

**Smoke Tree Resort
Guideline Comparison
May 2023**

Below is an evaluation of how the Smoke Tree Resort Major Special Use Permit amendment application meets the guidelines for property zoned Special Use Permit (SUP). **Red** highlighted text indicates where the proposed structures do not meet guidelines. **Purple** highlighted text indicates where existing structures (all proposed to be demolished) do not meet guidelines. The request is for the redevelopment of the 5.0 net acre site with 82 total resort guest units, a detached fine dining restaurant/bar with cellar and patio dining, all-day market bistro with outdoor patio, meeting function building with outdoor event lawn, resort pool, guest fitness and spa facility, and underground parking. The resort is located at 7101 E Lincoln Drive

No.	Topic	SUP Guideline - Town Code - Town Policy - General Plan	Proposed by Applicant sf=square feet
1	Use	<u>Section 1102.2 of the Zoning Ordinance identifies allowable uses for a resort:</u> ○ Guest units ○ Accessory uses ○ Indoor/outdoor recreational facilities ○ Retail sales ○ Office & business services ○ Restaurants/food services ○ Meeting spaces - Dwelling units	The primary use is for 82 guest units totaling approximately 52,796 sf (39% of the total area), back of house functions (offices, kitchen, storage, laundry, etc.) totaling approximately 49,542 sf (35%), public areas of the food/beverage uses totaling approximately 11,660 sf (10%), spa/fitness totaling approximately 5,361 sf (9%), lobby totaling approximately 4,958 sf (4%), and indoor meeting space totaling approximately 4,654 sf (3%). The total area used is 136,469 sf since there are public uses at the garage level (the 167,580 sf gross area minus the 31,301 sf underground garage parking area spaces). <i>Analysis: The type of resort uses are compliant with Section 1102.2 of the Zoning Ordinance. The site is and has been since incorporation in 1961 used as a resort, with the resort not in operation for the last couple of years. The uses at the proposed resort will include additional resort amenities from the past resort. Besides additional guest units, the proposal offers two different food and beverage options instead of one restaurant facility, an indoor/outdoor meeting function space, and fitness/spa facilities. Improvements to the grounds include a larger resort pool, enhanced landscaping, new signage, and underground parking.</i>

2	Noise Mitigation/Impact to Adjacent Uses	Section 1102.3.C of the Zoning Ordinance allows the Town to require various plans and studies, including a noise study to evaluate the compatibility of the proposed project with surrounding areas.	The applicant submitted a noise study that still requires additional clarification information and/or will require stipulations to demonstrate compliance to Town noise standards at the property line (specifically, the 45 decibels on Sundays, holidays, and between 10:00 p.m. and 7:00 a.m.) <i>Analysis: The submittal includes a noise study based on various modeling and assumptions that may include the consideration of stipulations, installation of noise mitigation equipment, and/or design modifications. There may be consideration of possible restrictions on the use of certain outdoor areas after 10:00 p.m. and on Sundays/legal holidays and/or the request needs to include technological noise mitigation and/or other design modifications in the areas along the property line like the French Cowboy patios, west of the event lawn along Quail Run Road, and the south opening near the resort pool. Some items requested of the applicant to clarify includes providing more information on the type of dispersed speakers proposed (locations, quantity ranges, type of speakers, etc.), noise limiters, and/or noise monitoring devices. Compliance with noise mitigation is under review and will be revisited.</i>
3	Density	<u>SUP Guidelines:</u> Minimum 20 acres Minimum 1 guest unit per 4,000 sq ft = 52 maximum units (net including Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road post dedication), 55 maximum units (net) or 58 maximum guest units (gross) (10.7 units per gross acre or 10.8 units per net acre or 11.0 units per net acre)	Site (Gross): 233,630 sf (5.4 acres) Site (Net): 218,096 sf (5.0 acres) Site (Net): 207,250 sf (4.8 acres Quail Run Road post dedication) Gross acres includes the rights-of-way on the adjoining streets. Existing net acres excludes the Lincoln Drive right-of-way at 33 feet in width in lieu of the typical 65 feet half width (but includes sidewalk easement of 7 feet) and Proposed net acres excludes the Lincoln Drive right-of-way at 33 feet in width in lieu of the typical 65 feet half width (but includes sidewalk easement of 7 feet) and excludes the Quail Run Road at the typical 25-foot half-width post dedication. 30 existing units (5.6 units per gross acre at 1 unit per 7,788 sf or 6.0 units per net acre at 1 unit per 7,720 sf) 82 proposed units (15.2 units per gross acre at 1 unit per 2,849 sf or 16.4 units per net acre at 1 unit per 2,660 sf or 17.1 units per net acre at 1 unit per 2,527 sf (includes Quail Run Road dedication)

