

**Paradise Valley
Major Special Use Permit
Mountain View Medical Center
10555 N Tatum Boulevard
-Compliance to Statement of Direction-**

The Major Special Use Permit for the redevelopment of Mountain View Medical Center located at Lincoln Medical Plaza located at 10535, 10555, 10565, 10575, 10595, and 10599 North Tatum Boulevard complies with the Statement of Direction (SOD) as follows:

SOD Focus Points	Description How Meet Focus Point
[1] USE: The property is currently utilized as a medical office. The proposed uses listed in the applicant's narrative comply with the allowable medical uses listed in Section 1102.2(B) of the Zoning Ordinance. The narrative notes that retail and medical marijuana dispensaries will not be allowed. Additional parameters may need to be addressed for the proposed uses, particularly for sleep centers, veterinary practices, pharmacy and urgent care uses.	The proposed narrative has a descriptive list of uses. The proposed uses align with the broad list of uses in Section 1102.2(B) of the Zoning Ordinance. The existing Special Use Permit provisions for the site are not use specific (except for pharmacy), it allows the site to be used as a medical clinic with interpretation required related to the uses called out in Section 1102.2 of the Zoning Ordinance. The proposed Special Use Permit by listing uses will mitigate the need to interpret allowable uses. The Planning Commission has considered additional parameters for uses like , sleep centers, pharmacy, and urgent care. These parameters include limiting the hours of operation to the regular hours of operation of M-F 7:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. and Sa 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. to effectively prohibit late night/overnight uses, limiting the above uses to certain buildings, limiting the allowable number to one pharmacy and urgent care, prohibiting Schedule I and II drugs, limiting the maximum size, and requiring certain operational procedures. The applicant has stated veterinary, retail and medical marijuana dispensary are not allowed. Residents would like to have the hours reduced closer to the M-F, prohibit uses like sleep centers and raised concerns over uses that could result in public demonstrations that would negatively affect their neighborhood.

[2] HEIGHT:

The applicant is proposing both one and two-story structures with a maximum height of 21 feet (one-story) and 30 feet (two-story). Special attention shall be given to the two-story buildings. The Planning Commission may consider allowing the proposed two-story Buildings C and D near the Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard intersection up to 36 feet in height as measured from existing grade to avoid negative impacts of the proposed below grade garden level open to the outside. Such negative impacts include places for persons to loiter after hours unseen from public view, storm drainage constraints of a fully enclosed outdoor area below grade and barriers of additional stairs/elevators to access the lower level to patrons of the medical center.

The proposed redevelopment replaces each of the 6 existing buildings with new buildings. These new buildings will have flat roofs, generally are larger than the building it replaces, and are roughly in the same locations.

The heights of 4 of the 6 buildings are 21' from adjacent grade. The other 2 buildings (Buildings C and D) are two story and set close to the Tatum Blvd/Shea Blvd intersection. These two buildings are 30' from finished grade. The SOD does allow for consideration of up to 36' on the two-story buildings to remove the garden level. The Planning Commission and residents expressed a preference for the proposed garden level with HVAC units on the adjoining one-story buildings since the height in this scenario is 26' from grade.

There are 9 proposed covered parking canopies. The proposed typical canopy is 9' tall.

Except for approximately 1' of the street-facing roof parapets on Buildings A and F, the proposed structures meet the Open Space Criteria.

The submitted plans show height from natural grade, which is common for Special Use Permit properties and is a fixed ground point compared to using the finished floor elevation.

[3] SETBACKS: The proposed setbacks for the buildings meet Special Use Permit Guidelines of 40' setback from public streets and 60' setback from residential properties. However, two of the proposed covered parking structures are only 50 feet from the adjoining residential lot lines. Attention shall be given to buffering between the subject property and residential properties to mitigate any adverse effects.	The building setbacks meet Special Use Permit Guidelines. Landscape area setbacks are described under Landscaping. The minimum setback along Shea Blvd is 40' (Building F, single story, 21' tall). The minimum setback along Tatum Blvd is 40' (Building A, single story, 21' tall). Buildings D and E have a minimum 101' setback from Shea Blvd. Buildings B and C have a minimum setback of 107' from Tatum Blvd. The minimum setback along the R-18A lots is 74'11" (Building F, single story, 21' tall), 82.7'(Building A, single story, 21' tall) and 240' to 310' for Buildings C & D, both two story and 30' tall. The Special Use Permit Guidelines do not differentiate whether there are different setbacks for primary, accessory and service structures as done for resorts and other uses. Assuming the 40' and 60' setback apply, 26 covered parking spaces of the total 94 covered parking spaces would partly encroach into those setbacks. The minimum setback to the public street is approximately 75'. The minimum setback to the R-18A lots is 50' on four of the canopies.
[4] IMPACT ON NEARBY RESIDENTIAL PROPERTIES: Adjacent uses include R-18A zoned residential to the southeast and commercial uses along the major arterials of Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard to the west and north. The Planning Commission shall focus on mitigating impacts above existing ambient levels. These impacts may include such items as lighting, noise, smells, and related effects. Ways to mitigate such impacts include appropriate setbacks, building heights, location of uses, landscaping material and other related design aspects. Of particular concern are the following items: - Outdoor employee areas and service uses such as maintenance, trash collection, and mechanical equipment (roof/ground). - Better understanding of the impacts related to the construction phasing of the project. The intent is to lessen the length of construction impacts such as visual clutter, light trespass, noise, dust, traffic and related effects. - Consideration of design requirements for uses that are open in the early morning or evening hours; such as urgent care, veterinary practices and sleep centers. This may include identifying drop off and parking for such uses away from the adjoining residential homes and/or limiting such uses to buildings closer to Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard.	The circumstance that the site adjoins commercial retail on two of its three sides mitigates many of the impacts typically reviewed with a Special Use Permit. However, there are single-family homes to the rear of this medical plaza and this residential subdivision accesses their lots via Beryl Avenue which adjoins the southern driveway into the medical center. Designated employee areas are at the drop off areas shown on the site plan and located 60' or more from Firebrand Ranch. Stipulation E.5 requires outdoor activity close to the buildings away from the perimeter of the property. Service uses (i.e. trash collection) have been setback 60' from Firebrand Ranch along the west side of the rear drive aisle. Trash enclosures are presently setback 15' from the Firebrand Ranch property line. Residents prefer that this setback be further, specifically located along the Tatum Blvd/Shea Blvd portion of the site. Mechanical equipment is located on the roof as the existing condition. Mechanical units will be screened by a building parapet. Construction and construction phasing is addressed in Stipulations F1 – F7. This includes the owner providing an assurance bond to

