



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Draft

Planning Commission

Tuesday, December 6, 2016

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

Meeting Delayed. New Start Time 6:40 PM

1. CALL TO ORDER

2. ROLL CALL

- Present** 4 - Chairperson Dolf Strom
Commissioner Scott Moore
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright
Commissioner Richard K. Mahle
- Absent** 3 - Commissioner Daran Wastchak
Commissioner Jeff Wincel
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Senior Planner Paul Michaud
Planner George Burton

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

No Reportable Action

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. [16-407](#) Discussion of Quality of Life - Cell Service

At the November 1, 2016 Planning Commission meeting, Town Manager Burke first presented background information regarding the Town Council Quality of Life Initiative associated with poor cell service coverage.

In summary, the Town is experiencing poor service due to a lack of antenna infrastructure. The task is how to facilitate investment in that infrastructure. Infrastructure can take many forms including stand-alone towers,

camouflaged towers, roof top antennas, pole mounted antennas, and others. The location of the infrastructure can also occur on private property or on public rights-of-way. The form and location of cell antennas are regulated by the Town in various documents. Most prominent among them is Article XII of the Zoning Code regulating Personal Wireless Service Devices (PWSF).

The Town Manager has proposed some changes to the PWSF regulations. Those are intended as a starting point. However, given the wide variety of possible outcomes, the Town Manager will lead a discussion to identify the goals, value conflicts, and tools associated with resolving this quality of life issue.

Chairman Strom mentioned that the Planning Commission has already approved existing 24 ft. - 35 ft. antennas as part of the DAS system and on some Special Use Permit sites.

Commissioner Moore would like clarification on the output of the towers based on height and cost for each.

Commissioner Marhle would like to identify the problem areas and see a hierarchy of solutions.

Town Manager Burke asked what the Planning Commission sees as next steps going forward. Commission stated modifications of setbacks, the need to work with the resorts, and possible reconsideration of 200 foot output distance.

No Reportable Action

- B.** [16-428](#) Discussion of a Major General Plan Amendment (GP-16-01), Zoning Ordinance Text Amendment (MI-16-03), Rezoning (MI-16-04), Private Roadway Conditional Use Permit (CUP-16-02), Private Roadway Gate Special Use Permit (SUP-16-03), and Preliminary Plat (PP-16-03) to develop eight single-family residential lots, ranging in lot sizes between 12,000 net square feet to 35,000 net square feet.
Northwest Corner of Northern Ave Alignment and Scottsdale Rd (APN: 174-36-002X)

Mr. Michaud noted that the recommended action is to deny the request to provide applicant the opportunity to look at other options and allow the Town Council to hear this request in 2016.

Chairman Strom opened the meeting to the public.

Michael Shoen, resident, expressed his concerns that more homes would require more commercial development to pay for municipal services and he does not want to see a change to the General Plan.

Carol Adams, resident, expressed concerns that the Planning Commission should not be spending so much time discussing what was already established in the General Plan.

Chairman Strom closed the meeting to the public.

Commissioner Wainwright stated he is willing to consider the concept of recommending more density than one dwelling unit to the acre on the site.

Chairman Strom and Commissioner Marhle feel it's too soon and need more information to make a decision.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. [16-429](#) GP-16-01: Consideration of a Major General Plan Amendment on a 4.4-acre property located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (Parcel No. 174-36-002X)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to deny this application request to allow for the applicant to consider other alternatives, allow this matter to be presented at a public hearing to the Town Council within the calendar year of 2016, and provide an opportunity for the Planning Commission to discuss and make a recommendation on this application should the Town Council continue the request. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

- B. [16-430](#) MI-16-03: Consideration of a Text Amendment to the Town's Zoning Ordinance on a 4.4-acre property located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (Parcel No. 174-36-002X)

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to continue this application request to a date uncertain to allow the applicant time to consider other alternatives and to allow for re-noticing and re-advertising. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

