CivTech

January 13, 2017

Mr. Michael Surguine
Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain Resort & Spa
5700 East McDonald Drive
Paradise Valley, Arizona 85253

RE: Amendment No. 2 to the Jade Bar Parking Analysis dated February 25, 2013
 Second Submittal

Dear Mr. Surguine:

The purpose of this letter is to serve as Amendment No. 2 to the *Jade Bar at Sanctuary Camelback Mountain Parking Analysis* prepared by CivTech and dated February 25, 2013. This second amendment to the parking analysis was requested by the Sanctuary for submittal to the Town of Paradise Valley. It has been necessitated by the addition of up to 45 new rental units proposed for The Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain Resort & Spa. This document represents a 2nd Submittal and addresses a comment that "[t]he study should address total approved parking and shared parking." The comment is addressed in a new section before the conclusions.

BACKGROUND

The Sanctuary site consists of two types of facilities in addition to the Main Resort. The Casitas are rental units that cannot be permanent residences. The Casas are privately-owned resort homes for individual families and guests for overnight accommodations; at an owner's request a Casa can be added to the resort rental pool. (Please note that these designations were taken directly from a report by Town staff and "Casitas" is used herein for consistency.) In this analysis, an addition of units proposed within the area in which the Casitas are located will be addressed.

The Sanctuary operated under Special Use Permit (SUP) stipulations of Town Ordinance Number 645 approved on April 12, 2012 and the stipulations approved on March 5, 2013 for a minor amendment of the SUP, a total of some 70 stipulations. The minor amendment application package approved in March 2013 included the Jade Bar parking analysis.

Amendment No. 1 to the parking analysis was finalized on August 29, 2014 after revision in response to comments received from the Town. That first amendment was requested to document the effect on parking of resort improvements proposed at that time and of any of the proposed modifications to several of the stipulations under which the resort operated. The Town consolidated all of the past stipulations and revisions to those stipulations, issuing two new SUPs (14-05 and 14-06) to replace those under which The Sanctuary had been operating. Amendment No. 1 addressed only those items that were considered parking-related, however remotely. It also allowed for four new guest units in a building that would replace a tennis court

PROPOSED IMPROVEMENTS

Since the first amendment was completed in 2014, an additional expansion of The Sanctuary has been proposed. The architect of the proposed improvements to the property has designated the improvements as "interstitial bungalows." Since the staff report noted above does not define the term "bungalow" and the proposed bungalows are within the Casitas area, the Casitas and bungalows

will be more-generically considered "rental units" for the purposes of this study. All are units that will be available for rent to hotel guests of The Sanctuary for purposes of this parking analysis.

The site plan provided to CivTech (see **Attachment 1**) shows that 39 1- and 2-floor bungalows will be constructed on the ends of or beneath the existing 41 Casitas. Two clusters of three more bungalows (6 total) will stand free among the Casitas, bringing the total number of new units to 45. Thus, the total number of rental units will be increased from the existing 41 Casitas to a total of 86 Casitas and bungalows. On-site guest units could increase to totals of 155 in the interim condition and 174 in the ultimate condition.

As part of the bungalow construction, one of the bungalow clusters will be constructed on the site of a small, existing swimming pool. This pool will be replaced by a new, larger pool elsewhere within the Casitas area. (The pool is considered an amenity that will not generate new vehicular trips or the need for parking spaces.)

Finally, the number of parking spaces for the Casitas-area rental units will be increased by 18 from the existing 79 spaces (including 1 ADA-compliant space) to 97 spaces. Overall on-site parking will increase to 368 in the interim condition and 391 in the ultimate condition.

ADA COMPLIANCE

The issue of compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (ADA) in regard to the entire site and elsewhere was addressed in Amendment No. 1. Since the number of parking spaces is expected to increase, it will be addressed again here.

With respect to the rental units in the Casitas area, there is, as noted, one existing ADA space provided near Casita Unit 10 on the site plan. CivTech assumes that Unit 10 was either designed (or retrofitted) to be accessible under the *2010 ADA Standards for Accessible Design* and, therefore, an ADA-compliant space was provided for the unit.

In regard to the other rental units, Exception 2 of Section 216.5 of the 2010 ADA Standards indicates that, "In residential facilities, where parking spaces are assigned to specific residential dwelling units, identification of accessible parking spaces shall not be required." Parking spaces are and will continue to be interspersed among the units to keep them close to the units and convenient for the occupants. From this it can be concluded that no other parking spaces identified as ADA-compliant are required for the new bungalows.