	complete construction. The total construction timeline has been reduced since the issuance of the SOD from 5 years to 3.5 years. Residents would like to have this timeframe reduced further and limit the phases from 3 to 2. The applicant states the timeframe is related to honoring tenant leases and relocating existing tenants. The applicant also states that there will interior-only work for months in between the construction of the buildings with each phase that will mitigate impact to neighbors/on-site medical tenants. Hours of operation are addressed under SOD Point 1. Traffic, parking and circulation is addressed under SOD Point 8. Stipulations I.1 – I.3 address exterior lighting and turning off/reducing illumination after hours. Stipulations J.1 – J.6 address noise. This includes the addition of stipulations that do not exist today on the site that limits testing of emergency generators, garbage pickup, tenant moves and delivery times.
[5] LOT COVERAGE: The proposed lot coverage increases from 22.3% to approximately 25%, within the 25% Special Use Permit Guideline. The floor area ratio increases from 22.3% to 29%. There are no guidelines for floor area ratio.	The proposed lot coverage increases from 21.6% to 23.7%, less than the 25% Special Use Permit Guideline. There are no guidelines for floor area ratio that include square footage of the proposed second story. The floor area ratio increases from 21.6 % to 28.9 %. The nearby residents still take issue with the second story and the increase in interior medical use space. The existing interior space is proposed to increase from 59,969 sf to 93,118 sf.

[6] LANDSCAPING:

The Special Use Permit Guidelines recommend a 50-foot landscape area adjacent to Tatum and Shea Boulevards and 40-foot landscape area from the adjoining residential lot lines. The existing landscape areas along the public streets varies at 24 feet, 55 feet and 100 feet. Whereas, the proposed landscaping along the public streets will see some reduction and vary between 28 feet and 42 feet. The existing and proposed landscape area adjoining the residentially-zoned properties remains at 25 feet. The Planning Commission shall focus on the following items:

- a. Attention shall be paid to the landscape area along Tatum Boulevard as this is along a Visually Significant Corridor and a known area of loitering. The landscape plan is in substantial compliance with the proposed Visually Significant Corridors Plan (VSC). Major amendments to SUPs are encouraged to use the “Best” option in the VSC. However, application of any “Best” options shall not conflict with the heightened provision of security necessary at a medical center.
- b. Consideration of design elements that discourage loitering, near and on the site, for safety and security. This may include the use of spiny desert landscaping in strategic locations where persons may loiter and attention to the location of screen walls that may become an attractive nuisance.
- c. Hardscaping and pedestrian access shall be considered with the landscape plan.
- d. A stipulation may be considered to ensure replacement of any dead landscaping.
- e. Attention shall be paid to the southeast side of the property to screen the residential homes from any adverse effects of the proposed development.

None of the lineal frontage on the proposed landscape areas along Tatum Blvd and Shea Blvd comply with the Special Use Permit Guideline of 50’ setback from the street property line. If of the total 950 lf of frontage does not meet the guideline today. The proposed widths vary approximately 29’ up to 42’ (measured from the property line). The Planning Commission found this acceptable as a means to have the buildings setback further from Firebrand Ranch.

The approximate 25’ wide landscape area adjacent to the residential lots is proposed to remain at the same width. This is less than the 40’ width suggested in the Special Use Permit Guideline. Although, the additional triangular landscaped area nearest to parcel 168-07-012 will be replaced with parking in Phase 3. To address this matter the applicant proposes to increase the number of trees on the site from 101 to 233, that includes increasing the total number of trees along Firebrand Ranch from 36 to 78. The plan also uses up to 36” box trees for the new trees. The applicant further changed the tree type to denser canopy trees and is allowing the adjoining residential property owner to select the tree type and will pay to raise the perimeter wall to 8’ tall for those who want to raise their wall.

