

**TOWN OF PARADISE VALLEY
PLANNING COMMISSION
NOVEMBER 04, 2014
MINUTES**

PRESENT: Dolf Strom, Chairman
Thomas Campbell, Commissioner
Richard Mahrle, Commissioner
Jonathan Wainwright, Commissioner
Jeff Wincel, Commissioner

ABSENT: Jerald Bien-Willner, Commissioner
Pat Hurley, Commissioner

STAFF: Larry Ratcliff, Public Safety Director
James Shano, Public Works Director/Town Engineer
Jeremy Knapp, Engineering Services Analyst
Andrew Miller, Town Attorney

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting of the Town of Paradise Valley Planning Commission was called to order by Chair Strom at 6:00 p.m.

Chair Strom acknowledged the great job Rick Mahrle did over the past two years as Chair of the Planning Commission.

WORK STUDY SESSION

Discussion of the Public Safety Communications Project for antennae, equipment building and conduit in the vicinity of 6900 North Highland Drive.

Mike Horn addressed the problems with the current communications system.

Chair Strom reviewed the meeting procedure.

Mr. Knapp provided an overview on the Public Safety Radio Communication Antennas.

In response to a question from Commissioner Wincel, Mr. Knapp stated the public exposure limits are not exceeded and construction of this site will follow OSHA guidelines for safety.

In response to a question from Commissioner Wainwright, Mr. Knapp provided

information regarding what determines the number of arms on a cactus.

In response to a question from Commissioner Campbell, Mr. Knapp provided information regarding the restoration of the site. Discussion ensued and it was recommended to add the following stipulations:

Add stone around the base of the faux cactus structure to camouflage the foundation and mounting hardware.

Restore to native condition any disturbed area near the faux cactus after completion of the project.

Chair Strom opened public comment.

Richard Post stated that in last week's Independent article the Mayor indicated that all aspects of this project are in compliance with the Hillside Ordinance. He further stated he would like to know whether the engineering on the site will be stable and not cause new runoff.

Mr. Miller advised that the Hillside Ordinance does not speak to a project like this but the project will be in substantial compliance with the Hillside Ordinance.

Ray Klein expressed his concern regarding having a commercial facility next to residential. He inquired what assurance we have that this will not end up like South Mountain in a few years with multiple cacti. Chair Strom advised that there is a stipulation that there can not be more that two cacti.

Mr. Klein also expressed his concerns regard radio frequencies and heath concerns.

Jim Hadeed inquired what value does the Global Solutions RF report have if they do not stand behind the report and provide a warrantee. He expressed his concern regarding the long-term exposure.

Mr. Knapp discussed information on the trenching and burial of the conduit for the project. He responded to questions and comments from the commissioners regarding this issue.

Wolfgang Monthofer stated that in his opinion dynamite will be necessary to accomplish the dig and there is no way it can be done with a jackhammer. He further stated that he felt the dig will be extremely dangerous and difficult.

A representative from Patriot Towers provided information regarding how the rocks on the mountain will be excavated. He stated there will be proper planning and engineering on this project. He discussed the safety measures that will be in place. He added this will

be done in the safest way possible.

In response to a question from Commissioner Wainwright, Mr. Miller stated a completion bond and performance bond will be required.

Penny Post stated that she is very concerned about the environment and she would like to see environmental studies completed prior to the start of this project.

Mr. Monthofer stated the use of dynamite conflicts with the Hillside Ordinance. Mr. Miller advised that the Hillside Ordinance does not prohibit dynamite. He stated this project will comply with the Hillside Ordinance in all applicable areas.

Louis Lopez inquired if the Planning Commission will include a stipulation that requires this project follow the Hillside Ordinance where applicable. He also inquired if there will be a stipulation that utility lines are buried. Commissioner Campbell advised there is a stipulation that the conduit will be buried.

Mr. Knapp provided an overview of the proposed Equipment Building. The Architect on the project provided an update on the changes to the building design since the last meeting. He discussed how the building will look, the proposed materials, colors and proposed landscaping.

The commission reviewed and discussed the aesthetics, proposed materials on the Equipment Building and the height of the retaining wall. The Commission recommended adding the following stipulations:

Delete the word “Alternative” from the roof material on the material board.

Commissioner Wincel stated there should be something to deter people from climbing the fence. A discussion ensued regarding creating a deterrent with landscaping.

Wolfgang Monthofer expressed his concerns regarding safety regarding the drop off behind the building and the possibility of someone falling. He stated that he is concerned about a commercial building being in residential. He further stated that he felt this project could devalue his property.

Jim Hadeed inquired about the signage and lighting on the building.

Mr. Knapp reviewed the proposed signage and lighting on the building. He provided information on the point to point communication devices on the structure.

Mr. Knapp reviewed the proposed site plan and landscaping plan. He responded to questions and comments from the commissioners regarding these plans.

The Commission discussed the site plan and landscaping plan and recommended to add the following stipulations:

Landscaping on the southwest side of the building, along the private driveway, should be of a type to deter pedestrian access, i.e. Cactus.

Add a landscaping planter bed along the northeast side of the building approximately four feet wide and remove the bollard.

The retaining wall along the driveway shall have a fence stop it for fall protection if required by the building code.

Add an additional retaining wall to the north of the building to step down the single wall height.

Raise the planter bed height along the south side of the building to break up the unbroken vertical plane of the retaining wall.

Change the top three feet of the eastern retaining wall from block to view fencing, wrapping around the corner to the first step along the northern wall.

Change the drive surface from asphalt to either pavers or decomposed granite.

Mr. Post stated that the drainage plan needs to be looked at carefully as water runoff is an issue.

Louis Lopez expressed his concern that the height of the retaining wall is violating the Hillside Ordinance.

Commissioner Campbell provided information regarding how walls are measured on the hillside.

Jim Hadeed outlined his concern regarding the retaining wall.

Nancy Monthofer outlined her concerns regarding this project. She inquired what happens if big trucks come up to her driveway and can't turn around. She stated that she would like to have a gate at their driveway. She expressed her concern about the words "substantially compliant" relating to the compliance for this project with the Hillside Ordinance.

Chair Strom closed public comment.

Mr. Knapp discussed how the Commission has addressed all of the items on the statement of direction.

ACTION ITEMS

Consideration of the Public Safety Communications Project for antennae, equipment building and conduit in the vicinity of 6900 North Highland Drive.

Commissioner Campbell moved the Planning Commission forward to Town Council approval of the design criteria for the Public Safety Communications project, subject to the stipulations contained in the action report and the stipulations as added this evening. Seconded by Commissioner Wainwright.

The motion passed by a vote of four (4) to one (1) with Commissioner Wincel dissenting.

STAFF REPORTS

Mr. Miller reported that the planning staff is in Yuma attending the Arizona Planning Association Conference.

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Mahrle moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:00 p.m. Seconded by Commissioner Wainwright and passed unanimously.

Eva Cutro, Secretary