# Meeting Notice and Agenda <br> Board of Adjustment 

## 1. CALL TO ORDER

2. ROLL CALL

Notice is hereby given that members of the Public Body will attend either in person or by telephone conference call, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431(4).

## 3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

The Public Body may convene into an executive session at one or more times during the meeting as needed to confer with the Town Attorney for legal advice regarding any of the items listed on the agenda as authorized by A.R.S. §38-431.03.A.3.

## 4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

Work/Study is open to the public however the following items are scheduled for discussion only. The Public Body will be briefed by staff and other Town representatives. There will be no votes and no final action taken on discussion items. The Public Body may give direction to staff and request that items be scheduled for consideration and final action at a later date. The order of discussion items and the estimated time scheduled to hear each item is subject to change.

## 5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

The Public Body may take action on this item.

## 6. ACTION ITEMS

The Public Body may take action on this item.
A. 19-143 Hayden Variance - 4202 E Desert Crest Drive (APN: 169-19-005B)

Case No. BA-19-03 a variance to Article X of the Town of Paradise
Valley Zoning Ordinance to allow for an addition to encroach on height and into the rear setback
Staff Contact: $\quad$ George Burton, 480-348-3525
Attachments: $\quad$ Vicinity \& Aerial
Application
Narrative and Plans
Noticing Materials
B. 19-144 Schick Residence-6318 N 52nd Place (APN 169-27-033)

Case No. BA-19-04 a variance to Article X of the Town of Paradise

|  | Valley Zoning Ordinance to allow for an addition that does not <br> meet the rear setback |
| :--- | :--- |
| Staff Contact: | George Burton, Planner, 480-348-3525 |
| Attachments: | Vicinity Map \& Aerial Photo |
|  | Application |
|  | Narrative and Plans |
|  | $\underline{\text { Noticing Materials }}$ |
| $\underline{19-148}$ | Selection of Chairperson per Section 2-5-3 of the Town Code |

## 7. CONSENT AGENDA

All items on the Consent Agenda are considered by the Public Body to be routine and will be enacted by a single motion. There will be no separate discussion of these items. If a Commissioner or member of the public desires discussion on any item it will be removed from the Consent Agenda and considered separately.
A. $19-146$

Attachments: $\quad$ 02-06-19 Minutes Draft

## 8. STAFF REPORTS

## 9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

## 10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

## 11. ADJOURNMENT

AGENDA IS SUBJECT TO CHANGE
*Notice is hereby given that pursuant to A.R.S. §1-602.A.9, subject to certain specified statutory exceptions, parents have a right to consent before the State or any of its political subdivisions make a video or audio recording of a minor child. Meetings of the Planning Commission are audio and/or video recorded, and, as a result, proceedings in which children are present may be subject to such recording. Parents in order to exercise their rights may either file written consent with the Town Clerk to such recording, or take personal action to ensure that their child or children are not present when a recording may be made. If a child is present at the time a recording is made, the Town will assume that the rights afforded parents pursuant to A.R.S. §1-602.A. 9 have been waived.

The Town of Paradise Valley endeavors to make all public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. With 72 hours advance notice, special assistance can also be provided for disabled persons at public meetings. Please call 480-948-7411 (voice) or 480-483-1811 (TDD) to request accommodation to participate in the Planning Commission meeting.

## Action Report

File \#: 19-143

## TO: Chair and Board of Adjustment

FROM: Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director Paul Michaud, Senior Planner George Burton, Planner

DATE: April 3, 2019

## CONTACT:

George Burton, 480-348-3525

## AGENDA TITLE:

Hayden Variance - 4202 E Desert Crest Drive (APN: 169-19-005B)
Case No. BA-19-03 a variance to Article X of the Town of Paradise Valley Zoning Ordinance to allow for an addition to encroach on height and into the rear setback

## A. MOTION FOR APPROVAL

I move for [approval] of Case No. BA-19-03, a request by the Hayden Family Trust, property owner of 4202 E Desert Crest Drive; for a variance from the Zoning Ordinance, Article X, Height and Area Regulations, to allow additions to an existing residence to encroach into the setbacks and to encroach into the height limitation and 2) allow an existing detached garage to be attached to the primary residence and encroach into the setback. The variance shall be in compliance with the submitted plans and documents:

1. The Variance Criteria Narrative, prepared by 180 degrees a design + build company, dated March 18, 2019;
2. Site Plan, Sheet a1.11, prepared by 180 degrees a design + build company, dated March 18, 2019;
3. Building Elevations, Sheet a2.01, prepared by 180 degrees a design + build company, dated March 4, 2019;
4. Floor Plan, Sheet a141, prepared by 180 degrees a design + build company, dated February 15, 2019;
5. Roof Plan, Sheet a1.41, prepared by 180 degrees a design + build company, dated March 4, 2019; and
6. Topographic Survey, prepared by Alliance Land Surveying LLC, date sealed by G. Bryan Goetzberger on August 7, 2018.

## Reasons for Approval:

I find that there are special circumstances, applicable to only the subject lot, meeting the variance

File \#: 19-143
criteria.

## B. MOTION FOR DENIAL

I move for [denial] of Case No. BA-19-03, a request by the Hayden Family Trust, property owner of 4202 E Desert Crest Drive; for a variance from the Zoning Ordinance, Article X, Height and Area Regulations, to allow additions to an existing residence to encroach into the setbacks and to encroach into the height limitation and 2) allow an existing detached garage to be attached to the primary residence and encroach into the setback.

## Reasons for Denial:

I find that the variance requested does not meet the variance criteria.

## BACKGROUND

## Request

The applicant requests a variance from the Zoning Ordinance, Article X, Height and Area Regulations, to allow additions to an existing residence to encroach into the setbacks and to encroach into the height limitation and 2) allow an existing detached garage to be attached to the primary residence and encroach into the setback.

Section 1001 of the Town Zoning Ordinance requires the house to be setback a minimum of 40' from the rear property line. The variance itself relates to the expansion of the existing garage and its attachment to the home. The detached garage currently complies with the 16' maximum height and 20' rear yard setback for an accessory structure. By incorporating the existing garage with the new home addition onto the existing house there will be approximately 339 square feet of the proposed garage addition within the 40' rear yard setback. This includes 257 square feet for the garage and 82 square feet for the roof overhang. The rear yard setback is 30 ' 2 " to the garage and $28^{\prime \prime} 4^{\prime \prime}$ to the roof overhang.

Almost half of the existing home encroaches into the 40' rear yard setback. The rear yard setback of this existing home varies to a minimum of 19 '9" to the house and 15 ' 8 " to the roof overhang. The applicant's narrative states that the proposed renovations are $40 \%$ of the existing square footage. As such, the existing home encroachment may remain pursuant to Section 2307. The proposed variance acknowledges that these existing encroachments exist.

Section 2307. Structural alternations, refurbishing, or remodeling of existing Nonconforming Structures shall not result in an increase in any existing encroachment over current setbacks or result in an increase in the height of the reconstructed, refurbished, or remodeled structure over the actual height of the nonconforming portion of the existing structure or result in an increase in any other nonconforming aspect. Permissible alterations or additions to Nonconforming Structures shall vary based upon whether the alteration or addition is for a structural demolition or a new addition, as provided for below:
A. Structural Demolitions: When permits are approved for structural remodels, alterations, or repairs (excluding such nonstructural cosmetic items as painting, flooring, cabinets, or appliances), covered by a single or multiple building permits issued within a thirty ix (36) month period that together covers work which exceeds fifty (50) percent of the original square

File \#: 19-143
footage of an existing Nonconforming Structure, such Nonconforming Structure shall be made to conform to the requirements for new structures. For the purposes of this section, the term "Square Footage" means the aggregate of the area of all floors in a structure, whether at or above established grade, measured between the exterior faces of the exterior walls of the structure.
B. New additions: All new additions to the existing Nonconforming Structure shall be in compliance with all current Zoning Code provisions.

The other component of the variance relates to height. This is the circumstance that the garage encroachment into the rear setback is the volume of the building. The other height variance relates to the west end of the home addition that penetrates the Open Space Criteria (OSC) of the Zoning Ordinance. The OSC criterion maintains view corridors around the perimeter of a lot by further limiting building height near property lines. Maximum allowable structure height shall not exceed a plane beginning at 16' above the natural grade, at 20' setback from all property lines and sloping upward at a $20 \%$ angle, perpendicular to the nearest property line. The proposed encroachment is approximately 1.2 ' at 22 square feet of horizontal encroachment. A visual is shown on the south elevation of Sheet a2.01.

The variance notice included a variance request from Article XXIV, Walls and Fences, to allow existing terraced retaining walls to remain and exceed the minimum separation requirements. This variance related to the existing retaining walls south of the pool. However, after additional survey information was provided on the 10' wall separation, it was determined these walls comply with the Zoning Ordinance. There is no variance request regarding these walls.

## Lot - Building Height Conditions

The property is zoned R-43 and is approximately 52,282 square feet in size ( 1.2 acres). The property is four sided, with the street side at an angle that reduces the lot depth on the west side of this lot. The building area depth on this lot along the west is 83 ' as compared to 208 feet along the east side of this lot. A typical building area depth is approximately 180 feet. The subject site is not hillside, but the adjoining lots to the west and north are designated as hillside.

The existing square footage under roof is 7,303 square feet, including roof overhangs. The proposed home will be 10,676 square feet under roof, including roof overhangs. The existing and proposed home with renovations will remain single story. The building height measured from grade is $17{ }^{\prime \prime} 2^{\prime \prime}$. The Town measures height from the lowest natural grade underneath the home to the top of the finished roof. Due to the sprawling nature of this home, the maximum height is 23 ' $53 / 8^{\prime \prime}$. This maximum height is under the maximum allowable height of $24^{\prime}$.

## Lot History

The subject property is not within a recorded subdivision. The Town annexed this property in 1982.
The following is a chronological history of the property:

- October 10, 2014. Building permit issued for gas line.
- May 14, 2014. Building permit issued for gas line to fireplace.
- May 11, 2005. Building permit issued for gas line.

File \#: 19-143

- February 13, 2004. Building permit issued, work not noted on the permit.
- November 21, 2003. Building permit issued for masonry wall.
- November 19, 2003. Building permit issued for retaining walls.
- July 21,1998 . Building permit for interior remodel.
- November 6, 1986. Building permit issued for addition.
- August 25, 1986. Building permit issued for addition.
- June 9, 1982. Electrical permit issued.
- May 6, 1982. Building permit issued for addition and remodel.

There is no building permit on file for the original construction of the house. The Maricopa County Assessor lists the house construction as 1985. However, this is likely due to the additions finished in 1986. Historical aerials show a house at similar setbacks as far back as 1969. The applicant's narrative states the home was originally built in 1962.

