

CRITERIA TABLE
Cottontail Run Road Private Roadway Gate (SUP-21-02)
June 9, 2022

CRITERIA	PROPOSED PRIVATE ROADWAY GATE
Bulk, Density & Design Standards (SUP Guidelines)	
Appearance architecturally and aesthetically compatible with adjacent buildings, structures, and landscaping	Complies. Subjective, but proposed materials have a Light Reflective Value (LRV) less than 38% to match the hillside homes that will access the private roadway gate. The stone, landscaping, and architectural style is compatible to the adjoining <u>Paradise Valley Country Club</u> entry improvements.
Turnaround outside gate meeting Town standards for cul-de-sacs	Generally Complies. The paved area meets the cul-de-sac standard of Section 6-3-2.B of the Town Code (which is the guideline for private roadway gates) having a paved radius of 40 feet. Including the landscaping and retention area easement the proposal meets the 45-foot right-of-way radius suggested as there is an additional 6 feet of turnaround in front of the proposed retaining wall for an emergency vehicle to safely turnaround in front of the gate and support of the turnaround dimensions meeting safety standards per the Traffic Study. Secondary emergency turnaround access is also provided after the gate. All gates require a key box for emergency access. Cul-de-sacs and other private roadway elements are typically in a private tract, with the proposed turn-around in an easement. However, the private roadway gate criteria are guidelines dependent on the specific request and Section 5-10-7.B of the Town Code allows easements when dedication renders the property in violation of Town zoning laws (e.g., shape and size).
Gate setback minimum of 150 feet from centerline of nearest intersecting street	Complies. The proposed gate is 222 feet 8 inches from the centerline of Tatum Boulevard. In past private roadway gate requests, the preferred minimum standard is 150 feet from the back of curb to the gate. However, each request varies based on the number of homes accessing the gate, the traffic and design of the adjoining public road, and location of the call box which is 128 feet 7 inches from the back of curb along Tatum Boulevard. The vehicle stacking capacity due to the gate and call box locations are supported per the submitted traffic study.
Guardhouse/Gatehouse no higher than 16 feet and 250 square feet	Not applicable. There is no proposed guardhouse or gatehouse. This will be an unmanned access gate via keypad access.
Gate no higher than 8 feet	Complies. The entry gate consists of two columns that are 5 feet 6 inches tall and two gates that are 7 feet tall measured from grade to the top of the finished portion of the gate.
Pedestrian and non-motorized vehicle access provided adjacent to the roadway access	Complies. The area north of the gate will remain open whereby someone can access as illustrated on the Conceptual Elevations. The hardscape surface is the decomposed granite ground cover, not a specified path.

CRITERIA TABLE
Cottontail Run Road Private Roadway Gate (SUP-21-02)
June 9, 2022

Signs (SUP Guidelines)	
One wall sign not to exceed 6 feet in height or 6 square feet	Not applicable. No signage is proposed.
Ground signs not to exceed 4 feet in height or 2 square feet each	Generally Complies. The proposal includes two signs. [1] A one square foot sign (1' x 1') on the call box with emergency/ contact information, mounted 5 feet to the top of the sign. This sign meets the sign area, but is one-foot taller than the guideline. The added height aids visibility to a driver stopped at the call box. [2] A second sign of four square feet (1.5' x 2.6') in the island with the call box illustrating the guest travel lane and resident travel lane for drivers entering off Tatum Boulevard mounted approximately 3 feet 6 inches from grade. This sign is larger in sign area, but meets the height guideline. The increased sign area aids in visibility as a driver approaches off Tatum Boulevard.
Lighting (SUP Guidelines)	
Light emitting element must be shielded so that no light extends above a horizontal plane; be hooded and shielded, not direct light on adjacent property	Complies. There are a total of 18 light fixtures proposed. 16 of these fixtures are up lights which this provision does not apply (except for the not directing light onto adjacent property) and a total of two ornamental lights proposed one on each gate column. The proposed lighting will meet all Town lighting provisions in accordance with the narrative and lighting details provided.
Up lights 300 lumens or less	Complies. Proposed up lights at 300 lumens.
Outdoor pole lights maximum 16-foot tall and setback height of device	Not applicable. No pole fixtures proposed.
Lighting within residential setbacks limited to 0.5 foot candles at the property line and 3-foot maximum height	Complies. Lighting associated with the private roadway gate located on 7117 N Tatum Boulevard (area of the turnaround easement) is at ground level, directed away from the residential property line, less than 300 lumens, and under 3-foot tall. This criteria is not applicable to the four up lights and two ornamental lights on the gate columns, being these are in the private roadway tract.