			<i>Analysis: The site area is and has been five acres, which is a quarter of the SUP Guideline for resorts for a minimum of 20 acres. Smoke Tree is the smallest resort by size within the Town. The proposed density at 15.2 units per acre (gross) and 16.4 and 17.1 units per acre (net) falls within the density range for existing Town resorts of 3.9 units per acre (Camelback Inn located at 5201 E Lincoln Drive due to it being the largest resort by size at 117 total acres) and 20.1 units per acre (Doubletree Paradise Valley located at 5401 N Scottsdale Road). Based on the five acres, the maximum number of guest units in accordance with the SUP Guideline is 58 units (gross) or 52 or 55 (net) and the applicant proposes 82 units. The SOD directs the Planning Commission to evaluate how the proposed density impacts safety and quality of life.</i>
4	Density Lot Coverage Floor Area Ratio	Maximum 25% Lot Coverage Maximum 60% Impervious Surface Minimum 40% Open Space No Floor Area Ratio Guidelines	Existing at 24,100 sf (10.3% gross, 11.1% net); Proposed 64,350 sf (27.5% gross, 29.5% net and 31.0% net Quail Run Road post dedication) Existing estimated at 69,700 sf (29.8% gross, 32.0% net) Proposed 137,360 sf (58.8% gross, 63% net and 66.3% net Quail Run Road post dedication) Existing estimated at 152,000 sf (65.0% gross, 70.0% net) Proposed 96,271 sf (41.2% gross, 44.1% net and 46.5% net Quail Run Road post dedication) Existing same as lot coverage. Proposed 116,570 sf (50.0% gross, 53.4% and 56.2% net Quail Run Road post dedication). Excludes basement level. <i>Analysis: The proposed lot coverage at 27.5% (gross) and 31.0% (net) compared to SUP Guideline of 25% falls near the lot coverage range for existing Town resorts of 7.8% (Camelback Inn located at 5201 E Lincoln Drive due to it being the largest resort by size at 117 total acres) and 28.7% (Omni Montelucia resort located at 4949 E Lincoln Drive). There are two Town resorts that allow for different lot coverage requirements. The Montelucia resort allows for the maximum building footprint (excluding roof overhangs or other projections) not greater than 25% of the gross area and the maximum lot coverage including building footprints, overhangs, projections, canopies, shade structures, trellis, pool cabanas and miscellaneous structures not greater than 31% of the gross</i>

			area. The Camelback Inn allows for fully enclosed buildings at a maximum of 20% of the gross area, all other structures at a maximum of 10% of gross area, and public areas a maximum of 30% of the gross area. The applicant should provide more detail on lot coverage by footprint, overhang, and other accessory structures should there be consideration in allowing total lot coverage above the 25% SUP Guideline. The proposed floor area ratio of 50.0% (gross) and 56.2% (net) would result in the highest floor area ratio percentage compared to existing Town resorts. The highest being the 35.1% (Montelucia) and 34.6% (Sanctuary on Camelback Mountain located at 5700 E McDonald Drive). As the SOD directs the Planning Commission to evaluate lot coverage and floor area ratio within the context of the immediately adjacent properties the applicant may want to provide lot coverage and floor area data on nearby resorts within the City of Scottsdale. Also, the SOD allows for consideration of lot coverage and floor area ratio based on the unique characteristics of the site (e.g. five acre size, proximity to the City of Scottsdale, and the site adjoining non-residential uses on three sides The maximum impervious surface meets the guideline using the gross acreage, but not the net acreage. The proposed project meets the guideline for open space. The reduced lot size of the resort, its location near the City of Scottsdale/Scottsdale Rd with public transit and more dense development, and adjoining non-residential on three sides may warrant some or all of the proposed differences from the SUP Guidelines.
5	Height/Viewsheds	<u>SUP Guidelines (Buildings):</u> 36-Foot Maximum – Principal Structures (guest registration, admin offices, and guest units). 24-Foot Maximum Accessory Structures	Existing buildings with guest units approximately 10-foot tall <u>Arrival Building</u> – This building has the 3-meal service market, lobby, event space, spa, fitness, and 77 of the 82 guest units. 36 feet 3 inches at tallest measured within the pool courtyard and east elevation – other elements at 14 feet, 18 feet, and 22 feet tall. <u>Casitas</u> - 5 one-story guest unit casitas located south of the event space. 14' feet tall Existing restaurant building 16 feet tall to tallest parapet/screen <u>French Cowboy</u> – 18 feet <u>Event Lawn Gazebo</u> – Approximately 20 feet by 20 feet, one-story.

		18-Foot Maximum Service Structures <i>Towers/architectural features may be higher subject to SUP approval</i> <u>SUP Guidelines (Open Space Criteria (OSC))</u>: Starting at 16-foot height at 20-foot setback in which height increases via 20-degree slope (24-foot height at 40-foot setback, 28-foot height at 60-foot setback, 32-foot height at 80-foot setback, 36-foot height at 100-foot setback)	Applicant to provide more information. <u>Pool Bar/Restrooms</u> – 11 feet, 30 feet by 35 feet (1,050 square feet) with most being covered awning and barat approximately 225 square feet and the restrooms at approximately 125 square feet <u>Cabanas</u> - Approximately 10 feet by 70 feet total area, one-story. Applicant to provide more information. None The Open Space Criteria is met on all existing buildings with the exception of the three westernmost buildings because they are within the 20-foot setback. The Open Space Criteria is met on the proposed buildings with the exception of the east end of the third story arrival building and parts of the roof of the French Cowboy penetrates the Open Space Criteria plane.															
			<table><tr><th>Property Side</th><th>Existing Minimum</th><th>Principal Building Guest Units, Market etc.</th><th>Principal Building Casitas</th><th>Accessory French Cowboy</th></tr><tr><td>Height Original Grade</td><td>10 feet</td><td>36 feet 3 inches 14, 18, and 22 feet</td><td>14 feet</td><td>18 feet 25 feet 5 inches</td></tr><tr><td>Height Open Space Criteria</td><td>Meets, except 3 west buildings are within the 20-foot setback</td><td>Meets, except part of 3rd story along east</td><td>Meets</td><td>Meets, except some roof sections</td></tr></table>	Property Side	Existing Minimum	Principal Building Guest Units, Market etc.	Principal Building Casitas	Accessory French Cowboy	Height Original Grade	10 feet	36 feet 3 inches 14, 18, and 22 feet	14 feet	18 feet 25 feet 5 inches	Height Open Space Criteria	Meets, except 3 west buildings are within the 20-foot setback	Meets, except part of 3 rd story along east	Meets	Meets, except some roof sections
Property Side	Existing Minimum	Principal Building Guest Units, Market etc.	Principal Building Casitas	Accessory French Cowboy														
Height Original Grade	10 feet	36 feet 3 inches 14, 18, and 22 feet	14 feet	18 feet 25 feet 5 inches														
Height Open Space Criteria	Meets, except 3 west buildings are within the 20-foot setback	Meets, except part of 3 rd story along east	Meets	Meets, except some roof sections														