## DISCUSSION/ FACTS:

Variance criteria:
Town Code and Arizona Revised Statutes set criteria an applicant must meet before a Board of Adjustment may grant a variance request. If the Board finds an applicant meets all of these criteria, the Board may grant the variance. However, if the Board finds the applicant does not meet all of the criteria, the Board may not grant the variance. The following are staff's findings with regard to such variance criteria.

1. "Such variance... will serve not merely as a convenience to the applicant, but [is] necessary to alleviate some demonstrable hardship or difficulty so great as to warrant a variance under the circumstances." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)2).

## Findings in Favor (FIFs):

The hardship was placed on the existing residence when the R-43 District was applied to this property many years after the existing home was built and later annexed into the Town of Paradise Valley. The footprint of the existing home has been relatively the same since the home was originally built in 1962.

The applicant is trying to improve the house while utilizing existing conditions, including having direct access from the garage to the home instead of its existing configuration as a detached structure. Only 339 square feet of the total 3,373 square feet of the new addition to this home requires a variance. The variance is to expand the existing 2-car garage to a 4-car garage. 4car garages are a common amenity on Paradise Valley homes.

The location of the existing driveway, existing garage entry at the rear yard and existing rear yard encroachments of the home are not changing. This existing driveway condition and existing rear yard encroachments of the home limit options to expand the garage. Additionally, the finished floor of the existing garage is 1,447 ' and the slope of the land south of the garage to add an addition drops to $1,441^{\prime}$ as the lot continues to slope downward toward Desert Crest Drive. As described in the applicant's narrative, shifting the addition further south will impact the lowest natural grade underneath the home likely resulting in requiring a variance to exceed the 24 ' maximum height from natural grade.

File \#: 19-143

Similarly, the small encroachment into the OSC is impacted by the site slope. The applicant's narrative states this slope limits placement of the new addition and the nonconforming aspects of the home do not allow for the new bedroom to be placed in a reasonable and accessible location.

## Findings Opposed (FOPs):

The size, shape, and topography of the lot do not prevent the applicant from remodeling the home. Options exist to reduce the proposed addition to either move the garage addition further south or keep the addition to the current detached garage as an accessory structure. As an accessory structure this changes the allowable rear yard setback from 40' to 20' and reduces the overall area underneath the structure in measuring height from natural grade. However, as an attached structure to the home, moving the garage addition further south to comply with a 40' rear yard setback would likely require retaining walls due to the slope of this lot near the garage and may require reducing the size of the addition to avoid exceeding the 24' height measured from natural grade underneath the structure.
2. The "special circumstances, hardship, or difficulty [do not] arise out of misunderstanding or mistake..." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)4(b)).

## FIFs:

The hardship is not out of mistake or misunderstanding. The reduced building area depth of this lot along the west half of this property, the slope of the property, the existing driveway configuration to the rear yard and existing rear yard setback encroachments of the home are not the result of any misunderstanding or mistake.

## FOPs:

The applicant should be aware of all special circumstances on the property and plan any designs accordingly.
3. "Such variance from ... the strict application of the terms of [the Zoning Ordinance] ... are in harmony with its general purposes and intents..." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)2).

## FIFs:

The intent of the Zoning Ordinance is to provide visual openness, limit visual impact to the natural landscape and maintain view corridors. The applicant points out that the area of the proposed encroachment is on the northern side of the existing residence and the addition will have limited visual impact from the street. The adjoining residential lots to the north are at a higher elevation and maintain clear views to the south as the home will maintain its single level height. The proposed garage encroachment will not exceed the rear yard setback of the existing garage.

## FOPs:

The request does not meet the intent of the code since other alternatives exist. The proposed addition can be reduced in size to either move the garage addition further south or keep the addition to the current detached garage as an accessory structure that has an allowable rear

File \#: 19-143

## yard setback of 20'

4. "The special circumstances, hardship or difficulty applicable to the property are [not] selfimposed by the property owner, or predecessor..." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)4).

## FIFs:

The request is not self-imposed. The property owner is trying to improve the house while utilizing the existing conditions. The west portion of the property is more impacted than other similar lots on buildable area depth. Challenges exist in adding onto the 2-car garage utilizing the existing driveway and garage located in the rear yard. The applicant's narrative notes that the home was built in 1962 before annexation and application of the zoning limitations on this site.

## FOPs:

The request is self-imposed since other design options can be used to help the applicant achieve the goal adding onto the home and expanding the garage.
5. Because of special circumstances applicable to the property, including its size, shape, topography, location, or surroundings, the strict application of the Zoning Ordinance will deprive such property of privileges enjoyed by other property of the same classification in the same zoning district." (Arizona Revised Statutes 9-462.06(G)(2)).

## FIFs:

The applicant's narrative states the special circumstance of the pre-existing setback encroachment, existing orientation of the existing home, access and limited buildable area require minimal encroachment into the setback and related height restrictions.

The subject site is not hillside. The slope of this site is close to the $10 \%$ slope used to define a hillside property. The slope of the subject site varies $8 \%$ to $9 \%$. This change in grade plus the circumstances in maintaining the driveway, garage location and existing house configuration create special circumstances that maintains visual openness for adjoining property owners.

## FOPs:

The size, shape, and topography of the property do not prevent the applicant from adding onto the home. The proposed addition can be reduced in size to either move the garage addition further south or keep the addition to the current detached garage as an accessory structure that has an allowable rear yard setback of 20'
6. The variance would not "constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with the limitations upon other properties in the vicinity and zone in which such property is located." (Arizona Revised Statutes 9-462.06(G)(2)).

## FIFs:

The proposed garage encroachment and OSC encroachment have limited visual impact since the house is situated lower than the homes behind it and setback further from the street than the minimum setback of $40^{\prime}$. The request is also in character with the neighborhood since

File \#: 19-143
other homes in the area encroach into the setbacks as shown in the aerial map provided by the applicant.

## FOPs:

Arizona Revised Statutes and the Town Code do not require the most optimal or profitable use of a property. Also, all other properties in the area must meet maintain or improve their nonconforming structures in accordance with the Town Zoning Ordinance.

COMMENTS: Staff received one inquiry from the neighbor south of this property. Attached is an email summarizing his comments.

COMMUNITY IMPACT: None.
FISCAL IMPACT None.
CODE VIOLATIONS: None.
ATTACHMENTS
Vicinity Map \& Aerial Photo
Application
Narrative and Plans
Noticing Materials
C: Jerry Park (Applicant)
Case File BA-19-03

## Vicinity Map



## Subject Property



## APPLICATION TO BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT FOR VARIANCE

DATE：FEK 15 20 19
LOCATION OFPROPERTY：$\frac{4 \pi C \lambda ~ E, ~ D E S E R T ~ C R E S T ~ D R I V E, ~}{\text { ADDRESS }}$ PARADISE VALLEY，AZ 85253

LEGAL DESCRIPTION：LOT6．SECTION T，TOWNSHIP 2 NORTH，
RANGEE 4 EAST OF THE GILA ANS SANT RIVER BASE ANY MERIDLAN， OWNER：AMANDA HAYDEN $\times \frac{\text { Altayk }}{\text { SIGNATURE }}$ $\frac{4202 \text { EDESERT OREST DR PARADISE VAULEY }}{42646334}$

## ENGINEER／OTHER：

PRINTED NAME
X
SIGNATURE
ADDRESS
PHONE\＃

APPLICANT／

4955 NORTH 7 Th AUE，FHOENIX，AZ 850 L 3 ADDRESS
602， $288,0.138$

802，スフス，1166
FAX \＃
THE ABOVE APPLICANT HEREBY APPLIES FOR A VARIANCE ASINDICATED BELOW IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE ZONING ORDINANCE AND SECTION 2－5－3 OF THE CODE OF ORDINANCES OF THE TOWN OF PARADISE VALLEY．

STATE HARDSHIP INVOLVED OR GROUNDS FOR APPEAL TO THE BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT．（Please atach additional sheets as necessary）．
THE PROJECT IS LEGALKY NON-CONFCRMNG, SLOFE AND LIMITPD ALLESS

GF THE SITE CREATE HARBSHIP THAT PROHIBITS FROM METT的G THE ANARENT ZONING CROINANEE．PLI二ASE REFI次 TO ATIACHED NARAATIUE．

## hayden residence | 18044.r04

```
project location
4202 E Desert Crest Dr
Paradise Valley. AZ 95253
parcel 169-19-005B
March 18 \({ }^{\text {th }}, 2019\)
To whom it may concern,
```


## Project summary:

The project being considered by and presented to the board consist of the expansion of the current 1962 single family, single story home to accommodate the growing needs of the family. The existing home contains approximately 4,389 sf of livable area to which the new program will add 1,960 sf of livable space as well as an additional 450sf of new garage space.

## Existing conditions:

A majority of the existing, original residence and detached garage is currently located within the rear yard setback as represented in the attached plan documents. The existing home and existing garage were constructed within the rear yard setback prior to the current ordinance requirements being applied to this site, as such creating this legal non-conformity.
While this site does not exist within the hillside district of Paradise Valley, the site does have significant slope (9\% average) to consider along the west, north and east boundaries which does impact available and logical design solutions as it relates to access and drainage. Additionally, access to the existing garage occurs on the uphill side of the site adding some complexities to expansion. The home, as typical in the mid-century era, was designed and constructed in a very linear fashion. The primary entry is placed on the uphill side of the site within the existing setback, again additional challenges to expansion. The placement of the home (within the setback) coupled with the natural slope of the site, entry location and patio amenities and new zoning ordinances being placed on this existing condition limit expansion potential and create a hardship not imposed by the homeowner.

## Proposed renovation:

Considering the above existing conditions, the project is limited in the potential expansion due to a combination of the zoning district requirements, time the house was constructed and site conditions. An effort has been made to keep the new bedrooms for the growing family relatively close and connected as well as limit needs for variances to the current zoning ordinance. Additionally, the new expansion makes an effort to limit disturbance to the existing natural desert on the south portion of the site. These efforts are represented in the proposed expansion plans attached to this request. Specifically, we will be expanding the existing residence to the west as stated above. The amount of new square footage encroaching into the rear yard setback has been limited to 145 sf of the total 2410 sf gross being added.

## Existing residence:

Please note that the interior renovation work to the existing residence is limited to $40 \%$ of the existing square footage therefore is allowed to remain non-conforming per the Zoning Ordinance Section 2307. There is no increase in building footprint and height to the existing residence. The nature of work is interior alterations, refurbishing, and remodeling.

