on phones you can see the other names as they are buried

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 3, 2018, at 5:48 PM, Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Can you recall this message?

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Wednesday, January 03, 2018 5:40 PM
To: Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Cc: Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Mark Stanton <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member David Sherf <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Andrew Miller <amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley
Importance: High

I beg to differ on costs of roads damage. I keep bringing this up and I know that damage to roads with long starts and stops on asphalt and in heat of summer because of our long distance between houses on a one acre per house town has real costs. There are various studies out there that confirm road damage costs include jim Shanos. I read about it in other cities also and all the HOAs in PV who attend PV meeting confirmed they all saw savings on road damages that went away once they all went to single hauler in each hoa We have several owners of road building companies in town who can confirm there are real costs and damages to road by having ten h to 12 big heavy trucks go by everyone's house who are not in hoas on a weekly basis. I don't know about the rest of Scotts questions. Just clarifying the road issue.

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 3, 2018, at 4:56 PM, Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Kevin- is Town staff representing to Republic and to others that staff has accurate, reliable and defensible studies that conclude the Town will save up to \$250,000 on road maintenance? If so, is this savings on an annual basis?

If this information is not defensible have you notified Republic Services that they're representing misleading information that is not endorsed by our staff.

Do you have a new proposal from Republic that says “no one’s rates will increase”? For how long will no one’s rates increase?

Is it true that the license agreement

Please see below-

Scott Moore

Council Member

Town of Paradise Valley

6401 East Lincoln Drive

Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253-4399

o 480-948-7411

m 480-828-8518

smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other members of the public body. Members of the public body may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other members.

**Thank you very much for choosing
Republic Services as your waste hauler for
Paradise Valley.**



And while the holidays may be nearing an end we still have a lot to do for you and the community. But we need your help to make it happen.

You see, the Town of Paradise Valley recently asked for proposals to reduce the cost of the garbage collection system in town that has too many noisy, polluting trucks, and prices that can and should be lower than they are.

We're proud that our company was selected from several to serve the town in a much better way. The improvements include:

- A **price reduction of \$4.40 per month** for the average customer and no increase
- A 70% **reduction in heavy vehicle traffic** which means less noise ear and fewer chances for accidents with garbage trucks throughout the day
- Lower taxpayer costs for road maintenance, a **savings of up to \$250,000** per year
- **Less pollution** with natural gas trucks being the only ones allowed to service the Valley
- **Improved community appearance** with uniform containers and fewer illegal dumps
- **Additional services** such as Christmas tree collection, household hazardous waste shredding events
- **Known pricing for 7 years** with only a 3.5% annual increase
- **Public safety assistance** according to former Paradise Valley Chief of Police Wintersteen

Several years ago the Town of Fountain Hills adopted a trash collection system and it has been working well. This system is now being considered in Paradise Valley after being frustrated with their chaotic approach in Fountain Hills. Voters there now **overwhelmingly support the new, better system.**

All you need to do to make this happen for Paradise Valley is to write Mayor Michael Collins and the Town Council at the emails below to let them know how you feel about the **"Better Environment"** plan for garbage service in Paradise Valley.

Mayor Michael Collins: 480.315.1000 - mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner: 480.442.3532 - jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Paul Dembow: 480.650.9940 -

pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Scott Moore: [480.828.8518](tel:480.828.8518) - smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Julie Pace: 480.985.2613 - jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Mark Stanton: 602.799.2401 - mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov

David Sherf: 310.729.2982 - dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Or you can call and leave them a message at [480.348.3610](tel:480.348.3610).

Thank you for all your help to
improve the Paradise Valley
community and **save more
residents more money.**



ParadiseAZ.com

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Wednesday, January 03, 2018 5:40 PM
To: Council Member Scott Moore
Cc: Kevin Burke; Mayor Michael Collins; Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner; Council Member Paul Dembow; Council Member Mark Stanton; Council Member David Sherf; Andrew Miller
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley

I beg to differ on costs of roads damage. I keep bringing this up and I know that damage to roads with long starts and stops on asphalt and in heat of summer because of our long distance between houses on a one acre per house town has real costs. There are various studies out there that confirm road damage costs include jim Shanos. I read about it in other cities also and all the HOAs in PV who attend PV meeting confirmed they all saw savings on road damages that went away once they all went to single hauler in each hoa We have several owners of road building companies in town who can confirm there are real costs and damages to road by having ten h to 12 big heavy trucks go by everyone's house who are not in hoas on a weekly basis. I don't know about the rest of Scotts questions. Just clarifying the road issue.

