



**TOWN COUNCIL MEETING
6401 E. LINCOLN DRIVE
PARADISE VALLEY, ARIZONA 85253
MINUTES
Thursday, January 25, 2018**

1. CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Mayor Collins called to order the Town Council Meeting for Thursday, January 25, 2018 at 3:30 p.m. in the Town Hall Boardroom.

COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT

Mayor Michael Collins
Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner
Council Member Paul Dembow
Council Member Scott Moore
Council Member Julie Pace
Council Member David A. Sherf
Council Member Mark Stanton

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Manager Kevin Burke
Town Attorney Andrew Miller
Town Clerk Duncan Miller
Police Chief Peter Wingert
Town Engineer Paul Mood
Deputy Town Manager Dawn Marie Buckland
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Public Works Director Brent Skoglund

2. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

18-043 Alarm Monitoring RFP Results and Selection of Vendor

Police Chief Peter Wingert presented a proposal to award a contract to Dynamark Monitoring, Inc to provide alarm monitoring infrastructure. In December 2016, an Alarm Working Group was created to research options to sustain the Town's police alarm monitoring program. The work group determined that a hybrid monitoring model could be created using a private vendor's alarm infrastructure along with direct police dispatching, customer service, and billing provided by the Town. An RFP was issued in October 2017 to identify potential private vendors. Four proposals were received and a selection

Note: Minutes of Town Council meetings are prepared in accordance with the provisions of Arizona Revised Statutes. These minutes are intended to be an accurate reflection of action taken and direction given by the Town Council and are not verbatim transcripts. Video recordings of the meetings along with staff reports and presentations are available online and are on file in the Office of the Town Clerk.

committee ranked Dynamark Monitoring, Inc as the most responsive proposer.

Rich Cowan, Western Region Director of Sales for Dynamark, responded to questions from the Council.

The Council discussed the proposal. There was support to place the contract on a future agenda for consideration. Mr. Burke stated the contract would be scheduled for a vote on February 8, 2018.

18-049 Legislative Update

Deputy Town Manager Dawn Marie Buckland briefed the Town Council on legislation pending in the Arizona Legislature. She focused on bills impacting photo enforcement and home occupation regulation pre-emptions. The Council discussed the bills and provided feedback to staff.

A motion was made by Vice Mayor Bien-Willner, seconded by Council Member Stanton, to go into executive session for discussion and consultation with the Town Attorney for legal advice regarding safety considerations related to hillside development as authorized by A.R.S.

§38-431.03(A)(3). The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mayor Collins
Vice Mayor Bien-Willner
Council Member Dembow
Council Member Moore
Council Member Pace
Council Member Sherf
Council Member Stanton

The Council went into executive session at 4:42 PM

18-055 Discussion of Process for the Community Conversation - Action Item regarding Single Trash Hauler License Agreement

Mayor Collins reconvened the study session at 5:55 PM.

Mayor Collins explained the order of events for the community conversation / action item related to the proposed single trash hauler license agreement. The process allowed for multiple opportunities for the Council and the public to ask questions of staff and the Republic Services, followed by public comments and a vote. There was Council consensus to proceed as the Mayor suggested.

Mayor Collins recessed the meeting at 6:00 PM.

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

18-044 Discussion and consultation with the Town Attorney for legal advice regarding safety considerations related to hillside development as authorized by A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

18-045 The Town Council may go into executive session at one or more times during the meeting as needed to confer with the Town Attorney for legal advice regarding any of the items listed on the agenda as authorized by A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

4. BREAK

5. RECONVENE FOR REGULAR MEETING

Mayor Collins reconvened the meeting at 6:05 PM

6. ROLL CALL**COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT**

Mayor Michael Collins
Vice Mayor Jerry Bien-Willner
Council Member Paul Dembow
Council Member Scott Moore
Council Member Julie Pace
Council Member David A. Sherf
Council Member Mark Stanton

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Manager Kevin Burke
Town Attorney Andrew Miller
Town Clerk Duncan Miller
Police Chief Peter Wingert
Deputy Town Manager Dawn Marie Buckland
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Public Works Director Brent Skoglund
Senior Planner Paul Michaud
Engineering Services Analyst Jeremy Knapp

7. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE*

Mayor Collins led the Pledge of Allegiance.

8. PRESENTATIONS*

There were no presentations.

9. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Resident Dorothy Smith thanked the Police Department and the Public Works Department for their efforts in keeping the Town safe and well maintained.

10. CONSENT AGENDA

Mr. Burke summarized the items on the Consent Agenda.

18-047 Minutes of Town Council Meeting January 9, 2018

18-048 Minutes of Town Council Meeting January 11, 2018

**18-042 Consideration of Luke Avenue Lot Line Adjustment/Re-orientation
 of 6430 E. Luke Avenue and 5602 N. Wilkinson Road**

Recommendation: Approve the Luke Ave Lot Line Adjustment, re-orientating two (2)
residential R-43-zoned lots, subject to the stipulations in the Action Report.

**18-051 Adoption of Resolution 2017-23; Consistent Application of Cost
 Recovery Percentages for Managerial and Minor Amendment Fees**

Recommendation: Adopt Resolution 2017-23 approving the reduction in fees for managerial
and minor amendments for schools, government buildings, and places of
worship to provide consistency with the cost recovery percentages with
other fees

**A motion was made by Council Member Sherf, seconded by Council Member Dembow, to
approve the Consent Agenda as submitted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Aye: 7 - Mayor Collins
 Vice Mayor Bien-Willner
 Council Member Dembow
 Council Member Moore
 Council Member Pace
 Council Member Sherf
 Council Member Stanton

11. PUBLIC HEARINGS

There were no public hearings.

