



**PARADISE VALLEY
HILLSIDE BUILDING COMMITTEE MINUTES
JANUARY 11, 2017**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Hillside Building Review Committee met on Wednesday, January 11, 2017, at Town Hall, 6401 East Lincoln Drive, Paradise Valley, Arizona, 85253. Committee Members present included Planning Commissioners Rick Mahrle, Jonathan Wainwright and Daran Wastchak, Scott McPherson and Chair Scott Jarson. Staff present: Planner George Burton, Engineering Technician Richard Edwards, and Executive Assistant/ Deputy Town Clerk Natalie Montenegro. Chair Jarson called the meeting to order at 8:05 a.m.

2. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Chair Jarson stated the Hillside Building Review Committee may convene to an executive session at any time during the meeting as needed to confer with the Town Attorney for legal advice regarding any of the items listed on the agenda, as authorized by A.R.S. §38-431.03.A.3.

3. APPLICATION REVIEW

**A. Formal Review for the Shoumaker Residence located at 5715 N. 55th Place
(APN: 172-47-057). Application for a major remodel/addition.**

Tommy Suchart, Architect

Planner George Burton presented the application for remodel/addition at 5715 North 55th Place. The proposal includes a larger master bedroom, outdoor storage space for gardening tools and an outdoor kitchen/BBQ. The existing roof will be removed and replaced with a new flat dark grey membrane roof. The exterior finishes will be grey stucco and black metal fascia, with anodized window/door frames. The project meets the hillside setback and height requirements. There will be 7 wall sconces and 15 soffit lights around the house. The asphalt driveway will be replaced with grey exposed aggregate. The perforated steel pool barrier will be 6 feet tall and expanded along the north and west sides of the existing pool. Staff feels the pool fence is not enough to secure the pool. The guard rail around the deck will match the pool fence. The drainage south of the property flows along the driveway to the street and into the existing natural wash east of the house. Existing drainage patterns will remain and onsite turf and retention will be included. Landscape improvements include native plants along the

driveway, 3 landscape lights and 11 path lights. The water feature near the entrance will be lighted.

Tommy Suchart, the architect for the project, said weathering steel will be used for the exterior trim, and a Mesa brown rip-rap will be used for landscaping. The pool fence is dilapidated and falling down. The owner needs an area for the dogs and is extending the pool fence to encompass the green area (retention area).

Scott McPherson wanted to know the materials for the new pool fence. Mr. Suchart said the fence will be steel that is meant to oxidize to blend with the hillside colors. The perforated fence will be 80% open steel.

Chair Jarson asked about the retention in the turf area. Mr. Suchart said will be rock and the grass will be limited to the sloped area. Chair Jarson said the grass is new and asked the dimensions of the grassed area. Mr. Suchart said it is 50 feet by 70 feet.

Commissioner Wastchak stated the green grass area is on the slope away from the property. He asked if it will be visible from the street. Mr. Suchart said the visibility from the street is very minimal. They want it to blend and the fence will mitigate it.

Chair Jarson wanted to know what materials will be used for the roof. Mr. Suchart said the roof will be constructed of a single gray membrane. He was asked to clarify the color of the gray membrane. Mr. Burton said it meets the LRV for hillside.

Mr. McPherson asked if solar panels are being considered. Mr. Suchart said no solar panels are planned at this time.

Mr. McPherson asked the color of the soffits and whether or not the lights will be set. Mr. Suchart said they will be grey and the recessed lights are meant to light the path only, and will not be aimed at the wall.

Chair Jarson felt the recessed lights may shed light onto the walls and asked if they should be placed closer to the outer edge. Commissioner Wastchak said that if they hit the glass, it will be like hitting a mirror.

Mr. McPherson asked how far out are the path lights. Mr. Suchart said they are 8 feet, with 4 feet on either side that can be a focused beam spread.

Chair Jarson stated he has a problem with the larger grass area and expanding the fence to make it a backyard. He asked the applicant to compromise and come in closer to the house.

Commissioner Mahrle said the plan is drawn to match the slope and if the area is reduced, it may not match the existing slope.

Commissioner Wastchak asked the height of the fence. Mr. Suchart said it is 6 feet, and it follows the natural landscape of the lot.

Commissioner Wainwright asked if the barrier is a concern. Chair Jarson felt it was expanded too much. Mr. Burton outlined the location of the existing pool barrier, well below what is being proposed.

Mr. Suchart said that if they were building a new home on this lot, the disturbed area would be greater than what currently exists. Commissioner Wastchak said that the disturbance is 16%, well under the 60% allowable for this property. Mr. Suchart suggested additional landscaping may solve the visibility issue.

Chair Jarson said the fencing will disappear on its own once it oxidizes and blends with the landscaping. He still feels the pool area is large and can come in 10 feet on either side to nestle in more with the visual landscape.

Mr. Suchart asked if they can keep the fence but lessen the grass area. Mr. McPherson said the concern is the fenced area is too large. Chair Jarson said they need to be mindful first of the fence and then the visual, since it is a safety feature for the pool area.

Commissioner Mahrle said the applicant is trying to be flexible to find a reasonable solution. Commissioner Wastchak agreed that the Committee needs to find a definable area and what can be done to establish precedent.

Mr. McPherson said the mitigating factor is the disturbed area. In other cases, the disturbed area was maxed out, but not in this case. He still feels the fenced area can be cut back because it is a very big area.

Mr. Suchart suggested the Committee can see the area in question while it is under construction.