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 3, 2018, at 4:56 PM, Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Kevin- is Town staff representing to Republic and to others that staff has accurate, reliable and defendable studies that conclude the Town will save up to \$250,000 on road maintenance? If so, is this savings on an annual basis?

If this information is not defendable have you notified Republic Services that they're representing misleading information that is not endorsed by our staff.

Do you have a new proposal from Republic that says "no one's rates will increase"? For how long will no one's rates increase?

Is it true that the license agreement

Please see below-

Scott Moore
Council Member
Town of Paradise Valley
6401 East Lincoln Drive
Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253-4399
o 480-948-7411
m 480-828-8518
smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other members of the public body. Members of the public body may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other members.

Thank you very much for choosing Republic Services as your waste hauler in Paradise Valley.



And while the holidays may be nearing an end we still have a few gifts left for you and the community. But we need your help to make it all happen.

You see, the Town of Paradise Valley recently asked for proposals to reduce the chaotic garbage collection system in town that has too many noisy, polluting trucks, damaged roads and prices that can and should be lower than they are.

We're proud that our company was selected from several to serve the town in a much better way. The improvements include:

- A **price reduction of \$4.40 per month** for the average customer and no one's rates increase
- A **70% reduction in heavy vehicle traffic** which means less noise early in the morning and fewer chances for accidents with garbage trucks throughout the day
- Lower taxpayer costs for road maintenance, a **savings of up to \$250,000** per town session
- **Less pollution** with natural gas trucks being the only ones allowed to serve Paradise Valley
- **Improved community appearance** with uniform containers and fewer pick-up days
- **Additional services** such as Christmas tree collection, household hazardous waste shredding events
- **Known pricing for 7 years** with only a 3.5% annual increase

- **Public safety assistance** according to former Paradise Valley Chief of Police John Wintersteen

Several years ago the Town of Fountain Hills adopted a trash collection system similar to what was being considered in Paradise Valley after being frustrated with their chaotic approach in Fountain Hills. Voters there now **overwhelmingly support the new, better system.**

All you need to do to make this happen for Paradise Valley is to write Mayor Michael Collins or the Town Council at the emails below to let them know how you feel about the **“Lower Cost, Better Environment”** plan for garbage service in Paradise Valley.

Mayor Michael Collins: 480.315.1000 - mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner: 480.442.3532 - jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Paul Dembow: 480.650.9940 -

pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Scott Moore: [480.828.8518](tel:480.828.8518) - smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Julie Pace: 480.985.2613 - jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Mark Stanton: 602.799.2401 - mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov

David Sherf: 310.729.2982 - dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Or you can call and leave them a message at [480.348.3610](tel:480.348.3610).

Thank you for all your help to
improve the Paradise Valley
community and **save more
residents more money.**



ParadiseAZ.com

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Saturday, January 06, 2018 8:20 AM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley

Did Kevin send this caution to Scott separately also when he sent email first to all council. If not why not. Can you figure out and let me know as I am curious if Kevin did not do so. Also it would be good if you did a refresher on opl and what to do if we all realize an issue. Kevin directed me to recall and delete my email on roads but is that the correct approach or can you give us the correct steps. Others believe key is disclosure right away not delete or recall. Your tips and guidance will be helpful at the meeting. Thx and welcome back from Santa Fe

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 6, 2018, at 12:39 AM, Andrew Miller <amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

I may not have seen all of them, just the one from Scott to Kevin (which copied the full Council), yours to Scott (that also copied all of the Council), and then Kevin's email to you alone that cautioned about sending comments to the full Council. If there are others, it is probably best to forward them to Duncan and he can then print them for the Council packet for 1/25. Thanks.

Andrew Miller
Town Attorney
Paradise Valley
6401 E. Lincoln Drive
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253
(480) 348-3691
amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Saturday, January 06, 2018 12:33 AM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Re: Big Garbage Savings, Big Benefits Coming to You in Paradise Valley

Also there were potentially a couple of emails that night with Scott and me so will you just incident all of them

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 6, 2018, at 12:18 AM, Andrew Miller <amiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Julie and Kevin,

Kevin- is Town staff representing to Republic and to others that staff has accurate, reliable and defensible studies that conclude the Town will save up to \$250,000 on road maintenance? If so, is this savings on an annual basis?

If this information is not defensible have you notified Republic Services that they're representing misleading information that is not endorsed by our staff.

