

would only apply to properties with the same restrictions as this lot (if any similar parcels exist).

Staff would like to see more detail on the area around the entry cul-de-sac and more detail on signage.

There was also a request for a dimension from the call box to the ROW. It was noted it is 75'. There is also room for residents to pass any cars that are stopped at the call box. Additional graphics were requested.

Open Space Criteria applied to these lots would pose a large problem according to the applicant. General direction seemed to not apply the open space criteria. It was noted that this criteria is only required for R-43 and R-175.

There was discussion regarding how height will be measured. The grade elevations are still being discussed with the Engineering department. Height may be an issue with lots 6, 7, and 8.

There was a concern that there may be confusion with calling this the Villas at Cheney Estates.

No Reportable Action

B. [17-254](#)

Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")

Paul Michaud introduced the consultants, Jim Coffman and Justin Azevedo.

Mr. Michaud presented per the Planning Commission packet. He reviewed the Statement of Direction (SOD). Introduced the Resort Loop and safety concerns, and the focus on bicycle and pedestrian routes while avoiding "urban" design elements. The SOD also calls for addressing mitigation of conflicts and minimizing signage when possible. This study should be paired with the Visually Significant Corridors plan, identify rough costs and phasing, prioritize projects while being clear and legible.

The survey results were reviewed as well as the maps of pedestrian facilities.

Gaps in sidewalks were discussed.

Bicycle related survey results were discussed. The STRAVA bicycle usage map was analyzed. There was discussion of speed humps. There was a request for additional information on the STRAVA map and to include it in the next packet.

There was a request to invite a police officer to a Commission meeting to discuss enforcement measures.

It was stated that the shared use path on Lincoln Drive has been revised to a resort loop in the SOD. There was discussion of the Capital Improvement Program and how it aligns with the proposed plan.

Missing bicycle connections were also shown.

Chairman Wastchak believes there must be a connection from the Resort Loop to someplace. The Commissioners were all in agreement. It should not be a stranded island, but we also need to be cautious of costs.

Commissioner Mahrle is beyond disappointed on the SOD as it relates to bicyclists. He believes it ignores reality and cyclists will continue to ride in the Town. He believes the SOD is short sighted and naive. It sends the message to residents that we don't care about bike paths or pedestrian paths.

Commissioner Campbell does not understand the Resort Loop to nowhere. He believes we should look at McDonald Drive or some other connection.

Tim Welsh, resident, believes McDonald Drive is horrible for bicyclists and automobiles due to the medians. He prefers the concept of a 10-foot wide shared path as originally proposed. McDonald Drive would have been a great option if not for the medians.

Commissioner Campbell is flabbergasted by the whole process. Mr. Michaud explained that bicyclists can still use sidewalks on McDonald Drive or the roadway. He added there may be an option to make improvements, such as widening part of the pavement or where there are medians or use of ribbon curb to address the ability of a motorist to more safely pass a cyclist.

Commissioner Anton believes the SOD plan may work to direct tourists, but all other cyclists are going to continue riding where they currently ride regardless of a new bike map.

Chairman Wastchak believes it is a balancing act and this study should guide where the Town invests its money.

John McCauley, resident, bicyclists use side roads so they don't have to compete with vehicles. This could lead to a conflict between cyclists and pedestrians. His concern is with the safety of pedestrians and residents

that live on these streets (Hummingbird).

Chairman Wastchak noted that the Council realized that there are issues on certain streets in the Town that are dangerous and need to be addressed. The Commission needs to respect these concerns, but not let that overly influence what happens elsewhere in the Town.

There was discussion of how we move forward. Chairman Wastchak asked if there will be a convening of stakeholders to work through some of these concerns. This is not currently in the scope of work. Chairman Wastchak would like to take the time to get this right.

Mr. Michaud explained that input was received from all stakeholders and there are opposing points of view. The Commission may have to move forward knowing this matter.

Jim Coffman suggests that a focus should be on the missed bicycle connections. He reviewed a map illustrating these missed connections.

Commissioner Anton stated that there are different bicycle users. Those that are getting from point A to point B and others that are just riding around. Their needs may have to be addressed separately.

