



**PARADISE VALLEY
SPECIAL HILLSIDE BUILDING COMMITTEE MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 28, 2017**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Hillside Building Review Committee met on Thursday, September 28, 2017, at Town Hall, 6401 East Lincoln Drive, Paradise Valley, Arizona, 85253. Committee Members present: Chair Scott Jarson, Scott Tonn, Planning Commissioners Tom Campbell, James Anton and Richard Mahrle. Staff present: Building Safety Manager Robert Lee, Town Engineer Paul Mood, Planner George Burton, and Executive Assistant/ Deputy Town Clerk Natalie Montenegro. Chair Jarson called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m.

2. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Chair Jarson stated the Hillside Building Review Committee may convene to an executive session at any time during the meeting as needed to confer with the Town Attorney for legal advice regarding any of the items listed on the agenda, as authorized by A.R.S. §38-431.03.A.3.

3. APPLICATION REVIEW

A. Formal review for a new single family residence located at 6149 East Indian Bend Road (APN: 169-35-014)

**CP Drewett, Architect
Braden Santarcangelo
Nick Prodanov, Engineer**

Robert Lee said this is the formal review of an application to construct a new home on a vacant lot at 6149 East Indian Bend Road. He said the Committee saw the concept design on April 12, 2017. The applicant was here to answer questions.

Mr. Drewett said they have a new color palette for the project, using dark bronze for the windows and cladding.

Chair Jarson asked what material will be used for the flat portion of the roof. Mr. Drewett said it will be colored granite.

Chair Jarson questioned the height. Mr. Lee said it was compliant with the hillside code.

Commissioner Campbell asked Mr. Prodanov to describe the retention basin, and what materials will be used. Mr. Prodanov said the historic drainage patterns have been preserved. The bottom of the retention basin will have a natural stone finish and the rip rap will blend with the natural landscape. Mr. Drewett said there will be a natural distribution of rocks of all sizes.

Commissioner Campbell said there is a lot of pavement on the property. Mr. Prodanov said the intent is to get it down the mountain into the historic flows.

Chair Jarson commented on the lighting shown on Page 202a. He felt the location of 6 or 7 landscape fixtures on L1 are too close to the vertical surfaces. He would like the plans modified to show the fixtures a little further away from the walls and suggested adding a stipulation to ensure all the light fixtures will not illuminate the walls of structure. Mr. Tonn and Commissioner Mahrle concurred that a stipulation be added to stress the point that light fixtures will not be aimed at the walls.

Mr. Tonn said he would like to see a sample of the materials that will be used for the driveway. Mr. Santarcangelo said he does not have a sample now but will bring one in for Chair and staff approval.

Commissioner Mahrle said this is an incredibly disturbed lot and asked if it was this way from the beginning. Mr. Prodanov said it was disturbed in this manner in 1965.

Chair Jarson said he appreciates the abundant landscape and it will be a great improvement to the lot. He opened the discussion to the public, and there being no public input, he called for a motion.

Commissioner Campbell moved approval of the application as submitted, with the addition of 2 stipulations:

1. Building and landscape light fixtures shall be moved and aimed so that no vertical structure are illuminated.
2. A sample of the driveway paver will be brought in for Chair and staff approval, and any other Committee member who would like to see the pavers.

Mr. Tonn seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 5-0.

B. Concept review for new single-family residence located at 5045 East Cottontail Run Road (APN: 169-08-039)

Marvin Lunt, Architect
Carrie Rowser
Nathan Wyllie

Town Engineer Paul Mood presented the application to construct a new home at 5045

East Cottontail Run Road. He said the vacant lot backs onto the Paradise Valley Golf Club and will feature a walk out basement, pool and lawn area. The home is below street level to take advantage of the views of the golf course and Mummy Mountain. Per the project architect the Maricopa County Health Department stated that the septic system will have to be relocated because it was too close to the golf course water feature. The applicant also needs an encroachment agreement to allow the driveway connection to the private road.

Chair Jarson said the Committee would like to see the material boards at the formal review. He asked about the finish on the light fixtures that will be wall mounted. Mr. Mood said it will be metal with a textured finish so that it is not shiny.

Mr. Lunt presented the electronic model and walked the Committee through the proposed plans for the structure, including the extensive array of retaining walls, the driveway, the double stack walls, and the water feature. He said there will be a 3-foot deep window well and indicated the location of the lawn and the mechanical yard.

Mr. Mood said retention will be underground, beneath the grassy area, with a special underground storage system.

