



# Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr  
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

## Minutes - Draft

### Planning Commission

---

Tuesday, March 19, 2019

6:00 PM

Town Hall

---

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:05 p.m.

#### STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller  
Community Development Director Jeremy Knapp  
Senior Planner Paul Michaud  
Planner George Burton

#### 2. ROLL CALL

**Present** 7 - Commissioner Daran Wastchak  
Commissioner James Anton  
Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell  
Commissioner Charles Covington  
Commissioner Pamela Georgelos  
Commissioner Orme Lewis  
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright

#### 3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

#### 5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. [19-089](#) Consideration of a Minor Amendment to the Camelback Golf Club Special Use Permit located at 7847 N Mockingbird Lane to add protective netting over part of the maintenance facility yard located off Caballo Drive. (SUP-19-01)

Mr. Michaud introduced the item and shared a summary of the request and the existing conditions.

Commissioner Wainwright asked if the net could be a color other than black.

Mr. Michaud responded he would defer that to the applicant.

Commissioner Covington asked if the net would cover the open area of the maintenance yard.

Mr. Michaud replied it would not be the entire maintenance yard but the section directly in front of the building.

Commissioner Campbell commented that most of the work takes place in the area that would be protected by the net.

Commissioner Georgelos asked if the netting is only overhead and if that would be sufficient shielding.

Mr. Michaud referred that back to the applicant to respond, but he understands that it would be sufficient.

Chairman Wastchak noted that there is a vertical component to it as well. Commented that they need to consider the neighbor letter addressing how the net would disturb the neighborhood's visual aesthetic. He also pointed out that vegetation could be grown tall enough shield the netting from the neighbors' views.

Commissioner Georgelos asked how many neighbors would be affected.

Chairman Wastchak stated it looks to be around ten.

Commissioner Covington commented that he and Commissioner Anton noticed that the vegetation has grown and now it is very difficult to identify the temporary posts placed by the applicant.

Commissioner Anton stated the applicant has done a great job. The Planning Commission only needs to be sure to stipulate that the net is maintained, and a minimum height be required.

Discussion was made on what stipulations the Planning Commission would like to ensure there is sufficient vegetation to shield the net and poles. It was decided that any replacement plant material needs to reach a height of 14 feet within a 24-month period.

Commissioner Covington asked if green netting would be more camouflage than black.

Discussion was then made on if the Planning Commission should require specific colors for the net and poles.

Chairman Wastchak asked for any public comment.

Jenny Cox stated she lives in the neighborhood by the golf course and from an aesthetic standpoint the netting is objectionable. She stated if the golf club can put green netting and keep the trees tall enough to cover it then it may not be as big of a concern, but they do not want to see miles and miles of netting.

Chairman Wastchak asked if people that build at ironwood Golf Villas (Town Triangle) would be allowed to put up netting.

Andrew Miller, Town Attorney, indicated he remembers there was some limitation to netting in those areas. He added they may want to point out to Council that the Commission is concerned about netting.

Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director, commented that he would be willing to inform Town Council that the Planning Commission is concerned about netting when the final plat on that site comes back to Council.

Mr. Miller shared the added stipulation about the netting color and material.

Chairman Wastchak closed the public hearing portion of the meeting. He then called for a motion.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Anton, seconded by Commissioner Lewis, to deem the requested amendment as a minor amendment to the Special Use Permit zoning per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote: The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

Commissioner Campbell mentioned that the noticing requirements are absurd.

Chairman Wastchak responded that his comment is duly noted.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Anton, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to add protective netting over part of the maintenance facility yard located at 7847 N Mockingbird Lane (Assessor Parcel 174-36-188A) subject to the following stipulations:**

- 1) All improvements shall be in substantial compliance with the following:
  - a) Maintenance Yard Site Plan, Elevations & Section, prepared by Mittlestaedt Cooper & Associates Ltd dated February 7, 2019, Sheet A1.0;
  - b) Project Mock-Up, prepared by Mittlestaedt Cooper & Associates Ltd dated February 7, 2019, Sheet A2.0; and
  - c) Overall Site Plan, prepared by Mittlestaedt Cooper & Associates Ltd dated

February 7, 2019, Sheet A3.0.