Heidi McCauley, resident, discussed runners' and walkers' fear of the cyclists on Hummingbird Road.

Mr. Michaud stated the goal of the next meeting was to go over goal and policies, but the direction is up to the Planning Commission.

Mr. Michaud explained that the Commission must keep in mind that this is a long range plan and not a Capital Improvement Program.

Jim Coffman explained that there are many more details not discussed, but it is up to the Commission what to focus on. One of his main focuses is safety.

Chairman Wastchak believes that the plan must include options. Must be a tool box, not a telling of what needs to be done.

Chairman Wastchak believes it is okay to keep options in the toolbox, but specific illustration on streets could be misinterpreted. Standard details may be a better option.

It was discussed whether cyclists want to ride on sidewalks. It was noted they do not and sidewalks are not a good alternative for mature cyclists,

maybe for kids.

Rick Mahrle agrees that there are the destination cyclists and recreational cyclists. He is a recreational rider but could follow a destination if there is a good one offered.

No Reportable Action

8. CONSENT AGENDA

A. [17-255](#) Approval of July 11, 2017 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to approve the July 11, 2017 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Strom

9. STAFF REPORTS

Paul Michaud provided the Commission the upcoming packet.

10. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

None

11. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

12. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell at 9:40 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Covington and Commissioner Strom

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: 
Eva Cutro, Secretary

No Reportable Action**C.** [17-270](#)

Discussion of Subdivision Sign and Modified Subdivision Wall . Kachina Estates Subdivision (MI 17-02). Northeast corner of Casa Blanca Drive and Malcomb Drive.

Mr. Burton described the request on the screen wall and subdivision sign. It was noted that these were installed without approval. Staff is not supportive of the screen walls since it reduces the sense of openness.

Commissioner Mahrle remarked on his frustrations when individuals do work without proper approval. He wants stronger penalties. Rich Brock, developer, responded.

Commissioner Anton stated the view fence would be visible from the street. Drew Hyatt, architect, stated the neighbors he heard back from are in support of the request. Homeowner Devin Booker spoke regarding his concerns over safety and privacy. There was discussion on the ability to plant oleanders or similar plants behind the fence and the approved shrubs in front of the fence per the approved landscape plan.

No Reportable Action**D.** [17-265](#)

Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan (the "Master Plan")

Paul Michaud introduced the consultant team of Jim Coffman and Justin Azevedo. Lieutenant Carney will join the meeting to discuss enforcement measures that the Town is utilizing.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the pedestrian facilities proposed in the plan. The existing General Plan does not address pedestrian facilities. Mr. Michaud reviewed a map of existing pedestrian sidewalks, those that are in the Capital Improvement Plan, and those that were addressed in the Statement of Direction.

Commissioner Mahrle noted the abundance of recreational paths on the proposed plan. It was stated that the legend on the map is incorrect. Discussion ensued on recreational paths and that these may be 6 - 10 feet in width. 10 to 12 feet is recommended, especially if it is promoted for bicycle use as well. However, the Town may not be able to accommodate a path of this width along Lincoln Drive. Commissioner Campbell stated the desire to have the path less curvilinear if it will also accommodate bicycles.

Mr. Michaud noted that the pedestrian facilities are focused on the non-local streets. There was discussion of what the official pedestrian map shall look like and that it should be pushed out to the public.

Lieutenant Carney reviewed enforcement. The motorcycle officer has changed his schedule to come in at 5 a.m. to be available to observe the early morning cyclists. A decoy car and police volunteers have also been utilized. A bike detail was done by police on Tuesday morning in the area of Hummingbird Lane. They stopped people for running the stop sign. Fifty bike citations have been issued since January 2017 and 30 traffic deployments have been done in the Hummingbird area since July 1, 2017. The majority of citations are for stop signs, others are for speed or riding more than two abreast. The police have met with leaders of various bicycle groups. At least one has now re-routed their direction. A neighbor commented that the re-routing may prove more dangerous.

Shauna Glazier, a cyclist and resident, has met with the police to try to work with the neighborhood. They have tried to divide the group into sub groups to ease the impact on the neighborhood. She believes they need to find a way to meet in the middle.

