



# Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr  
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

## Minutes - Final Planning Commission

---

Tuesday, November 17, 2015

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

---

### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Strom called the meeting to order to 6:00 p.m.

### 2. ROLL CALL

**Present** 6 - Chairperson Dolf Strom, Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell, Commissioner Scott Moore, Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright, Commissioner Daran Wastchak and Commissioner Jeff Wincel

**Absent** 1 - Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle

### 3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Chairman called for an executive session to discuss Item 15-280, Cottonwoods Resort.

### 4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. 15-271** Discussion of "Mountain Shadows Resort - Condominium Hotel"  
Preliminary Condominium Map (PP 15-04)  
SWC Lincoln Drive & 56th Street

Paul Michaud presented the material in the action report.

Chairman Strom asked about the tandem parking spaces and valet service noted in the CivTech parking study report. Mr. Michaud clarified that the condominium hotel will share the same valet service as the hotel. He continued that if a condominium unit is elected by the unit owner to go into the rental program that this owner will be required to use the valet service. Scott Lyon, the applicant, addressed questions regarding how the valet will access the vehicles, noting that the parking area to the condominium hotel will not be gated as any vehicles will be required to pass through the new guard gate on Mountain Shadows Drive.

Chairman Strom asked about the check in procedure for the hotel. Scott Lyons identified the location of three entrances from the public rights-of-way.

Chairman Strom asked if there are new proposed fire hydrants. Mr. Michaud replied that the site is within 400 feet of several fire hydrants

approved with the other plats for Mountain Shadows Resort.

With no other Planning Commissioner comment, Chairman Strom closed the study session on this application.

**No Reportable Action**

**B. 15-280**

Discussion of Minor SUP Amendment Cottonwoods Resort  
7150 E Rose Lane

Eva presented the application in accordance with the packet. She discussed the proposed lighting, sign package, and presidential suite.

*Lighting*

Commissioner Campbell requested that the applicant's next submittal include an arrow showing which fixture is being used on the table.

Chairman Strom asked about the photometric and wants to make sure the development standards are noted to identify compliance. The applicant agreed to provide a photometric showing compliance with the SUP Guidelines and to show which fixture is being used on each data sheet with an arrow for the next submittal.

Lee Story, resident adjoining the resort to the south, asked to speak about lighting. She asked for clarification of the type of lighting around the meeting areas and the parking areas. She was concerned about the illumination of the ground and it looking like a commercial establishment. It was noted that 12-foot tall pole lights are proposed for the parking lot. Chairman Strom explained the lighting performance standards noted in the SUP Guidelines. He continued that the Town wants the lighting to be as dark as possible and still meet safety standards. He noted that this lighting will need to meet the SUP guidelines. He also provided some local sites for her to see examples of similar lighting.

*Signs*

Commissioner Wainwright asked if there will be an address on any of the proposed signs. The applicant noted that they have not determined that at this point, but there will likely be an address on the entrance monument sign. The applicant also clarified that the entrance sign will be channel lit and the others will be externally lit. Chairman Strom requested that the applicant indicate which signs are lit from the ground and how the light is contained.

Commissioner Wainwright inquired if the parking lot lighting will be set to go on between dusk to dawn. The applicant replied yes.

*Presidential Suite*

Commissioner Wainwright asked if the existing suite was a presidential suite. Gary Stugard, applicant, replied it was a suite and the prior resort did not have what would be called a presidential suite. Mr. Stugard stated he hoped to rent these buildings as a group (e.g. 50 or 100 people wedding party).

Chairman Strom asked what type of water heater will be used. The applicant clarified that it is a roof mounted water heater and tank less system. He continued that the placement on the roof is more efficient based on the climate, also noting that there will be no interior closet to put the water heater.

Chairman Strom inquired about the setback to the building and Ms. Cutro clarified that it will be noted on the plan for the next meeting. It was noted that the wall around the presidential suite is three to four feet in height, and no pool will be located within this walled area.

Chairman Strom questioned the type of landscaping proposed around the presidential suite. Ms. Cutro showed the landscape slide, noting that this exhibit is illustrative and not being approved with this request.

Chairman Strom inquired about temporary tent locations. Ms. Cutro explained that there was a tent plan approved with the previous SUP amendment. She added that the southeastern portion of the site is a modification to that approval to prohibit temporary tents and activity in that area.

**No Reportable Action**

**C. 15-282 Discussion of Visually Significant Corridors**

Ms. Cutro explained that the Mayor has tasked staff and the Planning Commission to study the concept of Visually Significant Corridors (VSC) and develop a plan. She went over the improvements at 56th Street as an example of a developed VSC. There was discussion on using the findings to guide the development around the proposed Ritz Carlton site near Mockingbird Lane and Lincoln Drive, comparison of the 56th Street plan the Planning Commission reviewed and what was actually completed, and a request by Chairman Strom to consider requiring utility screening on any street that has utility boxes.