12. ACTION ITEMS

Mayor Collins recessed the meeting at 6:15 PM.

Mayor Collins reconvened the meeting at 6:30 PM.

18-054 Consideration of Single Trash Hauler License Agreement with Republic Services and associated resolution.

Town Manager Kevin Burke presented the proposed single trash hauler license agreement with Republic Services. He provided background on the history of trash collection service in Paradise Valley, described the phased approach the Town followed to find solutions to mitigate negative impacts of a multi-hauler system, and the RFP process used to identify a potential single hauler. He explained the services and provisions in the proposed license agreement.

Alberto Guardado, Director of Operations for Republic Services, and Tom Baker, Area Municipal Manager for Republic Services, addressed the Council and responded to questions.

Town Staff and Republic Services representatives responded to written questions submitted by the audience.

Mayor Collins opened the meeting to public comments. The following individuals addressed the Council:

Spoke in Favor	Spoke in Opposition
Bill Dougherty, Betty McRae, Jini Simpson (but with concerns about the contract), Mike Scerbo read letters of support on behalf of Francis Najafi and David Larcher, Mary Turner read letter of support on behalf of Joan Levinson and Larry Yount, Caleb Koremann, Jennifer Moser, John Wintersteen, Sid Chhabria (resident and Republic Services employee), Robin Grossman, Scott Grigg, Vernon Parker (nonresident), William Perkins, David Selden, and Jason Rose. Non-resident Brad Kiesling submitted a comment card in favor but did not speak.	Tony Scire, Robert Rasmussen, Bernard Kirk, Dorothy Smith, Nancy Lee Lisherness, Art Humble, Cheri Adelson (supported single hauler but opposed to Republic), Brice Samuel (Undecided. Requested additional information), JH Feinberg, Bart Corbett, Jan Wilson, Jane Kunde (expressed concerns about Republic Services specifically), Sandra Farmer, Pam Kirby, Jettie Kootman, Tom Gates, Scott LeMarr (concerns with the contract specifically and suggested more study is needed), David Hann, Nan Murley, Dayna Kully, Mark Hickman, Jacqueline Zipprich (nonresident HOA Management Company representative addressed impact on HOAs), Merian Cook, Bob O'Malley (opposed Republic Services. Made suggestions on implementation). The following residents submitted comment cards indicating their opposition but did not speak: Michael Mercer & A. Fornoff, Eileen Rasmussen, Bert Farmer, Phyllis Wheeler, Mike Kunde, Bruce Wheeler, Al Burhan, Russell Wilson

The following residents submitted comment cards but did not speak or indicate a position: Susan Stander, Suzanne Viteri, Joy MacLean, and Paul Rottas.

Mayor Collins recessed the meeting at 10:00 PM and reconvened the meeting at 10:10 PM.

The Mayor and Council Members explained their positions in detail.

A motion was made by Council Member Sherf, seconded by Council Member Pace, to adopt Resolution 2018-03; single-hauler license agreement. The motion failed by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Mayor Collins
Council Member Pace
Council Member Sherf
Nay: 4 - Vice Mayor Bien-Willner
Council Member Dembow
Council Member Moore
Council Member Stanton

A motion was made by Council Member Stanton, seconded by Council Member Pace, to reject the contract and direct the Town Manager to negotiate a new contract with Republic that addresses items brought up tonight including price, KPI, and timing acknowledging all proposals are only good for 180 days from September 6, 2017.

AMENDMENT

Council Member Pace moved, and Council Member Stanton seconded a motion to amend the motion to provide that the Council will articulate their direction on items to be included in a new contract on February 8, 2018 with action on February 22, 2018. The amendment passed by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Mayor Collins
Council Member Pace
Council Member Sherf
Council Member Stanton
Nay: 3 - Vice Mayor Bien-Willner
Council Member Dembow
Council Member Moore

MAIN MOTION AS AMENDED

A motion was made by Council Member Stanton, seconded by Council Member Pace, to reject the contract and direct the Town Manager to negotiate a new contract with Republic that addresses items brought up tonight including price, KPI, and timing to be articulated in a study session on February 8, 2018 with action on February 22, 2018, acknowledging all proposals are only good for 180 days from September 6, 2017. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Mayor Collins
Council Member Pace
Council Member Sherf
Council Member Stanton

Nay: 3 - Vice Mayor Bien-Willner
Council Member Dembow
Council Member Moore

13. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**18-046 Consideration of Requests for Future Agenda Items**

Mr. Burke summarized the items on the future agenda schedule. He stated that items on the February 8 and February 22nd meeting agendas may shift to accommodate discussions on the trash collection license agreement.

14. MAYOR / COUNCIL / MANAGER COMMENTS

Council Member Pace briefed the Town Council on the activities of the ACOPS Committee. She noted that the Committee is considering creating an ad hoc committee to focus on safety items impacting places of worship in Town.

15. ADJOURN

A motion was made by Council Member Pace, seconded by Council Member Stanton, to adjourn. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Mayor Collins
Vice Mayor Bien-Willner
Council Member Dembow
Council Member Moore
Council Member Pace
Council Member Sherf
Council Member Stanton

Mayor Collins adjourned the meeting at 12:10 p.m.

TOWN OF PARADISE VALLEY

SUBMITTED BY:

Duncan Miller, Town Clerk

STATE OF ARIZONA)

:SS.

COUNTY OF MARICOPA)

CERTIFICATION

I, Duncan Miller, Town Clerk of the Town of Paradise Valley, Arizona hereby certify that the following is a full, true, and correct copy of the minutes of the regular meeting of the Paradise Valley Town Council held on Thursday, January 25, 2018.

I further certify that said Municipal Corporation is duly organized and existing. The meeting was properly called and held and that a quorum was present.

Duncan Miller, Town Clerk