			<i>Analysis: The proposed structures are within the SUP Guidelines on height except for two buildings (French Cowboy building on height over 24 feet and penetrating the OSC and the Arrival building on height over 36 feet and portions of the third floor penetrating the OSC). There are some roof portions of the French Cowboy building penetrating the OSC but the exact encroachment is not clearly dimensioned or illustrated. For example, Section CC on the Conceptual Site Elevations illustrates a pitched roof with no chimney and the Conceptual Building Elevations show a chimney that would penetrate the OSC plane and the cross section shows a height of 25 feet 5 inches while the height diagram shows the height at 18 feet. There are portions of the Arrival building penetrating the OSC. 13 of the 25 third floor guest units on the arrival building have no OSC encroachment. However, eight third floor guest units almost fully encroach and four of the third floor guest units have some minor roof encroachment. The arrival building is 36 feet 3 inches tall. The nearest portions of the arrival building (meeting venue, market, lobby, back-of-house) are one-story ranging in height from 14 feet to 22 feet.</i> <i>The SOD identifies that heights comply with the guidelines with mechanical screening and architectural elements included in the maximum height, adding that 36 feet/three story is the exception and only considered where contextually appropriate and mitigated by design. The applicant could redesign the French Cowboy building to comply with the SUP Guidelines as the amount and roof location of the encroachment on this building is minimal. There may be options for the applicant to evaluate the design of the third story of the arrival building. This includes that the height could be lowered as the proposed finished floor to ceiling heights are ten feet for the first and second floors and 12 feet for the third floor. Also, the OSC encroachment could be lessened by stepping back the easternmost units or removing units. Some third floor encroachment might be considered as the market and lobby portion of the Arrival building and the approximate two-foot grade difference on the site mitigate the visual impact of the third story along Lincoln Drive so the building appears to be mostly two story.</i>
--	--	--	---

6

Setbacks

SUP Guidelines (Buildings from Street or Non-Residential):
100-Foot Maximum – Principal Structures

40-Foot Maximum - Accessory Structures

Nine existing buildings with guest units approximately 40 feet to Lincoln Dr, 0 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 40 feet to east (medical), and 35 feet to south (Andaz).

Arrival Building – 95 feet to Lincoln Dr, 55 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 50 feet to east (medical), and 44 feet to south (Andaz).

Casitas – 365 feet to Lincoln Dr, 60 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 230 feet to east (medical), and 50 feet to south (Andaz).

Property Side	Existing Minimum	Principal Building	Principal Building
		Arrival building	Casitas
North Front Lincoln Drive	40 feet	95 feet 175 feet (2 nd /3 rd stories)	365 feet
West Street Side Quail Run Road	0 feet	55 feet 175 feet (2 nd /3 rd stories)	60 feet
East Adjoins Medical	40 feet	50 feet (all 3 stories)	230 feet
South Adjoins Andaz	35 feet	44 feet (1 st /2 nd stories) 75 feet (3 rd story)	50 feet

Existing restaurant building 64 feet to Lincoln Dr, 130 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 52 feet to east (medical), and 310 feet to south (Andaz).

French Cowboy – 25 feet to Lincoln Dr, 39 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 305 feet to east (medical), and 360 feet to south (Andaz).

Event Lawn Gazebo – 320 feet to Lincoln Dr, 160 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 270 feet to east (medical), and 135 feet to south (Andaz).

Pool Bar/Restrooms – 315 feet to Lincoln Dr, 200 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 220 feet to east (medical), and 125 feet to south (Andaz).

Cabanas – 285 feet to Lincoln Dr, 225 feet to post dedication Quail Run

			Rd, 165 feet to east (medical), and 165 feet to south (Andaz).																				
			<table> <tr> <th>Property Side</th><th>Existing Minimum</th><th>Accessory French Cowboy</th><th>Resort Pool</th></tr> <tr> <td>North Front Lincoln Drive</td><td>64 feet</td><td>25 feet</td><td>315 feet</td></tr> <tr> <td>West Street Side Quail Run Road</td><td>130 feet</td><td>39 feet</td><td>240 feet</td></tr> <tr> <td>East Adjoins Medical</td><td>52 feet</td><td>305 feet</td><td>170 feet</td></tr> <tr> <td>South Adjoins Andaz</td><td>310 feet</td><td>360 feet</td><td>95 feet</td></tr> </table>	Property Side	Existing Minimum	Accessory French Cowboy	Resort Pool	North Front Lincoln Drive	64 feet	25 feet	315 feet	West Street Side Quail Run Road	130 feet	39 feet	240 feet	East Adjoins Medical	52 feet	305 feet	170 feet	South Adjoins Andaz	310 feet	360 feet	95 feet
Property Side	Existing Minimum	Accessory French Cowboy	Resort Pool																				
North Front Lincoln Drive	64 feet	25 feet	315 feet																				
West Street Side Quail Run Road	130 feet	39 feet	240 feet																				
East Adjoins Medical	52 feet	305 feet	170 feet																				
South Adjoins Andaz	310 feet	360 feet	95 feet																				
		65-Foot Maximum – Service Structures <u>No guideline on number of stories</u>	None Existing one-story and proposed one, two, and three-stories <u>Two and three-story setback</u> – 175 feet to Lincoln Dr, 175 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 50 feet to east (medical), and 75 feet (third story) and 44 feet (second story) to south (Andaz).																				
		<u>SUP Guidelines (Pools):</u> 65-Foot Minimum - Generally Available All Guests, No guideline for pools not generally available to all guests	<u>Resort Pool/Adjacent Hot Tub</u> – 315 feet to Lincoln Dr, 240 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 170 feet to east (medical), and 95 feet to south (Andaz). The proposed seven plunge pools are not available to all guests. These are located on the south side of the site (one at each casita and two at the spa), 350 feet to Lincoln Dr, 65 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 125 feet to east (medical), and 35 feet (casitas) and 30 feet (spa) to south (Andaz). The size of these plunge pools are approximately 10 feet in width and 15 feet in length (150 square feet, four of the pools are at this size), 10 feet in width and 25 feet in length (250 square feet, one of the pools is at this size), and 7 feet in width and 10 feet in length (70 square feet, two of																				

