



Town of Paradise Valley

6401 E Lincoln Dr
Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

Minutes - Final

Planning Commission

Tuesday, January 19, 2016

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Strom called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

- Present** 5 - Chairperson Dolf Strom, Commissioner Thomas G. Campbell, Commissioner Richard K. Mahrle, Commissioner Scott Moore and Commissioner Daran Wastchak
- Absent** 2 - Commissioner Jonathan Wainwright and Commissioner Jeff Wincel

3. EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

4. STUDY SESSION ITEMS

- A. 16-002** Discussion of "The Villas at Mountain Shadows - Amended - Condominiums"
Preliminary Condominium Plat Map (PP 16-01)
SWC Lincoln Dr & 56th St

Paul Michaud presented the material in the action report.

Chairman Strom asked about the scope of the request and timing of the related applications. Mr. Michaud replied that there is no requirement to process the applications all at the same time.

Commissioner Moore asked about the change in square footage. Mr. Michaud clarified.

Commissioner Wastchak asked about the changes to the plat. Mr. Michaud explained the changes.

Commissioner Campbell asked about density. Mr. Michaud explained that the number of units will be reduced from 20 to 19 homes.

Commissioner Moore asked about the change from one-story to two-story. Doug Jorden, representing the owner, explained why the change was made.

No Reportable Action

- B. 16-022** Discussion of a Minor Amendment to the Hermosa Inn Special Use Permit (SUP-15-5). 5532 N. Palo Cristi Road (Assessor No. 170-03-129).

George Burton presented the material in the action report. He explained the application is to reconfigure, reorient, and/or remodel several buildings, add various fireplaces and fountains, construct new and modify several fence walls to create courtyards, modify the parking lot, and add parking lot lighting.

Mr. Burton went over the Minor SUP criteria, stating that staff finds the application meets these guidelines. He also went over the two proposed stipulations in the action report, noting a proposed stipulation from Chairman Strom that "up-lighting shall be permitted so long as no device emits more than 250 lumens." Commissioner Mahrle questioned the need to add this stipulation if the request does not include up lights. Commissioner Campbell agreed. The applicant responded he is fine either way on adding the up-lighting stipulation.

Planning Commission discussion included:

- Discussion on the removal of the two-story structures near arrival area.
- Explanation on the use of the gate on Stanford Drive, with the applicant noting it will have a keypad for guest use.
- Clarification that the mechanical equipment will be a mix of roof and ground mounted equipment, with roof mounted not to exceed the height of the parapet.
- Clarification that the outdoor fireplaces will use natural gas.
- Explanation that the secondary wall approved in the rear parking lot in 2007 is not part of the current application request since the garden area is now remaining.

No Reportable Action**5. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

- A. 16-023** Consideration of a Minor Amendment to the Hermosa Inn Special Use Permit (SUP-15-5) 5532 N. Palo Cristi Road (Assessor No. 170-03-129).

There was no additional information provided by staff or the Planning Commission, as this was discussed at the study session this evening. Chairman Strom asked the applicant to speak. The owner of the site spoke, noting he invited the neighbors to the site before the Planning

Commission meeting to review the proposed improvement plans.

Chairman Strom opened the meeting to the public. Three people spoke.

- Alison Marshall, resident. She stated that the subject property is located within a residential neighborhood, noting that changes to this site can significantly impact the character of the neighborhood. She noted concerns on lighting. She asked the Planning Commission to be considerate in maintaining the historic and residential character of the area as they evaluate the request. She noted that the new rooms will result in additional traffic. Commissioner Wastchak clarified that the room count is remaining the same as previously improved in 2007.
- Nancy Swanson, resident. She stated she attended the site visit by the owner. She asked for clarification on the secondary wall approved in the rear parking lot in 2007. She inquired whether the parking lot lights will come on every night, noting her preference for no parking lot lighting. Chairman Strom replied that the proposed lights meet the low-level lighting standards of the Town.
- Scott LeMarr, resident and former Mayor. He stated he has long been a patron and supporter of the Hermosa Inn. He explained his history in supporting the various SUP amendments while he was on Town Council. He added that the Hermosa Inn has been a good neighbor. He believes that the new owner can take this property to the next level. He believes the Town should support responsible resort redevelopment. Regarding lighting, he stated he finds the lighting unobtrusive. Regarding noise, he stated he can hear soft music at times. Lastly, he noted that the architectural character remains the same.

Chairman Strom closed the public comment. With no Commissioner requesting to discuss this item further, Chairman Strom asked for a motion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Wastchak, finding that the applictaion request is a Minor Amendment per Section 1102.7 of the Zoning Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Moore and Commissioner Wastchak

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Wincel

A motion was made by Commissioner Mahrle, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to reconfigure and re-orientate buildings, add fireplaces and fountains, modify and add fence walls, and modify the parking area, subject to the following stipulations:

1. All improvements to the property shall be in substantial compliance with the following:
 - a. Project Narrative;
 - b. Sheet 1, Aerial/Vicinity Map/Sheet Index, prepared by Leo J. Miller Architect and dated January 3, 2106;
 - c. Sheet 2, Revised Site and Use Plan, prepared by Leo J. Miller Architect and dated January 3, 2106;
 - d. Sheet 3, Elevation Plan, prepared by Leo J. Miller Architect and dated January 3, 2106; and
 - e. Sheet 4, Parking Lot Lighting Diagram, prepared by Leo J. Miller Architect and dated January 3, 2106.

