



# Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr  
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

## Minutes - Draft

### Planning Commission

---

Tuesday, October 3, 2017

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

---

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

#### STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller  
Community Development Director Eva Cutro  
Senior Planner Paul Michaud  
Planner George Burton

#### 2. ROLL CALL

**Present** 4 - Chairperson Daran Wastchak  
Commissioner James Anton  
Commissioner Dolf Strom  
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright  
**Absent** 3 - Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell  
Commissioner Charles Covington  
Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle

#### 3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

#### 4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

None

#### 5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A.**     17-315     Consideration of Ordinance No. 2016-13  
A Text Amendment to amend Article II, Definitions, and Article IX, Cluster  
Plan District, of the Town's Zoning Ordinance  
(MI-16-03, The Villas at Cheney Estates - Town Triangle)  
  
Paul Michaud presented the request in accordance with the application  
packet.  
  
Mr. Michaud discussed the updated plans and then discussed the scope of  
each of the six applications.

Commissioner Strom had questions regarding sight lines at the entry into the property. It was noted that the entry area will accommodate two lanes of traffic.

Commissioner Strom asked about the volume of water retention and how the flow will work. Fred Fleet, engineer for the applicant, stated the retention will retain the 100 year two hour event, being 2.2. inches of rain that falls onto the parcel. Mr. Fleet explained the drainage patterns.

Commissioner Wainwright asked about how the domestic water line will be treated since it will be below the wash. Mr. Fleet explained that it will be buried at least three feet and made of cast iron.

Chairman Wastchak asked the applicant about the four landscape light fixtures in and near the Scottsdale Road right-of-way. Rod Cullum, developer of the site, explained he wants to have appropriate lighting for the entry. There are two trees that will be up-lighted. He does not believe the City of Scottsdale will have a concern about this lighting.

Chairman Wastchak asked staff if they had concern the the proposed 1,080 lumen exceeded the 750 lumen guideline. Mr. Michaud replied staff has no concerns since the Town has approved similar light fixtures for signs and the illumination levels along Scottsdale Road are higher than most Town streets.

Public comment was opened at 6:55 pm.

Mary Hamway, resident, is in favor of the Villas at Cheney Estates. She thanked everyone involved for the various compromises. She stated that this parcel was proposed for many other uses and the zoning equals that of neighboring Cheney Estates.

Robert Robinson, resident of Cheney Estates, supports this project and agrees with Mary Hamway.

Robert Nagle, resident, expressed a concern about the 24-foot height limit. He stated this height is taller than a fast food restaurant and will block view from Golf Drive. He asked the Planning Commission to consider a lower height. Also, he inquired about the lighting and whether this is visible from only Scottsdale Road or will lighting be installed at the back to the golf course. Chairman Wastchak stated the lighting reviewed is along Scottsdale Road.

The public comment was closed at 7:00 p.m.

Rod Cullum responded to the height. He explained the homes will be one-story, with an average height of 20 feet to 22 feet.

The public comment was reopened.

Steven Silvestri, resident, explained that his property is now in the floodplain based on the required FEMA drainage documentation as part of the processing of the proposed development. He understands that the grading on the golf course has resulted in this change to his property. He has no objections to the proposed development, but believes that the approval of this development shall be delayed until his and his neighbor's house are taken out of the floodplain. It was noted that Mr. Silvestri's home has never been flooded.