- 2) Any landscaping that dies adjoining the maintenance facility shall be replaced in substantial conformance with the landscape plans approved as part of the March 28, 2002 approval (SUP-01-08) to ensure adequate screening of the netting. Provided however, any replacement plant material shall reach a height of 14 feet within a 24-month period.
- 3) The property owner and Town shall sign and record a Waiver of Rights and Remedies agreement under A.R.S. § 12-1134 (Proposition 207 Waiver) in the form provided by the Town Attorney within 10 calendar days of the approval of this amendment to the Special Use Permit.
- 4) All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by this Minor Amendment SUP 19-01.
- 5) The netting material shall be a color that blends best with the surroundings, such as dark green, and the support poles shall be painted the same color as the netting; all as to be determined by the Town Manager.

The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

**B.**     [19-109](#)     Consideration of a Minor Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP-18-16)  
6947 E McDonald Drive - Valley Presbyterian Church Public Hearing

Mr. Michaud introduced the item and shared the request, existing conditions, plan edits, and related items.

Commissioner Anton asked if he was correct in understanding that parents do not drop their kids off at the curb side but walk them all the way inside. He then asked if that is the case, where they will park.

Ed Gladly, representative for the church, responded that the Valley Day students primarily park on the west and south side of the school. The kids that get dropped off are Kiva students that cut across their property.

Chairman Wastchak indicated they may need to put no parking signs up to deal with Quail Run Road.

Mr. Michaud stated it is drafted for the applicant to pay for the no parking signs to be put in on the west side of the road, but a resident is concerned that this would only push people to drop off on the east side of the road.

Chairman Wastchak stated he does not necessarily feel they should require the applicant to pay for the signs.

Commissioner Campbell asked if they could switch some of the accessible stalls into regular parking stalls to make it a more functioning drop off.

Ed Glady stated that all the accessible stalls are used especially for Sunday services. He added that he would not like to have a drop off there especially since it is not their students that use it.

Chairman Wastchak commented that if the applicant does not need the drop off they should not ask them for it. He also feels that they should not tell the applicant how many accessible and non-accessible spaces. He also does not feel they need the curb cut on the north entrance though he likes it.

Other members of the Commission agreed with Chairman Wastchak about not needing to require the curb cut on north entrance, except Commissioner Campbell who feels it is a good addition to the property.

Chairman Wastchak remarked that he feels that parking on Quail Run Road is a problem but does not feel it is within the Planning Commissions purview.

Mr. Michaud continued describing the proposed plans for parking on the property and the requirements. After he reviewed the existing and proposed exterior lighting and he reviewed the Special Use Permit (SUP) criteria. He finished up by sharing the public comments and the proposed stipulations.

Commissioner Covington asked if they would need the stipulation on gates if they do not require them to have gates.

Mr. Michaud stated they would no longer need that stipulation if all of the gates were removed.

Chairman Wastchak recommended that they remove all the gates.

Ed Glady commented that he does not know why the gates are there.

Chairman Wastchak asked the Commission if there was any objection on leaving the decomposed granite driveway on the north side. No objections were made. He then asked if they received any comments on the plaza expansion.

Mr. Michaud responded he did not.

Commissioner Georgelos asked if there is a greater easement agreement that covers Kiva school and this property.

Mr. Michaud replied the agreement that is mentioned only covers the trash access.

Mr. Miller shared there are other easement agreements as well and gave information on those agreements.

Ed Glady stated there is also an agreement between the church, the Town and the school district which allows people to use the church parking lot to access the fields.

Chairman Wastchak asked who pays for the lights on the field.

Mr. Miller responded it might be the Town, but he does not know.

Chairman Wastchak opened the meeting up for public hearing.