			the pools are at this size). <i>Analysis: Both the existing and proposed setbacks for the principal buildings are not within the SUP Guideline of 100 feet. The proposed arrival building is larger and taller than the existing buildings with setbacks that are greater than the existing buildings (particularly from Quail Run Rd moving from 0 feet to 55 feet and Lincoln Dr from 40 feet to 95 feet). The setback for the two story and three story elements exceed a setback of 100 feet from Lincoln Drive and Quail Run Road. The two-story setback to the medical plaza and Andaz Resort is similar to the two-story medical plaza setback along the shared eastern property line at 40 feet. The 44-foot setback to the south property line and the 50-foot setback to the east property line is why the third story encroaches into the OSC. This placement of the arrival building skewed eastwards results in a larger setback away from the single-family lots along the west side of Quail Run Road. Also, it places the guest unit balconies further away from the homes to the west and the Andaz Resort to the south due to the 'L' shape design with the open part of the 'L' facing south. The roof planters on the third floor are setback approximately 15 feet to 25 feet from the roof edge that will limit the visibility of persons on the roof patio for the two southernmost third floor guest units. The greatest impact of the third story is to the east with the medical plaza and the balconies of the resort on this side.</i> <i>The casitas building at one-story, 14-foot tall may have a setback less than 100 feet to the property lines of Quail Run Road and Andaz Resort, but these are 60 feet and 50 feet respectfully that would be no more impactful than an accessory structure with a lessor 40-foot setback and 24-foot height. This building also completes the courtyard that helps in mitigating noise/light from the event lawn.</i> <i>The event lawn gazebo, pool bar/restrooms, and cabanas accessory structures are all within the event lawn/resort pool courtyard at heights below the surrounding buildings which make these structures only visible when within the courtyard.</i> <i>The setbacks of the French Cowboy restaurant building (footprint/roof-patio overhang) at the northwest corner of the site are less than the SUP Guideline for an accessory structure of 40 feet from a public street. The</i>
--	--	--	---

			<i>building footprint is setback 38 feet 3 inches and setback approximately 30 feet to the edge of the patio roof along Quail Run Road. The building footprint setback is 33 feet 4 inches and setback approximately 25 feet to the edge of the patio roof along Lincoln Drive. It is suggested that the setback from the post Quail Run Road dedication property line not be less than 40 feet. Also, to consider a larger setback to the existing Lincoln Drive property line (33-foot half width right-of-way line) to account for any future right-of-way needs.</i>
7	Landscaping Buffers	<u>SUP Guideline</u> Landscape islands every 100 feet for within surface parking, shade trees every four stalls <u>SUP Guidelines (Setbacks for Parking Lots/Drives)</u> 40 feet from rights-of-way and non-residential <u>SUP Guidelines (Landscape Buffer):</u> 50-foot minimum – Lincoln Dr 30-foot minimum – Quail Run Rd No guideline adjoining non-residential - south & east	Compliant, longest span between landscape islands is 72 feet, shade trees generally every two to four stalls. 12 feet to 16 feet to Lincoln Dr, 0 feet & 18 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd, 2 feet to east (medical), and 5 feet to south (Andaz). 8 feet to 12 feet 2 feet & 18 feet to post dedication Quail Run Rd 2 feet (east) & 5 feet (south) The top number being the parking setback and the lower number being the landscape setback. Red text indicating below the SUP Guideline.

	<u>Section 5-10-7.D, Town Code/1996 Landscape Guidelines</u> Landscape right-of-way at average of 100 lineal feet (lf) with four 15-gallon trees and five 1-gallon shrubs; 1996 Landscape Guidelines trees 30-foot intervals (Ironwood trees 20%) and shrubs 20-foot intervals. Lincoln Dr is ~ 420 lf minus drives and Quail Run Rd ~ 475 lf minus drives. Results in 14 to 17 trees and 21 shrubs along Lincoln Dr and 16 to 19 trees and 24 shrubs along Quail Run Rd. Discourage eucalyptus and palms due to the height, not indigenous, partially block view corridors, possible fire hazards, and pollen irritants. Discourage oleander due to their toxicity and obstruction of views/public rights-of-way. Section 8-2-6, Town Code prohibits mulberry, and olive (unless non-pollenating variety) <u>Visually Significant Corridors Plan</u> Lincoln Drive is a significant corridor with guidelines for the Resort Living Zone addressing plant material, specialty paving at entry points or other areas, accent walls, 75% live cover, unique plants, outdoor room areas, massing of boulders, lighting,	<table><tr><th>Property Side</th><th>Existing Minimum</th><th>Proposed Minimum</th></tr><tr><td>North Front Lincoln Drive</td><td>0 to 2 feet 2 feet</td><td>12 to 16 feet 8 to 12 feet *</td></tr><tr><td>West Street Side North of Access Quail Run Road</td><td>0 feet 55 feet</td><td>Not Applicable 18 feet</td></tr><tr><td>West Street Side South of Access Quail Run Road</td><td>0 feet 55 feet</td><td>2 feet 2 feet **</td></tr><tr><td>East Adjoins Medical</td><td>2 feet 2 feet</td><td>2 feet 2 feet</td></tr><tr><td>South Adjoins Andaz</td><td>7 feet 40 feet</td><td>5 feet *** 5 feet ***</td></tr></table> Lincoln Dr is proposed with 15 trees and Quail Run Rd with 17 trees. There are triple the number of shrubs/accents above the minimum. No Ironwood trees are proposed. No palm trees are on the detailed landscape plan, but shown on the color illustrated plan around the resort pool. There are no proposed mulberry or olive trees. The palette consists of a mixture of trees, shrubs, and accent cactus. The primary palette includes mesquite trees with ghost gum trees and hopbush for creating a hedge along the south and east property lines. The other predominate shrubs, accents, and vines are bougainvillea, red yucca, agave, milkweed, and creosote. The predominate proposed ground cover along Lincoln Drive is pine muhly (an ornamental grass similar to mist grass). Except for the ghost gum (a type of eucalyptus that is from Australia and drought tolerant), these plants are all on the list or similar to	Property Side	Existing Minimum	Proposed Minimum	North Front Lincoln Drive	0 to 2 feet 2 feet	12 to 16 feet 8 to 12 feet *	West Street Side North of Access Quail Run Road	0 feet 55 feet	Not Applicable 18 feet	West Street Side South of Access Quail Run Road	0 feet 55 feet	2 feet 2 feet **	East Adjoins Medical	2 feet 2 feet	2 feet 2 feet	South Adjoins Andaz	7 feet 40 feet	5 feet *** 5 feet ***	*Due to sidewalk ** 10 feet in right-of-way *** 33 to 50 feet exclude the fire lane
Property Side	Existing Minimum	Proposed Minimum																			
North Front Lincoln Drive	0 to 2 feet 2 feet	12 to 16 feet 8 to 12 feet *																			
West Street Side North of Access Quail Run Road	0 feet 55 feet	Not Applicable 18 feet																			
West Street Side South of Access Quail Run Road	0 feet 55 feet	2 feet 2 feet **																			
East Adjoins Medical	2 feet 2 feet	2 feet 2 feet																			
South Adjoins Andaz	7 feet 40 feet	5 feet *** 5 feet ***																			