Chairman Wastchak disclosed that he knows Rod Cullum and has a business relationship with Mr. Cullum on other projects.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Strom, to forward to the Town Council approval of Ordinance No. 2016-13 to amend Article II, Definitions, and Article IX, Cluster Plan District, of the Town's Zoning Ordinance, to allow for modifications to the cluster plan provisions for the proposed development located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 4 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 3 - Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Mahrle

- B.     17-316**     Consideration of Ordinance No. 2016-14  
A rezoning request from R-43 and SUP to R-43 Cluster Plan located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (MI-16-04, The Villas at Cheney Estates - Town Triangle)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Strom, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to forward to the Town Council approval of Ordinance No. 2016-14 changing the zoning district from R-43 and SUP to R-43 Cluster Plan with the conditions and effective date as described in said ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 4 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 3 - Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Mahrle

## **6. ACTION ITEMS**

- A.     17-317**     Consideration of a Preliminary Plat on a 9.6-acre property located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road

---

(PP-16-03, The Villas at Cheney Estates - Town Triangle)

A motion was made by Commissioner Anton, seconded by Commissioner Strom, to forward to the Town Council approval of the preliminary plat for the proposed development located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road, subject to the following conditions:

1. The final plat for "The Villas at Cheney Estates" shall be in substantial compliance with the Preliminary Plat, Sheets 1□3, prepared by CVL Consultants, dated August 31, 2017.
2. Prior to the final plat of this Property being approved by the Town Council, the appropriate documentation shall be provided to the Town regarding "The Villas at Cheney Estates" subdivision having a 100-year assured water supply.
3. A final subdivision wall and landscape plan shall be approved with the final plat for "The Villas at Cheney Estates." This plan shall exclude the areas approved under the Special Use Permit of Ordinance 2016-15 (SUP-16-03) related to the private roadway gates, walls, and other improvements/landscaping depicted on such plan.
4. Prior to recordation of the final plat for said subdivision, the applicant shall provide to the Town Attorney a copy of the CC&R's or other documents for review.
5. Within 60 days of approval of the final plat, the applicant shall submit to the Town mylars of the approved plans and an electronic version of these plans in a pdf format for the Town's permanent record.

The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 4 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 3 - Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Mahrle

**B. 17-318**

Consideration of a Conditional Use Permit for a private roadway on a 9.6-acre property located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (CUP-16-02, The Villas at Cheney Estates - Town Triangle)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Anton, based upon compliance to the four findings of Section 1103.4 of the Town Zoning Ordinance, to approve CUP-16-02, a Conditional Use Permit for a private roadway at "The Villas at Cheney Estates", subject to the following conditions:

1. This private roadway Conditional Use Permit (CUP) shall apply to the property as described in the legal description prepared by Eric G. Coffey dated September 11, 2017. (the "Property").
2. This CUP shall be in substantial compliance with the roadway cross-sections as shown on the Preliminary Plat prepared by CVL Consultants, dated August 31, 2017, which are in general conformance with the Typical Local Cross-Section, Option B, of the Town's General Plan.

3. The owner of the Property shall provide the Town a grant of access easement over the private roadway and a private roadway maintenance agreement pursuant to Ordinance Number 2016-15, allowing for private roadway gates of SUP-16-03.

The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 4 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 3 - Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Mahrle

## **PUBLIC HEARINGS (CONTINUED)**

A. 17-319 Consideration of Ordinance No. 2016-15  
A Special Use Permit (SUP) for private roadway gates for a proposed subdivision located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road  
(SUP-16-03, The Villas at Cheney Estates - Town Triangle)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to forward to the Town Council approval of Ordinance No. 2016-15 of the Special Use Permit (SUP) for private roadway gates at the proposed subdivision of "The Villas at Cheney Estates," with the conditions and effective date as described in said ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 4 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 3 - Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Mahrle

## **ACTION ITEMS (CONTINUED)**

A. 17-320 Consideration of two proposed subdivision wall signs  
(MI-17-03, The Villas at Cheney Estates - Town Triangle)  
A motion was made by Commissioner Strom, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, based upon compliance to the Town's sign criteria, to forward to the Town Council approval of MI-17-03, for two subdivision wall signs at "The Villas at Cheney Estates," subject to the following conditions:

1. Subdivision signage and sign lighting for the Property of "The Villas at Cheney Estates" shall be in substantial compliance with the Wall and Gate Plan prepared by Cullum Homes.