## The request:

The Owner, through this proposal and attached documents, request a variance to the following:

## Encroachment \#1-Setback of existing non-conforming garage:

Maintain encroachment of the existing garage into the required 40 ' rear yard setback by 10 ' for 257 sf gross plus 82 sf gross roof overhang. The scope of renovation of the existing garage is as follows:

1. Existing garage scope:
a. Interior renovation to $64 \%$ of the existing garage.
b. Interior finishes of the existing garage.
c. Exterior modifications to the roof and exterior wall of the existing garage to attach the new garage addition. The roof height will remain as is with the new addition roof height matching the existing.
2. Minimal impact to encroachment
a. The existing garage is encroaching 10 ' into the 40 ' setback line therefore is still within the 20 ' setback line.
b. The total of 339 sf of encroachment is only $3.2 \%$ of the overall square footage of the project (10,676sf).

## Encroachment \#2 - Setback requirements for new garage:

Allow for encroachment of the new garage addition (not including existing garage as defined in Setback Encroachment \#1) into the required 40 ft rear yard setback by 9 ft for 145 sf gross plus 82 sf gross overhang.

1. New garage scope
a. Match existing garage height and architecture
2. Property hardship not allowing compliance
a. The site is sloped so that the addition of the garage could not be constructed in a location allowing for direct access to the home on the same level if constructed in an alternate distant location.
b. To comply with the setback, the entire new addition will have to shift more than 9' to the south. In which case the new lowest natural grade becomes 1437.8'. The current top of high roof elevation at existing residence is $1462.25^{\prime}$. This puts the maximum building height at $24.45^{\prime}$. This will result in a nonconformance of the existing residence.
3. Minimal impact to encroachment
a. The new garage is encroaching 9 ' into the 40 ' setback line therefore is still within the 20 ' setback line.
b. All new construction other than the proposed 227 sf is being constructed within the setbacks. The amount of garage being added is minimal for a garage door and the height will match the existing construction allowing for minimal impact to the encroachment.
c. By maintaining the existing encroachment, the distance between the existing high roof and the lowest natural grade is minimized, which makes less imposing volume from the street.
d. The proposed new addition runs parallel to the existing house and the topo lines therefore maintains the lower building height. The building height will only increase if constructed in an alternate location.

## Encroachment \#3 - Side Yard Height:

Encroachment of the new bedroom addition roof height into the side yard height restrictions by 22sf horizontal roof surface for approximately 1.2 ft of vertical encroachment. The new bedroom addition is constructed within the 20' side and 40' rear yard setbacks.

1. Property hardship not allowing compliance
a. The site is sloped so that the addition of the new bedroom limits placement of the new addition.
b. The location of the existing residence, built as a non-conforming use, would not allow for the new bedroom to be placed in a reasonable and accessible location.
2. Minimal impact to encroachment
a. The request indicates only 1.2 vertical feet of height and only 22 horizontal square feet of encroachment.
b. This represents only $1.1 \%$ of the new addition within the height limits. The balance of the addition has been designed to comply with the zoning ordinance.

## The variance criteria:

1. Criterion 1: "such variance... will serve not merely as a convenience to the applicant, but [is] necessary to alleviate some demonstrable hardship or difficulty so great as warrant a variance under the circumstances." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)2)

- The demonstrable hardship was placed on the existing residence when the R-43 zoning district was applied to the site after the existing residence was constructed. This event not borne by the homeowner or their
predecessor, coupled with the existing conditions of the home and existing conditions of the site do not allow the owner reasonable ability to comply with the current zoning ordinance.
- As such the variance is not being used merely for convenience but will allow reasonable ability to alleviate the some of the hardship with minimal impact to the zoning requirements.

2. Criterion 2: the "special circumstances, hardship, or difficulty [do not] arise out of misunderstanding or mistake. (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C) 4(b))

- The placement of the R-43 zoning district and associated setbacks did not arise out of misunderstanding or mistake.
- As such the variance will allow reasonable ability to alleviate the some of the hardship with minimal impact to the zoning requirements.

3. Criterion 3: "such variance from... the strict application of the terms of [the zoning ordinance] ... are in harmony with its general purposes and intents. (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)2)

- The intent of the ordinance is to provide visual openness, limit visual impact to the natural landscape and maintain view corridors. This request meets the intent of the zoning ordinance with the following bullet points: - as the northern side of the existing residence and addition will have limited visual impact from the street - the neighboring site to the north will still maintain clear views to the south since they are located uphill and all new work will not exceed the maximum building height of the existing residence.
- The new garage addition will not exceed the current encroachment into the existing setback. Additionally, the encroachment will be limited to approximately 145sf.

4. Criterion 4: "the special circumstances, hardship or difficulty applicable to the property are [not] self-imposed by the property owner, or predecessor..." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)4)

- The hardship is not self-imposed. The original structure was built in 1962 before Paradise Valley annexation and application of the zoning limitations on this site.

5. Criterion 5: "Because of special circumstances applicable to the property, including site, shape, topography, location or surrounding, the strict application of the zoning ordinance will deprive such property of privileges enjoyed by other property of the same classification in the same zoning district. (Arizona Revised Statutes 9-462.06(G)(2)).

- The special circumstance of the pre-existing setback encroachment, existing orientation of the existing residence, access and limited buildable area due to existing site improvements require minimal encroachment into the setback and related height restrictions.
- This will allow the property owner to make reasonable modifications to the existing residence to enjoy similar privileges to those properties of the same classification and developed after the annexation of Paradise Valley and the overlay of the current zoning ordinance.

6. Criterion 6: The variance would not "constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with the limitations upon other properties in the vicinity and zone in which the property is located." (Arizona Revised Statutes 9-462.06(G)(2))

- The request is in character with the Zoning Ordinance and the surrounding neighborhood and will not grant special privileges inconsistent with other properties in which this site is located.
- Refer to attached document demonstrating other properties incompliant with the setback requirement in vicinity.

Respectfully submitted,

Troy M Vincent, AIA
Principal
180 degrees, inc










1982 Aerial


1969 Aerial

## Paul Michaud

## From:

Paul Michaud
Sent:
To:
Cc:
Subject:

Monday, March 25, 2019 4:17 PM
George Burton
Paul Mood; Robert Lee; Tina Brindley; Jeremy Knapp
4202 E Desert Crest Dr Variance - Public Comment

## George:

Kevin Murphy who lives at 4205 E Desert Crest across the street came in. He had several questions and points, but is overall supportive of the variance.

- He asked what the driveway material will be since the existing DG material washes out into the street. He prefers a hard surface like concrete or asphalt.
- The wash to the west of this site pushes debris into the road regularly. He asked about who maintains the roadway to remove the debris and what solutions could be done to solve this matter (maintenance, roadway change etc.)
- He noted whether a small swale could be added running from the west to east within the right-of-way or on their property to bring storm water to outfall at the southwest corner of the site. He states storm water use to outfall in that location and over time now outfalls toward his lot.
- He had concerns with the brightness of the existing lights near the pool and if they are to code. He would like to see less outdoor illumination.
- During construction he has concerns that the contractors will use his pull out off the street and would like them not use it since it damages the surface.

Regards,
Paul E. Michaud, AICP
Senior Planner
6401 E Lincoln Drive
480-348-3574 (phone)
480-483-1811 (TDD)
pmichaud@paradisevalleyaz.gov

## AFFIDAVIT OF MAILING NOTIFICATION

STATE OF ARIZONA )
) ss:
County of Maricopa )
In accordance with the requirements of the Town of Paradise Valley, the undersigned hereby certifies that the mailing list for the proposed project is a complete list of property owners within 1,500 feet of the subject property, as obtained from the Maricopa County Assessor's Office on the following date_ $03 / 06 \quad, 2019$, and such notification has been mailed on the following date $03 / / / \quad, 2019$.


The foregoing instrument was acknowledged by me this
 day of March ,2019,

My commission expires:

$12-20-2021$

## AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING

## STATE OF ARIZONA )

) ss:
County of Maricopa )
I, JUNGIUNAN JERRY PARK , depose and state that the attached notice, of proposed application VARIANCE FRDM ZONING ORDINAMC Iocated at 4202 E DESERT CREET DK, for the (Planning Commission/Town Council/Board of Adjustmenty Hillside Committe mee meting date of $\qquad$ , 2019 is a true and correct copy of a notice which I cause to be posted by the following day of the week $03 / \mathrm{ll}$ , and on the following date $\qquad$ , 2019 in the following location(s):

All in the Town of Paradise Valley, Arizona and County and State aforesaid, the same being public places in said County and in the following locations:

All to the Town of Paradise Valley, Arizona and County and State aforesaid.
DATED this $/ /$ th day of $M A R C H \quad 2019$.


This affidavit was SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN to before me this $1^{\text {th }}$ day of March


My commission expires:
$12-20-2021$

From: William Hayden [mailto:wnhayden@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, March 11, 2019 9:54 AM
To: Amanda Hayden [anhayden2105@gmail.com](mailto:anhayden2105@gmail.com); Jerry Park [jpark@180degreesinc.com](mailto:jpark@180degreesinc.com); troy vincent [tvincent@180degreesinc.com](mailto:tvincent@180degreesinc.com)
Subject: Fwd: 18044 - Variance 2nd submittal (4202 E Desert Crest) SIGN POSTED PICS ATTACHED


## NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING TOWN OF PARADISE VALLEY

Notice is hereby given that the Town of Paradise Valley Board of Adjustment will hold a public hearing at 5:30 p.m. on Wednesday, April 3, 2019, at Town Hall, 6401 East Lincoln Drive, Paradise Valley, Arizona, 85253 for:

PUBLIC HEARING: Consideration of variances from the Zoning Ordinance:

- Article X, Height and Area Regulations, to: 1) allow additions to an existing residence to encroach into the setbacks and to encroach into the height limitation, and 2) allow an existing detached garage to be attached to the primary residence and encroach into the setback.
- Article XXIV, Walls and Fences, to allow existing terraced retaining walls to remain and exceed the minimum separation requirements.
The property is located at 4202 E. Desert Crest Drive (Assessor's Parcel Number 169-19-005B).

If you have questions about this application, please call the Planning Department at (480) 348-3692.

The Town of Paradise Valley endeavors to make all public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. With 72 hours advance notice, special assistance can be provided for disabled persons at public meetings. Please call 480-948-7411 (voice) or 483-1811 (TDD) to request accommodation.

For further information about any of these matters, please contact the Community Development Department, 6401 E. Lincoln Drive, Paradise Valley, Arizona, 480-3483692.