Larry Westhouse stated he is a resident and has lived to the east of the church parking lot for the last 30 years. He shared that the gates on the parking lot are there not to restrict the church use of the parking lot but everyone else who tries to use it after hours. He pointed out that about a year ago a couple of kids rolled their car in the parking lot and he does not feel this would have happened if the gates had been locked. He added that if they change the parking from angled to sitting east and west then the Commission should consider some higher screening to block headlights from shining into their yards and homes. There is also about 30-40 feet of the wall that has been run down and he would like to know when that will be fixed.

Mr. Miller stated if they want to add a stipulation for the pony wall they would want to measure it from the parking lot instead of the outside.

Commissioner Campbell stated that he would love to see all that asphalt go away so he is very encouraged by the plans that include a lot of landscaping within the parking lot. He pointed out that the landscaping will add screening as well. He then suggested to eliminate all internal gates and concentrate on the ones that give access from Quail Run Road.

Ed Glady pointed out that this may restrict access to the ball park. Commissioner Campbell shared that it may not be a problem if the gates were only closed between 11:00 p.m. to 6:00 a.m.

Chairman Wastchak commented that the park lights are off no later than 10:00 p.m.

Ed Glady stated he has some concerns about having an automatic gate and possibly trapping someone in the parking lot who has stayed too late.

Commissioner Covington asked if there was any liability with having an automatic gate.

Chairman Wastchak responded there would probably be sensors to allow for a vehicle to exit.

Commissioner Campbell added most automatic gates allow for people to leave but not enter parking lots after a certain hour, which is another option if they are worried about cars being trapped there after hours.

Ed Glady commented if they only keep the two gates on Quail Run Road it will still allow an escape valve on the north side if needed.

Commissioner Campbell asked Mr. Westhouse if he felt the two gates on Quail Run Road would satisfy his concerns. Mr. Westhouse prefers the three exterior gates.

Commissioner Campbell indicated he feels they need three gates to remain. The two on Quail Run Road and another by the memorial garden.

Chairman Wastchak stated he does not want to restrict it completely.

Ed Glady asked if the third gate would impede the trash truck.

Mr. Miller stated he is confident they could arrange for pick up at a time when the gates are open.

Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Covington agreed with Commissioner Campbell to keep three gates.

Commissioner Wainwright, Commissioner Anton and Commissioner Lewis agreed with Chairman Wastchak to only keep the two gates on Quail Run Road.

Chairman Wastchak clarified that the Planning Commission agrees to have the applicant keep and repair the two gates on Quail Run Road which the applicant can choose to have close automatically or manually. The rest of the gates can be removed.

Commissioner Covington asked even if they do not use or repair the third gate now if they could leave it in so that if problems arise later they do not need to put a new gate in.

Chairman Wastchak stated that is an excellent idea.

Commissioner Wainwright asked why they decided to change the orientation of the parking stalls.

Rob Huff, Architect with Jones Studio, responded that it prevents cars from cutting through the parking lot and additionally allows people to safely walk through the parking lot.

Chairman Wastchak closed the public comment portion of the meeting.

Commissioner Lewis asked which design provides the most parking spaces and by how many. He added that he feels it is much safer to park on a diagonal than a perpendicular.

Ed Glady stated there are more parking spaces when put at an angle rather than straight in. He added they were willing to take the cut in parking spaces to accommodate this configuration.

Chairman Wastchak asked if they could keep the north -south isles but have the parking spaces turned at an angle.

Commissioner Campbell commented that it has been his experience that angled parking often yields fewer spaces.

Chairman Wastchak indicated they need to be sure the perimeter wall is three feet tall off the level area of the parking lot.

Mr. Westhouse explained where the problem with the lights is coming from. He also noted the parking lot slopes up from the east to the west.

Commissioner Campbell pointed out that there are more than walls that can stop lights such as the vegetation included in the plans. He added that he would rather see them put money into vegetation than a wall.

Chairman Wastchak asked for Mr. Michaud to help them go through the stipulation options again.

Discussion was made on which stipulations to include and how they should be worded.

Chairman Wastchak asked the Commission if they were fine relying on the applicants parking analysis. No objections were made.

More discussion was made on what to include in the stipulations.