2. Sign lighting shall not exceed two fixtures per sign, each fixture shall not exceed a lumen count of 1,080 lumens, and the illumination shall not exceed 0.75 foot-candles at the property line.

The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 4 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 3 - Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Mahrle



# Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr  
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

## Minutes - Final

### Planning Commission

---

Tuesday, September 19, 2017

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

---

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Acting Chairman Wainwright called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

#### STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller  
Community Development Director Eva Cutro  
Senior Planner Paul Michaud  
Planner George Burton  
Town Engineer Paul Mood

#### 2. ROLL CALL

**Present** 6 - Commissioner James Anton  
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell  
Commissioner Charles Covington  
Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle  
Commissioner Dolf Strom  
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright  
**Absent** 1 - Chairperson Daran Wastchak

#### 3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

#### 4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. 17-295 Citizen Review Work Session and Continued Discussion of several applications to develop a 9.6-acre property for 8 single-family lots located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (The Villas at Cheney Estates - Town Triangle)
- Paul Michaud reviewed the updated aspects of the application requests. He clarified that there is a second R-18 CP SUP development in the Town, Via Vista with minimum 12,001 square-foot lots.

There was discussion regarding the subdivision wall height at the entry of Scottsdale Road near the proposed deceleration lane. Rod Cullum, developer of the project, replied that the inside of the wall will be 6-feet in

height. He added that in the easement portion of the wall location along Scottsdale Road at the entrance that some type of planter might be necessary due to the grade differences and proximity to the sidewalk. Mr. Cullum also stated that the entire wall along Scottsdale Road will be raised so it is 6 feet in height on the interior side. There were no specific concerns noted by the Planning Commission.

Mr. Michaud provided an overview of the six application requests. He stated that there are two requested modifications as part of the preliminary plat. One modification is not requiring a full cul-de-sac near Lots 1 and 2 since the homes comply with the fire code provision of being within 150 feet of a fire access road. The other modification related to not requiring public utility easements on all sides of each lot.

Mr. Michaud discussed the conditions of approval regarding the text amendment, rezoning, preliminary plat, conditional use permit, special use permit for the private roadway gates, and subdivision signs.

Mr. Michaud then reviewed the timing of this application.

Chairman Wainwright asked the applicant to speak regarding the application.

Rod Cullum explained that the delay in more detailed plans of the entry gate area related to the delay on the specifics for the deceleration lane. He stated the slide gates will be replaced with double wing gates. This is a result of the easement to move the subdivision wall/sidewalk further into the subject site. He presented a plan showing more detail on the landscaping, this included removal of the linear water feature at the entry with a signature Ironwood tree and smaller water feature. It was noted that these plans still need to be submitted to the Town and reviewed by staff. Mr. Michaud noted that depending on the completeness and date of the submittal, the Planning Commission may want to continue the Special Use Permit application.

The Planning Commission asked about the location of the call box. Mr. Cullum said it will be located further back at a 79-foot setback instead of the 75-foot setback as originally proposed.

Commissioner Strom asked the applicant to specify the type of light fixture that will be used for the signs since the cut sheet shows several options.

Discussing the possible planter at the entry near the deceleration lane, Mr. Cullum asked if staff could be given the authority to approve a planter instead of a berm. Responding to the size of the planter, Mr. Cullum stated it would be approximately 2-foot wide and 2-foot tall with landscaping such

as lantana that does not grow tall. The Planning Commission was agreeable.

There was discussion on the western cul-de-sac that is 55-feet in diameter. The Planning Commission asked that a landscaped median be added, provided it is not in conflict with the maneuverability of a fire engine. The addition of a signature tree was suggested.

Commissioner Strom asked for clarification of a floodway and floodplain. He asked if the lots will be in either. Mr. Cullum replied after the CLOMR is completed, the homes will not be in either one.

Discussing the illumination of the subdivision signs, Mr. Michaud noted that the applicant's plan shows the signs will not be illuminated during certain hours. He added that this condition is typical on commercial signs. The Planning Commission was agreeable to allow the signs to be illuminated at any time.