Another issue is whether The Sanctuary will continue to provide a sufficient number of ADA-compliant parking spaces with the addition of the bungalows. The original Jade Bar analysis and Amendment No. 1 indicated that there would be 369 permanent traditional parking spaces on site in what was then considered the ultimate condition. With the proposed addition of 18 parking spaces for the bungalows, the new ultimate total would be 387 parking spaces (369+18=387). The ADA standards indicate in Table 208.2 that a total of 8 ADA-compliant spaces is required at facilities that provide from 301 to 400 parking spaces. There are currently provided 8 ADA-compliant spaces on The Sanctuary property; thus, The Sanctuary will continue to provide a sufficient number of ADA-compliant parking spaces on the property with the addition of the 45 proposed bungalows.

PARKING RATIO

Upon completion of the project, there will be 86 rental units consisting of 41 existing Casitas and 45 new bungalows. With 18 new spaces added to the 79 existing spaces, a total of 97 parking spaces will be provided on the subject parcel. The resulting parking ratio is 1.13 parking spaces

CivTech

per rental unit or just over eight spaces for every seven rental units in this area of the resort. This ratio falls less than six percent short of a Town requirement that a minimum of 1.20 spaces be provided per each guest unit.

Overall, however, The Sanctuary will be well-parked, as will be demonstrated. In the interim and ultimate conditions, there will be 155 and 174 on-site guest units with 368 and 391 parking spaces provided, respectively. These yield ratios of 2.37 and 2.25 spaces per key or guest unit, nearly double the Town requirement of 1.20 spaces per key. **Table 1** is a summary of the parking for other resorts within the Town limits. A review of **Table 1** reveals that other resorts provide (or will provide) an average of fewer than two spaces per key; therefore, The Sanctuary will provide a sufficient number of parking spaces overall.

Table 1 – Comparison of Parking Provided at Town Resorts

Resort	Size (Acres)	Guest Units	Other Facilities	Parking Provided	Spaces per Key
Camelback Inn	117	453	Restaurant Conference Spa	1,157	2.55
Doubletree Paradise Valley	20	378	Retail Restaurant Ballroom Meeting Space	559 on-site 45 off-site	1.60
Montelucia	28	293	Retail Restaurant	610	2.08
Hermosa Inn	6.4	35	Restaurant Meeting Space	111	3.17
Renaissance Scottsdale Resort	22.75	171	Restaurant Meeting/Banquet Tennis Courts	230	1.35
Smoketree Resort	5	28	Restaurant Salon	74	2.64
Scottsdale Plaza	36.5	404	Restaurant Ballroom/Banquet Meeting Space	403	1.00
Ritz Carlton (Proposed)	110	200 / 320	Restaurant Ballroom/Banquet Meeting Space	460 / 700	2.30 / 2.19
Average	**43.2**	**254 / 260**		**456 / 486**	**1.80 / 1.87**

The Sanctuary Current / Ultimate ***Proposed***	***53***	106 / 125 ***155 / 174***	Restaurant Meeting Space Spa Tennis Courts	346 / 369 ***368 / 391***	3.26 / 2.95 ***2.37 / 2.25***

CivTech

SHARED-PARKING ANALYSIS

One of the tables in Appendix D of the approved 2013 parking analysis was a peak use shared parking analysis for the weekend condition, which was demonstrated in the study to require a higher number of shared parking spaces than the typical weekday condition. In Amendment No.1, Appendix D was updated to reflect The Sanctuary being permitted to allow the conference center, where large events could be hosted, to remain open longer in the evening. Since the changes affected only the hours after 10 PM and the highest number of parking spaces under the shared-use analysis was identified as being from 8 to 9 PM, the maximum number of shared parking spaces, 287 spaces, did not change. That shared-parking analysis was based in part on 125 rental units.

The 4 guest units noted in the 2014 amendment plus 45 proposed bungalows bring the rental unit total to 174 (125+4+45=174). **Attachment 2** is a revised version of Appendix D that was attached to Amendment No. 1 with the late-night hour changes incorporated into the table. *Please note that the only change necessary was the increase in the Resort Guest Rooms from 125 to 174 in the left-most column of facilities. As noted, the new pool is an amenity for Casitas-area guests and does not generate the need for new parking spaces.*

A review of **Attachment 2** reveals that the addition of 45 new bungalows would increase the maximum need for parking spaces on The Sanctuary property to 340 spaces, a net increase of 53 spaces from the reported maximum of 287 under prior shared-parking analyses. The need would be greatest from 8 to 9 PM on a weekend. With a new expected total of 391 spaces on the property, there will be sufficient parking spaces at The Sanctuary to accommodate its parking needs.