Commissioner Campbell pointed out again that of over 300 notices sent out there was only two who participated.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Covington, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to deem the requested amendment as a minor amendment to the Special Use Permit zoning per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Covington, to approve a Minor Special Use Permit Amendment to the Valley Presbyterian Church Special Use Permit located at 6947 E McDonald Drive to allow for renovations to some of the existing buildings, landscaping/hardscaping improvements, and modification to the onsite parking spaces from the phased 1999 Special Use Permit approval. These renovations consist of improvements to Building A (Sanctuary) for interior remodel, with a 197 square foot expansion and replacing an approximate 500 square foot trellis with a 1,000 square-foot trellis; Building B (South Classroom) interior remodel to add 7 classrooms from existing office/storage space and remodel 2 classrooms, resulting in an overall reduction of 450 square feet; Building C (Administrative Offices) to remodel interior spaces and additional window shade structures; Building D (Facilities) to remodel interior spaces; and the removal of the 1999 approvals for a larger sanctuary expansion and new classroom building. Site improvements include the renovation of the central plaza to provide new hardscaping and landscaping, rework of pedestrian and vehicular access to the plaza, relocation of accessible (ADA) parking spaces in the main parking lot closer to the buildings, new landscaping/irrigation surrounding these buildings, and modification to the onsite parking spaces from the phased 1999 Special Use Permit approval. Approval was subject to six stipulations.**

**Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

- 1. All improvements shall amend any prior approved plans, or portions thereof, and such improvements shall be in substantial compliance with the following:**
  - a. Site Plan & SUP General Information, Sheet ZA1.0, prepared by Jones Studio dated March 5, 2019;**
  - b. Preliminary Civil Improvement Plan, Sheets C1.0, C2.0, C3.1, C3.2, C4.1, C5.1, C6.1 and C6.2, prepared by Cypress Civil Development, date sealed by Jeffrey P. Hunt on March 5, 2018;**
  - c. Landscape and hardscape plans, Sheets L1.1, L1.2, L2.6, L2.7, L3.0 and L3.3 prepared by Chris Winters + ARC Studios and Jones**

Studio, date sealed by Christopher R. Winters on October 1, 2018, and revised on December 14, 2018;

- d. Landscape and hardscape plans, Sheets L1.0, L2.0, L2.1, L2.2, L2.3, L2.4, L2.5, L3.1 and L3.2 prepared by Chris Winters + ARC Studios and Jones Studio, date sealed by Christopher R. Winters on February 15, 2019, and revised on March 5, 2019;
- e. Demo, floor plans and building elevations, Sheet A2.0.0 prepared by Jones Studio dated October 1, 2018;
- f. Demo, floor plans and building elevations, Sheets A2.0.1, A2.0.2, A2.0.3, A2.1.0, A2.1.1, A2.1.2, A2.1.3, A2.2.0, A5.1.0, A5.1.1, A5.1.2 and A9.7.1 prepared by Jones Studio dated December 17, 2018;
- g. Photometric and exterior lighting, Sheets E1.4, E1.5, E1.6 and E1.7 prepared by Jones Studio, VoltaUS and Applied Engineering, and date sealed by William J. Bethrum IV on January 14, 2019;
- h. Narrative and Response to Existing Stipulations prepared by Jones Studio date stamped February 4, 2019; and
- i. Parking Analysis prepared by CivTech and date sealed by Joseph F. Spadafino on February 4, 2019.

2. Modify the following existing stipulations (deletions shown by ~~strike through~~ and additions shown in **track-change** text)

