



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Final

Planning Commission

Tuesday, October 20, 2015

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting of the Town of Paradise Valley Planning Commission was called to order by Chair Strom at 6:00 pm

2. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present

Dolf Strom, Chair

Richard Mahrle, Commissioner

Scott Moore, Commissioner

Thomas Campbell, Commissioner

Daran Wastchak, Commissioner – Commissioner Wastchak attended by phone

Jeff Wincel, Commissioner

Jonathan Wainwright, Commissioner

Staff Present

Eva Cutro, Community Development Director

Andrew Miller, Town Attorney

Paul Michaud, Senior Planner

George Burton, Planner

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

A. 15-243 Work Study Session - Special Use Permit Major Amendment

Ritz-Carlton Paradise Valley

7000 E Lincoln Drive (SUP-15-01)

Eva Cutro presented the application in accordance with the application packet. Eva described the updated documents from the previous meeting and identified the main concerns that were brought up during the October 19th meeting. The areas of the plan were discussed individually.

Area B.

It was noted that the number of lots were reduced to 66, the entrance was moved further south and this area has 2.09 dwelling units (du) per acre. It was also noted that the perimeter lots are larger than the interior lot and they have a minimum lot size is 10,000 sq ft.

There was discussion about the new lot coverage on Area B and Ms. Cutro identified that the homes located near St. Barnabus Church do not meet the Open Space Criteria.

Area A1.

Ms. Cutro discussed the proposal for Area A. It was noted that the building at southwest corner was reduced from 3 stories to 2 stories and that the applicant is proposing the same unit count.

Area C and Area D.

Ms. Cutro discussed the proposal for Area C and D.

Area E.

Ms. Cutro noted that Area E is a differed submittal that will need an Intermediate Amendment to the Special Use Permit. Chair Strom asked if the mistake on the parking study has been fixed and Commissioner Campbell asked about the side yard setbacks for Area B.

The Commission then reviewed and discussed the Special Use Permit Stipulations.

Special Use Permit Stipulations.

Ms. Cutro provided an overview of the changes that were made to the stipulations. Stipulations 30, 38 and 39 were discussed in detail. The Commission requested that the acronyms be spelled out and Ms. Cutro explained the stipulation regarding community outreach.

Ms. Cutro explained that if the application is forwarded to the Town Council, there would be a joint Council/Commission review on Thursday, November 5th.

The applicant noted that they are good with the stipulations.

Mr. Miller asked the applicant about how they want to reference booklet with all the supplemental sheets and Ms. Cutro clarified that the dates on the booklet and the amended dates must be noted if a motion is made.

Chair Strom asked for clarification about the applicant's letter. The applicant clarified that the updated plans show what the Commission wants to see, but the updated plans do not express what the applicant wants. The letter clarifies this.

At 6:35 pm, the meeting was moved to Council Chamber for the Public Hearing.

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. 15-244 Hearing - Special Use Permit Major Amendment

**Continued from 10-06-15 Meeting
Five Star Ritz-Carlton Paradise Valley
7000 E Lincoln Drive (SUP-15-01)**

The Public Hear started at 6:35 pm.

Ms. Cutro presented the Five Star/Ritz-Carlton application in accordance with the packet and explained the scope of improvement per Area. The Commission discussed:

- Visually significant corridors and the proposed landscaping along Lincoln Dr.
- The main points on fire safety, drainage, traffic/circulation and noise.

Ms. Cutro presented the three possible recommendations:

- Approval with stipulations, or
- Denial, or
- Continuance.

Ms. Cutro also explained that the Town Council will make the final decision on this application.

Commissioner Wainwright asked about how much the height was lowered in Area A1 from three to two stories. Ms. Cutro responded and identified the reduction in height.

Jason Morris, representative for the applicant, stated that his presentation will focus on the Statement of Direction. He identified that this is a transitional property between uses and density. Mr. Morris discussed the changes and reductions to the plans from the original submittal in June.

Chair Strom noted 8 discussion topics and opened the Public Comment portion of the hearing.

Public Comment:

Dorothy Smith is a resident and stated that she is in favor of the resort but not all aspects of the project. She stated that she has one problem and wants some physical activities to be added to the resort.

Linda Peterson Warren stated that she wants to address the resort

comprehensively. She discussed aesthetic and economic considerations, and noted that the application should move forward now and not delay it.

George Getz noted that he is a resident and was working with Five Star on this plan. He owns the Scottsdale Spectrum. Mr. Getz stated that the resort is a great economic driver and he supports it.

Miroszlv Briestensky is a resident that is strongly in favor of project. Mr. Briestensky noted that the project will increase property values and he is trying to understand why this approval process is taking so long. He stated that over 200 changes have been made to the plan and that the Statement of Direction is supposed to be flexible but it does not seem to be flexible.

Robert Rasmussen is a resident. Mr. Rasmussen stated that he has technical concerns. He said the resort area is not on 20 acres, only 18. He is concerned about the 56 foot tall resort building and the noise. He hopes there is no amplified sound from the tower. He also wants to make sure the resort pays it fair share for utilities and that it is not passed on to the residents.

Joan Levinson is a resident and a realtor specializing in Paradise Valley. She stated that people in PV are crazy about the Town like a sports team. That's why the Ritz chose us and we need to choose the Ritz. She stated that the older residents need the housing diversity.

Bob and Pat Bondurant are residents. Ms. Bondurant said her neighbors say to vote yes on this. They are 100% behind the resort and hope the Commission stops squeezing it down in size. It's a fantastic idea.

Collin Williams supports the resort and this project. It will be great for the Town and he hopes the Planning Commission votes yes.

Debbie Gaby is a resident that live at Montelucia. She said that she is tired of taking of everyone's time. She believes the pluses outweigh the negative. The baby boomers are tired of the big lots and this keeps the caliber people that we went to live here. She loves the opportunity to live at the Ritz.