All agendas are subject to change. You can view the agenda, find application material, and provide your input via eComment approximately 4-6 days prior to the meeting date at https://paradisevalleyaz.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx. You may also contact the staff liaison, George Burton on this application at gburton@paradisevalleyaz.gov or 480-3483525 at any time before the scheduled meeting date.







|  | E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | PO BOX 93430 PHOENIX AZ 85070 |
|  | 4002 E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6801 N 40TH ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4015 E FLYNN LN PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4016 E FLYNN LN SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253 |
|  | 4002 E FLYNN LN PARADISE VALLEY AZ 8525 |
|  | 4044 E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4039 E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 8525 |
|  | 7501 N VIA DE LOS LIBROS SCOTTSDALE AZ 85258 |
|  | 1918 W GRANT ST PHOENIX AZ 85009 |
|  | 6602 N 40TH ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6207 E MAVERICK RD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6601 N 40TH ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4002 E SIERRA VISTA DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4020 E SIERRA VISTA DR SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253 |
|  | PO BOX 68282 OAK GROVE OR 97267 |
|  | 6543 N 40TH ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6501 N 40 TH ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4020 E LINCOLN DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6504 N 40TH PL PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6520 N 40TH PL PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 17455 N BLACK CANYON HWY PHOENIX AZ 85023 |
|  | 6554 40TH PL SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253 |
|  | 3104 E CAMELBACK RD UNIT 702 PHOENIX AZ 85016 |
|  | 4009 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4050 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4030 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4031 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 852 |
|  | PO BOX 30276 PHOENIX AZ $85046-0276$ |
|  | 3104 E CAMELBACK NO 545 PHOENIX AZ 85016 |
|  | 6501 N 40TH PL PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4070 E LINCOLN DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6520 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6538 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4045 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4051 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6533 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253-3939 |
|  | 65918 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 6501 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4343 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4329 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253-3 |
|  | 4315 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4301 E HIGHLAND DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 |
|  | 4237 E HIGHLAND DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 | 9812 E KAREN DR SCOTTSDALE AZ 85260

2947 W MCDOWELL RD PHOENIX AZ 85009

| ACF LLC | 4060 E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| :---: | :---: |
| HALFORD ROBERT JOHN ARTHUR | 4055 E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| SHAbAt izhak ben | 4002 E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| LIEBERMAN ABRAHAM/INA | 6801 N 40TH ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| KITEI FRANK D/LYNNE D | 4015 E FLYNN LN PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| TANG SAM C \& JANE L CO-TRS | 4016 E FLYNN LN PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| GENTRY MILLICENT/ISMAIL BASEL | 4002 E FLYNN LN PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| avery thomas c/rosalie | 4044 E LAMAR R P PARADISE VALLEY 8525 |
| SUMAR RIYAZ A/KAMAL | 4039 ELA |
| UNDERWOOD PAMELAG | 4020 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| LISHERNESS HARLEY CTR | 4212 E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| WAND RICHARD W/SHARON B TR | 6602 N 40 TH ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| CARLO M KARIM AND AMY E MARKGRAF REVOCABLE LIV | 6611 N 40 TH ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| MEHDI BOBAK/LACAPRARA LISA | 6601 N 40 TH ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| FRITZ COLLEEN/ARNOLD | 4002 E SIERRA VIITA DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| AXE KATHY D | 4020 E SIERRA VISTA DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| HUNTER WILLIAM C | 4015 E SIERRA VISTA DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| MONTANARELLA PAUL D/CINDY J | 6543 N 40 TH ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| SALEM 5 HENRY/KHALIL RANYA | 6501 N 40 TH ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| gelow john g | 4020 E LINCOLN DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| VINCIC ZELKo/radmila | 6504 N 40TH PL PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| REICHMAN SUSAN R | 6520 N 40 TH PL PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| COOPER GENE | 6536 N 40TH PL PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| Marvin loeb trust | 6554 N 40 TH PL PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| EK TRUST | 6566 N 40TH PL PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| DEAKIN JOHN G/LINDA C TR | 4009 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| benjaminivor | 4050 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| borovay foll/daniel dona dian tr | 4030 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| DANIELS ALAN U/SUZANNE R | 4031 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| FRISBY HOWARD E/DONNA A TR | 6535 N 40 TH PL PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| FICKES HMAY | 6521 N 40 TH PL PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| GNNK TRUST | 6501 N 40 TH PL PARADISE VALLEY 8525 |
| THONGTRANGAN KATE//ISADA | 4070 E LINCOLN DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| ALWAY MARK D | 6520 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| BUSTOS ANDRES E/RITA J | 6538 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| TAYLOR WILLIAM H | 4045 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| CHAPMAN ANTONY C/BEAVER KELLY S | 4051 E DESERT CREST DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| ILEANA ORLICH FAMILY TRUST | 6533 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| RFK TRUST | 6519 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| HoEl david C/HUNG TSE | 6501 N 41ST ST PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| ANDREWS JEFFREY D/DEBRA J TR | 4343 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| WITtenberg ron | 4329 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| VH PROPERTIES LLC | 4315 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| ERIN C OLSCHANSKY REVOCABLE TRUST/CRAIG A OLSCH | 4301 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| Lleberman amron oscar Lewis/Jamie | 4237 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
| COXSEY LAUREN JOY/GREGORY PAUL TR/ETAL | 4223 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY 85253 |
|  | 42 |






 36974 N 109TH ST SCOTTSDALE AZ 85626


 PO BOX 5094 PHOENIX AZ 85010-5094 PO BOX 5094 PHOENIX AZ 85010-5094 4222 E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 4060 E LAMAR RD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 6736 SILVER MOUNTAIN RD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
6740 N SILVER MOUNTAIN RD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253 4342 E HIGHLANDS DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253


 7225 N CLEARWATER PKWY PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

4211 E HIGHLAND DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
6810 N HIGHLAND DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
316 41ST ST WESTERN SPRINGS IL 60558


|  |
| :---: |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |



 N. id $\stackrel{5}{5}$



[^0] 6645 N 40 TH ST 4001 E LAMAR RD 6638 N 40TH ST
6622 N 40TH ST 6644 N 40TH ST 6664 N 40 TH ST
6664 N 40 TH ST 6802 N 40TH ST 2648 INTERNATIONAL BLVD STE 800 656 COUNTRY CLUB DR 6542 N HILLSIDE DR

 6650 N HILLSIDE DR
6632 N HILLSIDE DR 6711 N HILLSIDE DR
105 ARRANDALE RD
PO BOX 854



 6535 N HILLSIDE DR 6515 N HILLSIDE DR 4201. E MARLETTE AVE
4241 E MARLETTE AVE
4027 E LINCOLN DR 4201. E MARLETTE AVE 4231 E MARLETTE DR
5695 E VILLAGE DR
6225 N 42 ND ST 4231 E MARLETTE DR 3120 W CAREFREE HWY STE 1 PMB 1530 6300 N 42ND ST
6312 N 42ND ST 4240 E MARLETTE AVE
4252 E MARLETTE AVE
4618 E BERNEIL DR
6300 N 42 ND ST










| D |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| D |
| D |









| PARADISE VALLEY |
| :---: |
| PHOENIX |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| Paradise valley |
| paradise valley |
| SCOTTSDALE |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| SCOTTSDALE |
| Phoenix |
| Paradise valley |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VAlley |
| SCOTTSDALE |
| OAK GROV |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| paradise valley |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PHOENIX |
| SCOTTSDALE |
| PHOENIX |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| Paradise valley |
| paradise valley |
| Phoenix |
| phoenix |
| Paradise valley |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| paradise valley |
| paradise valley |
| PaRAdISE VALLEY |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| Paradise valley |
| PARADISE VALLEY |
| paradise valley |
| PaRAdISE VALLEY |
| paradise valley |
| SCOTTSDALE |
| phoenix |










## Action Report

File \#: 19-144

## TO: Chair and Board of Adjustment

FROM: Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director Paul Michaud, Senior Planner George Burton, Planner

DATE: April 3, 2019

## CONTACT:

George Burton, Planner, 480-348-3525

## AGENDA TITLE:

Schick Residence - 6318 N 52 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ Place (APN 169-27-033)
Case No. BA-19-04 a variance to Article X of the Town of Paradise Valley Zoning Ordinance to allow for an addition that does not meet the rear setback

## A. MOTION FOR APPROVAL

I move for [approval] of Case No. BA-19-04, a request by Richard and Janelle Schick, property owners of 6318 N $52^{\text {nd }}$ PI.; for a variance from the Zoning Ordinance, Article X, Height and Area Regulations, to allow an addition to an existing residence to encroach into the rear yard setback. The variance shall be in compliance with the submitted plans and documents:

1. The Variance Criteria Narrative, prepared by Richard and Janelle Schick
2. Site Plan, Sheet C, prepared by Dimension 4 Design, dated $2 / 11 / 19$; and
3. Architectural Plans, Sheets A-2 and A-5, prepared by Dimension 4 Design.

## Reasons for Approval:

I find that there are special circumstances, applicable to only the subject lot, meeting the variance criteria.

## B. MOTION FOR DENIAL

I move for [denial] of Case No. BA-19-04, a request by Richard and Janelle Schick, property owner of 6318 N $52^{\text {nd }}$ Pl.; for a variance from the Zoning Ordinance, Article X, Height and Area Regulations, to allow an addition to an existing residence to encroach into the rear yard setback.

## Reasons for Denial:

I find that the variance requested does not meet the variance criteria.

## BACKGROUND

File \#: 19-144

## Lot Conditions

The property is zoned R-43 and is approximately 34,731 square feet in size ( 0.80 acres). The property is a rectangular shaped lot and is bisected by a wash on the eastern half. The eastern property line adjoins $52^{\text {nd }}$ Place, while the north, south, and western property lines adjoin other single -family residences zoned R-43.

## Lot History

The subject property is Lot 11 of the Macdonald Acres subdivision. The subdivision was platted in 1949 and annexed into the Town in 1961. The existing home was built within Maricopa County in 1949 prior to being annexed into the Town of Paradise Valley.

- October 6, 1980
- April 1, 1981
- May 5, 1986
- February 29, 1996
- April 19, 1997
- February 16, 2016
- March 9, 2016

There is no building permit on file for the original construction of the house as it was built in Maricopa County prior to annexation into the Town.

## Request

The applicant is proposing to add an $11^{\prime}-4$ " tall addition to the rear of the existing nonconforming home for a study. A large portion of the existing residence is 22 ' from the rear property line and encroaches into the rear yard setback and the proposed addition is $16^{\prime}-2$ ". Of the 519 square foot addition, 434 square feet is more nonconforming then the existing structure. Additionally, an overhang is proposed, bringing the edge of the roof overhang to 13 ' from the rear property line. Finally, 5' tall wing walls are proposed along the western side of the home to screen mechanical equipment, they range in setback from 23 ' to 26 '. However, the Town Zoning Ordinance requires a rear yard setback of $40^{\prime}$.