The proposed revised plan more than doubles the tree count to 233 trees. The proposed trees along the streets are all trees listed for the Rural Elegance zone (e.g. Mesquite, Palo Verde, Ironwood). Application of the VSC plan to both Tatum Blvd and Shea Blvd suggests each street frontage provide approximately 9 to 19 trees per street frontage. The proposed plan indicates 28 trees along Tatum Blvd and 39 trees along Shea Blvd. Both street frontages far exceed the 46 to 48 shrub counts. Each frontage has over 400 shrubs. The plan proposes 13 saguaros along Tatum Blvd per the VSC plan. The plan provides two ironwood trees along Shea Blvd and 6 ironwood trees along Tatum Blvd.

Major SUP requests encouraged to use the best option in this plan. This best option would include having approximately 55% live coverage, incorporation of year-round color, accent walls using with weathered steel sculptural split rail – stone veneer, screen walls that include desert motifs to hide utility boxes such as those along Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard, incorporating pedestrian seat walls/shade, among

	other design elements. The proposed plan meets the VSC “best” guidelines by having the area between the property line along the street and the front of the buildings at over 55% live coverage, incorporating saguaros and ocotillo, the use of exposed aggregate concrete for walkways and decorative pavers at drop off/driveway entries. Due to the modern architecture, the plan does not include split rail fencing or desert motif patterns on the parking lot screen walls. Design elements to discourage loitering includes the replacement of turf with decomposed granite ground cover, placement of red bird of paradise in front of the parking lot screen walls and removal of the garden level on the two-story buildings. However, the Planning Commission found that the garden level due to its large size, location and various on-site security measures would not encourage loitering. Landscaping stipulations H1.1 – H.9 address various landscaping points. This includes Stipulation H.2 to replace dead landscaping within 30 days.
[7] INFRASTRUCTURE AND UTILITY IMPROVEMENTS: The applicant shall address and identify the location of on-site retention and identify how the on-site retention may affect parking and circulation. Utility improvements that may have a visual impact or service level impact should be explained and mitigated. Water impact, utility information, and hydrology report shall be reviewed.	The applicant has provided correspondence from the utility providers they will provide service. There are no anticipated major system improvements to service the site. Fire flow wells exceeds the Town’s minimum 1,500 gallon per minute standard. It is at 3,842 gpm. The conceptual drainage plans submitted is designed such that each of the three phases will function independently. There will be above-ground retention basins at a maximum depth of 3’ and underground storage/drywells that will retain a total of 12,500 cubic feet of storm water.

[8] TRAFFIC, PARKING, AND CIRCULATION:

The primary concern when evaluating impact of this project is safety and mitigating impacts above existing ambient levels to adjacent homeowners such as excessive lighting, noise, and bad smells. The applicant's traffic/parking analysis indicates a few intersections at certain times of day will have some additional traffic delay. Some considerations for review shall include:

- a. Number of access points in/out of the site
- b. Emergency access to the site
- c. Sidewalk and other pedestrian circulation
- d. Loading/unloading areas and trash collection
- e. Number of parking spaces, use of shared parking, and ride-share
 - i. The applicant's traffic/parking assumes a parking calculation 0.8 parking space per 200 leasable square footage instead of the suggested 1.0 parking space per 200 leasable square footage. Attention shall be given to alternate studies to assure the proposed parking will meet the needs of the medical center and not negatively impact safety.
 - ii. Attention shall also be given to the phasing of the project and assuring that at all times parking will meet the demands of both the medical center and the construction vehicles.

No additional right-of-way is required. The Tatum Blvd and Shea Blvd right-of-way are fully within the City of Phoenix. The half width of right-of-way varies between 50' and 60', which is less than the Town standard but within the City of Phoenix standard. Correspondence with the engineering division at the City of Phoenix is ongoing. Initial comments from Phoenix resulted in the City does not currently have any plans for Tatum Blvd or Shea Blvd at that location and has no comments on the redevelopment plans. The City is agreeable to the traffic study findings to stripe a deceleration lane onto northbound Tatum at Beryl Ave and reconsider the signal timing.

The applicant submitted a parking analysis. Based on the proposed leasable square footage, 456 parking spaces are suggested by the Special Use Permit Guidelines. The applicant proposes 411 parking spaces. The analysis supports a reduction of the suggested one parking space/ 200 sf based upon the circumstance that part of the square footage will be used for uses such as a pharmacy that have less restrictive parking standards than the suggested one parking space/ 200 sf and neighboring jurisdictions have a parking standard of one parking space/ 250 sf.

Parking space size is 9' x 18' (with 2' overhang in landscape area or extended walkway). The Special Use Permit can allow for the 9' x 18' (with 2' overhang). Stipulation K.1 addressed that the overhang must remain clear of obstacles.

Per the study submitted, existing Level of Service (LOS) at the various intersections adjacent to the site operate at an overall LOS of D or better. Half intersections operate less than LOS D during 1 or more peak hours (i.e. Northbound right turn lane at Tatum/Shea intersection worsens, Tatum/Beryl/Fry's remains poor LOS, and Shea/50th westbound worsens).