Carl Schaeffer, resident of Hummingbird, spoke of the dangerous conditions on his street. He just received a speeding ticket for driving 38 miles in the 25 mile zone on his street. He believes if he gets a ticket the cyclists should as well. A cyclist also complained to him that he needs to keep the street clear of gravel or the cyclists will sue him.

Nan Murley, resident, wrote a letter that is included in the Commission packet. She noted that many neighbors are out of Town and that they should have another chance to speak at a later date. Believes signage and landscape maintenance may aid the situation.

Carly Welch, resident, has teenage kids and is concerned about when they drive. She proposes having cyclists go up Hummingbird instead of down it. Shauna Glazier aid she would bring this request to her bicyclist group.

John McCauley, resident, has no problem if the cyclists obey the law. The speed limit is 25 or 15 miles per hour along the curves.

Marci Johnson, resident, says she has been at her home for 40 years. It is noisy and litter is thrown. It was noted that the litter is from a construction site, not the cyclists. She also stated reflective or bright clothing should be utilized by walkers and cyclists.

Commissioner Wainwright stated he will try to ride this route. He also noted at his previous home the cyclists could be very rude.

Commissioner Anton stated that it doesn't work when too many cyclists are

on the same street. He believes cuts in the street may discourage cyclists from going too fast. He believes the residents need to suggest what improvements they would like.

Chairman Wastchak believes the Hummingbird area has a unique situation and may need to be addressed separate from the complete bicycle/pedestrian plan.

Commissioner Covington stated he is an avid cyclist and obeying the law is a priority.

Paul Michaud reviewed the bicycle component of the proposed plan. The Strava map was shown. This shows the heaviest used areas of the Town.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the General Plan map, the existing bicycle facilities, what is in the Capital Improvement Plan, and what is in the Statement of Direction.

The differences between the proposed map and the Statement of Direction were discussed.

1. Mountain View Road west of 52nd st has bike lanes and is heavily used.
2. Tatum Boulevard to the trailhead should be addressed. The City of Phoenix is willing to work with the Town on this connection.
3. 56th St. to Cherokee Elementary would provide a safe connection to a school.
4. 32nd St. is a connection that was supported in the opinion survey.
5. Lincoln/McDonald differs from the Statement of Direction because it recommends an expansion of the resort loop.
6. Invergordon Road north of McDonald has existing bike lanes
7. Jackrabbit road provides a connection to the AZ canal.

Commissioners Campbell and Mahrle are encouraged by the deviations from the SOD. Commissioner Mahrle would like even more facilities on Lincoln Drive and Tatum Boulevard. Commissioner Covington and Chairman Wastchak are also supportive of this compromise between the original plan and the Statement of Direction .

Commissioner Anton believes that the 32nd Street connection is too busy for cyclists and perhaps Palo Cristi Road should be looked at. The Strava map shows very little use of 32nd Street. It was noted that the residents of Palo Cristi Road may not support a recreational path along this road. Also, the draft 1 plan included facilities on Palo Cristi Road.

Jim Coffman asked if the Commission would support a connection on McDonald Drive from Tatum Boulevard to 40th Street as suggested in the

existing General Plan. This would deviate from the Statement of Direction.

Enhanced intersections were discussed next. The intersection of Quartz Mountain Road and Hummingbird Lane was discussed. At a minimum, stop signs are suggested, even a four way stop sign in this area. Consultants recommend a traffic circle with a raised island. Stop signs are not always obeyed. A traffic circle cannot be ignored. A pavement change may also be utilized. Mr. McCauley suggested placing a dip in the road at this location, it would also help with drainage. Shauna Glazier is supportive of traffic circles.

Hummingbird Lane and 61st Place was discussed next. A road straightening and raised median with a change in pavement is suggested. Nan Murley suggested that water flows be taken into consideration.

Rumble strips and cobblestones were also discussed as calming devices. Mrs. Glazier does not believe these calming devices will slow down cyclists or prevent them from using Hummingbird Lane. The consultant believes the rumble strips need additional studies.