		and utility screening. Major SUPs are suggested to meet the Best category. <u>General Plan LU 3.2.</u> Town shall require redevelopment within SUP properties to provide necessary mitigation through context and scale, architectural design, setbacks, sound moderation, resort property programming, and landscape buffering. [Refer to Setbacks for landscape buffer widths]	the plant list for the Resort Living Zone. The 1996 guidelines suggest avoiding eucalyptus, but these trees are drought tolerant and grow upward to 50 feet which may be beneficial for this application to screen the three-story building with the Hopseed bush are proposed to screen the ground-level areas. Current research shows that eucalyptus pollen is not easily airborne and allergies are more from its oils. The proposal includes specialty pavement at the arrival driveway, parking spaces along Lincoln Drive, and includes two walkways from Lincoln Dr into the site. The proposed patio and entry screen walls are illustrated as decorative tile to match the building architecture. The applicant was asked to provide more seasonal variation in color to better comply with the Visually Significant Corridors Plan and 1996 Landscape Guidelines the landscaping along Lincoln Drive. The predominate shrub/accent is Pine Muhly an ornamental grass and Milkweed with yellow/white flowers and Mesquite trees with yellow flowers. It is also suggested to change out three Mesquite trees with Ironwood trees along Lincoln Drive (possibly at the walkway toward the Market) and replacing several of the masses of Pine Muhly with a mix of desert accents like Aloe, Yucca, Ocotillo, Sage, and/or Saguaro. <i>Analysis: Neither the existing nor the proposed perimeter landscape and parking buffers meet the SUP Guidelines. The proposed plant quantities, hedge materials along the south and east property lines, and proposed screen/patio walls along the rights-of-way will buffer the resort as viewed from off the property with additional changes. These changes may include a greater setback of the French Cowboy as noted under Setbacks, a wider landscape buffer south of the access driveway along Quail Run Road, and plant material changes along Lincoln Drive and along the south and east property lines. Stipulations will be included regarding maintenance/replacement of plant material along with other applicable stipulations. Additional analysis is necessary as the applicant provides more information.</i>
--	--	---	---

8	Exterior Lighting	<u>SUP Guidelines:</u> Light source/bulb hooded and shielded so not visible from adjacent properties. Up lighting 300 lumens maximum Pole lights: ○ 16-foot maximum height ○ 16-foot setback (height of pole determines setback) 1.6 foot-candles (fc) – Parking Lots 5.0 foot-candles – Interior Driveways 5.0 foot-candles – Service Buildings 3.0 foot-candles – Other Structures 5.0 foot-candles – Pool Areas 10 foot-candles – Outdoor Dining Illumination at other property lines not adjoining residential 0.75-foot cand maximum (applies to all 4 property lines) – (Section 1023 Zoning Ordinance)	The proposed exterior light fixtures are all hooded and shielded except for possibly three fixtures that require additional information to verify proper hooding and/or shielding. These include fixture CP1 which is a hanging pendant light with an open weave shade proposed at and along the Quail Run arrival area. It has low illumination at 246 lumens, but the light element does not appear shielded. The M1 fixture are string lights on the event lawn. No mounted height is noted and the string lights are shown with the bulbs without a cap. The event lawn is within a courtyard so these lights should not be visible offsite particularly with landscape trees along Quail Run Rd. The N1 LED tape lights are shown within the casita pool areas which will meet guideline provided these are mounted with the light not directed upwards. The proposal includes several ground up light fixtures (G1, F1/F2). All these fixtures are at or under 300 lumens. The proposed pole light fixtures (P1 and P5) are all the same LED pole fixture directed downward. No height is provided, but assumed to be 16-foot tall. The P1 fixture is the predominant fixture used in the parking lot and fire lane. There are a total of five fixtures along both street frontages. This fixture is setback 20 feet or more from the property line (except for two fixtures nearest Lincoln Drive at an approximate 16-foot setback to the existing 33-foot half-width right-of-way line). The P1 fixture is 2,096 lumens and 2,700 Kelvins. The higher P5 fixture is shown in the arrival court nearest the arrival building at 3,695 lumens and 2,700 Kelvins. There are three P5 fixtures in this area. The average illumination based on use ranges from 0.61 to 2.52 foot-candles, except for egress stairs at 11.53 foot-candles. 10 foot-candles is the typical minimum for safety on stairwells. Most of these stairwells are internal to the site, with the nearest at the northwest portion of the French Cowboy building within the walled patio area and near Lincoln Dr and Quail Run Rd intersection which is illuminated with street lighting. Illumination at the property complies with Section 1023 of the Zoning Ordinance as no location is greater than 0.75 foot-candles (the maximum shown is 0.5 foot-candles at certain locations along the property line.)
---	-------------------	---	--