The applicant requests a variance from Article $X$ of the Zoning Ordinance, Height and Area Regulations, Section 1001, District Regulations, determines minimum lot size, building area, width, story, and setback limitations for zoning districts within the Town of Paradise Valley. Table 1001-A1 requires lots within the R-43 District to have a minimum rear yard setback of 40'. Below is Table 1001-A1 of the Zoning Ordinance:

File \#: 19-144

Table 1001-A1 Primary Building Area, Width, Story, and Setback Limitations

| District | Minimum <br> Lot Size, sq ft | Minimum <br> Lot <br> Width, ft | Minimum Front Setback, ft | Minimum <br> Side <br> Setback, ft | Minimum Rear Setback, ft | Minimum <br> Side/Rear with <br> Frontage | Maximun <br> Floor <br> Area <br> Ratio | Minimum <br> Floor <br> Area, sq <br> $\mathrm{ft}^{1}$ | Number of Stories |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { R-175 } \\ \text { with a } \\ \text { Primary } \\ \text { Building } \\ \text { built } \\ \text { prior to } \\ \text { June 13, } \\ 1991 \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 175,000 | 165 | 40 | $20^{2}$ | 40 | 40 | 25\% | 2,000 | 2 |
| $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { R-175 } \\ \text { with no } \\ \text { Primary } \\ \text { Building } \\ \text { built } \\ \text { prior to } \\ \text { June 13, } \\ 1991 \end{array}$ | 175,000 | 165 | 100 | $20^{2}$ | 100 | 100 | 25\% | 2,000 | 2 |
| R-43 | 43.560 | 165 | 40 | 20 | 40 | 40 | 25\% | 2.000 | 2 |
| R-35 | 35.000 | 150 | 40 | $20^{3}$ | 40 | 40 | 25\% | 1,800 | 2 |
| R-35A | 35,000 | 150 | 40 | $15^{3}$ | 40 | 40 | 25\% | 1.800 | 1 |
| R-18 | 18,000 | 120 | 40 | 20 | 40 | 40 | 25\% | 1,500 | 1 |
| R-18A | 18,000 | 120 | 35 | 10 | 35 | 35 | 25\% | 1,500 | 1 |
| R-10 | 10,000 | 100 | $20^{4}$ | $7^{4}$ | $25^{4}$ | $20^{4}$ | None | 1,500 | 1 |

## DISCUSSION/ FACTS:

## Variance criteria:

Town Code and Arizona Revised Statutes set criteria an applicant must meet before a Board of Adjustment may grant a variance request. If the Board finds an applicant meets all of these criteria, the Board may grant the variance. However, if the Board finds the applicant does not meet all of the criteria, the Board may not grant the variance. The following are staff's findings with regard to such variance criteria.

1. "Such variance... will serve not merely as a convenience to the applicant, but [is] necessary to alleviate some demonstrable hardship or difficulty so great as to warrant a variance under the circumstances." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)2).

Findings in Favor (FIFs):
The code requires that R-43 lots have a minimum lot size of 43,560 square feet. This particular lot was created in the county prior to annexation within the Town of Paradise Valley and only has a lot size of 34,731 square feet, therefore the hardship was placed on the property when the R-43 District was applied after the property was created and the home was

## File \#: 19-144

built. In addition, a wash bisects the property rendering parts of the buildable area unbuildable due to protection of the wash. The homeowner is trying to improve the existing house on site by adding a study.

## Findings Opposed (FOPs):

The size, shape, and topography of the property do not prevent the owner from designing an addition on a different area of the lot that could meet the required setbacks.
2. The "special circumstances, hardship, or difficulty [do not] arise out of misunderstanding or mistake..." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)4(b)).

## FIFs:

The hardship is not out of mistake or misunderstanding. The reduced building area of this lot and the existing encroachments into the rear yard setback are not the result of any misunderstanding or mistake.

## FOPs:

The applicant should be aware of all zoning requirements on the property and plan any designs accordingly.
3. "Such variance from ... the strict application of the terms of [the Zoning Ordinance] ... are in harmony with its general purposes and intents..." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)2).

## FIFs:

The intent of the Town Zoning Ordinance is to provide visual openness, limit visual impact to the natural landscape, and maintain view corridors. This is met by proposing a one story addition that is on the rear of the existing home, therefore not visible from the street, and the addition is within an area previously enclosed by a 6 ' tall wall, so a majority of the addition will be screened from view by the neighboring properties. Additionally, existing and proposed landscaping will help screen the addition from view.

## FOPs:

The request does not meet the intent of the code since other alternatives exist. Although not ideal, an addition could be constructed on the southeast corner of the home and meet the required setbacks.
4. "The special circumstances, hardship or difficulty applicable to the property are [not] selfimposed by the property owner, or predecessor..." (Town Code Section 2-5-3(C)4).

## FIFs:

The request is not self-imposed as the lot was created prior to annexation into the Town of Paradise Valley and a natural wash exists on the property that limits the amount of buildable area.

## FOPs:

The request is self-imposed since the applicant wishes to do an addition on the western side

## File \#: 19-144

of the existing structure.
5. Because of special circumstances applicable to the property, including its size, shape, topography, location, or surroundings, the strict application of the Zoning Ordinance will deprive such property of privileges enjoyed by other property of the same classification in the same zoning district." (Arizona Revised Statutes 9-462.06(G)(2)).

## FIFs:

The hardship is the reduced size of the property, 34,731 square feet and the location of the wash on the site.

## FOPs:

Although not ideal, the owner could propose the addition on another portion of the lot to comply with the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance.
6. The variance would not "constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with the limitations upon other properties in the vicinity and zone in which such property is located." (Arizona Revised Statutes 9-462.06(G)(2)).

## FIFs:

Similarly platted and aged homes within the "bulb" of $52^{\text {nd }}$ Place have reduced front or rear yard setbacks due to smaller lot size and age of the structures.

## FOPs:

All other properties in the area must meet the setbacks requirements outlined the Zoning Ordinance.

COMMENTS: Staff received no comments regarding this request.
COMMUNITY IMPACT: None.
FISCAL IMPACT None.
CODE VIOLATIONS: None.

## ATTACHMENTS

Vicinity Map \& Aerial Photo
Application
Narrative and Plans

## Noticing Materials

C: Richard and Janelle Schick (Applicant) Case File BA-19-04



# Schick Residence <br> 6318 North 52 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ Place, Paradise Valley, AZ 85253 <br> Lot 11 McDonald Acres APN 169-27-033 

## Application To Board Of Adjustment For Variance

Project Name: Schick Residence
Location of Property: 6318 North $52^{\text {nd }}$ Place
Paradise Valley, Az. 85253
Legal Description: Lot 11 McDonald Acres..
Accessors Parcel Number: 169-27-033
Size of Parcel: 34,731 sf.

Owner: Mr. \& Mrs. Richard Schick
Address: 6318 North $52^{\text {nd }}$ Place
Paradise Valley, Az. 85253
Phone: 602-617-0106
Email: richard.schick1@gmail.com

Applicant: Owner
Contact: Richard or Janelle Schick

Signature


## SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS:

$X$ Application, completely filled out
$x \quad$ (7) copies of Site Plan or ALTA Survey *
$X \quad$ (7) copies of Narrative
$\frac{X}{X} \quad$ (7) copies of Elevations / Details
$X \quad$ (7) copies of square footage table showing existing and proposed total square footage
(7) copies of height chart for all new and existing buildings
(7) copies of setback plan for all buildings along the perimeter of the property
(7) copies of parking plan showing approximate location of all parking areas, and other documentation as applicable *

* All plans shall be folded to approximately 8.5 by 11 -inch in size.

The Town will keep all Pre-application material for not more than 6 months from receipt of Preapplication submittal. A new Pre-application shall be filed with the Town (1) should the applicant not apply for the appropriate application process after completion of the Preapplication process within the above 6-month period or (2) other extenuating factors as determined by the Planning \& Building Director that may affect the project.


FOR DEPARTMENTAL USE ONLY

Pre-App.\#:
Staff Review Date: $\qquad$

Submittal Date: $\qquad$
Pre-App Meeting Date: $\qquad$

## APPLICATION TO BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT FOR VARIANCE

DATE: January 28, 2019
LOCATION OF PROPERTY: $\frac{6318 \text { North 52nd Place }}{\text { ADDRESS }}$



ENGINEER/OTHER:
PRINTED NAME


## ADDRESS

PHONE\#

APPLICANT/
REPRESENTATIVE: Owner

PRINTED NAME $\qquad$
ADDRESS

PHONE\#
FAX \#
THE ABOVE APPLICANT HEREBY APPLIES FOR A VARIANCE AS INDICATED BELOW IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE ZONING ORDINANCE AND SECTION 2-5-3 OF THE CODE OF ORDINANCES OF THE TOWN OF PARADISE VALLEY.

STATE HARDSHIP INVOLVED OR GROUNDS FOR APPEAL TO THE BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT. (Please attach additional sheets as necessary).

See attached narrative.

## SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS

$\qquad$ Application form with proof of ownership (current title report) ${ }^{1}$
$\qquad$

## Filing Fee ${ }^{1}$

Application for Variance $\$ 1,765$
Application for Variance for Non- $\$ 1,615$
livable detached structures having less than 10\% impact on setback or disturbed area
$\qquad$ (1) Narrative describing request and addressing all six variance criteria ${ }^{1}$

X (6) Folded* copies of site plan and all other applicable plans/documents for staff to review for completeness ${ }^{1}$

(20) Folded* copies of site plan and all other applicable plans/documents for hearing ${ }^{2}$

(20) Current color or black/white aerial photographs of the site for hearing ${ }^{2}$

(1) $81 / 2 " \times 11^{\prime \prime}$ copy of site plan and all other applicable plans ${ }^{2}$
$X$
(1) Set of noticing material
a. List of all property owners with respective Maricopa County Tax Parcel Number for all properties within the notice area. Notice area is 1,500 feet from perimeter of subject property, or as specified by the Town ${ }^{1}$
b. Signed Affidavit that the above list is the most current and accurate list from the Maricopa County Tax Assessor's office ${ }^{1}$.
c. Completed set of envelopes for each property owner within the notice area ${ }^{2}$. Envelopes to include:
i. Town return address:

Town of Paradise Valley
Planning Department
6401 E. Lincoln Drive
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253-4399
ii. Property address shall include 'or current resident'

Example: Mr. \& Mrs. Doe or Current Resident
4500 N Main Street
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253
iii. Appropriate postage paid on each envelope
iv. Notice material inserted in each envelope. The Town will provide the Applicant this notice prior to the due date for the noticing material.
v. All envelopes sealed
${ }^{1}$ Must be submitted with application.
${ }^{2}$ Must be submitted at least 21 days prior to the scheduled hearing.

* All copies must be folded to approximately $8 \frac{1}{2}$ by 11 -inch in size


## Schick Residence

6318 North $52^{\text {nd }}$ Place, Paradise Valley, AZ. 85253

Lot 11 McDonald Acres APN 169-27-033

## Narrative:

The existing residence is located at 6318 North $52^{\text {nd }}$ Place, APN 169-27-033, and is owned by Richard \& Janelle Schick. The existing home was built in 1949 prior to annexation into the Town of Paradise Valley in 1961. The Schick's purchased this residence in 1979. The existing residence as constructed in 1949 does not conform to the required Town of Paradise Valley rear setback requirements. Existing rear setback is $22^{\prime}-0^{\prime \prime}$.