CRITERIA TABLE
Cottontail Run Road Private Roadway Gate (SUP-21-02)
June 9, 2022

Retaining Walls (Section 2407, Zoning Ordinance)	
Only for containing fill material or for minimizing cut or fill slopes	Complies. Necessary to prevent erosion and contain fill to accommodate turnaround.
6-foot maximum height	Complies. 4-foot maximum proposed
Finished materials such as stucco, brick, stone, metal, rails, wood, or tile	Complies. Stone-veneered with a limestone color and LRV under 38% similar to hillside since adjoining hillside.
Meet setback requirements of Section 2404, unless deemed necessary to prevent erosion	Complies. 20-foot minimum from the property line proposed, 20-foot setback required from walls 3-foot to 6-foot tall on a side yard adjoining a right-of-way. Lesser setback allowable when needed for erosion control.
Fence walls may be located on top of the retaining material provided view fences have a 5-foot separation (10-foot other wall types) & combined walls 8-foot tall (unless pool barrier)	Complies. The proposed turnaround requires that 76 lineal feet of the existing pool barrier be removed and replaced. The owner will replace the pool barrier with a 6-foot tall view fence separated 10 feet from the turnaround retaining wall.
Statement of Direction (SOD)*	
The General Plan discourages the installation of private roadway gates. However, if a gate is allowed, the roadway must be private. Cottontail Run Road is a private roadway and has existed without a private roadway gate for decades without much incidence. A private roadway gate may be justified to prevent wayward traffic from utilizing the private roadway in that East Cottontail Run Road adjoins Tatum Boulevard and it is a 20-foot wide paved road that provides access to several hillside homes with no access to other public streets.	<p>Complies. A comprehensive evaluation of the Special Use Permit Criteria and SOD is considered when approving private roadway gates since the General Plan discourages such gates and the Zoning Code requires the more robust review by a Planning Commission/Town Council review process.</p> <p>Some of the reasons to support a private roadway gate on Cottontail Run Road include the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposal meets the majority of the Special Use Permit guidelines. Where it does not fully meet (i.e., right-of-way 45-foot radius turnaround), the traffic study finds that the proposed geometrics, emergency vehicle accommodation, and queuing meets required safety provisions. • There are special characteristics specific to Cottontail Run Road. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The street is a private road that existed before incorporation with no direct access to any other public streets. ○ It adjoins the Paradise Valley Country Club parking area/access gate which drivers may think accesses the club property. ○ It adjoins a major arterial like other approved private roadway gates.