Mr. Lunt said there will be 2 walk decks, one looks out to the views of Camelback Mountain and the other views Mummy Mountain.

Mr. Tonn asked the height of the wall around the pool. Mr. Lunt said it is 8 feet. Mr. Burton said the wall acts as the pool barrier. Mr. Mood said there is a gate that opens to the pool.

Commissioner Campbell said the mechanical yard is big. Mr. Lunt said it also contains a back-up generator.

Commissioner Anton commented on the height of the balcony wall. Mr. Lunt said the material between the posts is glass.

Commissioner Campbell questioned the need of a grassy area on hillside lots in the name of retention. Chair Jarson said he does not want to set a precedent of using lawns for retention purposes. Mr. Anton said there are other options for retention such as permeable pavers. He asked if it will be natural grass or artificial turf. Mr. Lunt said it will be natural grass. The Commission instructed the architect to look at options other than a grass lawn for the retention area.

Chair Jarson suggested the applicant be mindful that the lighting does not wash the vertical surfaces of the structure. He also asked the applicant to be mindful of the LRV factor when selecting materials. Ms. Rowser said they will use natural stone. Mr. Lunt said the driveway will be colored pavers and will make sure the LRV is less than 38%. He wants the home to be harmonious with the mountain.

Chair Jarson asked if the applicant is planning on having solar panels. Mr. Lunt said not at this time.

Mr. Tonn asked for clarification on the materials that will be used for the front facia of the house. Ms. Rowser said it will be a super fine stucco finish.

Chair Jarson suggested staying away from grasses when considering the landscape plant selections. He opened discussion to the public and there was no public comments.

C. Combined review of remodel/addition to main residence and site improvements at 6033 North 43rd Street (APN: 169-22-031)

Ed Scheletsky, Architect
Nicolas Ansara

Mr. Mood presented the application for a remodel, addition and site improvements at 6033 North 43rd Street. He said the patio, pool, exterior deck, entry sidewalk, planters and part of the garage will be demolished. A new pool and patio, a new porch and railing, new planter and new retaining walls will be constructed. Also, new desert landscaping and new concealed lighting will be added. A new driveway will be constructed at the entry side of the home. The brushed stainless steel cable railing has an LRV of 40% which is a bit higher than the 38% allowable.

Commissioner Mahrle asked for clarification on the size of the lot since the plan says it is .4 acre. Mr. Mood said is a typographical error and should read .94 acre and that the square footage shown is correct.

Mr. Scheletsky said the existing home was built in 1967 by Blaine Drake, an apprentice of Frank Lloyd Wright. Mr. Scheletsky would like to modernize the home but still maintain the mid-century elements of the original architect. He presented the electronic model of the improvements that will be made to the home. He said the existing asphalt driveway will be replaced with new asphalt. They will enclose the existing carport. A new gate will be added for security. Planters will be placed as several strategic locations. Cumaru ship lap will be added throughout, including the decks. Stairs will connect to the sublevel deck to the upper deck. They will replace the single glass panes with dual panes. They will rebuild the pool and add a small sports court area.

Chair Jarson said the pool area was previously disturbed. Mr. Scheletsky said they have squared off the circular pool. The materials around the pool will be earth tone pavers to match the surrounding desert colors.

Chair Jarson commented on the 40% LRV of the posts. Mr. Campbell suggested ionite or stain to make them a bit darker. Chair Jarson suggested keeping all the rail the same.

Commissioner Anton asked if they plan on adding shade to the new deck. Mr. Scheletsky said there is shade under the porch or they can use an umbrella. Mr. Jones, the owner, said they like the open space and they do not plan on using an umbrella.

Commissioner Campbell asked about the retention area. Mr. Scheletsky said they will create a retention basin that will have the same treatment as the septic area, stock piled with desert rocks.

Chair Jarson said they may have to use a Sonoran desert seed mix to revegetate cover the disturbed area.

Commissioner Mahrle left the meeting at 9:00 a.m.

Commissioner Anton asked if the new roof material has been approved. Mr. Tonn said it looks lighter than what is on the plan. Mr. Scheletsky said it is darker, a tongue and groove type asphalt shingle with 4% LRV. He said he hopes to add foam insulation underneath, and bring the roof to the 2012 energy code requirements.

Chair Jarson said he would like to add a stipulation to say that the Chair and staff will approve the alternative to redo the grass area.