Chairman Wainwright opened the meeting for public comment. There were no comments.

Commissioner Campbell stated he would like to see the detailed gate area drawings for the next meeting and that he leans toward continuance based upon the level of documentation at this point.

#### **No Reportable Action**

#### **B. 17-303**

##### **Discussion of Hillside Code Updates (Article XXII of the Town Zoning Ordinance)**

George Burton gave an update on the Hillside Code text amendment. He stated this was last discussed at the August 1, 2017 study session. Since the last meeting, staff worked with various Commissioners on specific points in the text amendment.

Discussing the driveway disturbance credit, the draft allows for partial credit on new homes and fixes a loop hole on existing driveways to avoid the creation of a 100-percent paved lot. There was discussion on the 6-inch allowance from natural grade and that this relates more to repaving. There were no edits by the Planning Commission.

Reviewing the hillside assurance/bond text, the current code is based on a flat dollar amount using cut and fill. The proposed text includes three assurance types: new single-family home, minor remodel, and landscape. It was suggested to add a definition of financial assurance. It was noted that



Office, in substantial compliance with the survey plat prepared by Land Development Group, dated June 21, 2017.

2. Prior to the recordation of said lot split plat, the following shall be completed:

a. The property owner or designee shall submit the required improvement plans for Town Engineer approval and provide a procedure and other forms of assurances necessary for the Town to be in a guaranteed position to complete the pavement widening and curbing adjoining Lots 1 and 2 of said lot split plat in accordance with the local roadway standard, Option B, of the Town's General Plan.

b. The property owner shall secure the appropriate demolition permit(s) and related inspections to remove all the vertical structures on Lot 2 as shown on the boundary survey prepared by Land Development Group, dated May 27, 2016.

3. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy for a new single-family residence on said lot split plat, the following shall be completed:

a. The property owner or designee shall complete the pavement improvements of Stipulation 2.a.

4. Within 60 days of approval of the plat, the applicant shall submit Mylars and an electronic version in a pdf format for the Town's permanent record

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Strom

#### 4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. 17-267 Discussion of several applications to develop a 9.6-acre property for 8 single-family lots located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (The Villas at Cheney Estates - Town Triangle)

Paul Michaud presented the application in accordance with the packet.

Chair Wastchak asked about the timing for this item.

Commissioner Campbell disclosed that he is not supportive of the 12,000 square-foot lots and thinks the development could lose one lot. Commissioner Covington noted that he finds this sets the bar lower than the R-18 SUP cluster development at Cheney Estates. Both were supportive of a minimum 18,000 square-foot lot. Commissioners Mahrle, Covington, and Anton agreed. Mr. Michaud noted that the minimum lot size in the SUP cluster plan noted is actually 16,000 square feet. The Commissioners were agreeable to a minimum of 16,000 square feet to match that SUP.

Chairman Wastchak stated he will abstain from voting since Shea Homes is his client.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to approve the application request for the expanded and elongated (joined) basement window wells and the removal of the 5-foot wide neighborhood walk for Area B of the Ritz Carlton Special Use Permit as a minor amendment to the Special Use Permit zoning per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 4 - Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 2 - Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Strom

**Abstain:** 1 - Chairperson Wastchak

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to deny the request for removal of the 5-foot wide neighborhood walk and the approve the Minor Special Use Permit Amendment for the Ritz-Carlton, Area B to allow for expanded and elongated (joined) basement window wells with the following stipulations:

1. All building shall be in accordance with the applicant's narrative and submittals dated June 1, 2017 and the applicant's supplement dated June 30, 2017.
2. The expanded window wells shall meet all setbacks for the main house and shall be included in the square footage calculations.
3. The contiguous window wells shall be allowed to encroach five (5) feet into the required setback area. Any portion that does not serve a bedroom shall be included in the square footage calculations for the main home.
4. A minimum setback of five (5) feet from the property line is required for contiguous window wells.