Do you have a new proposal from Republic that says "no one's rates will increase"? For how long will no one's rates increase?

Is it true that the license agreement

Please see below-

Scott Moore

Council Member

Town of Paradise Valley

6401 East Lincoln Drive

Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253-4399

o 480-948-7411

m 480-828-8518

smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other members of the public body. Members of the public body may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other members.

**Thank you very much for
Republic Services as your w
Paradise Valley**



And while the holidays may be nearing an end we need your help for you and the community. But we need your help.

You see, the Town of Paradise Valley recently asked for proposals for a new garbage collection system in town that has too many noisy, polluting trucks and prices that can and should be lower than they are.

We're proud that our company was selected from several others to win the bid in a much better way. The improvements include:

- A **price reduction of \$4.40 per month** for the average customer, a **50% increase** in savings
- A **70% reduction in heavy vehicle traffic** which means less noise and fewer chances for accidents with garbage trucks through the community
- Lower taxpayer costs for road maintenance, a **savings of \$1.5 million** per year
- **Less pollution** with natural gas trucks being the only ones in Paradise Valley
- **Improved community appearance** with uniform containers and no more illegal dumping
- **Additional services** such as Christmas tree collection, holiday decorations shredding events
- **Known pricing for 7 years** with only a 3.5% annual increase
- **Public safety assistance** according to former Paradise Valley Mayor Wintersteen

Several years ago the Town of Fountain Hills adopted a trash collection system that is now being considered in Paradise Valley after being frustrated with the current system in Fountain Hills. Voters there now **overwhelmingly support the new, better system**.

All you need to do to make this happen for Paradise Valley is to vote for the new system.

the Town Council at the emails below to let them know how you feel about the ***Better Environment*** plan for garbage service in Paradise Valley.

Mayor Michael Collins: 480.315.1000 - mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner: 480.442.3532 - jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Paul Dembow: 480.650.9940 -

pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Scott Moore: 480.828.8518 - smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Julie Pace: 480.985.2613 - jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Mark Stanton: 602.799.2401 - mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov

David Sherf: 310.729.2982 - dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov

Or you can call and leave them a message at **480.348.3610**.

Thank you for all your help to
improve the Paradise Valley
community and **save more
residents more money.**

ParadiseAZ.com

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Monday, January 08, 2018 4:55 PM
To: Kevin Burke
Cc: Duncan Miller; Andrew Miller; Deborah Robberson; Paul Mood
Subject: Re: Letter to Town Council and Staff - Right Away Disposal RAD
Attachments: image001.jpg

Thx. I am not a believer in lowest bid proposals. A variety of facts matter and your expertise in various areas is important when developing those factors and scoring. Thx for insights

Julie Pace
Council Member
Town of Paradise Valley
6401 E. Lincoln Drive
Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253
jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov
Work: 480.348.3690
Cell: 480.985.2613

Paradise Valley is residences and resorts with no commercial business and no property tax.

Disclaimer: All messages contained in this system are the property of the Town of Paradise Valley and are considered a public record subject to disclosure under the Arizona Public Records Law (A.R.S. 39-121). Town employees, public officials, and those who generate e-mail to and from this e-mail domain should have no expectation of privacy related to the use of this technology. To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other Town Council members. Members of the Town Council may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other Town Council members.

On Jan 8, 2018, at 4:51 PM, Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Mayor and Council (listed in the BC line):

I see you all received this email. This does not appear to be a protest but rather "to help further educate." So I will respond just to Council and staff at this time. A protest has some more formal procedures that they and the Town would need to follow.

As you know, RAD ranked second with its proposal. Under our procurement process, if the Town reaches an impasse with its top ranked proposer (Republic), it can declare that impasse and move to the next highest ranked proposer and begin negotiations with them. Or the Town can reject all proposals and either start over or not solicit again. So all options.

To their points, both in the email and in the attached letter. First, RAD is absolutely right, Republic is not the lowest priced proposal. RAD knows this because their proposal had a lower price. In fact (and RAD does not know this until we release all of the proposals after a contract has been awarded or the proposals have been rejected), they were the lowest of the 4 proposals received. As such, if you looked at just the scoring for pricing, RAD was rated number one by all 5 evaluators. But, as you also know, pricing is only 30% of the scoring. RAD did not do as well in other categories. But in part because they

had the best pricing, and the fact that they had decent scores in other categories, they ranked number 2 in the overall scoring.

