



# Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr  
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

## Minutes - Draft Planning Commission

---

Tuesday, December 1, 2015

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

---

### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Strom called the meeting to order at 6:02 p.m.

### 2. ROLL CALL

**Present** 7 - Chairperson Dolf Strom, Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell, Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle, Commissioner Scott Moore, Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright, Commissioner Daran Wastchak and Commissioner Jeff Wincel

#### **STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT**

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller  
Community Development Director Eva Cutro  
Senior Planner Paul Michaud  
Planner George Burton

### 3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

### 4. PUBLIC HEARINGS

**15-305**

Consideration of a Minor SUP Amendment Cottonwoods Resort  
7150 E Rose Ln (SUP-15-3)

Eva Cutro presented the material in the action report. She reviewed the background and prior approvals on the subject property. She reviewed the updated items mentioned at the study session on lighting, signage, and the renovation of the Presidential Suite.

Planning Commission discussion included the following:

- Discussion regarding the SUP Guidelines for up lights that they can be 25 watts or 250 lumens, noting that the proposed up lights are 25 watts and exceed 250 lumens. This included discussion on the palm tree strap mounted up lights near the pool. The applicant noted that about 10 palm trees in the center of the site near the pool will have this type of lighting.

- A question on whether there would be dining areas on the Presidential Suite patio. The applicant replied there would be patio furniture and seating.
- Confirmation that the Presidential Suite patio wall will be three feet in height.
- Discussion regarding the unanticipated impact of the inclusion of additional lights on the south side of the patio wall of the Presidential Suite that resulted in a suggestion to add the word “building” to the stipulation about all wall mounted lights located on the south side of the resort shall not be mounted above a height of 7 feet. Eva Cutro noted that additional lights not in substantial compliance with the approved plan would require an amendment of the SUP.
- Chairman Strom remarked that the parking lot pole lighting proposed is similar to the lighting at the Saint Barnabus SUP at 6715 N Mockingbird Lane. Commissioner Mahrle added that the subject parking lot will require lighting for safety.
- As a means to determine the lowest workable lumen fixture, Commissioner Campbell brought up questions on the lumen and wattage of the light fixtures of the cut sheets for AA1b (ground-mounted spotlight), AA2 (ground-mounted flood fixture), and BB2 (low level pathway fixture). This resulted in a discussion of whether to include an additional stipulation of 250 lumen maximum and/or equivalent maximum 25 watt incandescent for the above-noted fixtures. Eva Cutro reminded the Planning Commission that the SUP Guidelines only have lumen restrictions for up lights. It was also noted that the proposed lights are in compliance with the required foot-candles at the property line as demonstrated in the photometric plan. It was determined no additional stipulation was necessary as the proposed lighting fixtures complied with the intent of the SUP Guidelines based on Sheet LT006-03 that lists all the lighting fixture data and circumstance that the lowest lumen fixture on the cut sheets for the subject light fixtures are greater than 250 lumens.

Chairman Strom opened the public portion of the meeting.

- Robert Rasmussen, resident, expressed concern regarding lighting aimed at his property, noise amplification, timing of the landscaping improvements along Quail Run Road, and flooding from the Quail Run Road turn-around area into the SUP property.

- Lee Storey, resident, asked for verification that the Presidential Suite was 76' from the west property line and not the south property line and that a resident can request shielding if the 12-foot tall light poles need shielding. She also suggested putting the up lights on a timer to shut off when the pool area is not open.

Eva Cutro noted there are two recommendations: the request is a minor amendment and recommendation of the application request with stipulations.

Chairman Strom closed the public comment portion of the meeting and asked for a motion on whether the application request is a minor amendment and the minor amendment itself. Commissioner Wincel noted that he does not find the two lighting stipulations and the tent stipulation necessary from a land use planning standpoint. Chairman Strom noted such stipulations do not set precedent. Commissioner Campbell stated such stipulations aid in memorializing the discussion.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, finding that the application request is a Minor Amendment per Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Wastchak and Commissioner Wincel

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to allow for exterior lighting, resort signage, and modifications to the presidential suite building, subject to the following stipulations:**

