

TOWN *Of* **PARADISE VALLEY**



STAFF REPORT

TO: Chairman and Planning Commission Members

FROM: Lisa Collins, Community Development Director
Paul Michaud, Planning Manager
George Burton, Senior Planner

DATE: January 17, 2023

DEPARTMENT: Community Development
George Burton, Senior Planner 480-348-3525

AGENDA TITLE:
Verizon Wireless Conditional Use Permit (CUP-22-01) at Camelback Inn & Resort – 5402 E. Lincoln Drive

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Planning Commission approve the Conditional Use Permit (CUP-22-01) to allow the addition of personal wireless service facility antennas at the Camelback Inn, subject to the following stipulations:

1. All improvements to shall be substantially compliant with the project narrative and the following plans:
 - a. Project Narrative, Site/Project Name: PHO White-Wing/Project #20161493634, prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc.
 - b. Sheet T-1. Project Information, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - c. Sheet LS-1. Boundary Detail, Prepared by RLF Consulting and dated September 14, 2022.
 - d. Sheet LS-2. Topographic Survey, Prepared by RLF Consulting and dated September 14, 2022.
 - e. Sheet Z-1. Setback Plan, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - f. Sheet Z-2. Existing Overall Site Plan, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - g. Sheet Z-3. New Overall Site Plan, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - h. Sheet Z-4. New Enlarged Site Plan, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.

- i. Sheet Z-5. New Enlarged Antenna Plan, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - j. Sheet Z-6. Elevations, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - k. Sheet Z-7. Elevations, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - l. Sheet Z-8. Elevations, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - m. Sheet Z-9. Sight Line Elevation, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - n. Sheet Z-10. Sight Line Elevation, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
 - o. Sheet Z-11. Sight Line Elevation, Prepared by Pinnacle Consulting Inc and dated October 24, 2022.
2. Radio Frequency Exposure. RF Safety and NIER Analysis Report, Site PHO White Wing D, prepared by Pramira and date December 1, 2022.
 3. The wireless provider shall terminate operation of the proposed wireless service facility should it interfere with any emergency radio frequency.

SUMMARY STATEMENT

Request

Pinnacle Consulting, on behalf of Verizon Wireless, is requesting a Conditional Use Permit to allow the addition of personal wireless service facility antennas at the Camelback Inn. The proposal calls for the placement of seven antennas and nine radio heads on the ballroom building. The improvements will be placed on three areas or “sectors” of the building, will be concealed with textured and painted screens to match the building, and will not increase the height of the building:

- Alpha Sector. Two antennas and two radio heads will be placed at the southeast part of the ballroom building and are setback approximately fifty-nine feet from the nearest/adjoining residence.
- Beta Sector. Two antennas and five radio heads will be placed at the southwest part of the ballroom building and are setback approximately one-hundred and ninety feet from the nearest/adjoining residence.
- Gamma Sector. Three antennas and two radio heads placed at the northwest part of the ballroom building and are setback approximately two-hundred and eighteen feet from the nearest/adjoining residence.

A new equipment platform will also be placed on the southern part of the building and will be screened by the existing parapet.

Planning Commission Discussion

The Planning Commission reviewed the application at the December 20, 2022 work study session. The Commission asked questions regarding the RF Report and the applicant noted that the RF Engineer will attend the public hearing to answer any RF questions. No additional information or proposed changes were requested.

Background

In 1997, the Town Council approved Ordinance 437 which amended the Zoning Ordinance and established location, regulations, and development standards for Personal Wireless Service Facilities (PWSF). Section 1204 of the Town Zoning Ordinance states that a PWSF shall not be located closer than two-hundred-feet from a dwelling unit in existence at the time of the initial approval of the conditional use permit for such PWSF site. However, in accordance with Section 1211.I of the Zoning Ordinance, the applicant is requesting modified setbacks to allow the Alpha and Beta Sector improvements to be placed within the two-hundred-foot limit.

