



---

**STAFF REPORT**

---

**TO:** Mayor Bien-Willner and Town Council Members

**FROM:** Jill B. Keimach, Town Manager  
Lisa Collins, Community Development Director  
Paul Michaud, Planning Manager

**DATE:** June 10, 2021

**DEPARTMENT:** Community Development Department – Planning Division  
Paul Michaud, 480-348-3574

**AGENDA TITLE:** Consideration of a Subdivision Sign at 6403 E Luke Avenue  
(MI-20-02)

**RECOMMENDATION:**

I move for approval of the Cameldale Estates subdivision sign at 6403 E Luke Avenue, subject to the following stipulations:

1. The subdivision monument sign shall be in substantial compliance with the submitted documents that includes the following:
  - a. Narrative from Dirk Bloom dated May 6, 2021;
  - b. Overall Site Plan, Sheet DRB200, prepared by Drewett Works Architecture, dated February 17, 2020;
  - c. Site Plan (Detail), Sheet DRB201, prepared by Drewett Works Architecture, dated February 17, 2020;
  - d. Signage Plan, Sheet DRB202, prepared by Drewett Works Architecture, dated February 17, 2020 with the sign material using mocha-colored stone veneer and bronze lettering (or similar material); and
  - e. FXLuminaire up light cut sheets, 3 pages, showing that each fixture is 35 watt, 331 lumens and 2,700 Kelvins. Sign light fixtures shall not exceed 3 light fixtures per sign face, be pointed away from the right-of-way property line, be directed onto the sign as not to create light spillover, have an antique bronze metallic powder coat finish (or similar finish), and the brightness of these fixtures not exceed 0.75 foot-candles at the property line.
  
2. The applicant shall provide a setback certification for the monument sign along Invergordon Road and Luke Avenue prior to footing inspection approval for the sign building permit.



---

**STAFF REPORT**

---

3. Lot 2 of the Luke Avenue Lot Line Adjustment shall not be used in the future for calculation of a subdivision sign(s) separate from the sign application for Cameldale Estates.
4. The subdivision monument sign shall consist of a monument sign, lighting, and surrounding landscaping; which shall be maintained by the property owner in good condition (e.g., material finish in good appearance, properly secured, no weeds). Maintenance and enforcement shall follow Town Code provisions, including that landscaping within the 50-foot by 50-foot corner vision complies with Section 8-1-13 of the Paradise Valley Town Code that limits landscape material to two-foot tall.
5. Removal of the subdivision monument sign is allowable at any time and is a private matter between the property owner(s), or successors.

**SUMMARY STATEMENT:**

Request

Dean Ciofani, on behalf of the property owner of Cameldale Final Properties, Inc., is requesting approval of a two-sided subdivision identification monument sign of “Cameldale Estates” at the southeast corner of Invergordon Road and Luke Avenue located on the R-43-zoned single-family residential property at 6403 E Luke Avenue (Maricopa County Tax Parcel 173-10-023).

Council Discussion

The Council discussed this request at its May 27<sup>th</sup> study session. Items noted included several points summarized below.

There was an inquiry on whether the Council action is a legislative act. The approval of a subdivision sign is a ministerial act by the Council much like the Council role in approving a final plat. Article XXV of the Zoning Ordinance lists certain sign provisions (e.g. height, setback) that the applicant is to meet and allows for variations of said provisions whereby Council has greater approval discretion. The proposed sign as described in this staff report complies with the provisions of Article XXV.

There was discussion on the circumstance that the proposed subdivision sign is on a private lot. There are several examples of a subdivision sign located on a private lot within the town. Some of these include Camelhead North approved in 2017 with a sign at 4816 E Arroyo Verde Drive and 4600 E Pebble Ridge Road (which is conglomeration of several subdivisions operated through a voluntary neighborhood association),



---

## STAFF REPORT

---

Kachina Estates at 6608 E Malcomb Drive, La Place at 6500 N 64<sup>th</sup> Place, and Stone Canyon at 5331 E McDonald Drive and 5975 E McDonald Drive.

