



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Final

Planning Commission

Tuesday, July 17, 2018

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present 7 - Commissioner Daran Wastchak
Commissioner James Anton
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell
Commissioner Charles Covington
Commissioner Pamela Georgelos
Commissioner Orme Lewis
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. [18-281](#) Consideration of a proposed lot split (LS 18-01)
5617 N Huntress Drive (APN: 169-43-122)
- Eva Cutro, Special Projects Coordinator, presented the application. Subject site is part of the Mountain Shadows Resort property. Ms. Cutro explained that the site was originally approved as two lots in a 40 lot subdivision in 2014. In 2016 the two lots were combined into one. Now the applicant is requesting to split the property back into two lots in the same configuration as the original 2014 plat.
- Ms. Cutro explained there is a difference on the rear yard setback from what is shown on the plat in the packet. Lot 25B requires a 20' rear yard setback and Lot 26B an average rear yard setback of 25'.
- The approval process was explained. If approval is unanimous the lot split does not need to go to Town Council.
- The stipulations were reviewed.
- The Commission had no comments or questions.

There was no comment from the public.

No Reportable Action

5. ACTION ITEMS

- A. [18-283](#) Consideration of a proposed lot split (LS 18-01)
5617 N Huntress Drive (APN: 169-43-122)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to approve the Mountain Shadows Resort Estates III Lot Split, subdividing approximately 0.461 acres into two (2) residential lots of 10,000 square feet and 10,500 square feet each, subject to the following stipulations:

1. The lot split plat must be recorded with the Maricopa County Recorder's Office, in substantial compliance with the survey plat prepared by CVL Consultants, dated June 13, 2018.
2. Within 60 days of approval of the plat, the applicant shall submit Mylars and an electronic version in a pdf format for the Town's permanent record.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

6. STUDY SESSION ITEMS (CONTINUED)

- A. [18-288](#) Discussion of a Minor Amendment to the Hermosa Inn Special Use Permit (SUP-18-08)
5532 N. Palo Cristi Road (Assessor No. 170-03-129)

George Burton, Planner, described the application request. There will be no change to the previously approved 49 keys and 69,038 sf, the changes are to the locations and elevations of structures.

Mr. Burton gave background on the prior approvals.

Mr. Burton reviewed each aspect of the request describing each building, how it compared to the 2016 approval, and showed photographs/illustrations. He did not break out the prior managerial and minor SUP approvals but, rather, used the 2016 SUP amendment as the baseline.

Commissioner Campbell questioned the elevation of the middle building.

He also discussed the proposed string lights and possible visibility from the street. It was recommended that the applicant set up the lights for viewing by the Commissioners.

Commissioner Anton verified that both proposed tents in the event area can be erected at the same time and that the tents will be visible from the street. Commissioner Lewis had concerns with the tents being erected for up for 16 continual days. Commissioner Campbell noted that the new tent location is far superior to the previous area. It was discussed that the Town noise ordinance will apply. The noise at the property line shall not exceed 56 or 45 decibels. Police will go out with a noise meter if necessary. Chairman Wastchak is less concerned with noise since the tents are more internal to the site. It was recommended that the stipulation that prohibits amplified music also include any music associated with the tent. Applicant will consider this stipulation modification.

Mr. Burton reviewed the parking history, including removal of the garden and construction of a 10' screen wall. He noted that the neighbor to the north had concerns about the wall, measured from their grade and not Hermosa's grade. Neighbor is asking for a 13' tall wall. Doug Jorden, representing the applicant, noted that the wall is proposed to the west end of the parking area. Mr. Jorden states the applicant can extend the wall past the west end of the parking lot. Applicant is also requesting additional parking, although the parking is not required. Commissioner Georgelos asked what the parking requirements are for this site. Mr. Burton responded that 156 spaces are required.

There was discussion on the location and height of the proposed lights. The pole light height is proposed at 10'.

Mr. Burton stated he received 4 comments from the public. There were concerns with the intensity of use, noise, and light.

The application is scheduled for action at the August 21, 2018 Commission meeting. There were concerns about having a hearing before Labor Day. It was decided that the Commission will hear this item on August 21st, take any public comment, and then continue the hearing until September 18th.

