



**PARADISE VALLEY
HILLSIDE BUILDING COMMITTEE MINUTES
JUNE 14, 2017**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Hillside Building Review Committee met on Wednesday, June 14, 2017, at Town Hall, 6401 East Lincoln Drive, Paradise Valley, Arizona, 85253. Committee Members present included Chair Scott Jarson, Scott Tonn (by telephone) and Planning Commissioners Dolf Strom, Tom Campbell, and Jonathan Wainwright. Staff present: Sr. Planner Paul Michaud, Building Safety Manager Robert Lee, Planner George Burton, Town Engineer Paul Mood, Engineering Technician Richard Edwards, and Executive Assistant/ Deputy Town Clerk Natalie Montenegrino. Chair Jarson called the meeting to order at 8:05 a.m.

2. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Chair Jarson stated the Hillside Building Review Committee may convene to an executive session at any time during the meeting as needed to confer with the Town Attorney for legal advice regarding any of the items listed on the agenda, as authorized by A.R.S. §38-431.03.A.3.

3. APPLICATION REVIEW

A. Combined review for retaining walls, pool remodel, and spa addition located at Mady Residence, 5631 N. 52nd Place (APN: 172-47-037B).

Najib Monsif, Engineer
Attila Mady, Owner

Planner George Burton presented the application for the addition of new retaining walls, a pool remodel, and new spa at 5631 N. 52nd Place. He said the Town received a complaint regarding the addition of retaining walls on the subject property. Staff visited the owner and informed him that the site improvements require hillside approval and permits. The two retaining walls located on the property are subject to Hillside Committee review, and the four retaining walls in the right-of-way are not subject to Hillside Committee review. One of the retaining walls will be removed and the applicant is working with the Town on obtaining an encroachment permit for the other three retaining walls. The remodel of the existing pool and addition of a new spa has been included in this application.

The retaining walls were constructed to prevent erosion of the property. They meet the setback, height and LRV requirements, and will be constructed using brown cinder block, reddish masonry block with stone, and brown rip-rap. A flagstone walking surface will be placed between the retaining wall and the carport. For safety, a 36 inch unpolished metal guard rail will be placed on top of the retaining wall.

The pool area is located along the east side of the house and is setback 70 feet. A new travertine tile surface will be placed around the pool area. A new spa will be placed next to the pool. A glass panel guard will be placed round the pool area. The glass panels are supported with an unpolished metal frame and meets hillside requirements. A masonry screen wall will be placed around the pool equipment. The screen wall will have a stucco finish and will be painted a red color to match the existing retaining wall.

Since the lot is 5.83 acres in size and has a building site slope of 28.5%, the 9,770 square feet of disturbance is well under the allowable 28,164 square feet.

A neighbor expressed concern regarding the aesthetics of the wall and the guard rail. The neighbor felt the retaining walls do not blend in with the hillside and was concerned about the unpolished metal used for the pool guard.

Chair Jarson asked which retaining wall will be removed.

Commissioner Strom asked Mr. Burton is the two foot setback from the property line was acceptable. Mr. Burton said yes.

Commissioner Strom asked Town Engineer Paul Mood if there was a need for rainwater retention. Mr. Mood said no.

Commissioner Campbell stated his concern about the structural integrity of the retaining walls and asked if the stacking blocks will be removed. Mr. Najib Monsif, the Structural Engineer, said that he has been in the business for 30 years and his stamp is on the plans. He will stabilize the blocks from the back, using the "dead man" technique, so that each block will be attached individually.

Commissioner Campbell stated the haphazard array of the walls with all the different surfaces and finishes was very unattractive. Chair Jarson agreed with the assessment and said the variety of materials was visually confusing and would require cosmetic work to be done to calm the sight.

Commissioner Wainwright asked Mr. Mood if he had concerns that the structures were not sound. Mr. Mood said he has no concerns as long as the plans were approved and sealed by a structural engineer.

Chair Jarson asked if there will be a new concrete cap to cover the top of the walls. Mr. Monsif said they will be capped.

Mr. Tonn questioned the depth of the footings. Mr. Monsif said they are 12 inches deep and 2 feet wide. The wall will have a post in front and the "dead man" back to stabilize it. Mr. Tonn said the footings are not 2 feet wide and is concerned about the structural integrity of the wall. Mr. Monsif said he will check these walls. He talked about the wall materials and the locations of the walls.

Mr. Attila Mady, the homeowner, said they are not proposing new walls. He wants the engineer to make improvements so the walls are safe and blend with the mountain. He said there is an erosion issue in the area and the walls have been doing what they were designed to do. They need the permits to finish the work and they will try to satisfy all the concerns.