TOTAL APPROVED PARKING AND SHARED PARKING

As noted in the introductory paragraph, a reviewer for the Town of Paradise Valley commented that this amendment "should address total approved parking and shared parking." This section has been added to do that for two parking conditions, an Interim Condition and an Ultimate Condition. Both will be described below in this brief summary of CivTech efforts to date.

In February 2013, CivTech prepared the *Jade Bar at the Sanctuary Resort Parking Analysis*. In this study CivTech evaluated two parking conditions:

1. *Interim Condition*, described on Page 1 as "the number of parking spaces required to support the interim condition of the Resort with an expansion to the Jade Bar."

2. *Ultimate Condition*, described on Page 1 a future condition "which includes the addition of guest rooms and spa area…20 additional guest rooms (Spa Suites) and the 1,350 square feet of additional spa area (Spa Pavilion)…[T]he tennis courts will be removed and the lower level parking will be reconfigured[,] provid[ing] more parking than currently exists today."

On page 8, CivTech noted that, in the Interim Condition, "The site plan shows 346 parking spaces available for sharing in the main parking areas." Also on that page, CivTech noted that, in the Ultimate Condition, "369 parking spaces will be available for sharing in the main parking areas."

In Table 6 of the 2013 parking analysis, the peak demand for the Ultimate Condition was estimated at 276 shared parking spaces on a weekday during the peak season and at 287 on a weekend during the peak season. These are all as noted by the reviewer. On page 6 of the original study, the Non-Shared peak season parking spaces, that is, the number of spaces required by Code, are 320 for the Interim Condition and 345 for the Ultimate Condition. Thus, The Sanctuary provides a comfortable number of spaces more than is required by the shared parking analysis.

CivTech

Appendix D of Amendment No. 1, the "Casa 2" amendment (as described by the reviewer) was prepared in August 2014 for the Ultimate Condition. This amendment shows a requirement for the same 287 shared parking spaces needed with 346 shared parking spaces available. These are the same as documented in the 2013 parking analysis. The renovations to the Casa del Sano, which converted garages into bedrooms warranted the addition of four new parking spaces; thus, the non-shared total increased by four spaces to 349 from the 345 documented in 2013.

As the reviewer noted, the site plan attached to the first submittal of this Amendment No. 2 clearly showed a net increase of 17 parking spaces, which is corrected herein to 18 new spaces. This fact was noted in the first submittal of the amendment and continues to be noted herein on page 2, in the sentence just before the "ADA Compliance" section.

Table 2 summarizes the progression of the parking space counts from those documented in the approved 2013 parking analysis through this second submittal of Amendment No. 2.

Table 2 – Resort Parking Summary

| Source | | Parking Required | | Parking Provided | | | | Guest Keys | Spaces Per Key* |
| | | | | Traditional | | | Valet Assist[+] | | |
	Phase	Per Code	Shared	Prior	Added	Revised			
Jade Bar at the Sanctuary Camelback Mountain Parking Analysis (2013)									
	Interim[†]	320	267			346	398	106	3.26
	Ultimate[‡]	345	287			369	424	125	2.95
Amendment No. 1 (2014) – Casa del Sano Renovations									
	Interim	325	272	346	+4	350	402	110	3.18
	Ultimate	350	292	369	+4	373	429	129	3.32
Amendment No. 2 (2016) – Interstitial Bungalows									
	Interim	380	320	350	+18	368	423	155	2.37
	Ultimate	404	340	373	+18	391	450	174	2.25

+ – Valet Assist is a yield approximately fifteen percent above "provided" spaces as documented in 2013 Jade Bar study and elsewhere by CivTech.

* – Spaces per key calculated using "provided" [revised] traditional spaces divided by number of keys (i.e., guest units).

† – Interim Condition: "the number of parking spaces required to support the interim condition of the Resort with an expansion to the Jade Bar."

‡ – Ultimate Condition: a future condition "which includes the addition of guest rooms and spa area…20 additional guest rooms (Spa Suites) and the 1,350 square feet of additional spa area (Spa Pavilion)."

