



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Draft

Planning Commission

Tuesday, April 17, 2018

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Senior Planner Paul Michaud
Planner George Burton

2. ROLL CALL

Present 7 - Commissioner Daran Wastchak
Commissioner James Anton
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell
Commissioner Charles Covington
Commissioner Pamela Georgelos
Commissioner Orme Lewis
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

6. ACTION ITEMS

A. [18-157](#) Election of Chairperson

Vice Mayor Bien-Willner welcomed the new Commissioners and explained his role as liaison to the Commission. Duncan Miller, Town Clerk, swore in Commissioners Wainwright, Georgelos, Lewis, and Chairman Wastchak. Chairman Wastchak called for nominations for Chairperson.

A motion was made by Commissioner Anton, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to nominate Commissioner Wastchak as chairperson. This will be Commissioner Wastchak's second term as chairman. There were no other nominations. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

A. [18-158](#)

Discussion of Finisterre Subdivision Wall (MI-18-02)
6440 N 61st Place (Assessor's Parcel Number 169-39-125)

George Burton presented the application request. He noted that the subdivision and wall were platted in 1977. The request is to raise the wall along eight lots bordering Lincoln Drive and one lot bordering Invergordon Road.

Dave Pulatti, representing the Finisterre home owner association, gave background on the height of the wall along Invergordon Road.

The height of the finished wall will not exceed six feet. There was discussion of raising the height of the wall to eight feet along Lincoln Drive, however this is not the desire of the applicant. Mr. Pulatti stated the home owner association believes the six-foot height will serve their purpose. There was discussion of landscaping in front of the wall. This application does not include landscaping but the applicant is planning on improved landscaping along Lincoln Drive. The home owner association is aware of the Visually Significant Corridors Plan and is willing to research this while planning their landscape. There was discussion regarding ownership of the wall. It was built by the association. The outside maintenance is completed by the association while the inside maintenance is completed by the individual homeowners. Due to the noise from Lincoln Drive several Commissioners were very sympathetic to this request.

Mr. Burton noted that this application is scheduled for action on May 1st.

No Reportable Action

B. [18-156](#)

Discussion of a Minor Amendment to the Montessori Academy Special Use Permit to allow for storage at 6050 N Invergordon Road

Paul Michaud presented the application and the history of the Special Use Permit (SUP). The applicant has agreed to remove two existing shipping containers that were in violation of the SUP. The existing storage structure will then be enlarged by 500 square feet to provide the necessary storage. The proposed height of the addition will be approximately 12' and setback 30' to the west and 20' to the south property line. This request is proposed as a minor amendment. Mr. Michaud explained the minor amendment criteria.

There was discussion of allowing the existing, non-conforming section of the storage building to remain. The wire attached to the shipping containers is also not part of the SUP but is used on a temporary basis to attach a net to keep balls from leaving the property. This wire is also not currently part of the SUP. This netting is used during the summer camp only.

There was discussion of exterior lighting on the structure. Lighting is required at all exits and will meet all Town Codes. The applicant suggested that the lighting can be placed on a motion sensor.

There was discussion of the addition at the rear of the storage structure that appears to have been built without a permit. Commission recommends that this portion be removed. It will increase the setback between the neighbor. The applicant was in agreement and will remove this portion of the structure if this application is approved.

Materials were discussed. Commissioner Campbell believes an offset in the addition may provide for a better transition between the new material and the existing slump block.

Commissioner Anton would like the wire cable removed. He would also like construction debris along the property line removed prior to proceeding with this application. He recommends that the wire should be affixed properly to poles. Commissioners Campbell, Lewis, Wainwright, and Covington agree that the SUP shall address the wire and its placement. There was discussion of adding a stipulation regarding the time of year the temporary netting could be in use.

No Reportable Action

C. [18-160](#)

Discussion of Draft Visually Significant Corridors Master Plan (VSC)

Eva Cutro introduced the consultants. John Griffin, consultant with Environmental Planning Group (EPG), gave an overview of the requested edits from the last study session and how these were incorporated into the revised draft plan.

Chairman Wastchak requested formatting revision to the definitions of good, better and best. It was directed to clarify in the plan who needs to meet these levels (e.g., a homeowner along Lincoln Boulevard or Tatum Boulevard must meet the good level). This direction was to pull some of the information to the front of the plan and reference the table to get more information.

