



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Draft

Planning Commission

Tuesday, December 3, 2019

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wainwright called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present 6 - Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright
Commissioner James Anton
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell
Commissioner Pamela Georgelos
Commissioner Orme Lewis
Commissioner Daran Wastchak

Absent 1 - Commissioner Charles Covington

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. [19-449](#) Discussion of a Minor Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP 19-06)
Five Star Area C - Basement Lightwells, Modified Chimney Heights, and
Modified Fence Wall Heights - 7000 E Lincoln Drive
- George Burton, Planner, presented an overview of the request for a Minor Special Use Permit Amendment. He noted that staff recommended limiting the amount of encroachment into the setback area.
- Discussion was made on the size of the lots and Commissioner Campbell asked for details on the railing around the lightwells.
- The applicant explained that the railing would be three feet tall, but a decision had not been on the material and style. He then shared an idea for a 36-inch glass wall.
- Mr. Burton pointed out that the current Special Use Permit would have to be modified to allow for a 36-inch wall in the front yard since it currently does not allow for that. He added that he had a draft stipulation to address this request.

Commissioner Wastchak clarified that what they are asking for is a decrease of the setback by five feet for the lightwells.

It was indicated that the lightwells would be 12 feet deep.

Commissioner Campbell stated he was supportive of the concept. He pointed out that his issue was with the front encroachment and not those on the side and back yard.

Commissioner Anton asked what kind of landscaping they would have in front of the lightwells.

The applicant responded that there would be grass with planter beds between them.

Chairman Wainwright asked if there would be ladders in each of the lightwells.

The applicant indicated that approximately two-thirds of them would have ladders since they were attached to bedrooms.

Chairman Wainwright asked if they had done any radon tests on the site.

The applicant indicated it had not been an issue or brought up before, but that they could check into it as well as a potential mediation plan.

Chairman Wainwright shared that radon typically is more of an issue in basement areas.

Commissioner Wastchak noted that currently they are not required by the EPA to do radon test in the State of Arizona.

Mr. Burton explained that Stipulation 44 will have to be modified for the public hearing and that the proposed language was bolded in their packet. He added that he would include clarification of the 5-foot setback encroachment being limited to a maximum of 400 square feet total.

Commissioner Anton asked that the stipulation call out the maximum area on the front lightwells.

Commissioner Wastchak asked for better renderings of the wall or railing for the lightwells for each style of building when they come back. He indicated that the only area of concern with the railing for him was the front yard.

Chairman Wainwright suggested allowing for higher walls than 36-inches. It was suggested to allow for a height range of 36-42 inches.

Commissioner Lewis asked how the lightwells will be cleaned.

The applicant explained that they will all have drains so they can be washed out.

Commissioner Georgelos asked to see more of the landscaping that will go around the lightwell areas. She clarified it might help the Planning Commission get a better idea of how much of a hazard it is since landscaping could help prevent people from going near them.

Mr. Burton introduced information on the proposed chimneys and chimney screens. He clarified that the applicant was requesting an additional three feet to the allowed height for their chimney and screens.

Commissioner Wastchak indicated he was not supportive of a 24-foot-wide chimney.

Chairman Wainwright asked if there were any mechanical reasons why the chimneys need to be higher.

The applicant stated they had to sit above the roof in order to meet code and function properly.

Commissioner Georgelos asked what they planned to screen with the chimney screen.

The applicant clarified that they were for the chimney flue as well as vent hood and anything else that would sit on top of the roof. He shared that they do not want the roof plane speckled with vents and equipment. He further explained that it would not need to be that wide but architecturally they felt it was a better design. He also noted that all the fireplaces were gas and that some would be built out of masonry and others would not.

Commissioner Lewis indicated he liked the architectural definition of the design and how it would hide any relief on the roof. He added that he felt there was an accommodation that would work.

Commissioner Campbell recommended they keep the rest of the mass under the 20 feet and allow for only the required chimney portion to exceed that height.

Commissioner Anton asked if there was a maximum number of chimneys a

home could have.

Commissioner Campbell indicated he was fine with people having as many as they wanted.

Commissioner Georgelos asked what the ordinance says about popups and chimney heights.

Mr. Burton replied the popups are not addressed but states the maximum height is 24 feet for two-stories and 20 feet for one-story.

Chairman Wainwright suggested allowing for relief for the two-story buildings, but sticking to the Special Use Permit for one-story buildings.

The applicant asked if they could delineate between interior and perimeter lots as well, so an interior one-story lot could be allowed to have a chimney that goes above the 20 feet.

Commissioner Georgelos asked how that might affect the view shed.

The applicant indicated they felt that the interior homes would be set back far enough that it would not make a difference.

Commissioner Lewis asked for the material of the roof finish.

The applicant stated it will be concrete roof tiles on the pitched roofs.

Commissioner Wastchak asked what the inside ceiling height was on the one-story homes.

The applicant responded that they varied.

Commissioner Wastchak indicated he was in support of sticking strictly to the 20-foot height limit for the one-story homes on exterior lots.

Commissioner Anton expressed that he would still like to see a limit on the size and quantity of chimneys.

Chairman Wainwright asked for the applicant to come back with a specific minimum chimney size.

Mr. Burton clarified that the Planning Commission had determined that screens had to meet the building height of the building and chimneys on perimeter buildings also had to meet the maximum height of the building, while chimneys on interior buildings could extend three feet above the

adjoining roof. He added that the applicant would also need to come back with a reasonable maximum size and quantity for chimneys for Planning Commission consideration at the next meeting.

Mr. Burton described the request for modified fence wall heights. He clarified that the request is to have a three-foot retaining wall with six-foot fence wall on top for a maximum height of nine-feet tall. He presented renderings of the development with the locations of the fence and retaining walls. He then reviewed the standards for a minor Special Use Permit amendment to help the Commission identify if the request constituted a minor amendment or not.

Commissioner Campbell suggested the applicant invite members of the Planning Commission to go see the site in person.

The applicant indicated they would be happy to accommodate that request.

Mr. Burton clarified that they would have a work session for this Item on December 17, 2019 followed by a public hearing on January 7, 2020.

No Reportable Action

B. [19-451](#)

Continued Discussion of Upcoming Planning Commission Items for Council Retreat

Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director, announced that the retreat would be held on January 30, 2020. He added that they will get an agenda to the Planning Commission before the retreat.

Commissioner Wastchak asked that Mr. Knapp start composing an agenda with items that were brought up during the Commissions last conversation about the retreat and bring it back to them at their next work session.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

6. ACTION ITEMS

None

7. CONSENT AGENDA

A. [19-438](#)

Approval of November 5, 2019 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Wastchak, seconded by Commissioner Georgelos, to approve the November 5, 2019 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wastchak

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Covington

8. STAFF REPORTS

None

9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

None

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Mr. Knapp reviewed the upcoming items.

11. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell at 7:10 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Wastchak, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wastchak

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Covington