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

An addition of 45 bungalows is being proposed for The Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain Resort & Spa. The bungalows will be located within the area in which The Sanctuary's 41 rental Casita units are located. One free-standing cluster of three bungalows will be constructed on the site of a small existing swimming pool. The small pool will be replaced by a larger pool elsewhere in the casitas area. To accommodate the guests that rent the additional units, 17 new sparking spaces will be provided. This second amendment to CivTech's February 2013 Jade Bar parking analysis for the resort has assessed the effect of the proposed bungalows on parking at The Sanctuary.

From the above, the following can be concluded:

- No other parking spaces identified as ADA-compliant are required for the new bungalows.
- With 8 ADA-compliant spaces of a new total of 386 traditional parking spaces provided on site, The Sanctuary will continue to provide a sufficient number of ADA-compliant parking spaces on the property with the addition of the 45 proposed bungalows.
- The Sanctuary will be well-parked: in the interim and ultimate conditions, there will be 155 and 174 on-site guest units with 368 and 391 parking spaces provided, respectively. These yield ratios of 2.37 and 2.25 spaces per key or guest unit, nearly double the Town requirement of 1.20 spaces per key.

CivTech

- The addition of 45 new bungalows would increase the maximum need for parking spaces on The Sanctuary property to 340 spaces, a net increase of 53 spaces from the reported maximum of 287 under prior shared-parking analyses. The need would be greatest from 8 to 9 PM on a weekend. With a new expected total of 391 spaces on the property, there will be sufficient parking spaces at The Sanctuary to accommodate its parking needs.

Thank you. If you have any questions or comments, please contact me at (480) 659-4250.

Sincerely,

Joseph F. Spadafino, P.E., PTOE, PTP
Project Manager/Senior Traffic Engineer

CivTech

PROJECT DATA

Site: 268,235 sf = 6.2 acres

All Existing Units: 41 total = 53,300 sf
A Casitas   24 total = 31,200 sf
B Casitas   17 total = 22,100 sf

All New Units: 45 total = 20,666 sf (38.8%)
Infill A   4 total = 2,296 sf
Infill B   6 total = 3,180 sf
B2 lock-outs   3 total = 2,550 sf
End Bungalows   23 total = 9,085 sf
Cluster Bungalows 9 total = 3,555 sf

TOTAL UNITS   86 total = 73,966 sf

Total Parking: 97 spaces
Existing Parking   79 spaces
Added Parking   18 spaces

NOTE: On-site stormwater retention will
be provided for new additions/footprint.

5070 N. 40th St., Suite 140
Phoenix AZ 85016

R. NICHOLAS LOOPE, FAIA
ARCHITECT

7 relocated parking spaces
Existing parking Typ.

Casa 2 parking not included

6 new parking spaces

New Swimming Pool (see **A4**)
7 parking spaces relocated

Casa 2 parking not included

7' - 0" SETBACK TYP

7' - 0"

LANDSCAPE NOTE
NO NEW LANDSCAPE PLANTING WILL BE ADDED.
AFFECTED SIGNIFICANT PLANTS AND TREES WITHIN
CONSTRUCTION AREAS WILL BE RELOCATED NEARBY
AND CLEAR OF NEW STRUCTURES. ANY PLANT LOST
DURING CONSTRUCTION WILL BE REPLACED.

SITE LIGHTING NOTE
NEW STRUCTURES WILL NOT BE ILLUMINATED BY
EXTERNAL SITE LIGHTING. THE ONLY EXTERIOR
LIGHTING TO BE AT ENTRY/EGRESS DOORS AS
REQUIRED, TO MATCH EXISTING LIGHTING AND
COMPLIANT WITH DARK SKY ORDINANCES. PATHWAY
AND GROUND LANDSCAPE LIGHTING WILL BE
RELOCATED ONLY WHEN NECESSARY. ADDITIONAL
PATH LIGHTING IS NOT ANTICIPATED.
(SEE SHEET **A4** FOR PHOTOS OF FIXTURES)

Existing Parking Typ.

