



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Final

Planning Commission

Tuesday, May 2, 2017

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Wastchak called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Attorney Andrew M. Miller
Community Development Director Eva Cutro
Senior Planner Paul Michaud
Planner George Burton

2. ROLL CALL

Present 6 - Chairperson Daran Wastchak
Commissioner James Anton
Commissioner Charles Covington
Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle
Commissioner Dolf Strom
Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright

Absent 1 - Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. [17-154](#) Discussion of a Minor Special Use Permit Amendment.
Mountain Shadows Resort (SUP 17-02). 5517 E Lincoln Drive.
- George Burton reviewed the aspects of the application request for the building light fixtures on Mountain Shadows Resort.
- It was confirmed that the uplights have a purple colored translucent shield that goes to the roofline which helps prevent light trespass. Also, it was noted that these lights run along the both sides of the east guest wing which limits visibility off the property.
- Maintenance of the light fixtures was discussed.

Mr. Burton asked if a photometric plan is desired. Noting the large distance the lights are from the property line, the Planning Commission stated no photometric is needed. However, the applicant was asked to leave these lights on until Sunday, May 7th for people to view them and assess any impact.

No Reportable Action

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. [17-156](#)

Consideration of Intermediate Special Use Permit Amendment Sanctuary Resort (SUP 16-08). 5700 E. McDonald Drive.

Mr. Burton reviewed the application request. He noted this application was discussed at prior work sessions by the Planning Commission. He mentioned that the applicant did replace the wall HVAC unit at the snack bar with a mini split HVAC as suggested by the Planning Commission.

There was discussion of the 25-foot setback to Superstition Lane on one of the casitas, noting that this reduced setback is to a private street and for a small percentage of area of the structure.

Commissioner Anton questioned the hours of the snack bar, suggesting a 7:00 a.m. start time may be better than sunrise due to possible noise to adjoining neighbors.

The type of fencing was discussed. The Planning Commission was agreeable to the proposed mix of wood and stucco fencing around the new pool.

The size of the parking stalls and the change of one ADA parking stall was discussed.

Commissioner Anton suggested a start time for access to the storage containers along McDonald Drive. After much discussion, no new start time was added. However, it was suggested to add a stipulation for replacement of the oleander screen at a minimum height of 8 feet.

Commissioner Strom suggested an amendment to the retention basin stipulation that these basins must match the landscaping and architecture of the site.

Mr. Burton reviewed all the stipulations.

There was discussion to delete the existing Stipulation G.1.c on page 14 of the draft ordinance. It was determined to leave this stipulation in place.

Chairman Wastchak opened the meeting the public at 6:50 p.m.

A resident in Stone Canyon inquired about covering the containers until they get moved, what was in them, and how often the storage containers were accessed. The applicant replied they will be moved after the June 8th Council meeting, that housekeeping material like robes are stored in them, and they are not accessed on a regular basis.

There were no other comments or discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Mahrle, to recommend approval to the Town Council the Intermediate Special Use Permit amendment for the Sanctuary on Camelback Resort, subject to the stipulations in Ordinance #2017-02, with amendments. These amended stipulations related to requiring the hours of the new pool area to start at 7:00 a.m., to sign the existing ADA parking space near the valet stand for cart use, to require all new parking spaces have dimensions of 9 feet by 20 feet instead of the 180 square foot dimension, to modify the existing oleander replacement stipulation with hop bush for Casa 2 with an amendment that also applies to the oleanders along McDonald Drive related to the containers, and to amend the retention basin stipulation that these basins must match the landscaping and architecture of the site.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Campbell

B. [17-151](#) Consideration of a Minor Amendment to the El Chorro Lodge Special Use Permit
5550 E Lincoln Drive - Office/Kitchen Renovation and Monument Entry Sign

Mr. Michaud presented the application request. He noted that a fourth stipulation is added to address the required waiver of rights form the owner must sign.

There was clarification on the photometric chart, noting it should state the data is in footcandles.

Chairman Wastchak opened the meeting to the public. Doug Jorden, attorney for the owner, stated he is available to address any questions.