Full build-out adds 1,204 additional daily trips, 64 additional AM peak trips and 107 additional PM peak trips.

Traffic and parking remains a concern from residents, particularly due to the 50% increase in interior building footage. The Planning Commission had several questions on traffic, parking and circulation impact that the applicant's engineer addressed in the CivTech memo dated Feb 26, 2019. The Planning Commission may wish to restate their position on traffic, parking and

Compliance to Statement of Direction – June 4, 2019

	circulation.
--	--------------

[9] SIGNAGE:

The Special Use Permit Guidelines suggest medical use properties have one ground sign no higher than 8 feet and no larger than 40 square feet at each principal entrance, no moving elements or animation, and traffic/directional signs not exceed 5 feet tall and 12 square feet. Several of the proposed signs will not be in compliance with the Special Use Permit Guidelines and the site will have more signs than the existing medical center. Attention shall be paid to building mounted signage and the resulting impact to the streetscape including the location, dimensions, and illumination of the signs. The review shall be balanced with the need for visibility of the signs, and the location at a busy intersection with prominent signage on the other three corners.

Monument: The 2 proposed double-sided monument signs will replace 2 existing monument signs. The new signs are larger in sign area and exceed the total Special Use Permit Guideline on number and sign area since double-sided signs are considered two signs by the Zoning Ordinance. The proposed signs are 8' tall, 81.33 sf sign area each side, indirectly illuminated, include the site address, have the name of center and have space for up to 6 tenant names. Planning Commission direction was for a smaller sign area closer to the 67.2 sf of PV Medical.

Suite: Each tenant suite will have a sign near the suite doors, illuminated indirectly from soffit lights, and each building will have letters identifying the building. This is similar to the existing plaza and not unlike other medical Special Use Permit sites. There are no Special Use Permit Guidelines for tenant signage.

Directory: The site includes 3 primary directory signs. These signs comply with the maximum 5' tall Special Use Permit Guideline, but are greater than the 12 sf sign area. Building A & F will have a monument directory that is 4.5' tall, 18 sf, lists the tenants, is illuminated from up-lighting in the base and setback 65' from Firebrand Ranch. Buildings B-E have one directory that is 5' tall, lists the tenants, is illuminated from up-lighting in the base and setback 245' from Firebrand Ranch. The Planning Commission discussed the "M" component of the directory for Buildings B-E as artwork and not part of the sign. The directory itself is 16.5 sf in area.

Building: There are 4 maximum building signs mounted near the parapet. The Special Use Permit Guidelines do not address this type of signage. However, the commercial businesses in the City of Phoenix across from the subject site have similar signage. Also, Phoenix Country Day School and Paradise Valley United Methodist have similar illuminated building signs near the roof line, but not at this amount. The proposed signs include 2 signs that face Shea Blvd and 2 signs that face Tatum Blvd. All signs have 2' tall letters/logo, up to 40 sf in size, and halo illumination. 1 sign will be located on the one-story Buildings A & F at 20' tall to the top of the sign. An option is proposed to allow the other signs on either the one-story Building B and/or E or the two-story Buildings C and/or D, with the sign(s) on the two-story building at 30' tall to the top of the sign. Due to the circumstance that the 4 building signs face

Compliance to Statement of Direction – June 4, 2019

	commercial businesses in the City of Phoenix that will not impact adjoining Town residents, the Planning Commission agreed to allow some building signage ” Stipulations L.1 – L.3 address signs. This includes hours the signs are to be turned off.
--	---

**Paradise Valley
Major Special Use Permit
Mountain View Medical Center
10555 N Tatum Boulevard
-Compliance to Statement of Direction-**

The Major Special Use Permit for the redevelopment of Mountain View Medical Center located at Lincoln Medical Plaza located at 10535, 10555, 10565, 10575, 10595, and 10599 North Tatum Boulevard complies with the Statement of Direction (SOD) as follows:

SOD Focus Points	Description How Meet Focus Point
[1] USE: The property is currently utilized as a medical office. The proposed uses listed in the applicant's narrative comply with the allowable medical uses listed in Section 1102.2(B) of the Zoning Ordinance. The narrative notes that retail and medical marijuana dispensaries will not be allowed. Additional parameters may need to be addressed for the proposed uses, particularly for sleep centers, veterinary practices, pharmacy and urgent care uses.	The proposed narrative has a descriptive list of uses. The proposed uses align with the broad list of uses in Section 1102.2(B) of the Zoning Ordinance. <u>The existing Special Use Permit provisions for the site are not use specific (except for pharmacy), it allows the site to be used as a medical clinic with interpretation required related to the uses called out in Section 1102.2 of the Zoning Ordinance. The proposed Special Use Permit by listing uses will mitigate the need to interpret allowable uses.</u> The Planning Commission <u>has considered</u> may wish to consider additional parameters for uses like veterinarian practices, sleep centers, pharmacy, and urgent care. <u>These parameters include limiting the hours of operation to the regular hours of operation of M-F 7:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. and Sa 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. to effectively prohibit late night/overnight uses, limiting the above uses to certain buildings, limiting the allowable number to one pharmacy and urgent care, prohibiting Schedule I and II drugs, limiting the maximum size, and requiring certain operational procedures. -other than those identified by the applicant.</u> The applicant has stated <u>veterinary, retail and medical marijuana dispensary are not allowed. These parameters might include limits on what building the use is allowed, limits on after hour parking locations, limits on Schedule I and II drugs, evaluation of hours of pharmacy being increased from 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. to longer hours, among others. Residents would like to have the hours reduced closer to the M-F, prohibit uses like sleep centers and raised concerns over uses that could result in public demonstrations that would negatively affect their neighborhood.</u>