Commissioner Campbell is concerned about the visual aspects of the walls and suggested a veneer finish so that the walls all look the same. He said the structural issues can be addressed by staff.

Chair Jarson stated his concern about the exposed rebar on top of the walls. Mr. Mady said the rebar will be bent into the cap or cut off. They will remove all the loose rocks. He will entertain proposals on veneering the walls.

Chair Jarson said the colors ought to match what is existing. He also suggested a stipulation stating the stainless steel metal rail be brushed to prevent erosion.

Commissioner Campbell said the veneer should be one common material to make the walls look the same. He moved continuing the application so the applicant can provide a sample board with veneers, drawings showing the revised stacking, and a 3/16" bushed stainless steel rail, and plans with structural details.

Chair Jarson seconded the motion.

Mr. Mady asked if they can work on the swimming pool independently. Commissioner Strom asked if they can approve the pool portion of the application and approve the walls later. Mr. Burton said no, the application is for the pool and walls and cannot be split.

Commissioner Campbell said his motion to continue is on the table. Mr. Burton said that the Committee will need to specify a date. He also reminded the Committee that the Council requested no actions be taken during the months of July and August since many residents are out of Town.

Chair Jarson asked if there are any comments from the public regarding this application. Ryan, a neighbor, said he would like to see this application move forward as quickly as possible.

Commissioner Campbell moved to continue the application to a special Hillside Meeting on June 26 at 9:00 a.m. Chair Jarson seconded the motion, which carried unanimously, 5-0. The Hillside Committee will meet on June 26, 2017 at 9:00 a.m. to discuss this application.

B. Combined review for photovoltaic system located at 4134 E Keim Drive (APN: 169-22-133).

Cole Eaton

Bob Lee said this project will install 182 solar modules on the existing foam roof of the Shultz, DFX residence located at 4134 East Keim Drive.

Mr. Eaton said all the panels are located at a minimum of a 5 foot setback from the parapet walls and will be laid flat to the roof, hidden from view from the same or lower elevation. This project will also be installed with 4 inverters located in an electrical room, out of sight. Utility meter and disconnect will be located at the service entrance, which is in an enclosed gated area, and equipment will be out of sight from street view.

Commissioner Strom stated there is room to give the panels a 9 inch slant so they can be more efficient. Mr. Eaton said the panels are coated so as not to collect dust.

Chair Jarson asked if any homes will see the panels. Mr. Eaton said no.

Commissioner Strom moved approval of the application, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, which carried unanimously, 5-0.

C. Combined review for a guest/fitness addition located at 8113 N. 54th Street (APN: 168-75-024).

**Jim Blochberger, Architect
Nick Prodanov, Civil Engineer**

Paul Michaud presented the application to construct a guest/fitness addition at the Mamolen residence. He said the applications meets the height and setback requirements, and the colors/materials will match the existing house and blend with the mountain. He said the new lighting will also match the existing. Mr. Michaud said Stipulation 7 and 8 were added by the Town Engineer regarding the dry well that is being proposed.

Chair Jarson said the height is so close to the maximum allowed. Mr. Michaud said a height certification will be done. Commissioner Strom asked how the height will be measured from natural grade. Mr. Michaud said the natural grade is near the stairwell. Mr. Blochberger clarified the location of the lowest level to rolling 24 feet. The location will be verified by the architect.

Commissioner Strom asked if the balcony was included in the FAR calculation since it has a green canopy and they are well under the allowable. Mr. Blochberger said it was not but they will count it in.

Commissioner Strom asked when the drywell inspection and maintenance takes place (Stipulation 7). Mr. Prodanov said after a major storm event.

Commissioner Campbell asked what material is used to cover the lamps and if it will be added to the existing fixtures. Commissioner Strom would like to include a stipulation to make sure the fixtures meet the "dark sky" requirement and the lumens do not exceed 750.

Chair Jarson asked if the canvas awning at the balcony will match the exiting. Mr. Blochberger said it will.

Chair Jarson asked if there were any comments from the public. There being none, he called for a motion.

Commissioner Campbell moved to approve the application with 2 added stipulations:

1. The balcony be included in the FAR calculations.
2. The light fixtures will be "dark sky" compliant at 750 lumens or less (3500K or less).

Commissioner Strom seconded the motion, which carried unanimously, 5-0.

D. Combined review for a remodel to the pool area of an existing home located at 4668 E Foothills Drive (APN: 169-11-142).

**John R. Callow
Will Counts**

Planner Paul Michaud presented the application to remodel the pool area at 4668 East Foothills Drive. He said there will be no work done to the house and minor work to the columns at the driveway. Some retention will be added at the green area. Colors and materials will match existing.