The existing residence and proposed addition is single story and conforms to all other zoning requirements for height and building area.

## Scope of Variance Request

Due to existing residence location on the lot it is requested that an addition be allowed to be built in the required 40 ' rear yard setback. Of the 519 sf addition being proposed only 434 sf would encroach into the required 40 ' rear setback. These areas include roof overhangs.

The current residence is setback $22^{\prime}-0^{\prime \prime}$ minimum from the west (rear) property line. The proposed addition would reduce the west (rear) setback at an angle that tapers from $22^{\prime}-0^{\prime \prime}$ to $16^{\prime}-2^{\prime \prime}$ over a distance of $18^{\prime}-4^{\prime \prime}$.

In addition two wing walls would be added to the west elevation of the house similar to the existing wing wall in this area. These walls would be added to screen the existing electrical meter and trash \& recycle containers. These walls would be $8^{\prime \prime}$ wide, $5^{\prime}-0$ " high and $4^{\prime}-0$ " long. They would protrude into the required $40-0$ " rear setback leaving between $26^{\prime}-0^{\prime \prime}$ and $23^{\prime}-0^{\prime \prime}$ clear to the property line.

## Variance Criteria

1. Such variance will serve not merely as a convenience to the applicant but is necessary to alleviate some demonstratable hardship or difficulty so great as warrant a variance under the circumstances.

The existing property is zoned R-43, however, the lot area is only 34,731 sf or $80 \%$ of the 43,560 sf area required by the zoning code. To further compound the problem there is a major wash that bisects the lot making the north east corner 10,816 sf unusable for
an addition to the house. Overall buildable area on this lot is $23,913 \mathrm{sf}$ or $55 \%$ of the code allowable lot area.

Existing residence is only 3.238 sf in area. The proposed 519 sf of addition being planned would increase the final lot coverage to $10.2 \%$ well under the $25 \%$ lot coverage allowed by the Town zoning ordinance.

The existing house is designed around the natural grade of the lot. The natural grade east west follows the wash sloping from 1357.9 on the east to 1353.34 on the west for a drop of 4'-6" east west. Natural grade from north south slopes from 1360.67 on the south down to 1356.6 on the north for a total drop of 4 '-2" in the area of the house. Existing finish floor is set at 1358.79. The entire pool area behind the house had to be raised 2'-0" above finish floor so it conformed to the existing grades on the south side of the lot. There is a 30 " high retaining wall between the south patio and the pool to accommodate the grade difference.

The existing house was not laid out so the west exterior wall was parallel to the west property line. The west house wall is angled so that as you go south the house wall and the property line come closer together.

The addition is designed using the minimum amount of reduced setback area possible. Due to the existing site grades if the addition was angled to match the property line angle in order to maintain the 22'-0" setback the addition would protrude into the raised ground level around the pool disrupting the existing 30 " high retaining wall and pool area access stairs on both the south and west sides of the pool. Exit door out of the back of the house would be 2'-0" below existing grade.

## 2. "Special circumstances, hardship or difficulty do not arise out of misunderstanding or mistake"

This lot and existing residence were constructed with a reduced rear setback in 1949 prior to this area being annexed into the Town of Paradise Valley in 1961 and being subject to the R-43 zoning requirements imposed by the Town zoning ordinance.

The existing residence as constructed in 1949 prior to annexation currently encroaches into the required 40 rear yard setback.

## 3. Such variance from the strict application of the terms of the Zoning Ordinance are in harmony with its general purposes and intents.

The proposed addition to the residence has been designed so as not to affect the required front and side yard setbacks,these are consistent with the requirements of the zoning ordinance. The existing houses built to the north, south and east sides of the existing residence all encroach into the front or rear 40' setbacks required. The reduced
rear (west) setback does not encroach into the existing utility easement along the west property line and will be enclosed entirely within the existing 6 '-0" high site fence surrounding the rear and sidewalls of the proposed addition screening it from adjacent properties. Additional landscaping will be added between the addition and the west property line to help create a buffer between the addition and the residence to the west. See attached site plan.
4. The special circumstances, hardship or difficulty applicable to the property are not self-imposed by the property owner, or predecessor.

The special circumstances, hardship or difficulty applicable to this project are not selfimposed by the property owner but are entirely due to the smaller than allowable lot area, the natural topography of the lot and the construction of the original residence built in 1949 prior to the property being annexed into the Town of Paradise Valley in 1961.
5. Because of special circumstances applicable to the property, including its size, shape, topography, location, or surroundings, the strict application of the zoning ordinance will deprive such property of privileges enjoyed of the same classification in the same zoning district.

The reduced area of the lot, the existing wash which bisects the lot, natural topography of the lot and the location of the original residence on the lot as built in 1949 are all limiting factors in the location of any addition that would be constructed. All of these obstacles deprive this property of the privileges enjoyed by adjacent residences.
6. The variance would not constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with the limitations upon other properties in the vicinity and zone in which such property is located

In 1949 the McDonald Acres subdivision was laid out so houses alternated from front of the lot to the back of the lot in order for all homes to have a view of Camelback Mountain to the south. The houses that have not been demolished and rebuilt all have either a reduced front yard or rear yard setback. This variance request is consistent with the same limitations of other residences in the McDonald Acres subdivision which have either reduced front or rear yard setback granted by variances.


6318 North 52nd Place








##  <br> He






2. NEW ZRR OCLEARANCE DRECT VENT GAS FREPRACEIN
3. RELOCATED FRENCH DOOR
4. RELOCATED $4 \cdot \varnothing$ FXED WNDOW
5. NEWPAIR $26 \times 6^{\prime} B^{\prime}$ ILTE FRENCH DOOR, TEMPERED
6. NEW WXG FRAME WALL W S SAN KOTE ETUCCO OVER R 12 "

PITWOOD SHEATHMGG. PRROVDDEAPRROYED WEATHER
2XI2 FASCIA TO MATCH EXITING
b. EXSTING PARR LITE FEENCH DOors
9. $8^{\prime \prime}$ CMU WING WALL, STUCCO FINSH
10. EXSTING STUCCO OVER $8^{\prime \prime}$ CUI





$$
\text { suever No. } 79.6-15
$$

Bx: Beown Engineereing co, Ing
FOR: MTE RICK GEHICK

 SRd ploce 38 soun

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { BLAT OF SVNV OFV LOT II } \\
& \text { MAGLDONALD ACEES, AS EECOEDED } \\
& \text { IN SOOK AS OF NAAPS, PAGESN, NM.K. } \\
& \text { NAAR, COFA LOUNTY, AERE. }
\end{aligned}
$$

## NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING TOWN OF PARADISE VALLEY

Notice is hereby given that the Town of Paradise Valley Board of Adjustment will hold a public hearing at 5:30 p.m. on Wednesday, April 3, 2019, at Town Hall, 6401 East Lincoln Drive, Paradise Valley, Arizona, 85253 for:

PUBLIC HEARING: Consideration of a variance from the Zoning Ordinance, Article X, Height and Area Regulations, to allow additions to an existing residence to encroach into the setback. The property is located at 6318 N. $52^{\text {nd }}$ Place (Assessor's Parcel Number 169-27-033).

If you have questions about this application, please call the Planning Department at (480) 348-3692.

The Town of Paradise Valley endeavors to make all public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. With 72 hours advance notice, special assistance can be provided for disabled persons at public meetings. Please call 480-948-7411 (voice) or 483-1811 (TDD) to request accommodation.

For further information about any of these matters, please contact the Community Development Department, 6401 E. Lincoln Drive, Paradise Valley, Arizona, 480-3483692.

All agendas are subject to change. You can view the agenda, find application material, and provide your input via eComment approximately 4-6 days prior to the meeting date at https://paradisevalleyaz.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx. You may also contact the staff liaison, George Burton on this application at gburton@paradisevalleyaz.gov or 480-3483525 at any time before the scheduled meeting date.

## AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING

## STATE OF ARIZONA )

) ss:
County of Maricopa )
I, Richard Schick $\qquad$ , depose and state that the attached notice, of proposed application to allow addition to encroach into the rear setback 6318 North 52nd Place $\qquad$
 Adjustment/HixsidexCourdice meeting date o $\qquad$ April 3 , 2019 is a true and correct copy of a notice which I cause to be posted by the following day of the week Monday , and on the following date_ March 18 , 2019 in the following locations):
Front Yard

All in the Town of Paradise Valley, Arizona and County and State aforesaid, the same being public places in said County and in the following locations:

All to the Town of Paradise Valley, Arizona and County and State aforesaid.
DATED this 18 _day day of March , 2019


This affidavit was SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN to before me this
 day of March , 2019.


NOTARY PUBLIC
My commission expires:


## AFFIDAVIT

| STATE OF ARIZONA | ) ss: |
| :--- | :--- |
| County of Maricopa | ) |

In accordance with the requirements of the Town of Paradise Valley, the undersigned hereby certifies that all the property owners within 1,500 feet of the property, as obtained from the Maricopa County Assessor's Office on February 20. 2019 for the proposed rezoning, subdivision, lot split, lot line adjustment, or other permit approval has been mailed on March 5, 2019.
(This property list shall not be older than thirty (30) days at the time of filing of the application).
 , by $\qquad$ -.


My commission expires:


## NOTICE

Notice is hereby given that the Town of Paradise Valley Board of Adjustment will hold a hearing on the following proposed project. If you have questions about this application, please call the Planning Department at (480) 348-3692.