Paul Butzler is a resident. He noted that Area B is consistent with the SOD and wants it approved.

Dorothy Smith is a resident. She praised the Planning Staff and thanked Five Star for discussing her concerns and answering her questions. She would like to see some components different and activities for the resort. She does not approve the plan as presented. The lots are too small. Regarding Area B, the inside lots only have a 5 foot setback on the sides. Will you want to buy a lot with the house so close?

Lisa Parker is a resident and a realtor. She complimented the Planning Commission and applicant for all their hard work. Compared to Mountain

Shadows, this is going fast. The resort will be a beautiful product that will enhance the Town. She stated that there is a need for a smaller housing product for our aging population and she is confident that the Commission and Town will address the traffic issues.

Mel Comstock is a resident that is in the mobile home park business. He stated that you need a 15 foot separation between mobile homes and wants the applicant to reconsider the 10 foot setback. He stated that he supports the project.

Leonard Gaby is a resident. He said you don't need a lot of land. They have great security at Montelucia and he is frustrated about the amount of time it takes to approve something. It's time to get something done. If it's not approved, you must have a better alternative for this property. If so, he would like to hear what the alternative is.

Mike Foley is a resident at Colonia Miramonte. He stressed the need to downsize. There is a need for this type of housing product. He stated that the Commission should approve of the project.

Joe Straining lives just outside of Paradise Valley. He represents an age demographic that is at the back nine of their life. He supports the project and stated this is a commendable project.

Patrick Van Den Bossche supports the project. This is a creative project that will bring the right visitors to the city and will we have an iconic project.

Linda Peterson Warren. She stated that this is an opportunity for a new gold standard in our own back yard. It's here for both residents and tourist to enjoy. The time and opportunity is now and she urges the Commission to seize that opportunity.

Patti VanHawk is a Scottsdale Residents. She stated that there is a good deal of vagueness in this project and she is concerned about the traffic. She is also interested in the de-annexation before final decisions are made.

Miroslzv Briestensky stated that the applicant's concessions are reasonable. The applicant widened some of the right-of-way, reduced lots and heights. He stated that further reductions are an insurmountable task and wishes that the Commission will approve this.

Dorothy Smith stated that she is 85 years old and enjoys living on an acre and that we will have different views. She said this will get passed and this is about making it the best resort possible. We are not a town of this, this and this, now.

Robert Rasmussen is a resident and he stated that he is a baby boomer and a residents who moved here for the one acre lots and zoning.

The Chair closed the public comment portion of the meeting.

Commissioner Wincel motioned for approval.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Moore.

Commissioner Mahrle expressed his concerns about the unknown elements and the density. He stated that Area A1 and Area D are not appropriate uses for the Town.

Commissioner Campbell clarified the main points of the Statement of Direction and the direction the Planning Commission was given, for example, no fourth story. He noted that the plan has taken most of north east view away because of Palmeria. He asked why you can't capture the same rooftop experience from the deck outside the lounge lobby.

Commissioner Wainwright supports the motion of the floor. The density has been put to the east as much as possible.

Commissioner Wincel explained the length of the process. He disagrees with the comment that we have taken this diamond and are making it into a sliver of a jewel. Instead, we have been polishing this diamond. There have been changes to the density that allows residents to have different life style options and remain in the Town. He supports the proposal on the table.

Commissioner Moore stated that the only reduction compared to 2008 is a reduction in the resort. The density has increased. He supports this and reiterated that compromises have taken place.

Commissioner Wastchak stated that he appreciate all the comments. He is in support of the motion and the proposal.

The motion passed by a vote of 5 to 2, with Commissioner Marhle and Commissioner Campbell in descent.

The Planning Commission reconvened into Work Study Session at 8:35 p.m.

6. STUDY SESSION ITEMS (CONTINUED)

A. 15-222 Discussion of "The Villas at Mountain Shadows II" Final Plat SW Corner Lincoln Drive and 56th Street (FP 15-02)

Mr. Michaud presented the final plat and condo map in accordance with the application packet.

Commissioner Moore asked about a map dedication and public utility easements.

Fred Fleet with Coe & Van Loo Consultants stated that the public utility easements

are located on the perimeter.

Commissioner Moore asked how the utilities get to the lots if the public utility easements are on the perimeter.

Commissioner Campbell noted that Detail A is confusing. It looks like the north is to the left and he requested the applicant fix detail A so north is up.

Commissioner Wastchak stated that the update EPCOR letter was good.

**B.15-228 Discussion of “The Villas at Mountain Shadows Condominiums”
Preliminary Condominium Map
SW Corner Lincoln Drive and 56th Street (PP 15-03)**

Mr. Michaud presented the condo map in accordance with the packet.

Mr. Michaud discussed streets and parking in response to questions from Chair Strom.

Chair Strom noted that there was an error on Sheet 5. That the walls shown as .05 and .06 inches wide must be updated.

7. ACTION ITEMS

**A. 15-223 Recommendation of “The Villas at Mountain Shadows II” Final Plat
SW Corner Lincoln Drive and 56th Street (FP 15-02)**

Commissioner Campbell motioned for approval.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Wainwright.

The motion passed unanimously.

**B. 15-229 Recommendation, “Villas at Mountain Shadows Condominiums”
Preliminary Condominium Map
SW Corner Lincoln Drive and 56th Street (PP 15-03)**

Commissioner Wainwright motioned for approval.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Wincel.

The motion passed unanimously.

8. CONSENT AGENDA
9. STAFF REPORTS
10. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS
11. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS
12. ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Campbell motioned to adjourn the meeting.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Moore.

The motion passed unanimously.

By: 
Eva Cutro, Secretary