- C. [16-431](#) MI-16-04: Consideration of a rezoning on a 4.4-acre property located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road

(Parcel No. 174-36-002X)

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to continue this application request to a date uncertain to allow the applicant time to consider other alternatives and to allow for re-noticing and re-advertising. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

- D. [16-432](#) SUP-16-03: Consideration of a Special Use Permit (SUP) for private roadway gates on a 4.4-acre property located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (Parcel No. 174-36-002X)

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to continue this application request to a date uncertain to allow the applicant time to consider other alternatives and to allow for re-noticing and re-advertising. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

6. ACTION ITEMS

- A. **16-433** PP-16-03: Consideration of a Preliminary Plat on a 4.4-acre property located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (Parcel No. 174-36-002X)

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to continue this application request to a date uncertain to allow the applicant time to consider other alternatives and to allow for re-noticing and re-advertising. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

- B. [16-434](#) CUP-16-02: Consideration of a Conditional Use Permit for a private roadway on a 4.4-acre property located at the northwest corner of the Northern Avenue alignment and Scottsdale Road (Parcel No. 174-36-002X)

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to continue this application request to a date uncertain to allow the applicant time to consider other alternatives and to allow for re-noticing and re-advertising. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS (CONTINUED)

A. [16-441](#) Consideration of a proposed monument sign, building mounted sign, and lighted addressed numbers at the Paradise Valley United Methodist Church - Minor Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP 16-05) 4455 E. Lincoln Drive (APN: 169-20-004C)

Commissioner Marhle informed the Planning Commission that he is a member of the church but has no conflict of interest in the proposed sign changes. The Planning Commission agreed.

George Burton gave his presentation on the proposed changes.

Nicole Bergstrom, a church member and representative of the sign company, explained the reason behind the sign changes is simply because people have a difficult time finding the church. Ms. Bergstrom also explained the change made to the proposal for the breakaway sign.

Mickey Price, church administrator, reiterated Ms. Bergstrom’s explanation for the proposal as a means to help the public locate the church.

Chairman Strom asked for clarification on what parts of the sign will be lit and what will not be lit.

Commissioner Moore stated he appreciated the church working with the Commission and he thought the changes looked very nice.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to deem the requested amendment to the Paradise Valley United Methodist Church Special Use Permit a Minor Amendment per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by a unanimous vote.

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to Commission approve the Minor Amendment to the Special Use Permit for the Paradise Valley United Methodist Church to allow a new monument sign, a building mounted sign, and lighted address numbers on the entry walls, subject to the following stipulations:

- 1. All improvements to the property shall be in substantial compliance with the following:**
 - a. The Narrative, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Signs and Graphics;**
 - b. Site Plan Sheet, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Signs and Graphics;**
 - c. Address Numbers Plan Sheet, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Signs and Graphics;**
 - d. Sheet 1.0, Monument, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Signs and Graphics and dated November 4, 2016;**
 - e. Sheet 2.0, Monument Break-Away Footing, prepared by SmithCraft Custom**

- Signs and Graphics and dated November 9, 2016;
- f. Sheet 3.0, Monument, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Signs and Graphics and dated February 9, 2016
 - g. Sheet 1.0, Halo Illuminated Pan Channel, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Signs and Graphics and dated November 4, 2016;
 - h. Sheet 2.0, Halo Illuminated Pan Channel, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Signs and Graphics and dated November 7, 2015;
 - i. Sheet 1.0, Entry Address Number, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Signs and Graphics;
 - j. Sheet 2.0, Entry Address Number, prepared by SmithCraft Custom Signs and Graphics; and
 - k. Structural Calculations, prepared by Simply Structural Consulting Structural Engineers and dated November 9, 2016.
2. The building mounted sign shall not be illuminated;
 3. The monument sign shall be a break-away sign and the planter around the monument sign must be made of hollow construction in which the cells are not grouted solid;
 4. The monument sign and address numbers may only be illuminated during the hours of operation of the church, including special events and services;
 5. The lighted signs must comply with the Town’s lighting ordinance and the light output must be measured after the signs are installed.
 6. If the Town receives a complaint from an offsite owner that the lamp or lighting or illumination device of the signs (as defined by the Town’s Lighting Ordinance) are visible from off the Property or are too bright, the Town Manager may inspect the Property and may require the Owner of the signs to shield the light source if the light emitting element is visible from outside the Property and/or reduce the output or brightness of the signs if they exceeds the allowable output.
 7. All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by the Minor Amendment SUP-16-05.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye:** 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle
- Absent:** 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