Applicant Name / Contact: Richard \& Janelle Schick $\qquad$
Applicant's Company Name: $\qquad$
Phone Number: 602-617-0106 Fax Number: $\qquad$
Project Name: Schick Residence
Project Location: 6318 North 52nd Place
Acreage: 0.79
Existing Zoning: R-43
Brief Narrative of Project Proposal: Construct a 427 sf. addition that would encroach into the rear setback. Consideration of a variance from the Zoning Ordinance, Article X,Height and Area Regulations to allow additions to an existing residence to encroach into the setback.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$


## BLACK JACK

4930 E LINCOLN DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ROMERO ROSAMOND CLAUDE \& KAY M TR
5010 E LINCOLN DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

DAVID AND CARMEN RUTAN FAMILY TRUST/ETAL 3738 E ELM ST
PHOENIX AZ 85018

HABEEB MARY
PO BOX 1464
MESA AZ 85211
ANDREWS THURL E/SONJA D TR
5126 E LINCOLN DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

LYONS JAMES
6043 N 42ND ST
PARADISE VALLEY, AZ 85253

PARADISE VALLEY COUNTRY CLUB INC 7101 N TATUM BLVD

PARADISE VALLEY COUNTRY CLUB INC 7101 N TATUM BLVD PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

PARADISE VALLEY COUNTRY CLUB INC
7101 N TATUM BLVD
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

BARRY AND JULIA SMITH FAMILY TRUST
6508 N DESERT FAIRWAY DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

DAD PROPERTIES LLC
6512 N DESERT FAIRWAYS
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

## GAINES IRA

1819 E MORTEN AVE SUITE 180
PHOENIX AZ 85020

## ASPEN RESEARCH LTD

PO BOX 32694
PHOENIX AZ 85064

YELLEN IRIS J TR
1981 LONG LAKES SHORES
BLOOMFIELD HILLS MI 48302

EATON FAMILY TRUST
4949 E LINCOLN DR 2
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253-4108
D \& M CAPTIAL LC
4949 E LINCOLN DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
WEINSTEIN ALLAN M/PHYLLIS TR 4949 E LINCOLN DR VILLA 4 PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

JAGO RICHARD J/LISA D 12102 ARLENE DR
HOMER GLEN IL 60491
INGSTAD JAMES D
1102 32ND AVE S
FARGO ND 58103
KIEHNE ZANE/TANYA
1501 MARY ST
PECOS TX 79772

WADWEKAR FAMILY TRUST
4951 E ARROYO VERDE DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
VIVIAN ROBERT TMNENDI S
7927 WESTERN
PARK CITY UT 84098

## OMNI MONTELUCIA LLC

4001 MAPLE AVE SUITE 600
DALLAS TX 75219

FOX JAMES D TR/GENEVRA E TR<br>4902 E VALLEY VISTA LN<br>PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

SETHI JESSE
4940 E VALLEY VISTA LN
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
KUHL QUALIFIED PERS RESID TR/KUHL FAM REV TR
4960 E VALLEY VISTA LN
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

CARTER MARCIA C TR
5020 E VALLEY VISTA LN
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

MEYER CHARLES ROBERT/PATTY RAE TR
5030 E VALLEY VISTA LN
SCOTTSDALEAZ 85253

THOMPSON EUGENE E/JUDITH R
5040 E VALLEY VISTA LN
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
BUCKLEY AMY L
5930 W ORCHID LN
CHANDLER AZ 85226
BUCKLEY AMY L
5930 W ORCHID LN
CHANDLER AZ 85226
AKKAD MOHAMMED ZAHER/LAUGHLIN SUZANNE 1040 E MOUNTAIN VISTA DR
PHOENIX AZ 85048
5019 E ROVEY LLC
1445 N STATE PKWY NO 307
CHICAGO IL 60610

GREGORY S CHURCHILL TR/TERRY A CHURCHILL TR 1700 COTTAGE GROVE PKWY
MARION IA 52302
ROSS BYRAN/LISA
1509 W MESA DR
PAYSON AZ 85541
MITCHEM STEVEN C/CHASE BRIDGETTE D
5110 E ROVEY AVE
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

SCOTT AND JULIE ALLEN FAMILY TRUST<br>5109 E ROVEY AVE<br>PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

DAVID R AND RHONDA VROMAN ALEXANDER TRUST
6003 N 51ST ST
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
DOCILE ENTERPRISES LLC
3219 E CAMELBACK ROAD NO 405
PHOENIX AZ 85018
CHAKMAKIAN FAMILY TRUST
6420 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

LACY NANCY B/JOSEPH B
320 WILLOW SPRING RD
INDIANAPOLIS IN 46240
DISCOVER ENTERISES LLC
6230 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

## GUARNIERI FAMILY REVOCABLE LIVING TRUST 6226 N 51ST PL <br> PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

CASE STEPHEN S
6220 N 51ST PL
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85251

HOGAN JOHN/DIANE
4848 E CACTUS RD 505-209
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85254

DEATON ROBERT O/KATHI LEE
6202 N 51 PL
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253

BRIAN S PAGE TRUST
6140 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
STREAM JAMES BENNETT ESTATE OF/CAROL J
6132 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
COHN LEE M/LINDA S TR
4340 E INDIAN SCHOOL RD STE 463
PHOENIX AZ 85018
CONN PAUL A/KATHRYN V
6030 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253-5144

SIMPSON SCOTT H/NIRGINIA A TR
6022 N 51ST PLACE
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253
CHRISTOPER WESLEY \& HOLLY ANN SHILL FAM TRUST 6010 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
BALDWIN WILLIAM DAN/REFELITA R TR
14422 N 17TH PL
PHOENIX AZ 85022

GRAY BRUCE W/BARBARA
6001 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
TAMM FAMILY TRUST
6011 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

JAN M CROATT TRUST
6021 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

## LINCOLN FAMILY TRUST

6031 N 51ST PLACE
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

POOLE LAURENT/CHASE JENNIFER L
6101 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

RICHARD AND RACHEL HEROLD FAMILY TRUST
6111 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ELLISON A LEROY TR
6121 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

CHANT H MANOUKIAN TRUST
6131 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

BERKNER GEORGE E TR
6135 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
GRAY/BURTON FAMILY TRUST
1028 VAN DYKE DR
LAGUNA BEACH CA 92651
FOWLER LIVING TRUST
3910 PERRYDALE RD
DALLAS OR 97338-9332

MCDOUGALL CAMERON G/NIENS INGA L 6215 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
DOOLEY M RICHARD/ANN L TR
6223 N 51ST PL
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253

PERINI SEAN/HAYDEN HEIDI D
7915 N 54TH PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

HERTZBERG RICHARD J \& LINDA SUE 6253 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ISAACS JEFFREY D/MARION TR
6301 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
CLANTON SHELLY/GEILER ERIC A
6321 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
JOHN G BRETTELL REVOCABLE TRUST
6423 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

BOUCHARD MICHAEL J/JOANNE M TR
2902 E ELM ST
PHOENIX AZ 85016
LEAH HOFFMAN LANGERMAN LIVING TRUST
6310 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
ACKERMAN LINDSAY S
6250 N 51ST PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

AJ 51ST PLACE PARTNERS L L C
2 MILL GATE LN
OAK BROOK IL 60523

6130 LLC
11215 N 74TH ST
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85260
ADLER DANIEL/DANIELA
6120 N 52ND PLACE
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

## JAMILYN AND ROGER E FOURNIER FAMILY TRUST

 6110 N 52ND PLPARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ROSS THOMAS H/JANIS M TR
6050 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

MARTINSON JOHN S/SUZANNE P
6038 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ESKILDSON LOYD E \& DENISE I
6026 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

HILLMAN-KEIM 2002 REVOCABLE TRUST
6002 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

KRAKOW FAMILY TRUST
5202 E MCDONALD DR
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253

RHOADES JOHN
5234 E MCDONALD DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ANN V BAKER TRUST
5246 E MCDONALD DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

FLORES HENRY CNALERIE W TR
5302 E MACDONALD DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

KAPLAN MIMI CHARISSE
15412 N 23RD ST
PHOENIX AZ 85022
J STEPHEN QUILL TRUST
5353 E CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

## VAN ENGELHOVEN DAVID A/PHYLLIS A

5337 E CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

DAVIDSON JAMES/HEIDI
5338 E CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

GILBERT EDNA SNYDER TR 6105 CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
MOCK FAMILY TRUST
6130 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

HANN J DAVID/LEIGH A TR
6115 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253

6100 N 54TH STREET LLC
PO BOX 18085
PHOENIX AZ 85005
FATHEREE JAMES W/RICHELLE
5354 E CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
LINDA D COHN REVOCABLE TRUST
843 S 96TH ST
OMAHA NE 68114-4919

ABDO JOSEPH G/SARA SYLVIA RAMIREZ-
6125 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
BRANDIS STEVEN S/CAPRA JUDY E
340 E 64TH ST 10D
NEW YORK NY 10065
ITKIN NATHAN/HILTON RHONDA
PO BOX 62224
PHOENIX AZ 85082

## MILLING JENS A/ANNE

927 FISHER LN
WINNETKA IL 60093

KABAT WALTER
6540 W TONOPAH
GLENDALE AZ 85308

FERRIS KATHLEEN TR
6144 N CAMELBACK MANOR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

FERRIS KATHLEEN TR
6144 N CAMELBACK MANOR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

JARR DEREK
4854 E CAIDA DEL SOL DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

SCHWAB FAMILY LIVING TRUST
10751 W QUAIL AVE
SUN CITY AZ 85373

JERALD P UNDERDAHL TR/STEVEN F BRANDWEIN TR
5343 E LINCOLN DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

GRAHAM FAMILY REVOCABLE TRUST
5335 E LINCOLN DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

FRANCO NILDA/SANTANA PERICLES
24398 N 98TH LN
PEORIA AZ 85383

KIMBERLY C ALBER REVOCABLE TRUST
6307 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

MANNING MICHAEL/DOREEN A
6301 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

6245 N CAMELBACK MANOR LLC
1445 N STATE PKWY NO 307
CHICAGO IL 60610

GARY AND ANN LANE FAMILY TRUST
6233 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ADAMS FAMILY TRUST
6121 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

GOVIG TODD A/MCGRATH APRIL
6111 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

WALTIS TRUST<br>6124 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ALBERT D FREDERICKSON \& RUTH E TR 7002 E SAN MIGUEL
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253

BEARDSLEY EDWARD A/MARY JO 6300 N CAMELBACK MANOR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

MOOSCHEKIAN J TERRENCE/LINDA ANNE TR
13215 E PENN ST 510
WHITTIER CA 90602

MORIC ROBERT/MARINA/ETAL
6320 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

MORIC ROBERT/MARINA
6320 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

YUNG JOHN/ELIZABETH
6310 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

```
KITTY S CONOVER REVOCABLE TRUST
6 2 2 4 ~ N ~ C A M E L B A C K ~ M A N O R ~ D R ~
PARADISE VALLEY AZ }8525
JD RUSSELL TRUST
6222 W CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ }8525
ASLANIAN FAMILY TRUST
6210 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ }8525
WOOD ANN H TR
5215 E LINCOLN DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ }8525
MCNAMARA SUSAN PONDER
6417 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEEY AZ }8523
HALL FAMILY REVOCABLE TRUST
6411 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ }8525
KNISHINSKY AMRAM/SUMMERSON ANNE W
5900 N GRANITE REEF RD NO }20
SCOTTSDALE AZ }8525
BATES JENNIFER K
6423 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ }8525
HAWTHORNE JAMES/SUSAN
6419 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ }8525
RUBLE PAUL C JR/FRANCOISE L TR
6440 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ }8525
PEMR TRUST/CAPSTONE PROPERTIES LLC
PO BOX 108
PRESCOTT AZ }8630
```