Commissioner Campbell reminded the applicant that the lighting should not be on vertical surfaces. Mr. Scheletsky said they plan on tucking the fixtures under the eaves. The fixture will have a triangular flange to reflect light from the wall surface. He said they can add cladding to deflect light away from the wall. Chair Jarson said he would like to see it. Commissioner Campbell added a second stipulation that approval of the light fixtures can also be done by the Chair and staff.

Chair Jarson asked about the asphalt driveway and whether they considered other materials, or using a "colored" asphalt that is now available. He suggested the applicant ask the asphalt company for choices. Mr. Scheletsky said he did not know asphalt came in different shades and appreciated the input. He will ask about using a color other than black.

Commissioner Campbell asked if the planter wall meets the code requirement for hillside since it seems to be an extreme wall and they may lose the mountain views. Mr. Scheletsky said it is compliant with the pool barrier wall specifications. It will tie in with the brick work on the existing house. They could not use the cable/glass pool barrier. Mr. Burton said technically the planters are retaining walls. The color of the blocks will match the house.

Mr. Scheletsky said the pool equipment will be screened by a wall that acts as a pool barrier as well with a gate access.

Chair Jarson asked about the turf area and whether they can use other materials at that

area. Mr. Scheletsky said currently they plan on using pavers over the septic area to meet the new septic system requirements. The turf area is elevated, non-visible and contained. Mr. Tonn and Commissioner Campbell said they were okay with the grass area. Commissioner Anton asked if it was real grass or artificial turf. Mr. Scheletsky said it is labelled as a sports court putting green with real grass.

Chair Jarson opened comments to the public.

Mr. Tim Coran, a neighbor, was concerned about the lighting and landscaping and today's comments have alleviated his concerns.

Mr. Jones, the owner, said all the vegetation will be natural desert plants. They have taken away the palm trees. He does not plan on having shade structures on the decks.

Mr. Scheletsky said he will do a mock-up of the lighting plan. Chair Jarson said 74 lighting fixtures seems excessive. Mr. Burton said there is limit only on the number of up-lights and lumens.

Chair Jarson moved approval of the application with the addition of the following stipulations:

1. The final pool paver surface as an alternative to the grassy shall be approved by Chair and staff.
2. No lighting, including landscape, shall be placed where it may illuminate vertical surfaces. The revised lighting plan showing the installation and location of all light fixtures shall be approved by Chair and staff.
3. The applicant will research the use of a colored asphalt for the driveway surface and will bring the sample in for Chair and staff approval.
4. The final roof sample material shall be submitted for Chair and staff approval.
5. The landscape plan shall include a covering of Sonoran desert seed mix at the disturbed areas.

Commissioner Campbell seconded the motion which carried unanimously, 4-0.

D. Combined review of roof mounted solar panels at 6120 East Indian Bend Road (APN: 169-36-038)

Anthony Iannucci

Mr. Burton presented the application to install 10 new roof mounted solar panel arrays at 6120 East Indian Bend Road. A new 20 inch metal fascia will screen the panels. The new fascia will be painted to match the existing metal fascia around the house. The new solar panels and fascia are below the 24 foot height limit. The electrical disconnects will be placed on the side of the house and painted to match existing color. The addition of these solar panels to the existing arrays will produce close to 100% of electric power for

the home.

Mr. Tonn asked if the mock up parapet is metal. Chair Jarson said it is the same as the light copper facia and will require no maintenance.

Commissioner Mahrle returned to the meeting at 9:40 a.m.

Mr. Tonn was concerned about the water run. Commissioner Campbell said they can make a rain screen to have the roof water continue to run off the roof. The cross section of new screen can be reviewed and approved by Chair and staff.

Commissioner Campbell moved approval of the application with an additional stipulation as follows:

1. The height of the new parapet can be minimized to meet code and still cover the solar arrays and the vertical portion of the roof membrane. A sample of the material shall be presented for Chair and staff approval.

Chair Jarson seconded the motion which carried unanimously, 5-0.

4. STAFF REPORTS

There were no staff reports.

5. COMMITTEE REPORTS

Chair Jarson wished Ms. Montenegro a long and happy retirement.

6. NEXT HILLSIDE BUILDING COMMITTEE MEETING

The next meeting was scheduled for 8:00 a.m. on Wednesday, October 11, 2017, and the November meeting was scheduled for November 8 at 8:00 a.m. The December meeting was tentatively scheduled for December 13 at 8:00 a.m.

7. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Jarson moved to adjourn. Commissioner Campbell seconded the motion, which carried unanimously 5-0. The meeting adjourned at 10:00 a.m.