Mr. McPherson suggested a stipulation to reduce the size now. Chair Jarson said that if the area is reduced by 25%, or 20 feet in all directions from the patio, the 3500 square foot area can become 2400 square feet. Commissioner Wastchak stated the criteria can be used for future applications.

Robert Orlando, the civil engineer for the next application, suggested Chair Jarson may want to show the applicant the 20 foot marker. The applicant was shown the reduction on the plans and was agreeable to the reduction in size.

Commissioner Mahrle moved approval of the application with 2 additional stipulations:

1. The lighting trim be confirmed by staff and Chair of the Hillside Building Committee.
2. The fence around the pool area will be placed 20 feet from the patio in all directions, and the new plan revision will be approved by staff and Chair of the Hillside Building Committee.

Commissioner Wastchak seconded the motion, which carried unanimously, 5-0.

B. Combined Review for Peoples Residence at 8229 N 54th Street (APN: 168-65-030). Application for a drainage swale, solar panels, spa, and site restoration.

Robert Orlando, Civil Engineer

Planner George Burton presented the application for a drainage swale, roof mounted solar panels, spa and site restoration at 8229 North 54th Street.

The Town received a complaint regarding the addition a swale and fence on the subject property. Staff visited the site and informed the contractor that the improvements require hillside approval and permits. The applicant removed the fence and submitted a hillside application for the drainage swale, roof mounted solar panels, spa, and site restoration.

The applicant is proposing to widen the drainage swale along the east side of the house. The swale was widened to accommodate erosion protection with the placement of a calico rock rip-rap. These improvements will accommodate the 100 year peak storm flows and will not adversely impact or increase flooding hazards.

A new 17 foot long, 5 feet tall, stone retaining wall will be placed behind the house to prevent erosion.

The applicant is proposing to add 5 roof mounted solar panels on the house. A black fabric screen will be placed around the solar panels. Staff's concern is that the proposed screen is black in color and does not match the house; and since it made out of fabric, it will need to be replaced once it starts to deteriorate.

The existing spa was constructed in 2014 without hillside approval or permit. As a result, the applicant is including the spa in this application request. The spa is 110 feet from the front property line and approximately 40 feet from the east side property line. The spa wall is finished with a bluish grey tile with a LRV of 23.5% and has a beige colored tile deck with a LRV of 37.5%. The maximum allowable LRV is 38%.

Pathways were created in front of the house that did not receive hillside approval and count as disturbed area. As a result, the applicant is proposing to restore these areas back to a natural state and revegetate them with native plants.

Robert Orlando, a civil engineer, said he was brought in to remedy the project. He said the rip-rap and fence were not permitted. The fence posts were removed. He said that when the project was approved in 1985, there was no drainage plan for the site. The owner put in a trench that brought water to the driveway.

Emily Kile, a neighbor to the east, said the owner built a berm and when it rains, water washes out her driveway. The berm rechanneled the water flow.

Commissioner Wastchak stated that water now goes to the Kile driveway. He asked if the Town Engineer was involved with the revisions to the drainage plan for this property. Mr. Orlando said that Jeremy Knapp was involved. He is now asking the Committee for additional disturbance allowance to restore the area.

Chair Jarson said that a large amount of disturbed area will be restored to a natural vegetative state. He said there is a lot of light travertine and the calico colors in the rip-rap on the east side are very pink in nature.

Mr. Orlando said the existing tile at the pool area was not the original application. He said the rip-rap is scattered because there was a stop work order and everything was left as is. The intent is to restore the site.

Commissioner Wainwright asked if the swale was a solution to the flooding at the house. Mr. Orlando said the owner put the swale in after the AC units were washed out a couple of times.

Chair Jarson said the application ought to include the plans for the swale and berm, and the new rip-rap should be darker in color, or it can be spread out and treated with ionite so it will blend with the natural landscape.

Commissioner Wastchak asked if the trench will stay. Mr. Orlando said yes, he would like to stay.

Chair Jarson stated several items that will need to be seen by staff and Chair of the Hillside Building Committee:

1. The existing rip-rap should be treated with varnish or covered with a darker material.
2. The upper existing disturbance trench should be restored to its natural state.
3. The soils should be restored and blended to its natural conditions.

Commissioner Wastchak asked the definition of natural state. Chair Jarson said they want the water to flow to the swale to pre-development grade and not to impede with the natural flow.

Chair Jarson asked why they are installing the fabric around the solar panels. Mr. Orlando said the client wanted to create a frame around the panels. Mr. Burton stated staff's concern that the fabric will deteriorate over time and suggested solid metal instead of fabric.

Commissioner Mahrle said this can be a stipulation that the material be approved by staff and Chair.

Chair Jarson said the Committee needs to see a more complete application.

Emily Kile said that during the summer months, the pool drains across the street to the vacant lot.

Mr. Orlando asked if there was an issue with building a small retention wall in front of the house.

Commissioner Wastchak moved to continue the application to the March 8 Hillside Building Committee meeting. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion, which carried unanimously, 5-0.

C. Election of Chair

Commissioner Mahrle nominated Scott Jarson to serve as Chair of the Hillside Building Committee. Commissioner Wastchak seconded the motion which carried unanimously, 5-0.

4. STAFF REPORTS

There were no staff reports.

5. COMMITTEE REPORTS

There were no committee reports.

6. NEXT HILLSIDE BUILDING COMMITTEE MEETING

The next meeting was scheduled for Wednesday, February 8, 2017 at 8:00 a.m.

7. ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Mahrle moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Wainwright which carried unanimously 5-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:30 a.m.