		Building lighting (no guidelines)	The proposed building lights are decorative down lights and sconces (e.g., CW2, CW3, W1) that vary in lumen count from 139 lumens to 1,250 lumens all at 2,700 Kelvins. The applicant has been asked to provide the proposed lighting on the second and third floors. <i>Analysis: The proposed lighting appears to be within the Special Use Permit Guidelines with more information required on the hooding/shielding of fixtures CP1, M1, and N1. Also, the material needs to include the proposed light fixtures for the second and third floors.</i>
9	Grading/Drainage & Utilities	Submit with SUP preliminary drainage, grading, water, and wastewater information provided and are reviewed by the Town's Engineering Division to ensure compliance to required safety and other standards.	<i>Analysis: The site currently provides no onsite retention. The proposed improvements will utilize parking and drive corridors to drain stormwater east and north to match current drainage patterns through a series of catch basins and underground retention basins. Utility improvements are generally onsite with basic water and sewer connections in Lincoln Drive at the shared access with the medical plaza. The first review of these preliminary plans requires a couple of clarifications.</i>
10	Traffic, Parking, Access, & Circulation	<u>SUP Guidelines:</u> 1.2 spaces per guest unit 2.0 spaces per dwelling unit 1.0 space per 50 sf net dining 1.0 space per 2 seats/equivalent meeting space 1.0 space per 300 net sf retail 1.0 parking space per 300 net sf office and service establishment Shared parking allowable via approved traffic/parking analysis	The primary circulation is off Quail Run Road via a new access driveway along with the shared access with the medical plaza along Lincoln Drive that the Town worked with the prior resort owner and the owner of the medical plaza to remove the past four driveways along Lincoln Drive to this shared access driveway. Circulation along the south and east of the site will be restricted due to a fire lane. Parking is roughly split between surface and an underground parking. The garage access and loading/trash back of house services are in the northeast portion of the site nearest the medical plaza. The proposal is for 143 total parking spaces (69 surface and 74 in a proposed underground garage). The parking and traffic analysis has been reviewed by the town professional staff with comments sent back to the applicant.

		Parking & driveway areas situated to prevent lights shining onto adjacent residential properties. Parking and driveway areas within 200' of residential to be screened with 3' tall wall or landscape berm No loading trucks, truck parking, trash containers within 100' of residential property <u>General Plan Policy LU 6.2</u> Town shall require that proposals for revitalization and improvement of SUP properties include community impact assessments that address beneficial as well as adverse project impacts, including but not limited to noise, traffic, parking, open space or mountain views, and light pollution Policy 77 (Street Cross Sections and Details until the Town's Engineering Design Standards Manual is completed) identifies: Major Arterial Cross Section with 130 feet in width (65 feet in half width) with median, 24-foot wide asphalt, 2-foot wide curbs, and a 6-foot wide sidewalk Local Cross Section with 50' width (or 25' half width), 24' of asphalt and 2' curbs	The proposal includes a 3-foot tall screen wall for the parking spaces along Lincoln Drive, a 6-foot tall wall in front of the parking spaces along Quail Run Rd, and a 5-foot tall wall along the east property line. There are no parking spaces along the south property line and the existing 5-foot tall wall will screen any activity along the proposed fire lane. There are no loading trucks, truck parking, trash containers within 100 feet of residential property. The proposed loading area is at the northeast portion of the arrival building and approximately 300 feet away from the R-43 lots along the west side of Quail Run Rd with buildings, perimeter walls, and landscaping between these homes and this back-of-house functions. The application packet includes acoustical, photometric, parking, traffic impact, open space criteria assessment. <u>Lincoln Drive.</u> 33-foot half street existing and a 7-foot wide sidewalk easement granted in 2021 as part of the shared driveway work with the medical plaza along with a sidewalk built as part of a Town project in 2021/2022. <u>Quail Run Road.</u> 25-foot of half street (post dedication) and will comply with the minimum Town pavement standard of 26 feet measured from back of curb.
--	--	--	---

			<i>Analysis: The professional staff reviewed the parking analysis and traffic analysis and staff awaits a response from the applicant. There were aspects of the traffic and parking analysis requiring clarification such as the categorization of certain uses related to internal capture rate, time of day reductions, modeling assumptions related to back of house/employees, any valet mode options, queue storage, and additional information on warrants for deceleration lane(s).</i>
11	Signage	<u>SUP Guidelines:</u> ID/Monument Signs on Arterial Street (Lincoln Dr): ○ 8-foot tall ○ 40 sq ft aggregate size ○ Placed at resort entrance ID/Monument Signs on Other Streets: ○ 4-foot tall ○ 32 sq ft aggregate size ○ Placed at resort entrance Traffic & Directional Signs: ○ 5-foot tall ○ 12 sq ft aggregate size Building Signs: ○ Not addressed in SUP Guidelines ○ Deferred to Fire/Building Codes No moving or animated signs <u>SUP Guidelines Recommend Sign Illumination in Compliance with Article XXV Zoning Ordinance (Signs):</u> Light source/bulb to be shielded so	Sheet 21, Conceptual Signage Diagram, identifies a wall sign (Sign C-type) at the intersection of Lincoln Dr and Quail Run Rd and at the shared driveway with the medical plaza. These are 3 feet 6 inches tall and setback approximately 10 feet from the existing right-of-way property line for the west sign and on the property line for the east sign. No sign area is identified, but looks to be within the SUP guidelines. Sheet 21, Conceptual Signage Diagram, identifies a wall sign (Sign A-type) on the southern feature wall at the Quail Run Rd driveway. It appears to be mounted on the 8-foot tall wall at approximately 5 feet and the sign area is not listed. No traffic or directional signs are identified. Two building signs are illustrated on Sheet 21. There is a sign at the lobby area on the arrival building and a building sign facing Lincoln Drive on the French Cowboy building.