To the second point, I am not sure how they calculated the savings and even if they are right, it doesn't change the fact that this is not a low bid procurement.

To the last point, I understand what they are saying, but it doesn't change the outcome. By that I mean. Republic was not scored based upon their pricing for a 7 year contract. All scoring was based upon the 3 and 5 year proposals. The seven year is a subsequent negotiation. Second, as previously noted, RAD already had the lowest proposal so they already were the top scorer. So it doesn't change their rank if they were able to offer an even lower priced 7 year contract.

What this information tells you is that there could be a lower price out there, but that lower price might come at the expense of lesser customer service, less financial strength of the firm, less experience, etc. Again, ranking of these proposals was based upon multiple factors.

So this is what I will answer if this comes up in public meeting.

Thanks, Kevin

From: Jeremy Takas [<mailto:Jeremy@radservices.com>]

Sent: Monday, January 08, 2018 10:05 AM

Cc: Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; 'cpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov' <cpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member David Sherf <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Mark Stanton <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Bart Powell <Bart@radservices.com>; Bret McClue <Bret.M@rightawaydisposal.com>; Larry Williams <Larry@radservices.com>

Subject: Letter to Town Council and Staff - Right Away Disposal RAD

Dear Mayor and Town Council,

I'm providing this letter to inform Town Council and Staff of my concerns with the current RFP process regarding the solid waste and recycle collection services in Paradise Valley. I have been in the waste industry for over 17 years, it's my belief that Town Staff and Council are moving in the right direction in a one-company service provider for the residents of Paradise Valley. The pros greatly outweigh the cons with this type of transition.

However, the core reason for contacting Town Council is the Town Staff's intent to reach an agreement with Republic Services.

Presented by Kevin Burke, Town Manager, at the Study Session on December 7th, the following three subjects, outlined below, are vital concerns, which may be questioned from the community or other individuals:

- The price presented by Republic Services **is not the lowest** presented
- If awarded to Republic Services, the residents of Paradise Valley will **pay \$1,853,823.19 or more** over the next 10 years

- Outlined on Form 7, within the Paradise Valley Solid and Recycling Waste RFP, all bidders were directed to propose a “Basic and Standard Service” of three (3) years and five (5) year terms. The seven (7) year, with three (3) one (1) year renewals, offered only to Republic Services, created a substantial disadvantage to all other bidders.

To help further educate and understand these concerns we have attached the formal outline (PDF) for your review. We trust this information will be instrumental in creating a fair and nonbiased outcome that is truly beneficial to the residents of the Town of Paradise Valley.

Jeremy Takas
President



Right Away Disposal

Phone | 480-980-7353

RADservices.com

<Town of Paradise Valley RFP Waste and Recycling - 1.8.2018.pdf>

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Saturday, January 06, 2018 8:08 AM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Can you call my cell at

1 when you have a moment

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Saturday, January 06, 2018 8:40 AM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Fwd: Fountan Hills Trash Service

This exchange of emails should be included I think also in publishing it.

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

Begin forwarded message:

From: Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Date: January 3, 2018 at 5:45:34 PM MST
To: Council Member Julie Pace <jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Cc: Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Duncan Miller <dmiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Paul Mood <pmood@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member David Sherf <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member Mark Stanton <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: RE: Fountan Hills Trash Service

Julie,

If I could ask that you not respond to everyone because then it looks like a digital conversation among the full Council. If you have additional questions, please send them just to me and then I can convey.

I will treat your question that way for now.

You are correct. The distance between houses is another factor Republic cited when comparing to other cities. When comparing PV rates between the rates we knew HOA's were getting (some with one acres others without) and others, the response was hillside versus flatland. You are also correct that we have asked for and had proposed other elements that are not in the Fountain Hills contract. Again, price was 30% of the scoring. Thanks

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Wednesday, January 03, 2018 4:57 PM
To: Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Cc: Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Duncan Miller <dmiller@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Paul Mood <pmood@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member David Sherf <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Council Member Mark Stanton <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>; Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Fountan Hills Trash Service
Importance: High

Kevin can you go to Republic and get explanation from them as to why our rates would be different. My understanding is that it was not Hillside accounts but our one one house per acre distance in town and

that town in rfp requiref compressed natural gas that is not required in fountain hills. I don't know but would like complete and accurate info so can you ask and have Republic explain so we have it straight from them for all of us to learn instead of all of us speculating. Thx

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

On Jan 3, 2018, at 2:55 PM, Kevin Burke <kburke@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

All,
Scott appropriately asked that I share the information below from Fountain hills and my response. Thanks

Scott,
I did not have this specific information. I had a general idea of their rates from an earlier conversation with Paul Mood when he first transitioned because he gave us the ballpark he remembered from when Fountain Hills made the switch. I went into the rfp with similar expectations.