There was more discussion regarding parking and the need to increase parking for employee vehicles. Mr. Jorden will provide a parking analysis at the next meeting.

Controlled access to the site and fire access also need additional review.

Commissioner Campbell suggested additional landscaping at the northwest area, west of the parking lot.

There was discussion on the proposed wall and whether an additional 3 feet will have any effect on restricting noise. There was also a concern that if a "no man's land" will exist between the walls it should be gated and secured. It was noted that a gate will be added at each end of tall wall.

Commissioner Lewis had concerns on drainage. Mr. Jorden acknowledged that they will need to comply with the new manual. They will provide additional detail at the permit stage. There was discussion on the lack of retention on the site. It was noted that a stipulation should be added regarding drainage and that additional information is necessary.

Changes to the spa were discussed. It was noted that the spa currently has one treatment room. They are proposing to increase to 3 treatment rooms and 5-6 pieces of exercise equipment. It was explained that there used to be a friends of Hermosa program, the narrative will be revised to explain this in more detail.

Lastly, Commissioner Anton had concerns regarding the proposed string lights and their visibility. One idea is to add shields to the lights. Perhaps a stipulation can be added to provide shields if there are any complaints. The Commission would like photos of the possible shields.

No Reportable Action

B. [18-279](#)

Discussion of Major Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP-18-06)
7125 E Lincoln Drive - Lincoln Medical Plaza

Paul Michaud presented the application in accordance with the application packet.

Chairman Wastchak asked when the public hearing is scheduled.

Mr. Michaud noted the hearing is scheduled for October 16th and then it will go to Council for review.

Mr. Michaud reviewed the Statement Of Direction (SOD).

Chairman Wastchak asked if the applicant has a landscape plan in accordance with the Visually Significant Corridors Plan.

The applicant stated that he can discuss the landscaping, but has no plan at this time.

Mr. Michaud continued to discuss and outline the development (setbacks, height, floor area, etc.).

Mr. Michaud presented each SOD item to the Commission and the next steps.

Additional information is still needed from the applicant. Mr. Michaud identified the pending items that are needed.

Chairman Wastchak noted there will not be a break in the Commission review. The Planning Commission will continue to review documents as they are provided. Chairman Wastchak advised the Commission to be mindful of the SOD items. He also asked Mr. Michaud to identify which SOD items are satisfied as the application goes through Commission review. Chairman Wastchak stated it is ok if the SOD tracking document is sent to Commission even a day before the meeting in order to keep it as fresh as possible.

Jason Morris, applicants' representative, introduced Ben Tate, who will give the applicants' presentation. He stated the proposal provides a similar use that is better than what is currently there. The additional height is needed to accommodate current medical standards. Also, they don't have any residential neighbors.

He reiterated that they are building a better version of what's there. This is their goal. Mr. Tate outlined the scope of the request and history of the lot. The current building does not meet the current medical office needs and standards.

Chairman Wastchak asked for additional information on the increase in height. He noted that the lobby is an architectural feature that is at the maximum height.

Mr. Tate stated that the additional height will not affect the view sheds. He discussed the medical standards, in which medical HVAC equipment requires a 5' clearance which results in 15' floor to floor, in addition to the

required roof mechanical screens.

Chairman Wastchak is not satisfied that there is a need for roof mounted ac units, and that ground mounted systems are an option. He wants the applicant to vet this point.

Jason Morris noted ground mounted units will result in more ground space being utilized which may take up parking spaces.

Chairman Wastchak requested that the applicant provide realistic perspectives (e.g. what is the view or massing from the property line), including perspectives from across the street looking south (back towards the building). Also, show a comparison of the existing and new building from across the street.

Commission Campbell questioned whether the applicant has considered a central ac plan. That is not known at this time.

Mr. Tate explained the requested height. He stated it is contextual appropriate. He identified the height of the buildings on the surrounding properties. He noted, that although the building does not meet the OSC, it will not block any existing view sheds.

Chairman Wastchak noted that additional landscape buffer is necessary along Lincoln Drive. Something can be done.

Jason Morris stated he does not believe the Town has the legal right to require the dedication of land along Lincoln Drive.

