

**TOWN OF PARADISE VALLEY
PLANNING COMMISSION
OCTOBER 07, 2014
MINUTES**

PRESENT: Richard Mahrle, Chairman
Dolf Strom, Commissioner
Jerald Bien-Willner, Commissioner
Thomas Campbell, Commissioner
Jonathan Wainwright, Commissioner
Jeff Wincel, Commissioner

ABSENT: Pat Hurley, Commissioner

STAFF: James Bacon, Jr., Town Manager
Eva Cutro, Planning Director
Paul Michaud, Senior Planner
George Burton, Planner
Andrew Miller, Town Attorney
James Shano, Public Works Director/Town Engineer
Jeremy Knapp, Engineering Services Analyst

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting of the Town of Paradise Valley Planning Commission was called to order by Chair Mahrle at 6:00 p.m.

WORK STUDY SESSION

Discussion of the Public Safety Communications Project for antennae, equipment building and conduit in the vicinity of 6900 North Highland Drive.

Mr. Bacon provided information on the history of this project. He also provided information on the criteria used to select the site for this project. He stated the Town Council requests the Planning Commission provide a recommendation on the design review.

Mr. Knapp requested that the Planning Commission review and discuss the following:

- 1) Building Layout and landscape palette that should be developed.
- 2) What building materials should be utilized.
- 3) What additional information is need for the Planning Commission to make a recommendation on the design.

Jim Jimmy Trivedi representing Motorola Solutions, reviewed the RF reports and

discussed the differences between the 2012 and 2014 reports. He provided information on the RF compliance levels. He responded to questions from the commissioners regarding the reports.

Ricardo Aguilar provided information on the point to point transmission connection.

The Commission discussed the equipment building. In response to questions from the commissioners, Al Wawrzyniak provided information on the size of the back-up power generator and requirements. He also provided information regarding the on-site security.

Mr. Knapp provided information regarding the five building layout options. Braden Santarcangelo, Architect, provided information on what was looked at in determining the layout options presented. He discussed how the building will integrate into the site. He reviewed the building materials.

Mr. Bacon advised that two neighbors expressed interest in having a gate and the ability for cars that find themselves at the drive approach the ability to turn around.

The commissioners discussed the layout options. Mr. Knapp and Mr. Santarcangelo responded to questions and comments from the commissioners regarding the layout options.

In response to a question from Commissioner Wincel, Mr. Santarcangelo provided information on how a buffer could be created to keep people from climbing on the roof.

Commissioner Bien-Willner stated that there should be warning signage about the facility and possible traffic signage.

Chair Mahrle opened public comment.

Richard Post spoke in opposition of this request. He expressed his concerns regarding the site that was selected.

Nancy Monthofer spoke in opposition of this request. She expressed her concerns regarding this project. She discussed how she will be directly affected by this project. She also expressed her concerns regarding RF emission. She stated that she is also concerned about hazardous waste.

Marty Huschke, spoke in opposition of this request. He expressed his concerned regarding the disturbance this project will have on the mountain. He also expressed his concern as it relates to scarring of the mountain. He stated there needs to be stabilization of the trench all the way around the mountain. He further stated there

needs to be flood control.

Commissioner Strom provided information regarding a similar project and how those issues were addressed.

James Hadeed spoke in opposition of this request. He discussed his concerns regarding aesthetics of this project and RF emissions.

Penny Post spoke in opposition of this request. She expressed her concern that the design of the building does not comply with the Hillside Ordinance. She inquired about the outreach to the neighbors during construction. She also expressed her concern regarding water runoff. She further expressed her concern regarding how radiation could affect the wildlife in the area.

Wolfgang Monthofer spoke in opposition of this request. He stated that he does not understand why they are putting commercial in a residential area. He expressed his concern that if the equipment is not installed properly there could be radiation leak. He inquired about who is responsible for maintenance.

Chair Mahrle closed public comment.

The commission continued to discuss the building layout options and the consensus was in favor of layout 5 with some suggested adjustments.

ACTION ITEMS

Consideration of the Final Plat for Kachina Estates having four single-family one-acre R-43 lots and its associated wall/landscape plan for Malcomb Drive. The subject property is approximately 4.1 acres located at 6602 and 6606 E Malcomb Drive (FP 14-01).

Mr. Michaud presented this case as per the project coordination packet. It is recommended that the Planning Commission forward to the Town Council approval of the Final Plat (FP 14-01) for the property located at 6602/6606 E. Malcomb Drive subject to the stipulations contained in the Action Report.

Mr. Michaud responded to questions and comments from the commissioners regarding this request.

Commissioner Strom requested that date in stipulation one be changed to September 8, 2014.

The Commission discussed who will be responsible for maintaining the landscaping. The consensus was that the applicant shall be responsible for maintaining the landscaping

until the owner of the lots assumes this responsibility.

Chair Mahrle opened public comment.

Dennis Roth spoke in favor of this request. He stated that he agrees with the request as proposed.

Chair Mahrle closed public comment.

Commissioner Strom moved the Planning Commission recommend approval of the Final Plat for Kachina Estates and its associated wall/landscape plan for Malcomb Drive located at 6602/6606 E Malcomb Drive subject to the stipulations contained in the Action Report with the following amendments:

- 1a. Final Plat for Kachina Estates prepared by Coe & Van Loo Consultants, Inc., dated September 8, 2014;
- 6a. Completion of the wall and landscaping improvements as shown on the Wall & Landscape Plan prepared by LOCUS Inc., date sealed September 22, 2014. The applicant shall be responsible for watering and maintaining the landscaping until such time as the owner of the lot assumes this responsibility;

Seconded by Commissioner Wainwright.

The motion passed by a vote of five (5) to one (1) with Commissioner Campbell dissenting.

PUBLIC HEARING

Consideration of a minor amendment to the Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain Resort Special Use Permit to modify and update the SUP stipulations. The property is located at 5700 E McDonald Drive (SUP-14-06).

Consideration of an intermediate amendment to the Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain Resort Special Use Permit to allow for modifications to existing SUP stipulations for the inclusion of spa-related uses, the addition of four guest units, and related modifications at Casa 2. The subject property is located at 5700 E. McDonald Drive (SUP-14-05).

Mr. Michaud presented this case as per the project coordination packet. It is recommended that the Planning Commission deem the Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain Special Use Permit (SUP 14-06) request a minor amendment per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7B of the Zoning Ordinance.

Mr. Michaud stated it is also recommended that the Planning Commission approve the minor amendment for modifications of several stipulations to the Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain resort as outlined in the Action Report.

Chair Mahrle opened and closed public comment as there was no resident wishing to speak.

Commissioner Wincel moved the Planning Commission deem the Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain Special Use Permit (SUP 14-06) request a minor amendment per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7B of the Zoning Ordinance. Seconded by Commissioner Bien-Willner.

The motion passed unanimously by a vote of six (6) to zero (0).

Commissioner Bien-Willner moved the Planning Commission approves the minor amendment for modifications of several stipulations to the Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain resort as outlined in the Action Report. Seconded by Commissioner Strom.

The motion passed unanimously by a vote of six (6) to zero (0).

ELECTION OF CHAIR

Commissioner Campbell nominated Dolf Strom as Chair of the Planning Commission. Seconded by Commissioner Bien-Willner.

The motion passed unanimously by a vote of six (6) to zero (0).

STAFF REPORTS

Mr. Burton reviewed the future agenda items.

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Strom moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:10 p.m. Seconded by Commissioner Wainwright and passed unanimously.

Eva Cutro, Secretary