There was discussion requiring a homeowner association to maintain the sign. Article XXV of the Zoning Ordinance that governs subdivision signs includes no provisions on whether said sign needs to be managed through a homeowner association or any particular mechanism. The proposed request meets the intent of Article XXV in that the 11 lot owners all support the proposed sign (refer to the emails in Attachment D, Noticing). Sign maintenance rests with the lot owner of 6403 E Luke Avenue as requested with this application request. However, these owners might later opt to pursue other mutually agreeable means to maintain the sign. Maintenance and enforcement will follow regular Town Code provisions to the property owner of 6403 E Luke Avenue (as any violation that occurs on private property).

A concern was noted that the proposed subdivision sign is within the 50-foot x 50-foot corner vision. The only portion within this area is 2 square feet of a 6-inch tall planter. Pursuant to the building code provisions per Section 5-2-2 of the Town Code, the planter is not a structure as it is under 8 inches tall. Stipulation 4 addresses maintenance and enforcement if the sign is not maintained (which follows the typical Town Code compliance procedures).

There was discussion over the long-term implication of a private lot owner maintaining a subdivision sign instead of a homeowner association. Stipulation 6 emphasizes that extinguishment of the subdivision sign is a private matter between the property owner(s), unless there is a code compliance matter regarding the maintenance of the sign.

### Residential Subdivision Sign Process

The application request for installing new residential subdivision signs follows Article XXV, Signs, of the Town Zoning Ordinance. The exact specifications of the sign that include dimensions, materials, method of illumination, number and location are approved by Council. This type of sign does not require Planning Commission recommendation per the Town Zoning Ordinance.

### Cameldale Estates

The subject lots comprise of 10 lots from the Invergordon Manor final plat recorded on June 14, 2006 and Lot 2 of the Luke Avenue Lot Line Adjustment along the north side of Luke Avenue. All 11 lots are being developed by the same general contractor of Bedrock Developers, LLC. There is no homeowner association or Code, Covenant, & Restrictions (CC&Rs) approved with any of these lots. The maintenance of the



---

## STAFF REPORT

---

subdivision sign will be the owner and any future owner(s) of 6403 E Luke Avenue. Exhibit D includes a draft private maintenance agreement included as a stipulation should the Council approve the subdivision sign request.

There are seven entities that comprise the ownership of the 11 lots. Cameldale Final Properties, LLC and Cameldale Land, LLC is the developer who presently owns Lots 1, 2, 3, 7, and 9 of Invergordon Manor. The proposed subdivision sign is on Lot 1 of Invergordon Manor at 6403 E Luke Avenue which is owned by Cameldale Final Properties, LLC. The other owners include the following: 6439 East Luke Avenue, LLC (owner of Lot 4 of Invergordon Manor); ATARAXIA 6453 L.L.C. (Owner of Lot 5 of Invergordon Manor); Lanny Bruce Lahr and Marlene Frances Lahr (owner of Lot 6 of Invergordon Manor); Casa Blanca Retreat, LLC (owner of Lot 8 of Invergordon Manor); Cameldale Residence LLC (owner of Lot 10 of Invergordon Manor); and 5602 Wilkinson, LLC (owner of Lot 2 of the Luke Avenue Lot Line Adjustment). Attachment C includes correspondence from these lot owners in support of the proposed subdivision sign.

### General Plan/Zoning

This neighborhood, including the subject property has a “Low Density Residential” General Plan designation and “R-43” zoning for single-family use. The proposed residential subdivision monument sign supports policies of the General Plan. These include the following:

- CC&H 3.1.1.1 Neighborhoods as a Basic Unit. Recognizing that the Town of Paradise Valley is home to many smaller neighborhoods that contribute to the Town’s cultural fabric, the Town shall strive through community outreach to preserve and enhance their distinctiveness, identity, and livability.
- LU 2.1.1.4 Encourage Neighborhood Maintenance. The Town shall encourage the maintenance and revitalization of existing neighborhoods while sustaining their visual coherence and compatibility. The Town shall also actively encourage resident involvement in neighborhood maintenance and revitalization. The identity of this neighborhood association supports the association’s active involvement in maintenance and revitalization.