The last intersection discussed was Hummingbird Lane and Cheney Drive. Roadway would be re-aligned to simplify the intersection. A roundabout could be added with decorative pavement details.

Roadway cross sections were quickly reviewed, including the Berneil Ditch.

Traffic calming measures were also reviewed and other enhanced intersections were identified. Wayfinding signs were shown and it was noted they would be in limited quantities.

This will come back to Commission on September 5th for further discussion.

It was noted that the Commission may need to go back to Council for the deviations from the Statement of Direction. Commissioner Mahrle did not believe this was necessary. Chairman Wastchak stated he has already discussed the deviations with Councilmember Bien-Willner (the liaison between Council and Commission).

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Draft

Planning Commission

Tuesday, September 5, 2017

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m.

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Senior Planner Paul Michaud
Planner George Burton
Town Engineer Paul Mood

2. ROLL CALL

Present 7 - Chairperson Daran Wastchak
Commissioner James Anton
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell
Commissioner Charles Covington
Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle
Commissioner Dolf Strom
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

A. 17-275 Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan

Paul Michaud presented the progress on the bicycle and pedestrian master plan. He stated that the items for discussion this evening includes identification of any changes to the route maps from what was already discussed, noting that the Statement of Direction will be brought back to Town Council at their meeting of September 28, 2017. He continued that he would like input on the proposed enhanced intersections, mission statement, and goals and policies.

Commissioner Mahrle objects with the Town Manager's interpretation that the Statement of Direction needs to go back to Town Council. He feels this is within the scope of the Commission's purview.

Mr. Michaud highlighted the pedestrian routes discussed at the last meeting. The Planning Commission had no changes to the pedestrian route map.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the bicycle Capital Improvement Program Map and route map discussed by the Planning Commission at the last meeting. He asked to verify any changes related to the deviations from the Statement of Direction. The one change was on Jackrabbit Road between Invergordon Road and the Arizona Canal east of Scottsdale Road. This change was to modify the proposed bike lanes to a recreation path on one side since there are physical constraints in the area, the use will likely be recreational bike riders based on the STRAVA heat maps, and the existing General Plan and policies do not indicate bike improvements on this corridor.

There was discussion regarding modification of a 6-foot wide sidewalk into a 10-foot wide recreation path. It was noted that additional pavement could be added or the entire sidewalk could be reconstructed. There are costs and benefits to both methods.

Commissioner Strom inquired on consideration of making rolled edge curb along the north side of McDonald Drive near Invergordon Road. Chairman Wastchak did not recall any discussion on rolled curb.

There was discussion about signs. Mr. Michaud clarified the intent is to limit the amount of signs.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the proposed enhanced intersections.

Commissioner Strom asked what the definition of an enhanced intersection. Mr. Michaud responded it is any intersection that needs an improvement or enhancement such as a crosswalk or other physical improvement that makes it safer for bicyclists or pedestrians. He added that these intersections are on a bike or pedestrian path.

In updating the Hummingbird Lane intersections, it was noted that the prior concept of mini-roundabouts has been changed to stop signs and rumble strips based on site inspection. The Town Engineer noted that the final design will require the appropriate engineering study. Mr. Michaud added that the intersections would require approval to fund and engineering plans through a Town process beyond this master plan.

There were no specific concerns with the proposed enhanced intersections, except to modify the write up for each intersection to emphasize what is proposed for enhancement.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the proposed mission statement. There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the timing, noting that the intent is to have a complete Draft 2 of the plan by the end of October 2017.

No Reportable Action

B. [17-284](#)

Discussion of Draft Visually Significant Corridors Master Plan (VSC)

Eva Cutro introduced the topic and the consultants.

John Griffin and Kevin Kuglar, consultants, gave an overview of the draft plan. It was noted the plan is divided into five sections.

Commissioner Strom asked about the cover of the plan. He stated he liked the concept of decorative material at the Lincoln Drive/Tatum Boulevard intersection. He had concerns about the durability of the material and the safety with marking travel lanes, the photo radar lines, and related markings.

The Planning Commission stated that the landscape guidelines, particularly the information on the plant types is useful and should be promoted. The proposed plants are all native or native-adapted.