There was no public comment or further discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Strom, to deem the requested amendment at the El Chorro Lodge as a minor amendment to the Special Use Permit zoning per the criteria listed in Section 1102.7.B of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Campbell

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Covington, to approve the Minor Special Use Permit Amendment at the El Chorro Lodge related to the new entry monument and the renovation and addition of office, kitchen, and storage space, subject to the following stipulations:

1. All improvements shall be in substantial compliance with the following:
 - a. Project Narrative, prepared by Jordan Hiser & Joy, P.L.C., document "00071572 2";
 - b. Site Plan Sheets SP1, SP2, and SP3, prepared by Ideation Design Group, sealed by registered architect Carl Frederick Schaffer, dated April 25, 2017;
 - c. Building Sign Elevation, Sheets SK2, prepared by Ideation Design Group, dated March 29, 2017;
 - d. Monument Sign Elevation/Plan View, prepared by Ideation Design Group, dated April 6, 2017 showing sign at 4'6" in height;
 - e. Photometric Plan, prepared by eDesign Group, dated April 25, 2017;
 - f. Lighting cut sheets for the Focus Industries LED Flood Light, Kichler Mount Vernon Collection wall light, and Philips LED wall sconce 102L light; and
 - g. Corner Vision documentation prepared by prepared by CivTECH Inc., sealed by registered professional engineer Douglas Ostler, dated April 7, 2017 and April 18, 2017;
2. Lighting
 - a. The lighting for the entry monument sign shall be placed on a timer to shut off between the hours of 12:00 a.m. and 7:00 a.m., unless otherwise approved by the Town Manager or designee for special events.
 - b. The loading dock emergency light shall be on a motion sensor that limits operation to five minutes per incidence.
3. All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by this Minor Amendment SUP 17-01.
4. The Owner and Town sign and record a Waiver of Rights and Remedies agreement under A.R.S. §12-1134.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Campbell

C. [17-155](#) Phoenix Country Day School - Intermediate SUP Amendment
3901 E. Stanford Drive

Eva Cutro presented the application in accordance with the packet.

The primary discussion related to the proposed signs. It was suggested to add a stipulation that the Stanford Drive entry sign meet the American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials (AASHTO) sight triangle requirements. Commissioner Wainwright questioned the need for the address number on one or more of the signs. Jordan Rose, attorney for the owner, described a security report done for the school, noting that including the address number on signs was not suggested.

There was discussion on the garbage pick-up along the west property. It was noted this was not part of the Intermediate amendment, but the school officials worked out a pick up schedule that is acceptable to the neighbor. Commissioner Strom stated he noticed several stored items in that garbage area that might also need screening. Ms. Rose stated she would look into the matter and is unaware of any complaints.

There was no public comments or further discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Strom, seconded by Commissioner Anton, to recommend approval to the Town Council the Intermediate Special Use Permit Amendment for Phoenix Country Day School, subject to the following stipulations:

- 1. All improvements to the property shall be in substantial compliance with the following:**
 - a. Intermediate Special Use Permit Amendment Application. Submitted November 2016. Resubmitted April 2017.**
- 2. The illumination of the proposed signs shall be turned off between the hours of 9:30 p.m. and 5:30 a.m.**
- 3. All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by this Intermediate Amendment.**
- 4. The monument sign on Stanford shall be located outside of the American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials (AASHTO) sight triangle.**

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Campbell

6. ACTION ITEMS

7. CONSENT AGENDA

- A.** [17-140](#) Approval of April 18, 2017 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Wainwright, seconded by Commissioner Mahrle, to approve the April 18, 2017 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Campbell

8. STAFF REPORTS

Andrew Miller noted that he will have a new intern. He also discussed that he will be bringing up for discussion at a later date amending the Planning Commission rules.

The bicycle and pedestrian master plan process was reviewed, along with updated on the lighting code and hillside code.

9. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

Chairman Wastchak said the Mayor asked him for a joint meeting with the Planning Commission and Town Council on May 17, 2017 regarding cell sites. The Planning Commissioners in attendance stated they could attend the meeting.

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

11. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Strom at 8:00 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Covington, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 6 - Chairperson Wastchak, Commissioner Anton, Commissioner Covington, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Strom and Commissioner Wainwright

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Campbell

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: 
Eva Cutro, Secretary