[2] HEIGHT:

The applicant is proposing both one and two-story structures with a maximum height of 21 feet (one-story) and 30 feet (two-story). Special attention shall be given to the two-story buildings. The Planning Commission may consider allowing the proposed two-story Buildings C and D near the Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard intersection up to 36 feet in height as measured from existing grade to avoid negative impacts of the proposed below grade garden level open to the outside. Such negative impacts include places for persons to loiter after hours unseen from public view, storm drainage constraints of a fully enclosed outdoor area below grade and barriers of additional stairs/elevators to access the lower level to patrons of the medical center.

The proposed redevelopment replaces each of the 6 existing buildings with new buildings. These new buildings will have flat roofs, generally are larger than the building it replaces, and are roughly in the same locations.

The heights of 4 of the 6 buildings are 21' from adjacent grade. The other 2 buildings (Buildings C and D) are two story and set close to the Tatum Blvd/Shea Blvd intersection. These two buildings are 30' from finished grade, ~~but extend 5' further below grade and are accessed via stairs/elevators to the lower garden level. Since the grade is fully restored around this garden level, height is measured from grade and in compliance with the SUP Guidelines. This garden level would be included in lot coverage/floor area ratio.~~ The SOD does allow for consideration of up to 36' on the two-story buildings to remove the garden level. The Planning Commission and residents expressed a preference for the proposed garden level with HVAC units on the adjoining one-story buildings since the height in this scenario is 26' from grade. will want to review the impact of this change in height. Some of the reasons used to support the 36' tall height might include:

~~The current Class A building standards for medical office is 15-foot floor to floor, with five-foot ceiling space.~~

~~There is an additional 6 to 12 inches of roof height to accommodate proper storm water drainage for flat roofs. This is generally one inch for every four feet.~~

There are 9 proposed covered parking canopies. The proposed typical canopy is 9' tall. ~~However, the parking canopies nearest the two-story buildings appear to be integral to the building and slope with the lower edge at a height of 8' and the taller height at approximately 12'.~~

Except for approximately 1' of the street-facing roof parapets on Buildings A and F, the proposed structures meet the Open Space Criteria.

The submitted plans show height from natural grade, which is common for Special Use Permit properties and is a fixed ground point compared to using the finished floor elevation.

[3] SETBACKS:

The proposed setbacks for the buildings meet Special Use Permit Guidelines of 40' setback from public streets and 60' setback from residential properties. However, two of the proposed covered parking structures are only 50 feet from the adjoining residential lot lines. Attention shall be given to buffering between the subject property and residential properties to mitigate any adverse effects.

The building setbacks meet Special Use Permit Guidelines. Landscape area setbacks are described under Landscaping. The minimum setback along Shea Blvd is 40' (Building F, single story, 21' tall). The minimum setback along Tatum Blvd is 40' (Building A, single story, 21' tall). Buildings D and E have a minimum 101' setback from Shea Blvd. Buildings B and C have a minimum setback of 107' from Tatum Blvd. The minimum setback along the R-18A lots is 74'11" (Building F, single story, 21' tall), 82.7' (Building A, single story, 21' tall) and 240' to 310' for Buildings C & D, both two story and 30' tall.

The Special Use Permit Guidelines do not differentiate whether there are different setbacks for primary, accessory and service structures as done for resorts and other uses. Assuming the 40' and 60' setback apply, 26 covered parking spaces of the total 94 covered parking spaces 5 of 9 parking canopies would partly encroach into those setbacks. The minimum setback to the public street is approximately 75'. 28' on one of the canopies along Shea Blvd. The minimum setback to the R-18A lots is 50' on four of the canopies.

~~Also, most of the proposed canopies are designed with the long side facing the residential lots. Only one existing parking canopy does not have a 60' setback. It has a 14' setback.~~

[4] IMPACT ON NEARBY RESIDENTIAL PROPERTIES:

Adjacent uses include R-18A zoned residential to the southeast and commercial uses along the major arterials of Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard to the west and north. The Planning Commission shall focus on mitigating impacts above existing ambient levels. These impacts may include such items as lighting, noise, smells, and related effects. Ways to mitigate such impacts include appropriate setbacks, building heights, location of uses, landscaping material and other related design aspects. Of particular concern are the following items:

- a. Outdoor employee areas and service uses such as maintenance, trash collection, and mechanical equipment (roof/ground).
- b. Better understanding of the impacts related to the construction phasing of the project. The intent is to lessen the length of construction impacts such as visual clutter, light trespass, noise, dust, traffic and related effects.
- c. Consideration of design requirements for uses that are open in the early morning or evening hours; such as urgent care, veterinary practices and sleep

The circumstance that the site adjoins commercial retail on two of its three sides mitigates many of the impacts typically reviewed with a Special Use Permit. However, there are single-family homes to the rear of this medical plaza and this residential subdivision accesses their lots via Beryl Avenue which adjoins the southern driveway into the medical center.