- a. Modify Stipulation 7 from the SUP-99-20 approval to read “Gate **Four (4)** [Previously Gate One (1) on Sheet DR1.0], located **west of the columbarium memorial garden and south of the access into the center shared parking lot on the Kiva Elementary school** south of the proposed turnaround on the north side of the property, shall **remain**.be automatically operated and open from 5:00 p.m. to 11:00 p.m. weekdays and from 6:00 a.m. to 11:00 p.m. on Saturday and Sunday. **Gate Three (3)** [Previously Gate Two (2) on Sheet DR1.0] located at the southernmost driveway into the south parking lot off Quail Run Road and **Gate Two (2)** [Previously Gate Three (3) on Sheet DR1.0] located at the northernmost driveway into the south parking lot off Quail Run Road shall be closed from 11:00 p.m. to 6:00 a.m. daily. **Gates Two (2), Three (3) and Four (4)**, located in the existing driveways off Quail Run Road, shall be open from 6:00 a.m. to 11:00 p.m. and shall be closed all other

hours as indicated on exhibit E (sheet DR1.0).  
Ballfield activities shall be considered  
special events as indicated on sheet RR 1.2.”

- b. Based on the anecdotal parking counts provided by the applicant, the Planning Commission finds that the required parking is met on the church property, maintaining Stipulation 10 from the SUP-99-20 approval that reads “No parking on Kiva School property shall count to satisfy Valley Presbyterian Church required parking.”
- c. Modify Sheet DR1.0, DR1.2 and delete Stipulation 12 from the SUP-99-20 approval due to the removal of the interior parking lot gates and chains. Stipulation 12 of SUP-99-20 that reads “Parking shall be divided into Three (3) zones; Zone A (core church parking), Zone B (south lot parking), and Zone C (Kiva/shared-use parking lot), and shall be operated as described in Exhibit G (Sheet DR1.2), except that core church parking Zone A shall be reduced from 242 spaces to 180 spaces; however, 242 spaces shall be permitted on Wednesday and Thursday evenings and on eight (8) Tuesday evenings during any calendar year. The parking zones shall be physically controlled through the use of movable chains, which restrict the available parking.” is deleted.
- d. Modify Stipulation 20 from the SUP-99-20 approval to read “**Except as modified by the exterior lighting with SUP-18-16 on Sheets E1.4, through E1.7, A**all other lighting or illumination shall conform to Article X, Section 1023 of the Zoning Ordinance. Lighting fixtures shall correspond to approved Exhibits H (Sheet DR2.0) and I (Sheet DR2. I), except that lumen output shall be reduced to a maximum of two hundred fifty (250) lumens for aesthetic and landscape lighting, and a maximum of seven hundred fifty (750) lumens for safety and security lighting.”
- e. Modify the December 9, 1999 approval of SUP-99-20 to remove the approval of the 1,900 square foot addition to sanctuary of Building A and the 9,465 square foot classroom building that was approved to replace Building G shown on Sheet ZA1.0 of SUP-18-16.

3. **Prior to commencing work on the south parking lot improvements listed as Phase 2, All Phases Completed, on Sheet ZA1.0 (or sooner if necessary), the parties involved in the limited ingress and egress access easement agreement granting access to the trash enclosure on the Kiva Elementary School property recorded with the Maricopa County Recorder in document #20080061593 on January 23, 2008 shall re-record this agreement to correctly depict the access easement.**
4. **Delete the draft stipulation regarding requiring the new curb cut in the north parking lot along Quail Run Road.**
5. **The property owner and Town shall sign and record a Waiver of Rights and Remedies agreement under A.R.S. § 12-1134 (Proposition 207 Waiver) in the form provided by the Town Attorney within 10 calendar days of the approval of this amendment to the Special Use Permit.**
6. **All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by this Minor Amendment SUP 18-16.**

**C.**     [19-115](#)

Consideration of a Preliminary Plat (PA-17-01) & Private Road Conditional Use Permit (CUP-19-01)  
Sanctuary II - Three Lot Subdivision with Private Road  
4474 E. Valley Vista Lane (APN 169-20-122) and 4490 E. Valley Vista Lane (APN 169-20-123)

George Burton, Planner, introduced the item. He shared the summary of the request, commission review, and other facts.

Commissioner Campbell stated he feels this is a dangerous application and is a flag lot that does not work.

Commissioner Georgelos agreed with Commissioner Campbell that this is a big safety concern.

Commissioner Wainwright shared that unless there is strong support to give a variance here he is opposed to it.

Commissioner Lewis commented that he is uncomfortable with the bridge over the arroyo as well as the lack of sight when coming off the proposed roadway.