CRITERIA TABLE
Cottontail Run Road Private Roadway Gate (SUP-21-02)
June 9, 2022

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The street rises in elevation and later drops restricting visibility that the road dead ends into a cul-de-sac designed to hillside standards (narrow width (20') and reduced paved cul-de-sac) that may benefit from restricting access for less wear & tear/maintenance.
The visioning process in both the 2012 General Plan and current 2022 General Plan process emphasizes quality of life issues of Town residents such as preserving a sense of privacy, providing high-quality public safety services, maintaining dark skies and protection against increased noise and air pollution and blighted properties that private roadway gates may enhance for a particular neighborhood based on their locational characteristics.	<p>Complies. Subjective, however, the proposed private roadway gate according to the applicant will enhance the quality of life for the owner of the private roadway gate and the homeowners within the gated area by providing a physical barrier to mitigate potential burglaries, a sense of security to the homeowners, reduction of opportunities for incidents/accidents on the private roadway which reduces liability of the owner of the private road, and less vehicular traffic to help out on maintenance costs.</p> <p>The applicant noted a prior theft occurring in the central mailbox for the homeowners which is located near Tatum Boulevard. Also, Chief Wingert noted that E Cottontail Run was part of a neighborhood traffic enforcement plan in the 4th Quarter of 2019 through the 1st Quarter of 2020, noting one traffic complaint near the area of the proposed gate. It is not uncommon for issues to arise that go unreported.</p>
This private roadway gate request is being considered because East Cottontail Run Road is a private roadway, not a public roadway	<p>Complies. The proposed gate is on an existing private roadway approved under Maricopa County jurisdiction prior to incorporation into the Town of Paradise Valley in 1982. Cottontail Run Road is not a public road.</p>
Safe conditions related to vehicle stacking (particularly preventing impact onto Tatum Boulevard).	<p>Complies. Based on the traffic study provided, this study finds that the proposed geometrics, emergency vehicle accommodation, and queuing meets required safety provisions despite having a turnaround right-of-way radius less than the typical 45 feet. Being that this proposed gated community accommodates 10 homes (9 existing, 1 potentially future home, and the traffic study conservatively modeling 12 homes), vehicle stacking is not expected to be an issue as experienced with other larger gated communities of 100 or more homes or gated communities with manned gated areas that restrict access at certain times of the day. The stacking distance to the call box accommodates 5 vehicles and 2 vehicles pulling trailers (and excludes the capacity of the second through lane for residents and others who do not require stopping at the call box).</p>
Amble turnaround area for emergency access and other vehicles.	<p>Complies. The applicant provided a traffic study with metrics showing that there is proper turning area for emergency and other vehicles. This includes turnaround in front of the gate and secondary turnaround access after passing through the gate.</p>

CRITERIA TABLE
Cottontail Run Road Private Roadway Gate (SUP-21-02)
June 9, 2022

Height, location, and design of all structures (i.e., retaining wall and gates) such that these are compatible with the surrounding area and nearby hillside properties. In particular, preference is that the private roadway gate improvements meet Special Use Permit Guidelines (i.e. gate height of 8-foot tall) unless there are compelling reasons to deviate from the guideline recommendations.	Complies. Both the 4-foot maximum height and minimum 20-foot setback of the retaining wall meets Town requirements for a retaining wall located along the side yard of a right-of-way as noted in the Retaining Walls section of this table. The gate complies with the private roadway gate guidelines as described in the Bulk, Density & Design Standards of this table. The selected stone veneer has a Light Reflective Value (LRV) less than 38% to match the requirement of the hillside homes that will access the private roadway gate.
Landscaping that is drought tolerant, provides seasonal color, and will not negatively impact views from neighboring properties	Complies. The proposed landscaping is all drought tolerant (i.e., palo verde trees, lantana, leucophyllum (sage), and trumpet vine). These selected plants are ground cover and shrubs, with the palo verde tree typical of desert trees allowing for filtered view through the canopy. The proposed plant palette offers a variety of color. The plant material and design (e.g. use of stone on the gate columns and retaining wall) is also consistent with the nearby Visually Significant Corridors Master Plan (VSC) along Tatum Boulevard. Cottontail Run Road accesses Tatum Boulevard at the Resort Living Character Zone.
Lighting that is the minimum needed for safety and security	Complies. The proposal includes a total of 18 ground-mounted up light fixtures and two wall-mounted ornamental wall fixtures on the gate columns. 16 of the 18 up lights will illuminate trees, with such illumination occurring within the vicinity of the call box and gate areas. These proposed fixtures comply with the maximum lumen provisions of 300 lumens for the up lights and 750 lumens for the wall mount fixtures. The lighting will also meet the Town's preference of a warm color temperature with a maximum of 2700 Kelvins. If necessary, the approval could require that the applicant provide a photometric plan. Based on Special Use Permit Guidelines, entrance roadways are suggested to have a light level of 5.0 foot-candles.
Demonstrated effort by the applicant to document support for the proposed gate from neighboring property owners on Cottontail Run Road.	Complies. The applicant meet with and noticed the property owners on Cottontail Run Road several times. This included preparing a private agreement to address long-term administration, operations, financial assurance, and related matters.