1. All improvements to the property shall be in substantial compliance with the following:
  - a. Cover letter/Narrative, dated November 10, 2015, from M. Andrew Rodrigues, AIA.
  - b. Lighting Narrative, dated November 25, 2015 and prepared by Ruzika Company.
  - c. Lighting Cut Sheets prepared by The Ruzika Company.
  - d. Lighting Plans, dated November 11, 2014 and prepared by The Ruzika Company and Delawie Architecture.
  - e. Sign Plans, dated November 2, 2015, November 10, 2015, November 20, 2015 and November 24, 2015, and prepared by Airpark Signs and Graphics.
  - f. Restricted land Use Area and Wall Exhibit, Exhibit A, dated October 6, 2015, and prepared by Hubbard Engineering
  - g. Planting Plan, Exhibit B, dated October 7, 2015, and prepared by Burton Landscape Architecture Studio.
  - h. Presidential F Plan, Exhibit C, dated October 5, 2015, and prepared by Delawie Architecture.
2. No lighting of trees shall be allowed in the "no tent/no event" area.

- 3. If tree lights are added around the Presidential Suite, these tree lights must be turned off at 10 p.m.
- 4. All building wall mounted lights located on the south side of the resort shall not be mounted above a height of 7 feet.
- 5. All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by the Minor Amendment SUP-15-3.

**Approved Subject to Stipulations**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Wastchak and Commissioner Wincel

**5. ACTION ITEMS**

None

**6. CONSENT AGENDA**

**A. 15-302** October 20, 2015 Planning Commission Minutes

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Wincel, to approve the October 20, 2015 minutes with one edit. The edit was on Page 6, fourth paragraph, to change the last sentence to read, "He asked why you can't capture the same rooftop experience from the deck outside the lounge lobby." The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Wastchak and Commissioner Wincel

**B. 15-294** November 17, 2015 Planning Commission Minutes

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Wincel, to approve the November 17, 2015 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Wastchak and Commissioner Wincel

**A. 15-301** Discussion of Visually Significant Corridors

Chairman Strom stated that Commissioner Wincel will lead the discussion on this topic based on his prior experience. Commissioner Wincel described a similar project he was part of as a Commissioner at a different municipality. He envisions that the Visually Significant Corridor (VSC) study would include various options for roadway designs and options within each of them, design firms would meet with the Planning Commission, and the proposals would come back and be reviewed by the Planning Commission. Eva Cutro stated she liked the approach with the various

design options since it allows for a corridor to develop over time. Andrew Miller added that an improvement district is a possible implementation measure, whether that applies to an entire corridor or parts of a corridor. He also noted that not all corridors need to be the same. Commissioner Campbell emphasized that many areas of concern are behind the right-of-way line and in front of the private wall. Commissioner Wincel raised the idea of considering an overlay district. It was noted that the Town does have an overlay district, Hillside Building Regulations. There was discussion on possible future changes to the wall/fence code and that different right-of-way widths might have different plant palettes.

Eva Cutro handed out and reviewed the RFP the Town did for 56th Street. She also reminded the Planning Commission staff is in the process of getting similar scopes from other local communities.

Chairman Strom stated that the Town has control of the right-of-way. Andrew Miller noted that although the Town has right-of-way, the property owner landscapes and maintains that portion of right-of-way. He added that without a rezoning or similar application, it is difficult to require a property owner to make such improvements. He further noted that in many instances the Town has limited right-of-way width beyond the paved areas.

Commissioner Wincel suggested the scope include an inventory of roads and in what order such roadway corridors might be improved.

Commissioner Mahrle stated that the Planning Commission might consider if money was not an object the components/elements that would make up the VSC, then to think about implementation. He noted that there are practical limitations on ROW. Commissioner Wincel added that the consultant for the plan might be different than the consultant for the construction work.

Chairman Strom asked for the sequence of events on the 56th Street improvements. Eva Cutro noted that the sketches of the roadway came with the Mountain Shadows Resort Special Use Permit prior to the RFP. She stated the Town paid for the design work in that particular situation.

Eva Cutro restated that the next step will be to get similar scopes from other places. It was suggested to look at the City of Scottsdale, Thomas Road between Hayden Drive and Scottsdale Road. Commissioner Wincel stated he would provide staff a copy of the manual he worked on and meet with Eva Cutro on this topic.

**No Reportable Action**

**7. STUDY SESSION ITEMS****8. STAFF REPORTS**

Paul Michaud reminded the Planning Commission about the upcoming Boards conference on December 4, 2015. Eva Cutro reviewed the timeline for the Ritz Carlton SUP application.

**9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS****10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Paul Michaud reviewed the upcoming agenda items. It was noted that the December 15, 2015 Planning Commission meeting will be cancelled for a lack of agenda items.

**11. ADJOURNMENT**