Chairman Wastchak stated his biggest issue with this plan is safety. He then asked why staff recommends denial.

Mr. Burton explained that the requests does not meet the 45-foot cul-de-sac among other points. He then pointed out some of the concerns in the public comments.

Chairman Wastchak opened the meeting up for public comments.

Rich Brock, owner, indicated that he purchased the lot back in 2007. He shared some of the original plans for the property and explained that he has done everything he could to meet the Planning Commission requests, including adding the hammerhead as well as a 30-foot turnaround at the end of the road. He also feels that having the two homes would be best for the neighborhood and would disturb less area, but either way he will be building on the property.

Chairman Wastchak closed the public comment portion of the meeting and then called for a motion.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Georgelos, to recommend to the Town Council denial of the preliminary plat application at 4474 and 4490 E. Valley Vista Lane for a total of three hillside lots with a new road. This recommendation was based on safety and related concerns. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

**A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Georgelos, to deny the Conditional Use Permit application for the private road associated with the preliminary plat application at 4474 and 4490 E. Valley Vista Lane for a total of three hillside lots with a new road. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

## 6. ACTION ITEMS

None

## 4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

### A. [19-107](#)

Discussion of Major Special Use Permit Amendment (SUP-18-12)  
10555 N Tatum Boulevard - Mountain View Medical Center

Paul Michaud, Senior Planner, introduced the item. He shared updates received from the last meeting. He noted that the next neighborhood meeting will be in the community room on March 26, 2019 at 5:00p.m. After

he identified existing landscaping and proposed landscaping.

Chairman Wastchak stated he remembers dropping the idea of increasing the width on the rear yard landscaping if they were to deal more with the wall heights and tree selections.

Commissioner Lewis shared that it was suggested but not decided upon.

Mr. Michaud continued sharing discussion points on landscaping. He added that the plans generally meet the Town Code and guidelines.

Chairman Wastchak commented the Planning Commission needs to make sure the landscaping plans meet the Visually Significant Corridor Plan. Commissioners Georgelos, Wainwright, Covington, and Anton also commented in support of paying attention to what is being planted in the visually significant corridors, especially since the Commission has been lenient with the width of the landscaping area.

Mr. Michaud clarified that they are currently meeting the landscaping guidelines on the plant palate and number.

Commissioner Campbell stated he is supportive of the 25-foot width of landscaping along Firebrand Ranch. He clarified that adequate would mean a thorough visual screening from the development for the neighbors. He currently feels there needs to be many more trees.

Commissioner Georgelos indicated she would like to see the division be more substantial than it is now in addition to substantial landscaping. Commissioner Covington agreed with her point.

Commissioner Wainwright shared that landscaping to him is paramount, but a bigger buffer is always better received.

Commissioner Lewis commented that he could agree with either widths. He added that it will take sophisticated landscape architecture to make it work for everybody's needs.

Commissioner Anton stated that he feels the landscaping is more important than the width, as well as the offering to increase the wall height to eight feet where requested.

Chairman Wastchak agreed with Commissioner Anton. He added that homeowners participating in the vegetation selection is also an important element.

Mr. Michaud pointed out that they will see the draft stipulations at the next Planning Commission meeting. He then asked for feedback about using spiny plants and other design elements to discourage loitering.

Chairman Wastchak indicated that Town Council shared some concern about loitering on the property. He mentioned he has talked about possible lighting on the property to prevent it.

Commissioner Georgelos stated a solution may be adding spiny plants in the landscaping along the back and along the Tatum Boulevard and Shea Boulevard arterials.

Mr. Michaud specified that along the parking screen wall the applicant shows Red Bird of Paradise which has some prickliness to it.

Chairman Wastchak asked if they could add in a stipulation that if there were problems with loitering the Town Manager could work with the property owner on putting plants in there that would discourage it.

Mr. Michaud responded that staff could draft such a stipulation.

Commissioner Lewis commented that decomposed granite should be used as the sub base, noting that granite will aid in discouraging loitering.