~~The Planning Commission will want to evaluate and discuss the points addressed in the SOD over the various work sessions on this application request.~~

Designated employee areas are at the drop off areas shown on the site plan and located 60' or more from Firebrand Ranch. Stipulation E.5 requires outdoor activity close to the buildings away from the perimeter of the property.

Service uses (i.e. trash collection) have been setback 60' from Firebrand Ranch along the west side of the rear drive aisle. Trash enclosures are presently setback 15' from the Firebrand Ranch

centers. This may include identifying drop off and parking for such uses away from the adjoining residential homes and/or limiting such uses to buildings closer to Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard.	<u>property line. Residents prefer that this setback be further, specifically located along the Tatum Blvd/Shea Blvd portion of the site.</u> <u>Mechanical equipment is located on the roof as the existing condition. Mechanical units will be screened by a building parapet.</u> <u>Construction and construction phasing is addressed in Stipulations F1 – F7. This includes the owner providing an assurance bond to complete construction. The total construction timeline has been reduced since the issuance of the SOD from 5 years to 3.5 years. Residents would like to have this timeframe reduced further and limit the phases from 3 to 2. The applicant states the timeframe is related to honoring tenant leases and relocating existing tenants. The applicant also states that there will interior-only work for months in between the construction of the buildings with each phase that will mitigate impact to neighbors/on-site medical tenants.</u> <u>Hours of operation are addressed under SOD Point 1.</u> <u>Traffic, parking and circulation is addressed under SOD Point 8.</u> <u>Stipulations I.1 – I.3 address exterior lighting and turning off/reducing illumination after hours.</u> <u>Stipulations J.1 – J.6 address noise. This includes the addition of stipulations that do not exist today on the site that limits testing of emergency generators, garbage pickup, tenant moves and delivery times.</u>
[5] LOT COVERAGE: The proposed lot coverage increases from 22.3% to approximately 25%, within the 25% Special Use Permit Guideline. The floor area ratio increases from 22.3% to 29%. There are no guidelines for floor area ratio.	The proposed lot coverage increases from 21.622.3% to 23.724.89%, less than the 25% Special Use Permit Guideline. <u>There are no guidelines for floor area ratio that include square footage of the proposed second story. Lot coverage calculation needs to be verified.</u> The floor area ratio increases from 21.622.3% to 28.929%. <u>The nearby residents still take issue with the second story and the increase in interior medical use space. The existing interior space is proposed to increase from 59,969 sf to 93,118 sf.</u>

[6] LANDSCAPING:

The Special Use Permit Guidelines recommend a 50-foot landscape area adjacent to Tatum and Shea Boulevards and 40-foot landscape area from the adjoining residential lot lines. The existing landscape areas along the public streets varies at 24 feet, 55 feet and 100 feet. Whereas, the proposed landscaping along the public streets will see some reduction and vary between 28 feet and 42 feet. The existing and proposed landscape area adjoining the residentially-zoned properties remains at 25 feet. The Planning Commission shall focus on the following items:

- a. Attention shall be paid to the landscape area along Tatum Boulevard as this is along a Visually Significant Corridor and a known area of loitering. The landscape plan is in substantial compliance with the proposed Visually Significant Corridors Plan (VSC). Major amendments to SUPs are encouraged to use the "Best" option in the VSC. However, application of any "Best" options shall not conflict with the heightened provision of security necessary at a medical center.
- b. Consideration of design elements that discourage loitering, near and on the site, for safety and security. This may include the use of spiny desert landscaping in strategic locations where persons may loiter and attention to the location of screen walls that may become an attractive nuisance.
- c. Hardscaping and pedestrian access shall be considered with the landscape plan.
- d. A stipulation may be considered to ensure replacement of any dead landscaping.
- e. Attention shall be paid to the southeast side of the property to screen the residential homes from any adverse effects of the proposed development.

~~The None of the lineal frontage on the~~ proposed landscape areas along Tatum Blvd and Shea Blvd ~~are not in compliance~~ comply with the Special Use Permit Guideline of 50' setback from the street property line in width. 550 lf of the total 950 lf of frontage does not meet the guideline today. The proposed ~~width is~~ widths vary approximately 29' up to 42' (measured from the property line). The Planning Commission found this acceptable as a means to have the buildings setback further from Firebrand Ranch.

The approximate 25' wide landscape area adjacent to the residential lots is proposed to remain at the same width. This is less than the 40' width suggested in the Special Use Permit Guideline. Although, the additional triangular landscaped area nearest to parcel 168-07-012 will be replaced with parking in Phase 3. To address this matter the applicant proposes to increase the number of trees on the site from 101 to 233, that includes increasing the total number of trees along Firebrand Ranch from 36 to 78. The plan also uses up to 36" box trees for the new trees. The applicant further changed the tree type to denser canopy trees and is allowing the adjoining residential property owner to select the tree type and will pay to raise the perimeter wall to 8' tall for those who want to raise their wall. The existing shared wall could be raised to a maximum 8' tall wall.