Commissioner Wincel gave an example of his Planning Commission time in Michigan where that body developed a book for commercial design standards. He continued that this book had four to five design standards/outlines for a property owner to select. He believed it would be beneficial to create various options of design standards for VSC. Responding to an earlier question, he expressed a desire to hire a consultant for the development of this plan. Chairman Strom stated that the Planning Commission can identify what they constitute as visually significant and identify certain elements.

Commissioner Campbell remarked that a large part of the visual significance is between the property line and the fence wall. He asked if there is a way to require a landscape palette on the private property side and require it to be maintained. Andrew Miller indicated that it could be required by a code amendment.

Commissioner Wainwright asked if other municipalities have a VSC plan. Ms. Cutro replied yes, and then showed VSC pictures of other cities. She noted that the Town should be careful borrowing aspects of the VSC from other cities because we want people to know that they are in Paradise Valley.

Responding to a question of timing, Ms. Cutro replied that the Town would likely complete the VSC corridors as the Town has available funds or there is an amendment to a Special Use Permit property.

Commissioner Wastchak proposed with moving forward with a consultant that has a design sense to present back some ideas to the Planning Commission.

Commissioner Moore emphasized the importance of connectivity. He remarked that he resides near 56th Street and has not seen a lot of pedestrian traffic. He believes that the Ritz Carlton project should do signage and colored walkways to connect the resort area to the community. Ms. Cutro explained that the Town is working on development agreement, noting the specifics have not been defined for that project.

Wrapping up, Eva Cutro stated she will present a draft scope of work for the Planning Commission to identify what elements they like and identify examples. Commissioner Wastchak suggested the scope include the Town Council early in the process to make sure the work being done at the Commission level is on track. He noted this might be a joint study session. Chairman Strom noted that the VSC should be tied with the branding effort headed by Councilor Stanton. The chairman also suggested the Planning Commissioners can presently start to identify corridor and elements they

like. Responding to timing, Ms. Cutro stated she would bring this item back for discussion in January 2016.

**No Reportable Action**

## 5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

## 6. ACTION ITEMS

- A. 15-272** Recommendation of "Mountain Shadows Resort - Condominium Hotel"  
Preliminary Condominium Map (PP 15-04)  
SWC Corner Lincoln Drive & 56th Street

Chairman Strom opened the item for public comment. He closed the public comment, being there were no persons requesting to speak on this application.

Commissioner Wastchak asked the applicant if he could explain the tentative timeframe they hope to break ground. Scott Lyon explained the plan is to construct west to east, with the hotel opening in early 2017, noting the condominium hotel opening will likely lag three to four months after the hotel opening.

Chairman Strom inquired about the timing of the perimeter landscaping along Lincoln Drive. Scott Lyon stated it was his goal to keep as many of the oleanders to screen the site, but many have to be removed due to the turn lanes. Also, he remarked he does not recall his landscape and sidewalk schedule. Commissioner Campbell requested that staff check if the perimeter landscape was required to be installed and to enforce it if required. Eva Cutro stated she would get back with the Planning Commission on this matter. Stipulation 24.c of Ordinance 653 requires:

"Upon or prior to substantial completion of the civil improvements and site work as reasonably necessary to commence perimeter walls and landscaping for such phase, including areas immediately adjoining such phase, the perimeter landscape planes) shall be submitted, reviewed and approved by the Town Manager. Installation of perimeter landscaping shall not be required to commence until adjacent site or structure improvements are sufficiently complete such that additional work will not harm the proposed landscape elements perimeter landscaping is landscaping between a public right-of-way and any proposed perimeter wall on the Property, or twenty (20) feet back of such right-of-way, whichever is less."

The Planning Commission deleted the proposed Stipulation 5, as it pertained to submittal of the updated Certificate of Assured Water Supply that was provided to the Town on November 12, 2015.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Wincel, to recommend approval of the application to the Town Council with Stipualtions 1 through 4, and Stipualtion 6, in the action report. Stipulation 5 was deleted since the applicant provided the updated Certificate of Assured Water Supply. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 6 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Wastchak and Commissioner Wincel

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Mahrle

## 7. CONSENT AGENDA

### A. 15-270 October 19, 2015 Planning Commission Minutes

**A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to approve the Planning Commission minutes of October 19, 2015. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 6 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Wastchak and Commissioner Wincel

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Mahrle

## 8. STAFF REPORTS

Paul Michaud reminded the Commissioners that December 4, 2015 is the Boards Conference by ULI. It was confirmed that four members will attend.

Eva Cuto reminded the Commissioners to RSVP for the upcoming holiday party.

## 9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

Chairman Strom reviewed the Planning Commisison representation for the upcoming Council meetings.

Commissioner Campbell inquired about the wireless coverage for Verizon. Eva Cutro replied that staff would follow up with him on this matter.

## 10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Staff reviewed the future agenda items.

## 11. ADJOURNMENT

**A motion was made at 8:15 p.m. by Chairperson Strom, seconded by Commissioner Wastchak, to adjourn. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 6 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Wastchak and Commissioner Wincel

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Mahrle

**Paradise Valley Planning Commission**

By:   
Eva Cutro, Secretary