The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 4 - Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 2 - Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Strom

**Abstain:** 1 - Chairperson Wastchak

## 6. ACTION ITEMS

## 7. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. 17-253 Discussion of several applications to develop a 9.6-acre property for 8 single-family lots located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (The Villas at Cheney Estates - Town Triangle)
- Paul Michaud, Senior Planner, presented the Villas at Cheney Estates per the application packet. He explained the existing conditions and provided

background on the parcel. The original request was over a year ago. Originally a request for 11 lots with a re-zoning to R-10. This required a major general plan amendment as well as other applications. The current application has been modified to an 8 lot cluster plan subdivision. This does not require a General Plan amendment, but required the applicant to purchase additional land from the golf course.

Commissioner Mahrle questioned how this cluster plan works. The lots will not extend into the golf course, but the golf course land will be included in the cluster plan calculations. Mr. Michaud replied the gross density is at least one home per acre, not requiring an amendment to the General Plan.

Paul Michaud reviewed the six application requests which included an amendment to modify Article IX, rezoning from R-43 to R-43 CP, CUP for private road, SUP for gate, preliminary plat, and subdivision signs.

Mr. Michaud compared the proposed setbacks, heights, and areas to those that are allowed in all other zoning categories. He also referenced the General Plan values regarding new development. There was discussion of the subdivision wall. It may vary between the amount of solid wall and amount of view fence. Traffic was reviewed, as was sight visibility. There was discussion as to whether the City of Scottsdale will require a right turn lane. This is still being discussed with the City of Scottsdale. If required, this may result in modifications to the plan.

The applicant stated they received a CLOMR yesterday.

There was concern regarding the stacking of vehicles in front of the call box. It was noted that only one landscape company will service the development for both front and rear yards. The deceleration lane would also allow stacking of vehicles if it is required.

There was discussion of sidewalks. None are proposed. There is a code box for both sides of the gate to allow bicycles and pedestrians to exit the development.

There was one public comment. They were not in support.

This is scheduled for another work session on August 15, 2017 with a citizen review on September 19, 2017 and public hearing on October 3, 2017.

Commissioner Campbell asked about the revisions to the Zoning Ordinance and whether it would now apply to all cluster plans. Town Attorney, Andrew Miller, stated that the text amendment is very limited and

would only apply to properties with the same restrictions as this lot (if any similar parcels exist).

Staff would like to see more detail on the area around the entry cul-de-sac and more detail on signage.

There was also a request for a dimension from the call box to the ROW. It was noted it is 75'. There is also room for residents to pass any cars that are stopped at the call box. Additional graphics were requested.

Open Space Criteria applied to these lots would pose a large problem according to the applicant. General direction seemed to not apply the open space criteria. It was noted that this criteria is only required for R-43 and R-175.

There was discussion regarding how height will be measured. The grade elevations are still being discussed with the Engineering department. Height may be an issue with lots 6, 7, and 8.

There was a concern that there may be confusion with calling this the Villas at Cheney Estates.

**No Reportable Action**

**B.     17-254**

Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")

Paul Michaud introduced the consultants, Jim Coffman and Justin Azevedo.

Mr. Michaud presented per the Planning Commission packet. He reviewed the Statement of Direction (SOD). Introduced the Resort Loop and safety concerns, and the focus on bicycle and pedestrian routes while avoiding "urban" design elements. The SOD also calls for addressing mitigation of conflicts and minimizing signage when possible. This study should be paired with the Visually Significant Corridors plan, identify rough costs and phasing, prioritize projects while being clear and legible.

The survey results were reviewed as well as the maps of pedestrian facilities.

Gaps in sidewalks were discussed.

Bicycle related survey results were discussed. The STRAVA bicycle usage map was analyzed. There was discussion of speed humps. There was a request for additional information on the STRAVA map and to include it in the next packet.

There was a request to invite a police officer to a Commission meeting to discuss enforcement measures.