John explained the street scape enhancements. There was discussion on the decorative luminaires. It was noted the Town would maintain these luminaires.

In discussing implementation, the proposed good, better and best options were reviewed.

The corners at the Lincoln Drive/Tatum Boulevard intersection were discussed, which included improvements such as seating and opportunity for vertical elements to acknowledge the pillars of the community. These would be places to take advantage of views, places to provide visual interest, and create some verticality to provide balance among the four corners. It was noted that working with the adjoining homeowner associations will be required to use some of their land, but maintenance would likely be a Town function. The Planning Commission liked the conceptual designs, particularly the pillars of the community corner that could be paid for through donations. Phasing of the one vertical element or use of natural plant material was suggested on the other corner instead of the proposed pillar. All agreed that some type of shade should be incorporated, either natural or with a structure.

parameters of the Statement of Direction.

Commissioner Strom suggested to gather all the retention code provisions into one category. Mr. Burton will work with Commissioner Strom on these edits.

No Reportable Action

C. [17-302](#)

Discussion of Paradise Valley Bicycle + Pedestrian Master Plan

Paul Michaud presented the proposed revised goals, policies, and implementation measures for the bicycle and pedestrian master plan. He explained that the packet included a track change version comparing those goals, policies, and implementation measures in the General Plan and another document that compares the changes to the February 2017 draft of the bicycle and pedestrian master plan.

He reviewed each revised goal and policy. There was discussion of signage. This included a request for clarification on Policy 4.6.5 that the intent is not to install signage, but if the Town must install signage that it be the minimum number along with the rest of the conditions outlined in that policy. Staff stated it would reword this policy. Some suggestions included, "Shall not install signs except where appropriate/needed" or "The Town desires to minimize visual clutter and shall only allow the minimum needed/required signs". The Planning Commission had no other changes to the draft revised goals and policies.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the draft revised implementation measures. There was concern over multiple responsible parties listed. Commissioner Strom wanted only one party listed or more clarity on who is responsible for what aspects of each measure. Eva Cutro noted that this format follows the existing General Plan.

Regarding Implementation Measure 3, addressing minimizing adverse impacts to the neighborhood, Commissioner Anton commented that additional detail regarding how the adverse impacts would be minimized may be necessary. The Planning Commission had no other changes to the draft revised implementation measures.

Mr. Michaud next reviewed the timeline of upcoming meetings. He stated October 12th is scheduled for Town Council amendment to the Statement of Direction, moved from September 28th. He continued that October 7th is the next Commission work session. Mr. Michaud asked the Planning Commission whether or not the proposed November 7th citizen review and December 5th action dates are still viable with the Statement of Direction going back to Town Council since the noticing would need to be done by October 13th. In an effort to avoid holiday weeks, the revised meeting

dates would be December 5th for citizen review and January 16th for Planning Commission action. The Planning Commission agreed to push out the timeline to the latter dates.

Heidi McCaulley had a question regarding lighting on her home. Her final inspection was held up because her lighting did not meet Code. She has a concern regarding her neighbor's lighting.

Ms. McCaulley also wanted to express safety concerns and requested when these will be addressed. The safety concerns are being reviewed by the Town Manager, with input from the Commission and Council. This will be it's own study, separate from the bicycle and pedestrian master plan. Commissioner Anton suggested that the neighbors should get together, propose solutions that they would like to see, and prioritize their concerns and solutions. Mr. McCaulley suggested to reduce the speed limit to 15 mph, install additional stop signs, and add rumble strips or speed humps.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

6. ACTION ITEMS

7. CONSENT AGENDA

A. [17-300](#) Approval of September 5, 2017 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to approve the September 5, 2017 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Chairperson Wastchak

8. STAFF REPORTS

Eva Cutro gave a quick review of the previous night's Visually Significant Corridors charrette. She thanked Commissioners Covington and Strom for their participation.

9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

None

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Mr. Michaud reviewed the October 3, 2017 meeting items.

11. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell at 8:48 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Anton, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Chairperson Wastchak

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: 
Eva Cutro, Secretary