The Town Code and Zoning Ordinance is silent on requiring the name of the subdivision sign to match the name of the final plat. However, this is the most common circumstance within the Town. There are examples of subdivision signs named something other than the platted subdivision names. In 2017, Council approved a subdivision sign at 4816 E Arroyo Verde Drive and 4600 E Pebble Ridge Road under the name of “Camelhead North.” This is the name of a neighborhood association that

# TOWN Of PARADISE VALLEY



## STAFF REPORT

consists of 71 lots within five platted subdivisions. These subdivisions include Villa Maderos del Cuenta, Villa de Cabrillo, Pebble Ridge, Camelhead Estates, and Camelhead Estates Unit 2.

### Sign Criteria

The proposed monument sign meets Article XXV, Signs, of the Town Zoning Ordinance as described in the following table.

CRITERIA	PROPOSED MONUMENT SIGN
Quantity: two signs	<b>Complies.</b> 2 signs, “Signs” under Section 201, Definitions, of the Zoning Ordinance defines each sign face as a sign. As such, each face of the one “L” shaped monument sign are 2 signs per the Zoning Ordinance.
Content: name & logo	<b>Complies.</b> Each sign face of the proposed sign includes only a name and logo. The application describes the sign as concrete construction with mocha-colored stone veneer and bronze aluminum lettering. The sign design is consistent with other signs approved in the Town.
Sign Area: 22 sf (2 sf per lot, 30 sf maximum; whichever is lower)	<b>Complies.</b> 22 square feet. The request in incorporating Lot 2 of the Luke Avenue Lot Line Adjustment has the effect of increasing the allowable sign area by two square feet for each sign face. This results in a difference of up to 8 inches in width.
Height: 3 feet	<b>Complies.</b> 3 feet
Setback: 25 feet	<b>Complies.</b> 26 feet from Invergordon Road and Luke Avenue right-of-way lines. The planter area in the front of the sign is 6 inches tall and not considered a structure by the Zoning Ordinance. This curb is setback 24 feet from the right-of-way lines. The planter will include various annuals and perennials.
No audible signs permitted	<b>Complies.</b> Sign will not have any components that flash, move, or are otherwise animated/audible
Indirect lighting of sign limited to two 75-watt incandescent bulbs (750 lumens) per sign side; bulb completely shielded from view at	<b>Complies.</b> Applicant proposes to use 3 light fixtures per sign. The proposed FXLuminaire up light fixtures will be mounted behind the planter curb and give indirect lighting to the sign. The proposed fixture will have an antique bronze metallic powder coat finish, will be 35 watt, 331 lumens and 2,700 Kelvins. The fixtures will be pointed

# TOWN *Of* PARADISE VALLEY



---

## STAFF REPORT

---

nearest property line, limited to 0.75 foot-candles at property line; and not more than 3,000 Kelvins	away from the property line and roadway, which should not exceed 0.75 foot-candles at the property line. As with other approved residential identification signs, the sign may be illuminated from dusk to dawn.
---	--

### Sight Visibility

As an aid to safe movement of vehicles at and near street intersections and in order to promote more adequate protection for the safety of children, pedestrians, and operators of vehicles, the Town Code has limitations on the height of fences, walls, gateways, ornamental structures, hedges, shrubbery and other fixtures, construction and planting on all corner lots. The proposed monument sign is outside the typical 50-foot corner vision of Section 8-1-13 of the Town Code. There is a small portion of the 6-inch tall planter within the corner vision which is allowable as restrictions are obstructions between 2-foot and 8-foot tall.

### Comments & Noticing

As previously noted, the owners of the 11 lots used to calculate the proposed sign area are in support. These along with 14 other nearby property owners were mailed notice of the request set for the June 10<sup>th</sup> action. As of the writing of this report, staff received no additional public comments.

### **BUDGETARY IMPACT:**

There are no direct Town budget impacts associated with the application request.

### **ATTACHMENT(S):**

- A. Staff Report
- B. Vicinity Map
- C. Application Packet & Plans
- D. Noticing
- E. Presentation

- C: - Applicant
- Case File