It was stated that the shared use path on Lincoln Drive has been revised to a resort loop in the SOD. There was discussion of the Capital Improvement Program and how it aligns with the proposed plan.

Missing bicycle connections were also shown.

Chairman Wastchak believes there must be a connection from the Resort Loop to someplace. The Commissioners were all in agreement. It should not be a stranded island, but we also need to be cautious of costs.

Commissioner Mahrle is beyond disappointed on the SOD as it relates to bicyclists. He believes it ignores reality and cyclists will continue to ride in the Town. He believes the SOD is short sighted and naive. It sends the message to residents that we don't care about bike paths or pedestrian paths.

Commissioner Campbell does not understand the Resort Loop to nowhere. He believes we should look at McDonald Drive or some other connection.

Tim Welsh, resident, believes McDonald Drive is horrible for bicyclists and automobiles due to the medians. He prefers the concept of a 10-foot wide shared path as originally proposed. McDonald Drive would have been a great option if not for the medians.

Commissioner Campbell is flabbergasted by the whole process. Mr. Michaud explained that bicyclists can still use sidewalks on McDonald Drive or the roadway. He added there may be an option to make improvements, such as widening part of the pavement or where there are medians or use of ribbon curb to address the ability of a motorist to more safely pass a cyclist.

Commissioner Anton believes the SOD plan may work to direct tourists, but all other cyclists are going to continue riding where they currently ride regardless of a new bike map.

Chairman Wastchak believes it is a balancing act and this study should guide where the Town invests its money.

John McCauley, resident, bicyclists use side roads so they don't have to compete with vehicles. This could lead to a conflict between cyclists and pedestrians. His concern is with the safety of pedestrians and residents

that live on these streets (Hummingbird).

Chairman Wastchak noted that the Council realized that there are issues on certain streets in the Town that are dangerous and need to be addressed. The Commission needs to respect these concerns, but not let that overly influence what happens elsewhere in the Town.

There was discussion of how we move forward. Chairman Wastchak asked if there will be a convening of stakeholders to work through some of these concerns. This is not currently in the scope of work. Chairman Wastchak would like to take the time to get this right.

Mr. Michaud explained that input was received from all stakeholders and there are opposing points of view. The Commission may have to move forward knowing this matter.

Jim Coffman suggests that a focus should be on the missed bicycle connections. He reviewed a map illustrating these missed connections.

Commissioner Anton stated that there are different bicycle users. Those that are getting from point A to point B and others that are just riding around. Their needs may have to be addressed separately.

Heidi McCauley, resident, discussed runners' and walkers' fear of the cyclists on Hummingbird Road.

Mr. Michaud stated the goal of the next meeting was to go over goal and policies, but the direction is up to the Planning Commission.

Mr. Michaud explained that the Commission must keep in mind that this is a long range plan and not a Capital Improvement Program.

Jim Coffman explained that there are many more details not discussed, but it is up to the Commission what to focus on. One of his main focuses is safety.

Chairman Wastchak believes that the plan must include options. Must be a tool box, not a telling of what needs to be done.

Chairman Wastchak believes it is okay to keep options in the toolbox, but specific illustration on streets could be misinterpreted. Standard details may be a better option.

It was discussed whether cyclists want to ride on sidewalks. It was noted they do not and sidewalks are not a good alternative for mature cyclists,

maybe for kids.

Rick Mahrle agrees that there are the destination cyclists and recreational cyclists. He is a recreational rider but could follow a destination if there is a good one offered.

**No Reportable Action**

## **8. CONSENT AGENDA**

### **A. 17-255 Approval of July 11, 2017 Planning Commission Minutes**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to approve the July 11, 2017 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 2 - Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Strom

## **9. STAFF REPORTS**

Paul Michaud provided the Commission the upcoming packet.