		bulb not visible from off property 0.75- foot candles at property line for Internally illuminated 3000K for external illumination	<i>Analysis: The proposed exterior signs appear consistent with the quality and design for a Town resort. Based on the conceptual plans the proposed signs should comply with SUP Guidelines. The applicant will provide a table summarizing the proposed exterior signs that includes maximum sign area, height from grade to the top of the sign, quantity, and the type of illumination. Also, the applicant will provide a typical detail with material identified and dimensions.</i>
12	Walls/Fences	<u>SUP Guidelines Recommend compliance with Article XXIV Zoning Ordinance Walls & Fences</u> Adjoining Residential – Maximum 8 feet tall Varies from 3 feet to 8 feet tall (with 2-foot tall berm) depending on setback. Article XXIV provides for no walls/fences within the first 10-foot setback along a right-of-way, linear walls over three-feet tall up to six-feet tall along Quail Run Road be setback 20 feet from the post-dedication property line, linear walls over three-feet tall up to six-feet tall (eight-feet with a two-foot berm) along Lincoln Drive be setback 20 feet from the post-dedication property line since this is a major arterial, and walls/fences along the south and east property line can be at the property line up to six-feet tall.	There are no perimeter walls in the existing condition except near the south property line. Not applicable, as the only zoned residential is along the west side of Quail Run Road. Quail Run Road adjoining a public the guideline for height is a maximum 6 feet. The proposal includes two 8-foot tall feature walls at the Quail Run Rd driveway. One 56 lineal feet an the other 18 lineal feet.

		The Visually Significant Corridors Plan guidelines apply along Lincoln Drive for Major SUP amendments with decorative walls and encourages utility screening that incorporates the materials used elsewhere within the plan, such as stone and patterns/themes from the applicable Character Zone (Resort Living).	The table below provides approximate post-dedication setbacks and heights. The top number being the setback measured from the property line (post-dedication right-of-way line along Lincoln Dr (33-foot half-width) and Quail Run Rd (25-foot half-width)) and the lower number being the height. Red text indicating below the SUP Guideline					
			Property Side	Existing Minimum	Proposed Feature Walls Lincoln Drive	Proposed Feature Walls Quail Run	Proposed Patio Walls	Proposed Parking Screen
			North Front Lincoln Drive	No wall	10 feet & 0 feet 3 feet 6 inches	Not Applicable	12 feet 5 feet	12 feet 3 feet
			West Street Side North of Access Quail Run Road	No Wall	12 feet 3 feet 6 inches	5 feet 8 feet	18 feet 5 feet	Not Applicable
			West Street Side South of Access Quail Run Road	No wall	Not Applicable	5 feet 8 feet	Not Applicable	In Right-of-Way 6 feet
			East Adjoins Medical	No wall	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
			South Adjoins Andaz	Wall south of property line	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
			*Measured from 33-foot half-width right-of-way line					

			<i>Analysis: The three-foot tall parking screen wall along Lincoln Drive (based on a 33-foot half width right-of-way dedication) and the five-foot tall walls along the east and south property lines are within the guidelines. The four proposed feature walls (proposed with signage on at least three walls) and the two French Cowboy patio walls are not within the guidelines. Also, the proposed six-foot tall wall south of the Quail Run Road driveway is within the post-dedication right-of-way. Additional information on the screening and/or relocation of the APS utility cabinet north of the proposed French Cowboy restaurant building is needed. Some items requested of the applicant are to show the setbacks of each wall from the adjoining property lines and net/post dedication property lines, show the existing oleander hedge along the south property line (which is thought to be on the Andaz property), provide fence and site wall elevations, modify the proposed six-foot tall wall along Quail Run Road south of the access driveway to remove it from the right-of-way which may require a larger setback and redesign (e.g., material, meander, etc.), and to consider designing the inside west outdoor patio wall of the French Cowboy to a wall height of six feet tall to aid in noise mitigation as the west patio wall based on the site cross section shows a berm on the street side of this wall (goal is to make the wall appear three feet in height or less from the street side). Allowance for some taller walls at a setback closer than the guideline may or may not be warranted due to the resort site being a quarter of the recommended 20 acres and that walls help mitigate unwanted noise and other nuisances.</i>
13	Context Appropriate Design	<u>General Plan Policies:</u> LU 3.2 - The Town shall require development or redevelopment within Special Use Permit properties to provide any necessary mitigation achieved through context and scale, and architectural design, setbacks, sound moderation, resort property programming, and landscape buffering. LU 6.5 - The Town shall encourage	The application packet includes master plan, conceptual floor plans, conceptual elevations, visual images, conceptual renderings, illustrative color/materials, along with narrative text to aid in understanding context appropriate design. <i>Analysis: The policies from the General Plan broadly cover architecture and address mitigation of context appropriate development (e.g., scale, massing, façade articulation) and a high-quality built environment that contribute to the Town's identity. The proposed elevations and renderings illustrate the building architecture and visual impact off-site. The design mitigates the view of the three separate stories from Lincoln Drive by the placement of the approximate 18-foot tall market, ten-foot ceiling heights of the first and second floors compared to the 12-foot ceiling height of the third floor, and an approximate two-foot grade difference underneath the principal building.</i>