When we did not get it, I looked and asked a number of questions. First, I looked at all the other RFP's. These are sealed bid amongst very fervent competitors. The lowest 3 year rate amongst the four was \$17.40per month. So that gave me a pretty good idea of what our market was. Now I went back and looked at the 5 year rates, the lowest 5 year rate was \$16.50. But remember that price is only 30% of the scoring. Even so, I tried to get that Matched. The response was no.

I then talked to queen creek, buckeye and lake havasu about their rates which were all lower. In all cases they have many more accounts than we do. Fountain hills has about double the number of accounts. Lake havasu was more but they also were at 15-20 year Agreement. Buckeye obviously has far more accounts, but they and queen creek were doing their own billing. So that saved an estimated \$1per month per account.

Lastly, I argued that there is already lower rates in town as evidenced by the hoa's with fewer accounts. How could that be possible? The answer I got was these are not hillside accounts. A small flatland subdivision with close driveways is much easier. These rates account for the wide variety of accounts across PV.

So again, I argued for lower rates right to the last day under the guise that it's an easier story line if they can say they have a \$16 rate. They insisted they could not go any lower. I told them that I thought it would be a hard sell for Council but they said they were willing to take their chances.

Remember, if the issue is price. You can turn down this proposal and I can go to the next vendor on the list. And I told Republic this as well. So that continues to be a backup.

Hope that helps.

Sent from my iPad

On Jan 3, 2018, at 1:02 PM, Council Member Scott Moore
<smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Kevin- Did you research and have this information prior to or during negotiations with the haulers?

Paul, thank you again for confirming what I researched as well.

Kevin- Please share with the rest of the Council. Thanks.

Scott Moore

Council Member

Town of Paradise Valley

6401 East Lincoln Drive

Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253-4399

o 480-948-7411

m 480-828-8518

smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other members of the public body. Members of the public body may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other members.

From: Paul Mood

Sent: Wednesday, January 03, 2018 10:51 AM

To: Council Member Scott Moore

Cc: Kevin Burke; Paul Mood; Duncan Miller

Subject: Re: Fountain Hills Trash Service

Scott,

I was told that there are currently 9,877 solid waste accounts in Fountain Hills.

1 trash & 1 recycle weekly service is \$11.58 per month.

2 trash & 1 recycle weekly service is \$16.64 per month.

I believe a 2nd trash can is an additional \$5 per month on top of the rates shown.

Fountain Hills does not offer a household hazardous waste collection event or paper shredding events in their rates.

Paul

Sent from my iPhone

On Jan 2, 2018, at 12:19 PM, Council Member Scott Moore
<smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov> wrote:

Happy New Year Paul!

Would you please tell me how much Fountain Hills residents pay for their trash service and how many pickups it includes. Thanks.

Scott Moore

Council Member

Town of Paradise Valley

6401 East Lincoln Drive

Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253-4399

o 480-948-7411

m 480-828-8518

smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov

To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other members of the public body. Members of the public body may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other members.

Duncan Miller

From: Council Member Julie Pace
Sent: Saturday, January 06, 2018 9:07 AM
To: Andrew Miller
Subject: Fwd: Trash and Recycling
Attachments: Paul.Dembow.Head.Shot.jpg

Not sure but maybe this one also to be published just to be conservative

Excuse errors from gliding.
Julie Pace 602.322.4046

Begin forwarded message:

From: Council Member Paul Dembow <pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Date: January 4, 2018 at 5:29:21 PM MST
To: Bob Barnitt <bob@barnitt.com>
Cc: Mayor Michael Collins <mcollins@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner <jbienwillner@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member Scott Moore <smoore@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member Julie Pace <jpace@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member Mark Stanton <mstanton@paradisevalleyaz.gov>, Council Member David Sherf <dsherf@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Subject: Re: Trash and Recycling

Mr. Barnitt,

Thank you for responding. Unfortunately we are not allowed to communicate as a council in this venue because it would violate the Open Meeting Laws.

I hope you come to the meeting on Trash to voice your position.