	Proposed Setback	Zoning Ordinance Setback
Alpha Sector	59'	200'
Beta Sector	190'	200'
Gamma Sector	218'	200'

Section 1211.I states that:

Where the Planning Commission finds that strict compliance with the requirements of this Article may result in extraordinary hardship or are needed to ensure the Town's compliance with Federal or state law, the Planning Commission may modify such requirements only upon a showing of noncompliance with applicable law or extraordinary hardship so that substantial justice may be done and the public interest secured. Hardship as used herein shall include, but not be limited to, a finding that special circumstances applicable to the property, including its size, shape, topography, location or surroundings, will deprive such property of privileges enjoyed by other property in the same classification in the same zoning district through the strict application of the zoning ordinance. In granting such modifications, the Planning Commission may require such conditions as will, in its judgment, secure substantially the objectives of the standards or requirements so varied and modified.

Based upon the applicant's analysis, placing the Alpha and Beta Sectors within the setback enables them to provide coverage without raising the height of the building and without obstructing views. Since the proposed improvements blend in with the design of the ballroom, do not increase the overall height of the building, and will comply with the FCC radio frequency emission requirements, staff supports the request.

DISCUSSION

Council Resolution 932 (adopted in February 1998, and recently amended by Resolution 2022-23) identifies the Camelback Golf Inn as a potential personal wireless facility site. The proposed Verizon Wireless facility will meet the following standards outlined in Article XII, Personal Wireless Service Facilities:

Site Location and Design:

1. The visual impact of the proposed antennas is minimal since the antennas will be concealed behind new screens. The new screens match the design of the building and will be painted the same color as the ballroom.
2. The related equipment should have no visual impact due to the location and screening by existing parapets.
3. Based on the information provided by the applicant, the antennas and associated equipment will not negatively impact the surrounding neighbors since the proposed improvements will not emit any odor, dust, gas, noise, vibration, smoke, heat or glare.
4. An environmental assessment is required in instances where any of the following exist on the subject site: wilderness area, wildlife preserve, endangered species, historical site, Indian religious site, flood plain, high intensity white lights, or excessive RF exposure. None of the aforementioned exists on the site and thus, no environmental assessment is required pursuant to the National Environmental Policy Act.

Radiofrequency Performance and Interference Standards:

The antenna and associated equipment must meet Federal Communication Commission (FCC) guidelines for radiofrequency (RF) performance. The applicant provided documentation from their RF Engineer stating the site will be compliant with the FCC rules and regulations if mitigation details are implemented (e.g. use of signage and barriers/markers).

Wireless antennas are prohibited in creating localized interference. Wireless antennas use a frequency band that is much different than the frequencies for telephone, radio, and emergency services, making interference unlikely. However, as a safeguard, staff added a stipulation identifying that “the wireless provider shall terminate operation of the proposed wireless service facility should it interfere with any emergency radio frequency.”

Co-Location

Other service providers may utilize different areas of the ballroom and T-Mobile currently has antennas on the building. However, these proposed antennas and radio heads are designed solely for Verizon Wireless and cannot accommodate additional service providers.

Community Impact

The impact to the surrounding properties will be minimal. The proposed improvements will be screened and will be compliant with the FCC standards on RF exposure. Verizon’s proposed locations/sectors at the Camelback Inn will improve coverage for the provider in the area.

Public Comment

Public notification is done in accordance with the public hearing process; in which all property owners located within a 1,500-foot radius of the resort will be notified of the public hearing in accordance with the public hearing process. Staff received several inquiries regarding the scope of the improvements and questions if the new antennas will improve their cell phone coverage.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. Staff Report
- B. Vicinity Map & Aerial
- C. Application
- D. Narrative & Plans
- E. Photo Simulations
- F. RF Safety and NIER Analysis Report
- G. RF Design Analysis
- H. Resolution 932
- I. Notification Materials

- C: - Graham Chapman (Applicant)
 - Case File: CUP 22-01