Jeremy Knapp, Community Development Director, pointed out the concern with potential loitering on the Town's monument sign.

Chairman Wastchak asked that spiny plants be used by the monument sign.

Mr. Michaud shared information on the existing and the proposed architecture.

A video of the property plans was shown. The video was previously shown at the neighborhood meeting.

Commissioner Wainwright shared what happened at the neighborhood meeting. He pointed out some of the more common concerns which included change in architectural design to a more commercial look, building height, road access, stacking on Tatum Boulevard and length of construction.

Paul Couture, resident, shared five main concerns that the neighbors had after the neighborhood meeting. The concerns included a desire for a deeper setback then the proposed 25 feet and shortening of the

construction time. The list also included not allowing two story buildings and a concern for busier streets and decrease in property value.

Chuck Vogel, resident, indicated that Mountain View Medical has been a great neighbor. He shared that neighbors are concerned with the changes the new development will bring. One specific concern is with the height of the buildings. He stated that at the neighborhood meeting the developer seemed receptive to the idea of bringing the building down in the ground another five feet. He is also concerned with the landscape such as the Palo Verde, their backyards being only 25 feet from the medical center internal driveway and the construction time. He believes they also need to be more sensitive to their property values.

Chairman Wastchak asked Mr. Vogel what he would like to see differently at the next neighborhood meeting.

Mr. Vogel stated he would like to see some visual lines showing the two-story buildings looking into the backyards that border the property. It would also be good to see the landscape palate improved.

John Cantrell, project architect, stated the height, traffic, and the 25-foot buffer are what he felt were the biggest concerns at the neighborhood meeting. He pointed out problems with extending the buffer, but that the owner is willing to do the landscaping on that buffer in the first phase, so they have time to mature by phase three. He commented that the existing and proposed trees will screen out the entire building. He added that they can take another look at the landscaping plan to be sure it addresses the visually significant corridor. They also can prepare a rendering of the view from the two-story building back toward the houses. He also believes that it should not decrease property value.

Commissioner Campbell stated he would like to see more lush vegetation in the 25-foot barrier to the neighboring homes by the next meeting.

Commissioner Anton asked if they could get a commitment by the next meeting to get all the vegetation at the beginning of the first phase.

Chairman Wastchak commented that the Planning Commission may be headed toward reconsidering the five-foot drop to get the applicant what they want while also reducing the height.

Commissioner Lewis shared he would like to see the applicant add something to the architecture that adds more vitality to it.

John Cantrell stated they could reduce the height to 30 feet without doing

the garden level by putting the mechanical units on the one-story buildings on each side.

Commissioner Campbell suggested that the applicant do the five-foot drop and place the mechanical units to the side of the building.

Commissioner Georgelos commented that she would see the reduction of height as a sort of compromise and Chairman Wastchak agreed.

Commissioner Campbell pointed out that many medical professionals are not working in private practices anymore and he is concerned that this area may deteriorate if it is not redeveloped.

Mr. Michaud shared the future discussion points. He then asked if the Planning Commission needs to go back and ask Council for another extension.

Chairman Wastchak asked Mr. Michaud to put it on the agenda so there is an option to request the extension at the next meeting if needed.

**No Reportable Action**

**7. CONSENT AGENDA**

- A. [19-114](#) Approval of February 26, 2019 Planning Commission Minutes

**A motion was made by Commissioner Lewis, seconded by Commissioner Georgelos, to approve the February 26, 2019 minutes with edits on page 4 and 16 to change "they" to "Planning Commission" and "the" to "they" regarding comments made by Commissioner Campbell. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

**8. STAFF REPORTS**

None

**9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS**

None

**10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Mr. Knapp stated that the next meeting agenda will include continued discussion on Mountain View Medical, Sanctuary Casa 3 Intermediate Special Use Permit amendment for the first time, and three possible lot splits.

## 11. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Georgelos at 10:35 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Lewis, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 7 - Commissioner Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Georgelos, Commissioner Lewis and Commissioner Wainwright

### Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By:   
Jeremy Knapp, Secretary