2-Story attached Bungalow Keys
adjacent to Existing Casita

Added Parking (2)

Infill Key under
Existing Casita
and Balcony

1-Story Freestanding Bungalow
Keys Cluster & 2 new parking spaces
after demo of part of Unit 24 & pool

2-Story attached Bungalow Keys
adjacent to Existing Casita

Infill Key under Existing
Casita and Balcony

1-Story attached Bungalow Key
adjacent to Existing Casita

Added Parking (8)

2-Story Freestanding
Bunglalow Keys Cluster

Infill Key under Existing Casita
and Balcony

SEE TYP ELEV 2/A3
SEE TYP ELEV 3/A3
SEE TYP ELEV 5/A3

205
172-02-048

217
172-02-054

265
172-02-077

223
172-02-059

225
172-02-058

227
172-02-057

229
172-02-056

233
172-02-062

255
172-02-075

261
172-02-072

235
172-02-061

241
172-02-066

247
172-02-071

249
172-02-070

251
172-02-069

253
172-02-068

273
172-02-081

277
172-02-085

281
172-02-083

Sanctuary Interstitial Keys
The Sanctuary Resort on Camelback Mountain

Project Site Plan

Project number   **1605**
Date   9 January 2017
Scale   1" = 40'-0"

A3
Attachment 1

Site Plan
1" = 40'-0"

N

Ultimate
(Spa Expansion with Bungalows)

WEEKEND

APPENDIX D
PEAK USE SHARED PARKING CALCULATIONS
WEEKEND

Land Use	Resort Guest Rooms		Resort Employees		Restaurant		Sanctuary — Conference		Sanctuary — Spa		Retail		Residential		TOTAL SPACES	SHARED PARKING DEMAND
Gross Size	174 125 Rooms		None		6,349 SF		6,211 SF		10,247 SF		640 SF		0 Units			
Percent Adjustment	None		None		None		None		None		None		None			
Net Size	174 Rooms		3,529 SF		6,349 SF		6,211 SF		10,247 SF		640 SF		48 Units			
Parking Rate	1.2 /Room		1 /300 SF		1 /50 SF		1 /50 SF		1 /300 SF		1 /300 SF		1.2 /Unit			
Req-d Spaces	210		15		45		113		19		2		0			
Adjustments	None		None		w/ 75% Non guest		w/ 90% Non-guest (ballroom) & 90% Non-guest (Lawn)		w/ 60% Non-guest		w/ 60% Non-guest		None			
Time of Day	% OF PEAK	# OF SPC	% OF PEAK	# OF SPC	% OF PEAK	# OF SPC	% OF PEAK	# OF SPC	% OF PEAK	# OF SPC	% OF PEAK	# OF SPC	% OF PEAK	# OF SPC	TOTAL SPACES	
6:00 AM	100%	210	60%	9	20%	9	0%	0	5%	1	0%	0	0%	0	229	
7:00 AM	100%	210	70%	11	20%	9	0%	0	10%	2	3%	1	0%	0	233	
8:00 AM	100%	210	100%	15	20%	9	50%	57	40%	8	10%	1	0%	0	300	
9:00 AM	70%	147	100%	15	20%	9	100%	113	55%	11	30%	1	0%	0	296	
10:00 AM	65%	137	100%	15	20%	9	100%	113	75%	15	45%	1	0%	0	290	
11:00 AM	65%	137	100%	15	30%	14	100%	113	90%	18	70%	2	0%	0	299	
12:00 PM	65%	137	100%	15	30%	14	100%	113	100%	19	85%	2	0%	0	300	
1:00 PM	65%	137	100%	15	45%	21	100%	113	100%	19	95%	2	0%	0	307	
2:00 PM	65%	137	100%	15	45%	21	100%	113	100%	19	100%	2	0%	0	307	
3:00 PM	65%	137	100%	15	45%	21	100%	113	100%	19	100%	2	0%	0	307	
4:00 PM	70%	147	100%	15	45%	21	100%	113	85%	17	90%	2	0%	0	315	
5:00 PM	75%	158	100%	15	60%	27	80%	91	65%	13	75%	2	0%	0	306	
6:00 PM	80%	168	85%	13	90%	41	80%	91	35%	7	65%	2	0%	0	322	
7:00 PM	90%	189	80%	12	95%	43	80%	91	15%	3	10%	1	0%	0	339	
8:00 PM	90%	189	75%	12	100%	45	80%	91	10%	2	10%	1	0%	0	340	
9:00 PM	90%	189	70%	11	100%	45	80%	91	5%	1	10%	1	0%	0	338	
10:00 PM	90%	189	60%	9	40%	18	80%	91	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	307	
11:00 PM	100%	210	50%	8	20%	9	80%	91	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	318	
MIDNIGHT	100%	210	50%	8	0%	0	80%	91	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	309	
Number of Parking Spaces With Shared Parking for Sanctuary																340
Number of Non-Shared Parking Spaces Required by City Code for Sanctuary																404