Eva Cutro addressed a question from Commissioner Lewis regarding the oleander blight. She explained how the Town on Special Use Permit sites typically includes a stipulation to replant with an oleander alternative.

There was discussion on the entry monument signs, page 2.6, Figure 2.3. The direction was to include a design where the welcome lettering was removed. Later in the meeting this topic was discussed again, asking for the etched design on each of the four monument signs to be different on

each sign and based on a different theme using the character zones (e.g. barrel cactus, lizard, tortoise, agave). It was clarified the monument signs will not be lighted.

On the location maps showing the character zones using the wider line width, it was suggested to use a dashed line around the subject areas.

Regarding page 2.20 on the 60% live cover, it was noted to add the word "approximately."

There was discussion on the color banding on the various pages. It was suggested to lower the "Design Guidelines" text and add a color band on the open side of the page.

Mr. Griffin discussed the design of the Lincoln Drive/Tatum Boulevard intersection, including the turn lines and extension of curb lines. It was noted that this design is technically accurate.

Commissioner Lewis had a question whether maintenance was a considered factor in the plants selected for good, better, and best. Mr. Griffin explained the plant selection was based on Town landscaping guidelines and valley-wide guidelines. It was noted that plant selection from the lists will be left up to the owner/designer. After much discussion, the consultant was directed to add a category of maintenance to the plant lists to determine if the plant is low, medium, or high. Later in the meeting, there was discussion on whether to differentiate on the plant lists the distinction of water use for the low-water use plants similar to the maintenance. After much discussion, the direction was not to add such a distinction.

Commissioner Lewis suggested that the designs in the plan should be more natural versus manicured. He gave the example of not having barrel cactus in a geometric shape. It was noted that such design will vary based on the specific character zone, with note that the Resort Living zone will likely be more manicured.

It was noted the plan does not address perennials, which Commissioner Lewis was supportive.

Commissioner Georgelos inquired about the significance of the different colors on the plant lists. Mr. Griffin noted these represent the seasonal year-round colors. It was directed to add a footnote so the person reading the plan knows the color is the color of plant flower

Regarding the center design at the Lincoln Drive/Tatum Boulevard intersection on page 4.13, the consultant was directed to provide an

enlarged view of the center medallion. Commissioner Lewis stated the brown and gold color choices are not inviting. This led to a discussion about the durability of the colors, need to confer with the Town Engineer, and that the color choices came out of an earlier public preference survey. Commissioner Lewis will look at the preference survey and Davis color samples to bring forth specific alternatives to give to staff and the consultant for future Commission review.

Mr. Griffin reviewed the good, better, and best table.

Commissioner Georgelos presented some alternatives to display the data related to the Opinion of Probable Cost table on page 4.7. It was noted that the term "opinion of probable cost" is a term of art and will be retained. Revisions to the chart were suggested. The chart should address the overlap between the good, better and best levels, a shadow box should be added, and a suggestion was made to not include many cost increments on the y-axis.

Commissioner Georgelos noted she had some various typos and related matters marked up on her draft plan. She was instructed to provide these to Ms. Cutro prior to the next meeting.

The Commission requested there be another work session, then the plan can be set for a public hearing for recommendation to Town Council.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

7. CONSENT AGENDA

- A. [18-135](#) Approval of March 20, 2018 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Covington, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to approve the March 20, 2018 minutes with one deletion on page 3 related to option being require and enforceable. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

8. STAFF REPORTS

Eva Cutro informed the Commission about her change in position, noting that Mr. Michaud will be the interim Community Development Director until the Town interviews and selects a new Community Development Director. She also updated the Commission on the limited staffing next week due to

the National Planning Conference.

9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

Chairman Wastchak gave an update on upcoming summer projects, including the Statement of Direction for the Sanctuary Resort.

Commissioner Covington inquired about the Azure entry wall that was approved by Commission. He heard that this wall might not be built. Ms. Cutro explained that the applicant modified the wall that broke the wall in sections, increasing the setback from the street. As such, staff determined the modification was in substantial compliance and did not require review by the Commission.

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Mr. Michaud noted that the next meeting will be a light agenda. The Finisterre wall application is set for recommendation and possibly there will be another work session on the Visually Significant Corridors Plan.

11. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell at 9:00 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Anton, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: _____
Eva Cutro, Secretary