The proposed revised plan more than doubles the tree count to 233 trees. The proposed trees along the streets are all trees listed for the Rural Elegance zone (e.g. Mesquite, Palo Verde, Ironwood). ~~Properties requesting a~~ Application of the VSC plan to both Tatum Blvd and Shea Blvd suggests each street frontage provide approximately 9 to 19 trees per street frontage. The proposed plan indicates 28 trees along Tatum Blvd and 39 trees along Shea Blvd. Both street frontages far exceed the 46 to 48 shrub counts. Each frontage has over 400 shrubs. The plan proposes 13 saguaros along Tatum Blvd per the VSC plan. The plan provides two ironwood trees along Shea Blvd and 6 ironwood trees along Tatum Blvd.

Major SUP ~~are~~ requests encouraged to use the best option in this plan. This best option would include having approximately 55% live coverage, incorporation of year-round color, accent walls

	using with weathered steel sculptural split rail – stone veneer, screen walls that include desert motifs to hide utility boxes such as those along Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard, incorporating <u>pedestrian seat walls/shade</u>, among other design elements. <u>The proposed plan meets the VSC “best” guidelines by having the area between the property line along the street and the front of the buildings at over 55% live coverage, incorporating saguaros and ocotillo, the use of exposed aggregate concrete for walkways and decorative pavers at drop off/driveway entries. Due to the modern architecture, the plan does not include split rail fencing or desert motif patterns on the parking lot screen walls.</u> <u>Design elements to discourage loitering includes the replacement of turf with decomposed granite ground cover, placement of red bird of paradise in front of the parking lot screen walls and removal of the garden level on the two-story buildings. However, the Planning Commission found that the garden level due to its large size, location and various on-site security measures would not encourage loitering.</u> <u>Landscaping stipulations H1.1 – H.9 address various landscaping points. This includes Stipulation H.2 to replace dead landscaping within 30 days.</u> The Planning Commission will want to evaluate and discuss the points addressed in the SOD over the various work sessions on this application request.
[7] INFRASTRUCTURE AND UTILITY IMPROVEMENTS: The applicant shall address and identify the location of on-site retention and identify how the on-site retention may affect parking and circulation. Utility improvements that may have a visual impact or service level impact should be explained and mitigated. Water impact, utility information, and hydrology report shall be reviewed.	The applicant has provided correspondence from the utility providers they will provide service. There are no anticipated major system improvements to service the site. Fire flow wells exceeds the Town’s minimum 1,500 gallon per minute standard. It is at 3,842 gpm. The conceptual drainage plans submitted is designed such that each of the three phases will function independently. There will be above-ground retention basins at a maximum depth of 3’ and underground storage/drywells that will retain a total of 12,500 cubic feet of storm water.

[8] TRAFFIC, PARKING, AND CIRCULATION:

The primary concern when evaluating impact of this project is safety and mitigating impacts above existing ambient levels to adjacent homeowners such as excessive lighting, noise, and bad smells. The applicant's traffic/parking analysis indicates a few intersections at certain times of day will have some additional traffic delay. Some considerations for review shall include:

- a. Number of access points in/out of the site
- b. Emergency access to the site
- c. Sidewalk and other pedestrian circulation
- d. Loading/unloading areas and trash collection
- e. Number of parking spaces, use of shared parking, and ride-share
 - i. The applicant's traffic/parking assumes a parking calculation 0.8 parking space per 200 leasable square footage instead of the suggested 1.0 parking space per 200 leasable square footage. Attention shall be given to alternate studies to assure the proposed parking will meet the needs of the medical center and not negatively impact safety.
 - ii. Attention shall also be given to the phasing of the project and assuring that at all times parking will meet the demands of both the medical center and the construction vehicles.

No additional right-of-way is required. The Tatum Blvd and Shea Blvd right-of-way are fully within the City of Phoenix. The half width of right-of-way varies between 50' and 60', which is less than the Town standard but within the City of Phoenix standard. Correspondence with the engineering division at the City of Phoenix is ongoing. Initial comments from Phoenix resulted in the City does not currently have any plans for Tatum Blvd or Shea Blvd at that location and has no comments on the redevelopment plans. The City is agreeable to the traffic study findings to stripe a deceleration lane onto northbound Tatum at Beryl Ave and reconsider the signal timing.

The applicant submitted a parking analysis. Based on the proposed leasable square footage, 456 parking spaces are suggested by the Special Use Permit Guidelines. The applicant proposes 411 parking spaces. The analysis supports a reduction of the suggested one parking space/ 200 sf based upon the circumstance that part of the square footage will be used for uses such as a pharmacy that have less restrictive parking standards than the suggested one parking space/ 200 sf and neighboring jurisdictions have a parking standard of one parking space/ 250 sf.