2. All existing Special Use Permit stipulations shall remain in full force and effect, unless changed or modified by the Minor Amendment SUP-15-5.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Moore and Commissioner Wastchak

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Wincel

6. ACTION ITEMS

- A. 16-003** Consideration of "The Villas at Mountain Shadows - Amended - Condominiums"
 Preliminary Condominium Plat Map (PP 16-01)
 SWC Lincoln Dr & 56th St

There was no additional information provided by staff or the Planning Commission, as this was discussed at the study session this evening. Chairman Strom opened the meeting to the public. No one asked to speak on this item. Chairman Strom closed the public comment. With no Commissioner requesting to discuss this item further, Chairman Strom asked for a motion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wastchak, to forward a recommendation of approval of the Preliminary Plat Map application, subject to the following stipulations:

1. The Final Plat Map shall be in substantial compliance with the Preliminary Plat Map, "The Villas at Mountain Shadows – Amended - Condominiums," Sheets 1-5, prepared by Coe & Van Loo Consultants, Inc. dated December 23, 2015.

2. Prior to recordation of the Final Plat Map, the applicant shall provide to the Town Attorney a copy of the CC&R's, declaration, bylaws, or other documents for review to insure that all terms required under the SUP or other recorded agreements are part of these documents, including provision for maintenance of any drainage easements dedicated on the plat.

3. The final improvements shall be in substantial compliance with improvement plans approved by the Town Engineer and Community Development Department that address items such as sewer, water, grading, drainage, paving, landscaping,

and irrigation. Prior to the recordation of the Final Map, the applicant shall provide, subject to Town approval and consistent with the requirements set forth in the SUP and Development Agreement, all assurances necessary to guarantee completion of any improvements in the public right-of-way. The Town Engineer shall approve said final improvement plans prior to the issuance of any building permit for a residential unit in said Final Plat Map.

4. Within 60 days of approval of the Final Map, the applicant shall submit to the Town mylars of the approved plans and an electronic version of these plans in a pdf format for the Town's permanent record.

5. The Final Plat Map and/or declaration shall include any and all necessary easements, including:

a. Easements for drainage that are consistent to the overall grading and drainage plans for the entire Special Use Permit (SUP) site west of 56th Street, which shall be depicted on the Final Map prior to recordation of said plat,

b. Easements for utilities, with said easements to be in the locations and widths as prescribed by the respective utility provider, with correspondence from said utility providers given to the Town prior to Town Council approval of the Final Plat Map, and

c. Easements for access, parking, refuse collection, and other similar easements.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Moore and Commissioner Wastchak

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Wincel

7. STUDY SESSION ITEMS (Continued)

A. 16-015 Discussion of Lighting Code

Chairman Strom explained he asked staff to add this to the agenda for the Planning Commission to consider lighting code changes that would remove the term "watts" and replace the term with "lumens" where appropriate. He described the loop hole of a recent application.

Commissioner Mahrle suggested the Town solicit input from experts on lighting to make sure any changes do not create any unintended circumstances to meet code. Commissioner Campbell raised the point that "watts" may still come into play as people can still buy an incandescent fixture and these fixtures typically include a lumen conversion.

Commissioner Wastchak asked about sustainability, whether it might be possible to comply with the lumens and still use a lot of wattage.

Eva Cutro noted that the Town Council will be reviewing staff and Planning

Commission priorities. Direction was given to delete the "watt" and "incandescent" terms.

There was discussion regarding the possibility of hiring professional services. Ms. Cutro stated she would check with a local lighting experts to get his or her opinion before moving forward with the formal text amendment process.

No Reportable Action

8. CONSENT AGENDA

A. 16-012 Approval of December 1, 2015 Planning Commission Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Mahrle, to approve the December 1, 2015 minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Moore and Commissioner Wastchak

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Wincel

9. STAFF REPORTS

Eva Cutro stated that the Town Council will be reviewing Quality of Life items at their January 28, 2016 meeting. Commissioner Wastchak inquired about the timing of Visually Significant Corridors and the Ritz project. It was noted to follow up with Commissioner Wincel regarding the scope.

Paul Michaud gave an update on the timing of the bicycle-pedestrian study. Commissioner Wastchak gave an example of Denver, CO on connectivity and paths not being part of street system.

George Burton asked for input on the rotation for the Hillside Building Committee chairperson. It was determined that a six-month rotation is workable and can be interpreted by the current code.

10. PUBLIC BODY REPORTS

Commissioner Campbell stated he can attend the March 1, 2016 meeting by phone if needed.

11. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Paul Michaud reviewed the upcoming agenda items.

12. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made at 7:15 p.m. by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Campbell, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairperson Strom, Commissioner Campbell, Commissioner Mahrle, Commissioner Moore and Commissioner Wastchak

Absent: 2 - Commissioner Wainwright and Commissioner Wincel

Paradise Valley Planning Commission

By: 
Eva Cutro, Secretary