Chair Jarson asked if the metal railing will be painted. Mr. Callow said it will match the existing rail.

Commissioner Campbell asked if there will be landscape lighting. He said he was confused about the light fixtures. Mr. Callow there will be a few landscape lights. He said the fixture is a light bulb that shines straight down.

Commissioner Strom said the color of bulbs should be halogen 3000K, 3500K maximum, for a warmer light.

Commissioner Campbell said he likes the retention wall design.

Commissioner Strom asked about the rainwater retention. Mr. Callow said the existing pool takes up about 75% of the space that will be used and will go to the retaining wall with a cantilever deck, coming out about 6 feet.

Commissioner Strom asked where the retention basin will be. Mr. Callow said all the planter space will be retention. He said the Town asked him to lower the space, add rip rap and make it a retention space.

Mr. Mood said because of the slope, no retention was required. He said Woody Scoutten, the Interim Town Engineer, worked with the applicant and came up with the patio deck retention at the planter area, creating a retention triangle. Water from the patio drains towards the planter area.

Chair Jarson asked if there were grasses in the landscape design. He said that desert buckwheat is okay.

Chair Jarson asked if there were any comments from the public. There being none, he called for a motion.

Commissioner Wainwright moved approval of the application as proposed. Commissioner Strom added a stipulation that the LED fixtures not exceed 3500K, or less. The motion carried unanimously, 5-0.

E. Combined Review for landscape and site drainage improvements at Marsoner Residence, 6199 N. 44th Street (APN: 169-20-115). Application for

Nick Prodanov, Civil Engineer
Reinold Masoner, Owner

Planner George Burton said this application was discussed at the March 8, April 12, and May 10 meetings. Mr. Burton provided background about this application. He said the owner is out of Town and is represented by Nick Prodanov, the Civil Engineer.

Mr. Prodanov said the property will be brought back to its natural grade and revegetated with native plants. He tried to match the contours and the disturbed areas will be restored. The new design will remove the existing rip rap and add a retention basin at the northeast corner of the lot. The historic drainage flows will be restored and the retention basin will mitigate the amount of silt that leaves the property.

Commissioner Strom said the calculations are new and asked what numbers were used. He asked the Town Engineer if using 7.5 instead of 7.0 was acceptable. He also wanted to know the size of the retention basin.

Mr. Prodanov said the retention basin is 18 inches deep. He said he used C Factor of 75 but also used a higher 2.82" for the rainfall calculations rather than the required 2.2". Mr. Mood said this higher rainfall number makes up for the any minor reduction in the C Factor.

Chair Jarson said they Committee has seen this application several times. He said a letter from a neighbor was delivered to them.

Commissioner Strom stated for the record that the application that was approved in 2004 did not require onsite retention.

Mr. Bill Wilhoit is the neighbor who lives across the street from the subject property. He said that the retention basin may not hold all the runoff and it will go to his property. He suggested 2 options. The first option is installing a culvert/grate system which was rejected by Mr. Edwards. The second option is installing a pipe across the road. Mr. Edwards told him the option that will likely be approved today was restoring the property to its original natural grade.

Mr. Scudder Gookin, the Civil Engineer representing Mr. Wilhoit, suggested a cast iron drain in the public right-of-way. The other option is a culvert across the street.

Chair Jarson said that these suggestions are for the Town and not for the application that is before the Committee. He said the applicant was asked to restore the property to its natural grade and what is before the Committee today is what they were asked to do.

Commissioner Strom said the retention design is better than the original and will catch more rain water than they are required to do.

Commissioner Strom moved approval of the application as submitted.

Chair Jarson added a stipulation that the applicant seed the disturbed area with native Sonoran plantings.

Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion which carried unanimously, 5-0.

F. Combined review for a pool, deck, and pathway located at 6210 E Hummingbird Lane (APN: 169-49-026).

Justin Ferrick

Mr. Burton presented the application for a new negative edge pool, a metal fin pool barrier, a new pool deck that will be surfaced with a dark beige colored concrete, and a decomposed granite pathway along the west side of the property. The pool deck will have a cable guard rail and will house the pool equipment below. New landscape and

path lights will be placed at the improvement areas. There will be 2 retention areas between the new pool deck and the house, and a septic leach field improvements will be installed at the north side of the pool. The leach field will be restored to natural grade with native plants. The improvements meet all setback and lighting requirements.

Mr. Ferrick presented the material board for the project. He said the paint colors will match those of the existing house and the handrail will be have a natural color. The pool terrace will nestle into the landscape and the pool fencing will be the darker color.