Parking space size is 9' x 18' (with 2' overhang in landscape area or extended walkway). The Special Use Permit can allow for the 9' x 18' (with 2' overhang). Stipulation K.1 addressed that A stipulation will be drafted to make sure the overhang must remains clear of obstacles.

Per the study submitted, existing Level of Service (LOS) at the various intersections adjacent to the site operate at an overall LOS of D or better, ~~with the exception of Tatum Blvd/Shea Blvd intersection and Tatum Boulevard/Beryl Avenue intersection which are worse in the evening commute. The proposed buildout generally maintains the existing LOS, except for some movements in the evening that worsen (i.e., northbound right turn lane at Tatum Blvd/Shea Blvd intersection). The additional daily trips added at buildout is 1,204. The existing access driveways will remain in their current locations. The Planning Commission may want to discuss the findings of this study and its impact. Half intersections operate less than LOS D during 1 or more peak hours (i.e. Northbound right turn lane at Tatum/Shea intersection worsens,~~

	<u>Tatum/Beryl/Fry's remains poor LOS, and Shea/50th westbound worsens).</u> <u>Full build-out adds 1,204 additional daily trips, 64 additional AM peak trips and 107 additional PM peak trips.</u> <u>Traffic and parking remains a concern from residents, particularly due to the 50% increase in interior building footage. The Planning Commission had several questions on traffic, parking and circulation impact that the applicant's engineer addressed in the CivTech memo dated Feb 26, 2019. The Planning Commission may wish to restate their position on traffic, parking and circulation.</u>
--	--

[9] SIGNAGE:

The Special Use Permit Guidelines suggest medical use properties have one ground sign no higher than 8 feet and no larger than 40 square feet at each principal entrance, no moving elements or animation, and traffic/directional signs not exceed 5 feet tall and 12 square feet. Several of the proposed signs will not be in compliance with the Special Use Permit Guidelines and the site will have more signs than the existing medical center. Attention shall be paid to building mounted signage and the resulting impact to the streetscape including the location, dimensions, and illumination of the signs. The review shall be balanced with the need for visibility of the signs, and the location at a busy intersection with prominent signage on the other three corners.

Monument: The 2 proposed double-sided monument signs will replace 2 existing monument signs. The new signs are ~~lower and smaller~~ larger in sign area, ~~but still do not meet and exceed~~ the total Special Use Permit Guideline on number and sign area since double-sided signs are considered two signs by the Zoning Ordinance. The proposed signs are ~~5-8'~~ 8' tall, ~~30~~ 81.33 sf sign area each side, indirectly illuminated, include the site address, ~~and~~ have the name of center and have space for up to 6 tenant names. Planning Commission direction was for a smaller sign area closer to the 67.2 sf of PV Medical.

Suite: Each tenant suite will have a sign near the suite doors, illuminated indirectly from soffit lights, and each building will have letters identifying the building. This is similar to the existing plaza and not unlike other medical Special Use Permit sites. There are no Special Use Permit Guidelines for tenant signage.

Directory: The site includes 3 primary directory signs. These signs comply with the maximum 5' tall Special Use Permit Guideline, but are greater than the 12 sf sign area. Building A & F will have a monument directory that is 4.5' tall, ~~18~~ 22.5 sf, lists the tenants, ~~and~~ is illuminated from up-lighting in the base and setback 65' from Firebrand Ranch. Buildings B-E have one directory that is 5' tall, ~~85 sf,~~ lists the tenants, ~~and~~ is illuminated from up-lighting in the base and setback 245' from Firebrand Ranch. The Planning Commission discussed the "M" component of the directory for Buildings B-E as artwork and not part of the sign. The directory itself is 16.5 sf in area.

Building: There are ~~4~~ maximum 7 building signs mounted near the parapet. The Special Use Permit Guidelines do not address this type of signage. However, ~~the recent Lincoln Plaza Medical Center site and~~ the commercial businesses in the City of Phoenix across from the subject site have similar signage. Also, Phoenix Country Day School and Paradise Valley United Methodist have similar illuminated building signs near the roof line, but not at this amount. The proposed signs include ~~2~~ 5 signs that face Shea Blvd and 2 signs that face Tatum Blvd. All signs have that are 20' tall to the top of the sign, 2' tall letters/logo, up -20-sf to 40 sf in size, and halo illumination internally illuminated. 1 sign will be located on the one-story Buildings A & F at 20' tall

to the top of the sign. An option is proposed to allow the other signs on either the one-story Building B and/or E or the two-story Buildings C and/or D, with the sign(s) on the two-story building at 30' tall to the top of the sign. Due to the circumstance that the 4 building signs face commercial businesses in the City of Phoenix that will not impact adjoining Town residents, the Planning Commission agreed to allow some building signage. There is one sign along Tatum Blvd on Building A matches the Shea Blvd signs. The sign facing Shea Blvd on the 2-story building is 30' tall to the top of the sign, 2' tall letters, 46 sf, and internally illuminated. It would be recommended that all or some of these signs be turned off pursuant to Section 2506.H of the Lighting Code that states "Signs may be illuminated only during the hours that the associated establishment is open for business."

Stipulations L.1 – L.3 address signs. This includes hours the signs are to be turned off.