## **10. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS**

None

## **11. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

## **12. ADJOURNMENT**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell at 9:40 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Wainwright

**Absent:** 2 - Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Strom

**Paradise Valley Planning Commission**

By: Eva Cutro  
Eva Cutro, Secretary

**13. RECONVENE REGULAR MEETING**

Mayor Collins adjourned the Special Meeting and reconvened the Regular Meeting.

**14. ACTION ITEMS**

**17-201            Consideration of a Statement of Direction for "The Villas at Cheney Estates" Private Roadway Gate**

Senior Planner Paul presented the proposed Statement of Direction for "The Villas at Cheney Estates", also known as the Town Triangle. He noted that the Statement of Direction (SOD) is part of several applications to develop 8 residential lots at the northwest corner of Northern Ave and Scottsdale Rd. He said the SOD was discussed at the May 25, 2017 Council Study Session. During the meeting there was discussion about the application timing noting the private roadway gate application will not be approved until the Town Council takes action on the related applications.

He summarized the overall application and the SOD.

There was no Council discussion or public comments.

**A motion was made by Council Member Stanton, seconded by Council Member Dembow, to Approve the Statement of Direction for The Villas at Cheney Estates Private Roadway Gate Special Use Permit located at the northwest corner of Northern Avenue Alignment and Scottsdale Road. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye: 7 - Mayor Collins  
Vice Mayor Bien-Willner  
Council Member Dembow  
Council Member Moore  
Council Member Pace  
Council Member Sherf  
Council Member Stanton**

**17-219            Consideration of Statement of Direction for Personal Wireless Service Facility (a.k.a. Cell Antennas) Ordinance Amendment**

Town Manager Burke summarized the proposed Statement of Direction for the Planning Commission to draft amendments to the Personal Wireless Service Facility Ordinance to add objective design standards, undergrounding, stealth and concealment, and timely processing for new small cell antennas.

There was no Council discussion or public comments.

**A motion was made by Council Member Sherf, seconded by Council Member Stanton, to Approve the Statement of Direction for Personal Wireless Service Facility (a.k.a. Cell Antennas) Ordinance Amendment The motion carried by the following vote:**



consistent with the 56<sup>th</sup> Street design, and a plan to remove or screen the storage containers if the oleanders die.

Council action on the SUP was scheduled for June 8, 2017.

### **17-180 Discussion of The Villas at Cheney Estates Private Roadway Gate Statement of Direction**

Senior Planner Paul Michaud presented a request from Doug Jorden, P.C. on behalf of Town Triangle, LLC for a private roadway gate Special Use Permit near the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road. Mr. Michaud discussed alternative draft statements of direction for Council consideration, supporting and opposing private roadway gates.

Council discussed the Statement of Direction process for SUPs as they relate to concurrent applications for land use and zoning amendments. The Council directed that the Statement of Direction emphasize that the Council's consent to allowing the Planning Commission to consider the private gate does not constitute support for the associated zoning applications. The Council also asked staff to research including a reverter clause in the SUP to revert approval of the private gate if the zoning applications do not get approved or if the project is not built within a certain period of time.

The Statement of Direction would be scheduled for action on June 8, 2017.

### **17-193 Discussion of Lighting Code Revisions**

Community Development Director Eva Cutro presented proposed amendments to Zoning Articles 10 and 25 regarding lighting. She said that certain portions of the lighting code were outdated and did not reflect current standards while other changes were "housekeeping in nature. The amendments included the following:

- A purpose statement has been added
- A definition section has been added
- All references to watts have been changed to lumens
- A provision for holiday lights has been added
- Light measurements can now be computed in both Footcandles (existing measurement) and Lux (new measurement)
- Sign regulations have been tightened:
  - Sign lighting permitted only during business hours
  - Kelvin measurement added to prevent bright, blue/white lighting
  - Non-opaque, back lit signs now prohibited

The Council noted that municipal buildings in Town do not meet the lighting standards for non-residential properties. There was consensus to research placing timer switches on outdoor lighting for government buildings. It was also noted that many street lights, like those along the Tatum Curve, are very bright