Chair Jarson asked about the lighting at the pool, which side the pool light will face, and whether or not the pool trough will be lit.

Commissioner Campbell suggested a stipulation that the cascade edge and trough not lit.

Commissioner Strom said that none of the neighbors will see the pool lights. He would like to include a stipulation that the new lights not be higher than 3500K.

Commissioner Strom stated that rainwater retention was not a requirement when the house was built and other remodels were done. Now that it is a requirement, he wanted to know how the negative edge pool will handle the rainwater. Mr. Merrick pointed out the 2 retention sites. He said the pool water will flow into the trough. Mr. Mood said the trough should accommodate the rain flow but may be oversized in needed.

Commissioner Strom suggested adding a stipulation to add 2.2 inches of rainfall to the trough to accommodate rainwater flow and normal pool flows. Mr. Merrick said they can make the trough deeper.

Chair Jarson asked about the new leach field. Mr. Merrick said the house has been empty for several years and the leach field is not working. The new owner plans to replace it and work it into the landscape plan. Mr. Edwards said the County manages all the septic matters.

Chair Jarson opened the conversation to the public.

Julie Ono, a neighbor to the south, sated her concern about the septic system and the gas odors in the area. She also would like to see additional landscaping, preferably big trees, in the boulder area. She also wanted to make sure the pool equipment would not disturb the neighbors.

David, another neighbor, commented the dark color choice of the glass barrier. He would like to see a lighter color. He also would like to see more larger trees planted than the 6, 24 inch plants that are being suggested to obscure the building.

Chair Jarson said the lighter color is preferred since it opens up the view corridor. He suggested a stipulation to ensure that the lighter glass is used. He also suggested a

stipulation that the leach field be landscaped with Sonoran desert seeds. He said larger trees is encouraged but not a requirement.

Marci Johnsen, also a resident in the area, stated that where the ground percolation is not sufficient, planters can be placed to catch the water.

Commissioner Campbell left the meeting at 10:45 a.m.

Nan Murley, a neighbor 2 doors away, stated her concern about the grading and striping of vegetation. She said there have been many floods in the area and the grading at the pool and terrace area will alter the water flow and affect the neighbors.

Mr. Mood pointed out the drainage paths that will flow to the 2 retention basins. He said the water will flow off the terrace to the pool area and the pool trough.

Mrs. Murley stated her concern about the decomposed granite path. She said the granite will be washed down the mountain to the street.

Chair Jarson said a stipulation can be added to remove the decomposed granite on the pathway.

Chair Jarson asked staff to rein in the scope of the leach field. He recapped the added stipulations.

1. The pool trough of the negative edge pool will not be lit.
2. The new exterior LED lights will be 3500K or less.
3. The negative edge pool spill trough to be sized to accommodate 2.2 inches of rainwater capacity across the surface area of the pool and trough, in addition to normal pool operation.
4. Change the color of the glass barrier of the existing terrace/patio to a clear glass.
5. The new leach field area will have an application of a Sonoran desert seed mix.
6. The temporary construction access path will be completely removed offsite and the area restored.
7. The new decomposed granite pathway must be stabilized.

Chair Jarson moved approval of the application as submitted, and to include the 7 new stipulations (listed above). Commissioner Strom seconded the motion, which carried unanimously, 4-0.

G. Combined review for a spa addition located at 5700 E McDonald Drive (APN: 172-02-009B).

Justin Ferrick

Mr. Burton presented the application for a spa expansion at the Sanctuary Resort, 5700

East McDonald Drive. Also, one of the tennis courts will be converted into a synthetic lawn area. Materials and lighting will match existing resort colors. He said the managerial amendment to the resort's SUP was approved by Town Manager Burke on May 10, 2017. A stipulation was added that requires these improvements be approved by the Hillside Committee.

Mr. Tonn asked if a resident want to cover his tennis court with synthetic turf, would he require a permit. Mr. Burton said no.

Chair Jarson asked if there were any comments from the public. There being none, he said application was straight forward and called for a motion.

Commissioner Wainwright moved approval of the application as submitted. Commissioner Strom seconded the motion, which carried unanimously, 4-0.

4. STAFF REPORTS

There were no staff reports.

5. COMMITTEE REPORTS

There were no committee reports.

6. NEXT HILLSIDE BUILDING COMMITTEE MEETING

A special meeting is scheduled for Monday, June 26 at 9:00 a.m. The next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, July 27 at 8:00 a.m. and the August meeting was tentatively scheduled for August 9 at 8:00 a.m.

7. ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Wainwright moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Strom, which carried unanimously 4-0. The meeting adjourned at 11:25 a.m.