## GILL RONNY A/BRANDELL

6404 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253-4157

## BUTLER ARIZONA QPR TRUST

6400 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253-4157

ANN JARRETT SMITH 2007 LIVING TRUST
6210 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
SCHICK RICHARD H
6318 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

## ALPERT HARVEY B

9335 E HARVARD AVE
DENVER CO 80231-7649

GRAPPLE TRUST
6320 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
RICHARD R AND NANCY L WILKINSON LIVING TRUST
6324 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
BERANEK GEORGE R/LYNETTE TR
6402 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

KALOS THOMAS P/LEE ANN TR
6353 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

SCHIAVONI MARK A/AMY
208 W PORTLAND ST UNIT 460
PHOENIX AZ 85003

HERWICK PETER H \& JUDITH W
6321 N 52ND PL
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253

## MCAUSLAN ROBERT R

6205 E SAGE DR
SCOTTSDALE AZ 85253

MATUSZ BRIAN R
6420 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

## THOMAS P KALOS PROFIT SHARING PLAN TRUST

6353 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

HAYES GREGG H/ROBIN A TR
6416 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

MATUSZ BRIAN R
6420 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ERIE LEONARD J II/SUSAN M 6306 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

RICHARD J LEHMANN AND SALLY STACK LEHMANN REV 6 226 N CAMELBACK MANOR DR PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

GEISLER FAMILY REVOCABLE TRUST
6301 N 52ND PL
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

ABBELL ALEXANDER R/KIMBERLY A
5434 E LINCOLN DR \#5
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

MARRIOTT CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT CORP
PO BOX 579
LOUISVILLE TN 37777-0579

HOOD DENNIS R/BARBARA BARR TR
5525 E LINCOLN DR \#90
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

```
ASB TRUST
5525 E LINCOLN DR NO 91
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253-4119
GOLDNER LINDA M
5525 E LINCOLN DR # }9
PARADISE VALLEY AZ }8525
BIRDWELL DAVID/ODOR JAMES
15001 WILSON RD
EDMOND OK 73013
NELSON ROGER D/NELSON CATHERINE R 5525 E LINCOLN DR UNIT 94
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
MALLENDER WILLIAM H/CAROLE M TR
5525 E LINCOLN DR \# 95
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
PV NO 96 LLC
PO BOX 556
HARBOR SPRINGS Ml 49740
HATCH FAMILY TRUST
5525 E LINCOLN DR UNIT 97
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
EVELYN L MILLER LEGACY TRUST
5525 E LINCOLN DR UNIT 98
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
SR LP
6690 E HAIGHT RD
LODI CA 95240
TERESA A RAY TRUST
5525 E LINCOLN DR NO 100
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
EJC II LEGACY TRUST
21741 N 37TH ST
PHOENIX AZ 85050
```

SMITH EDWARD/MARILYNE TR
5525 E LINCOLN DR
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253

CLARK ALEXIA BROOKE
5525 E LINCOLN DR NO 104
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
COLLINS RICHARD L/MARGARET H TR
5525 E LINCOLN DR \#105
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
BUNN JOHN T
5525 E LINCOLN DR \#106
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
888 REVOCABLE TRUST
5841 E INDIAN BEND RD
PARADISE VALLEY AZ 85253
MOUNTAIN SHADOWS WEST HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION
2432 W PEORIA AVE STE 1032
PHOENIX AZ 85029
MS RESORT OWNER LLC
1900 N AKARD ST
DALLAS TX 75201

Minutes - Draft<br>Board of Adjustment

## 1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Leibsohn called the meeting to order.

## 2. ROLL CALL

Board Members in Attendance:

Chairman Eric Leibsohn
Board Member Emily Kile
Board Member Rick Chambliss
Board Member Jon Newman
Board Member Quinn Williams
Board Member Hope Ozer
Staff in Attendance:

George Burton, Planner
Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director
Andrew Miller, Town Attorney

## 3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

## 4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

Tashman Variance - 6010 E. Hummingbird Lane (APN: 169-49-060) Case No. BA-19-01

Mr. Burton introduced the item to modify the front entry of the home. He gave the history, scope of the project, and identified findings in favor and findings against the request.

Board Member Kile clarified that the only variance they are asking for is on the entryway, even though the house will look completely different.

Mr. Burton confirmed and responded that the other improvements are compliant with code.

Board Member Williams asked if the original design of the house is a recognized hardship.

Mr. Burton responded that it is not in the traditional sense, but a hardship since they are trying to work within an existing conditions.

Nute Variance - 4517 E. Foothill Drive (APN: 169-11-069) Case No. BA-19-02

Mr. Burton introduced the the variance request to allow unscreened roof mounted solar panels. He then gave the background, the scope of the request, and findings in favor and finding against the request.

Board Member Williams asked if there are alternative locations where the panels could be placed and be partially screened, such as ground mounted solar panels.

Mr. Burton responded not that he is aware of. He also added that the applicant indicated that solar tiles are not as efficient as panels.

Board Member Kile asked if this variance would also apply to new homes built on the property if the existing one was knocked down.

Mr. Burton clarified that if the variance is approved, it applies to the existing home.

Chair Leibsohn pointed out the panels are on the west and not the south end of the home.

Board Member Kile motioned to adjourn the work study session.

Board Member Newman seconded the motion.

The motion passed.

## 5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. 19-038 $\quad \begin{aligned} & \text { Tashman Variance-6010 E. Hummingbird Lane (APN: 169-49-060) } \\ & \text { Case No. BA-19-01 }\end{aligned}$

Deborah Weisberg, from Design Link Architecture, shared some of the history of the home including that it was built in 1965. She pointed out that the current plans do not encroach further than the original setbacks and that these additions will make it easier
to identify the front door without a large extension of the main house.

Chair Leibsohn expressed that he is leaning towards allowing the design to proceed.

Board Member Chambliss asked if there were any neighbors that were opposed to this application.

Mr. Burton replied that he did not receive inquiries but no stated opposition.

Chair Leibsohn asked for any public comment.

No public comment was given.

Board Member Kile motioned to approve case number BA-19-01 finding it meets the requirements for the special circumstances applicable only to the subject lot and that it meets the variance criteria subject to the plans, documents, and stipulations set forth in the action report.

Board Member Ozer seconded the motion.

Chairman Eric Leibsohn: yea; Board Member Emily Kile: yea; Board Member Rick Chambliss: yea; Board Member Jon Newman: yea; Board Member Quinn Williams: yea; Board Member Hope Ozer: yea

The motion passed unanimously.
B. $\quad 19-040 \quad$ Nute Variance - 4517 E. Foothill Drive (APN: 169-11-069)

Case No. BA-19-02
Howard Nute, applicant, shared details about the site. He clarified that the roof is the only place where the solar panels would be effective. He feels that getting solar panels is the right thing to do and the only person that may be affected is the neighbor above to the west who will see the solar panels on his metal roof. He then asked if he would have to go through the Hillside Building Committee if the Board approves it.

Mr. Burton responded he would.

Chair Leibsohn asked if he had spoken with his neighbors about this.

Mr. Nute replied that he has spoken with most of his neighbors who are all fine with
it. He made several attempts to talk with the western neighbor without success.

Board Member Ozer asked if his roof is visible to homes further up the mountain.

Mr. Nute stated he does not know for sure, although there is a significant elevation drop and lots of coverage from vegetation.

Board Member Ozer asked if the solar panels are the same color as the roof.

Mr. Nute replied that his roof is green, and the solar panels are black.

Chair Leibsohn asked if the solar panels reflectivity would affect adjacent properties.

Board Member Newman stated most solar panels are not reflective since they are trying to absorb the light. He also noted that the metal roof would probably be more reflective than the solar panels.

Board Member Ozer asked if the panels would be together or not.

Mr. Nute stated there are five groupings of panels.

Mr. Burton noted that with hillside code only requires the solar panels to be screened from the same elevation or lower.

Board Member Kile motioned to approve case number BA-19-02 pursuant to the submitted plans document, the stipulations set forth in the action report, and the variance criteria.

Board Member Ozer seconded the motion.

Board Member Chambliss stated he is not sure he is okay with this since the ordinance requires it to be screened.

Mr. Nute shared that this is the best option they could come up with. He added that for them to do ground panels they would have to be along the road which would also not be complaint.

Chair Leibsohn asked if they have considered methods of screening on the sloped roof.

Mr. Nute stated screening would decrease the efficiency of the panels and may be more obtrusive than the panels themselves. He also pointed out that they would not help screen anything from the neighbors above.

Board Member Kile commented that she feels that this meets the hardship criteria, and the variance should be allowed.

Chair Leibsohn, Member Newman, and Member Williams indicated they agree with Member Kile.

Board Member Williams urged staff to provide some clarification in the code so all solar panel cases like this do not have to come in for a variance.

Mr. Burton clarified that the Hillside code recommends solar tiles as a way to try and mitigate these issue. He added that less variance requests like this as solar tiles become more efficient.

Chairman Eric Leibsohn: yea; Board Member Emily Kile: yea; Board Member Rick Chambliss: yea; Board Member Jon Newman: yea; Board Member Quinn Williams: yea; Board Member Hope Ozer: yea

The motion passed unanimously.

## 6. ACTION ITEMS

## 7. CONSENT AGENDA

A. 19-042 | Approval of the January 2, 2019 Board of Adjustment Minutes. |
| :--- |
| Board Member Ozer motioned to approve the January 2, 2019 meeting minutes. |
| Board Member Newman seconded the motion. |

The motion passed unanimously.

## 8. STAFF REPORTS

None.

## 9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

None.

## 10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Staff identified the variance applications that are currently in review.

## 11. ADJOURNMENT

Board Member Kile motioned to adjourn the meeting at 6:25 p.m.

## Board Member Newman seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.


[^0]:    MAll_ADDRI
    8408 E SHEA BLVD SUITE D-4100 101 S PHILLIPS AVE SUITE 501 80 E RIO SALADO PKWY SUITE 511 4535 N 56TH ST 6645 N 39TH WAY 5441 E MOCKINGB 6625 N 39TH WAY 6615 N 39TH WAY
    6605 N 39TH WAY 3970 E SIERRA VISTA DR 2451 MARVIN LN
    
     5229 N TTH AVE 103 12934 W LLANO DR 1242 E JACKSONST 1242 EJACKSON ST 13 CARRIAGE RD
    6811 N HILLSIDE DR
    
     8200 N HILLSIDE CREST CREST DR
     4222 E LINCOLN DR 605 N 43 RD PL
     6531. N 43RD PL
     4333 E DESERT CREST DR 4333 E DESERT CREST DR
     4334 E DESERT CREST DR
    
    
     1437 ACACIA CT 4243 E DESERT CREST DR
    
     7d Oyet N 9t59