		context- appropriate and responsive building design and site planning on Special Use Permit properties that mitigates the scale of larger buildings through careful use of building massing, setbacks, facade articulation, fenestration, varied parapets and roof planes, and pedestrian-scaled architectural details. CC&H 2.2 - Town shall encourage building design that respects and responds to local context, massing and scale, including use of energy saving and sustainable materials where feasible, responsiveness to the Sonoran Desert climate, and consideration of the cultural and historic context of the Town of PV neighborhoods. CC&H 2.6 - The Town shall support the development of architecturally significant public and private buildings and resort development in key locations to create new landmarks and focal features that contribute to the Town's identity and value the Town's location, climate and historic legacy.	<i>Further analysis is warranted on the visual impact (particularly from Lincoln Drive) as the flat roof of this 36 feet 3 inch tall principal building and the 22-foot tall meeting space is approximately 325 lineal feet of the 445 lineal feet of post-dedication frontage along Lincoln Drive (75 percent) that elongates the building mass. The applicant has been asked to identify certain elevation points on the conceptual elevations/site sections, consider a darker decorative paver in the arrival zone, and provide additional renderings (e.g., view looking southwest from the north side of Lincoln Drive near the east end of the property, view looking southeast from the north side of Lincoln Drive near the west end of the property, view looking north from inside the Andaz property, view looking northeast from the south end of the site along Quail Run Road, the south and east view of the French Cowboy (which may be an elevation instead of a rendering), close up view of the ramp area into the garage, view inside the event lawn (looking west near the resort pool), view at the resort pool showing the access area between the casitas and spa, and view of a plunge pool at a casita.)</i>
--	--	---	--

RESORT SUP PROPERTY	TOTAL NET SITE ACREAGE	TOTAL SITE SQUARE FEET	TOTAL UNITS	DENSITY (UNITS/ACRE)	TOTAL DRIP LINE SQUARE FOOTAGE (ESTIMATED)	LOT COVERAGE (%)	TOTAL FLOOR AREA (SF) (ESTIMATED)	FAR (%) (ESTIMATED)	MAXIMUM HEIGHT (FEET)	PARKING SPACES	PARKING SPACES PER UNIT	TOTAL FLOOR AREA PER PARKING SPACE	Near Scottsdale Rd
Andaz (8)	22.1	964,042	185	8.4	138,466	14.4%	138,466	14.4%	25	278	1.5	498	*
Andaz (8) (Proposed)	27.2	1,183,069	195	7.2	173,276	14.6%	173,276	14.6%	25	290	1.5	598	*
Camelback Inn (10)	117.0	5,096,520	453	3.9	400,000	7.8%	500,000	9.8%	36	1157	2.6	432	
Doubletree PV	18.8	818,928	378	20.1	173,970	21.2%	257,251	31.4%	28	559	1.5	460	*
Hermosa Inn	6.4	277,022	49	7.7	68,035	24.6%	68,035	25.0%	24	189	3.9	360	
Montelucia (4)	28.0	1,219,680	327	11.7	349,900	28.7%	427,650	35.1%	44	738	2.3	579	
Mtn Shadows (3)	68.5	2,983,860	331	4.8	505,750	16.9%	767,524	25.7%	36	494	1.5	1,554	
Ritz Carlton (1)(2)(9)	104.1	4,534,596	458	4.4	746,168	16.5%	1,129,168	24.9%	48	1380	6.4	818	*
Sanctuary (5)	37.4	1,629,144	184	4.9	219,566	13.5%	564,000	34.6%	24	369	2.0	1,528	
Scottsdale Plaza (6)	36.5	1,589,940	404	11.1	270,721	17.0%	351,107	22.1%	30	737	1.8	476	*
Scottsdale Plaza (Proposed)	36.5	1,589,940	468	12.8	346,779	21.8%	464,935	29.2%	36	571	1.2	814	*
Smoke Tree (7)	5.0	218,096	30	6.0	24,100	11.1%	24,100	11.1%	18	70	2.3	344	*
Smoke Tree (Proposed)	5.0	218,096	82	16.4	64,350	29.5%	116,570	53.4%	36	143	1.7	815	*
AVERAGES (Existing, Excludes Proposed)	44.4	1,933,183	280	8.3	289,668	17.2%	422,730	23.4%	31	597	2.6	705	
AVERAGES (Proposed, Excludes Existing Andaz and Scottsdale Plaza)	44.9	1,955,086	287	8.3	300,754	17.7%	437,594	24.1%	32	582	2.5	749	

(1) Total site acreage includes internal roads and Area E2 (which requires further SUP approval)

(2) A-1 Villas and D Attached Residences have maximum height 36'; E1 Resort Retail 30'; Height measured finished grade-not more than 2' fill to highest point

(3) Height measured from original natural grade or finish grade (if lower than natural grade), 3' allowance for chimney, elevator enclosure, architectural features; parking total includes for-sale product and excludes valet mode

(4) Height measured from finish grade to highest point, lodge at 36', Plaza buildings at 32' and 34'; some elements to 44'; stipulated to a total floor area of 427,650 sf and a maximum building footprint of 25% and lot coverage of 31% with overhangs, canopies, shade structures and misc structures

(5) Includes the Casa parcels zoned SUP-Resort, assumes these have a 15% floor area ratio being hillside lots and likely not reaching 25%; excludes valet mode on parking

(6) Existing height on plans are from finished floor, not finished grade or natural grade that may result in increased height

(7) Net area, gross including right-of-way 5.363 acres

(8) SUP allows up to 201 units

(9) Parking total includes all areas including for-sale product, for-sale product only counted 2 spaces per unit and Area E-2 not factored since requires a future amendment; valet mode not included

(10) The Camelback Inn allows for fully enclosed buildings at a maximum of 20% of the gross area, all other structures at a maximum of 10% of gross area, and public areas a maximum of 30% of the gross area.

Date: May 8, 2023

Data is as accurate as possible, some data are estimates

10 resorts in town (excludes the 2 country clubs and El Chorro)

The numbers provided in the table above are only one of many ways to evaluate an application and should be viewed as seeing general trends