Andrew Miller does not necessarily agree with Mr. Morris's assessment.

Mr. Tate stated there needs to be give and take with the ROW dedication and the landscape buffer for this project to work, as there is simply not enough land. The more landscaping that is added will hide the building from those trying to find it.

Chairman Wastchak asked if the landscaping will be compliant with the VSC requirements.

Mr. Tate stated this has not yet been considered.

Chairman Wastchak stated this is an important element that should be complied with. How well does your plan meet VSC? Maybe it can be accomplished even without all of the ROW dedication.

Mr. Tate noted their proposed landscape plan balances both visibility and a sufficient amount of plants. Ben presented the proposed landscape pallet. Civ Tech is working on a traffic impact analysis; however, since it is the same use and roughly the same size building, it will not have any adverse impacts and can accommodate the new building.

The applicant discussed signage and the request for building mounted signage.

Commissioner Lewis questioned the architecture of the building. He does not believe it is very inviting. Wants a more friendly building that gives you a sense of confidence.

Commissioner Wainwright stated he wants a class A building, and that the proposal is an improvement over the existing site.

Commissioner Covington believes there is no context around it, and that this building would stand out. The building will not disappear with additional landscaping.

Commissioner Campbell is supportive of the 15' floor to floor since he works on a lot of medical buildings. Believes there will be enough height on adjacent properties so it will be in context. Willing to give the extra height for the dedication of the right-of-way. Additional landscaping is needed at the street frontage. Wants to hide the building more due to the additional height.

Commissioner Georgelos believes the key word is flexibility. Must be workable for the future. The architecture should fit into the community.

Commissioner Anton's concern is from the building on out. He doesn't want more traffic and believes this is our gateway to the Town. We will need the extra footage on the roadway. We can be flexible on the landscaping. This is doable.

Paul Mood explained that he will be getting the 30% plans for Lincoln Drive. Also, the applicant has parking spaces located in the ROW which is not allowed and the parking spaces are smaller than that recommended by code. The parking analysis must address all access points.

Chairman Wastchak requested that the applicant confer with CivTech on the traffic study being done for Smoke Tree Resort. There was discussion of shared entrances between SmokeTree and the Medical facility.

No Reportable Action

- C. [18-290](#) Discussion to Amend Article 22, Hillside Building Regulations, to incorporate pre-application process and related matters
- Mr. Miller, Town Attorney, explained the Hillside Code Amendment in accordance with the packet.
- Chairman Wastchak clarified that these changes are just a clean up after the technical code update.
- Mr. Miller agreed.
- No Reportable Action**
- D. [18-289](#) Discussion of Amendment to ArticleXVI, Home Occupation; Section 1603, of the Town Zoning Ordinance.
- Andrew Miller, Town Attorney, presented the home occupation amendment in accordance with the packet.
- Chairman Wastchak noted that the town will not be pro-active on parking on lawns in general, unless it is in relation to a home occupation to accommodate that use.
- Mr. Miller clarified that the home occupation will include short term rentals.
- No Commission comments.
- No Reportable Action**

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

8. CONSENT AGENDA

- A. [18-280](#) Approval of June 19, 2018 Planning Commission Minutes
- Approval of minutes. There was a correction at the bottom of page 3. Change to Commissioner Lewis preferred to keep it a 50%; another correction on page 4 at the end of page - Ordinance is mis-spelled. Commissioner Lewis motion to approve and second by Commissioner Georgelos.
- Approved as amended 7 to 0.

A motion was made by Commissioner Lewis, seconded by Commissioner Georgelos, to approve the June 19, 2018 minutes with two edits. A correction on Page 3 that only Commissioner Lewis stated keeping the homeowner good box at 50% and to correct the misspelling of ordinance on Page 4. The motion carried

by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

9. STAFF REPORTS

10. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

Commissioner Wainwright will not be at the 8/7 meeting and Commissioner Georgelos may not be able to attend.

11. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

12. ADJOURNMENT

Motion by Commissioner Campbell and seconded by Commissioner Anton. Approved 7 to 0 at 9:13 pm.

A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell at 9:12 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Anton, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: 
Paul Michaud, Secretary