8. STUDY SESSION ITEMS (CONTINUED)

A. [16-438](#)

Discussion of Ritz-Carlton Preliminary Plat (Area C)

Chairman Strom and Commissioner Wainwright had questions regarding enforcement and adherence of the plan review. Ms. Cutro informed them the planning department would be handling both.

Commissioner Moore would like to see a stipulation that all houses located on the perimeter are one story to give it a more linear feel. He would also like to add that Lots 27-29 have two trees planted behind each lot.

Commissioner Moore would also like to see the water certification included on the plat.

Commissioner Marhle stated the changes have addressed his original concerns.

No Reportable Action

B. [16-439](#)

Discussion of a Conditional Use Permit at the Camelback Golf Club for proposed Personal Wireless Service Facility Antennas 7847 N. Mockingbird Lane (Assessor's Parcel Numbers 174-36-188A and 174-36-189).

Commissioner Moore wanted to know if the towers can accommodate other providers and if the 200-foot service area would still exist.

Declan Murphy representative from Verizon stated they can add others but would have to look at structural concerns on the roof. Also that the coverage area would most likely be greater than 200 foot but will not know for sure until they are turned on.

Chairman Strom requested an RF report to include the output within the 200-foot signal range.

Chairman Storm would also like to see a strongly worded sign on RF exposure, and requested where such sign(s) will be displayed and a visual of the exposure area.

No Reportable Action

C. [16-440](#)

Discussion of Lighting Code Revisions to Article 10 Height and Area Regulations, Section 1023 Outdoor Lighting and Illumination; Article 22 Hillside Development Regulations, Section 2208 Outdoor Lighting; Article 25 Signs, Section 2506 Lighting; and Special Use Permit Guidelines,

Section 2 Lighting as contained in Ordinance # 2016-04.

Chairman Strom met with Eva Cutro and discussed the Town Council's concerns.

Chairman Strom stated he felt flatland and hillside should have the same codes.

Commissioners Moore and Marhle disagreed and felt hillside should have shielded lights.

Commissioner Moore was not in favor of string lights for hillside homes.

Chairman Strom was in favor of string lights as long as they are adjacent to the house and only at outdoor living spaces.

The Planning Commission is okay with tree lighting for flatland homes.

Commissioners Moore, Marhle and Wainwright do not want to see tree lighting on hillside homes and would like to see a cap on the height of these lights.

The Planning Commission is okay with string and bulb lights on flatland homes but would like to see a maximum height, spacing of strings, and a provision that architectural features or walls cannot be lit.

The Planning Commission would like to see tree lighting maintained within the canopy of the tree with a maximum of 12-feet in height. The Planning Commission will further discuss if flatland and hillside should have the same codes.

The Planning Commission agreed coach and or carriage lanterns are okay, but the color should be limited and have a lower height versus a shielded bulb.

No Reportable Action

9. CONSENT AGENDA

A. [16-424](#) Approval of November 1, 2016 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to approve the minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

B. [16-425](#) Approval of November 15, 2016 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to approve the minutes with the edits to the duplicate labels of "Chairperson" and the vote on Agenda Item 16-388. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

10. STAFF REPORTS

11. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

12. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

13. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore at 9:10 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Wainwright, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Moore, Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Mahrle

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Wincel and Commissioner Campbell

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: _____
Eva Cutro, Secretary