Regards,
Paul Dembow
Councilman

(480) 348-3690
pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov



Paradise Valley is residences and resorts with no commercial business and no property tax

6401 E. Lincoln Dr.
Paradise Valley AZ 85253

Disclaimer: All messages contained in this system are the property of the Town of Paradise Valley and are considered a public record subject to disclosure under the Arizona Public Records Law (A.R.S. 39-121). Town employees, public officials, and those who generate e-mail to and from this e-mail domain should have no expectation of privacy related to the use of this technology. To ensure compliance with the Open Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other Town Council members. Members of the Town Council may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other Town Council members.

On Jan 4, 2018, at 11:53 AM, Bob Barnitt

> wrote:

Dear Councilman Dembo,
Thank you for your quick response.

I find it odd that an HOA is getting significantly lower rates than the entire town, unless they are using dumpsters, or a lower level of service. The economy of scale should have brought that into some alignment, unless the competing companies shared information (which is a crime), or they make more profit with the system in place today even without 100% of the households. What company does your HOA use? Did they bid on the entire town?

To date I was unaware of the pricing that the town negotiated... it doesn't sound like we did very good. For your reference, I have Republic Waste today with twice per week trash and once per week recycle. My single annual payment was \$334.72 or \$27.89/month for the last two years, and my annual renewal invoice just came in at \$350.41 or 29.20/month (4.7% increase). I was hoping that not having multiple trucks running into town would have a more significant impact on pricing than you mentioned below. I hope they plan to offer a discount for people willing to make a single annual payment like we do with the Fire service. I will contact Republic from my side to voice concern that the economic impact is minimal for me personally, and that I expected more.

Has the town thought of allowing HOAs with a minimum number of homes to opt out as long as they have a single provider that meets whatever requirements the town has put on the main supplier regarding frequency and equipment?

It doesn't sound like this debate is over, but I hope in the end we get to a situation where a single provider is possible at least by area of town.

Regards,
Bob Barnitt

-----Original Message-----

From: Council Member Paul Dembow [<mailto:pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>]

Sent: Thursday, January 4, 2018 8:32 AM

To: Bob Barnitt

Subject: Re: Trash and Recycling

Dear Mr. Barnitt,

Thanks for reaching out to me.

The RFP gave us a mixed bag of tricks. Some folks would pay less and some folks would pay more, and at first having twice a week trash pick up is also not available. I'm on my HOA board. Currently we are paying \$16.00/month, to get the same service after our contract runs out, would go to \$27.00 per month. I'd have to explain to my HOA members, and several other HOA members throughout the Town, why their costs were going up by 60% for the same services. I can't think of how I'd say that with a straight face.

Our Town does not have a property tax so it would not be saving the residents any money. The 'savings' from less wear and tear on the roads is, at best, a guesstimate. The having only one truck on the street would be a nice benefit, I totally agree!

The amount of residents who believe they can select a better vendor than the government is outweighing those who think one is a better idea. As an elected official, I'm not voting against what my residents want by such a large margin and something that will help some and hurt others.

Unless things change with the RFP or numbers, we will disagree on this matter. If things change... I can change my opinion too.

If you're passionate about this project, please get your fellow residents involved. Voices count for your elected officials.

Please accept this email with my respect for you and your opinion. I wanted you to know where I stand and why.

Regards,
Paul Dembow
Councilman
(480) 348-3690
pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov<<mailto:pdembow@paradisevalleyaz.gov>>

[cid:22E27191-1774-4D02-9DBE-B0FC17334E5D@expressvpn]

Paradise Valley is residences and resorts with no commercial business and no property tax

6401 E. Lincoln Dr.
Paradise Valley AZ 85253

Disclaimer: All messages contained in this system are the property of the Town of Paradise Valley and are considered a public record subject to disclosure under the Arizona Public Records Law (A.R.S. 39-121). Town employees, public officials, and those who generate e-mail to and from this e-mail domain should have no expectation of privacy related to the use of this technology. To ensure compliance with the Open

Meeting Law, recipients of this message should not forward it to other Town Council members. Members of the Town Council may reply to this message, but they should not send a copy of the reply to other Town Council members.

On Jan 3, 2018, at 10:47 PM, Bob Barnitt

wrote:

Dear Mayor, Vice Mayor, and Members of the Town Council,

I support the plan that limits the number of trash and recycling companies driving past my home to one. As long as the selection process is both competitive and transparent I will support this. I do not plan on coming to the town council meetings, but I hope this email will help push back attempts to roll back this common sense plan.

Sincerely,
Bob Barnitt

Paradise Valley, AZ 85253